Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings

Dydd Mercher, 11 Gorffennaf 2012
Wednesday, 11 July 2012

Cynnwys
Contents

3 Cwestiynau i’r Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ
Questions to the Minister for Finance and Leader of the House

23 Cwestiynau i’r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth
Questions to the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science

47 Cwestiwn Brys: Remploy
Urgent Question: Remploy

52 Datganiad: Adroddiad y Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar Ddinas-ranbarthau
Statement: The City Regions Task and Finish Group

71 Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol i’r Cyfraniad a Wneir gan Fferyllfeydd Cymunedol i Wasanaethau Iechyd yng Nghymru
The Health and Social Care Committee’s Inquiry into the Contribution of Community Pharmacy to Health Services in Wales

94 Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer

94 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deisebau ar Reoli Sŵn o Dyrbinau Gwynt
The Petitions Committee’s Report on Control of Noise from Wind Turbines

112 Dadl Plaid Cymru: Y Rhwydwaith Rheilffyrdd
Plaid Cymru Debate: The Railway Network

135 Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time

137 Dadl Fer: Anrhydeddu ein Harwyr—Gwarchod Cofebau Rhyfel yng Nghymru
Short Debate: Honouring our Heroes—Protecting War Memorials in Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m.with the Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) in the Chair.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ
Questions to the Minister for Finance and Leader of the House

Cynaliadwyedd

1. Julie James: *Pa ystyriaeth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei rhoi i agenda gynaliadwyedd Llywodraeth Cymru wrth bennu'r gyllideb gyffredinol. OAQ(4)0150(FIN)*

The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House (Jane Hutt): Sustainable development is our central organising principle, and consideration of the impact on sustainable development has been mainstreamed into all aspects of the budget planning process.

Julie James: What impact does the £1.7 billion reduction in Welsh Government funding from Westminster have on ensuring that adequate provision is made for sustainability? Will you be able to ensure that sustainability remains a key driver at the heart of all decisions made by the Welsh Government and local authorities in the light of those cuts?

Jane Hutt: Our commitment to sustainable development as a central organising principle was reflected in the capital investment package that I announced in May with the Wales infrastructure investment plan, including the additional £9 million for home energy efficiency and flood protection schemes.

Russell George: The new ecosystems approach, which is outlined in the 'Sustaining a Living Wales' consultation and which is central to achieving the Welsh Government's objectives, will require dedicated funding if it is to achieve and deliver its objectives. Can the Minister outline what discussions she has already had, and will be having, with the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development concerning future allocations in

Sustainability

1. Julie James: *What consideration does the Minister give to the Welsh Government's sustainability agenda when setting the overall budget. OAQ(4)0150(FIN)*

Y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Jane Hutt): Datblygu cynaliadwy yw ein prif egwyddor drefniadol, ac mae ystyried yr effaith ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy wedi cael ei brif ffrydio i bob agwedd ar y broses o gynllunio'r gyllideb.

Julie James: Sut y mae'r £1.7 biliwn o ostyngiad yng nghyllid San Steffan i Lywodraeth Cymru yn effeithio ar sicrhau y gwneir darpariaeth briodol ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd? A fyddwch yn gallu sicrhau bod cynaliadwyedd yn dal yn sbardun allweddol sydd wrth wraidd yr holl benderfyniadau a wneir gan Lywodraeth Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol yng ngoleuni'r toriadau hynny?

Jane Hutt: Cafodd ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fel prif egwyddor drefniadol ei adlewyrchu yn y pecyn buddsoddi cyfalaf a gyhoeddais fis Mai gyda'r cynllun buddsoddi yn seilwaith Cymru, gan gynnwys y £9 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer cynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref ac amddiffyn rhag llifogydd.

Russell George: Os yw'r dull rheoli ar lefel yr ecosystem newydd—a amlinellir yn yr ymgynghoriad 'Cynnal Cymru Fyw' ac sy'n ganolog i gyflawni amcanion Llywodraeth Cymru—am lwyddo a chyflawni ei amcanion, bydd gofyn cael cyllid penodol ar ei gyfer. A all y Gweinidog amlinellu pa drafodaethau y mae eisoes wedi'u cael, ac y bydd yn eu cael, â Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy

the budget for delivering this approach?

ynghylch dyraniadau yn y gyllideb yn y dyfodol ar gyfer cyflwyno'r dull hwn?

Jane Hutt: The ecosystems approach and our dedicated focus on this is reflected in budgetary decisions and discussions. I was pleased to see that Jonathan Porritt said yesterday that Westminster should learn from Wales, and that the Welsh Government

Jane Hutt: Mae dull yr ecosystem a'n ffocws penodol ar hyn yn cael eu hadlewyrchu mewn trafodaethau a phenderfyniadau cyllidebol. Roeddwn yn falch o weld bod Jonathan Porritt wedi dweud ddoe y dylai San Steffan ddysgu gan Gymru, a bod Llywodraeth Cymru

'provides a bright light in these gloomy times'.

yn cynnig goleuni yn y cyfnod tywyll hwn.

That includes budgetary allocations.

Mae hynny'n cynnwys dyraniadau cyllidebol.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Derbyniaf fod y Gweinidog Cyllid yn gwbl ddiffuant yn ei hymroddiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, ond a yw hyn yn wir am holl weithgarwch ei Llywodraeth, yn arbennig, o bosibl, ym maes datblygu ffyrdd a thrafnidiaeth? A all y Gweinidog roi arwydd pryd y bydd yn debygol y cawn wybod beth yw effaith amgylcheddol adeiladu unrhyw draffordd ar draws gwastadeddau Gwent?

Lord Elis-Thomas: I accept that the Minister for Finance is entirely sincere in her commitment to sustainable development, but is this true of all Government activity, particularly, possibly, in the area of road development and transportation? Can the Minister give us some signal as to when we are likely to hear what the environmental impact is of building any motorway across the Gwent levels?

Jane Hutt: I have talked about the strong evidence base that we need to inform decisions, including budgetary decisions, as well as ensuring that we balance short-term implications with the long-term impact of our strategic objectives. Sustainability is key for the Minister for Local Government and Communities, as well as for all other Cabinet members.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf wedi sôn am y sylfaen dystiolaeth gadarn y mae ei hangen arnom i lywio penderfyniadau, gan gynnwys penderfyniadau cyllidebol, yn ogystal â sicrhau ein bod yn cydbwyso goblygiadau tymor byr ag effaith hirdymor ein hamcanion strategol. Mae cynaliadwyedd yn hollbwysig i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, ac i holl aelodau eraill y Cabinet hefyd.

Sefydliadau Anllywodraethol

Non-governmental Organisations

***2. Eluned Parrott:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr egwyddorion archwilio a ddefnyddir ar gyfer perthynas ariannol Llywodraeth Cymru gyda Sefydliadau Anllywodraethol. OAQ(4)0149(FIN)*

***2. Eluned Parrott:** Will the Minister make a statement on the auditing principles applied to the Welsh Government's financial relationships with Non-Governmental Organisations. OAQ(4)0149(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: The Welsh Government clearly sets out the auditing principles to be utilised in its financial relationships with non-governmental organisations in its grant offer letters.

Jane Hutt: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn nodi'n glir yn ei llythyrau cynnig grant pa egwyddorion archwilio a ddefnyddir ar gyfer ei pherthynas ariannol â sefydliadau anllywodraethol.

Eluned Parrott: In the Public Accounts Committee meeting on 24 April, Dame Gillian Morgan described a situation where

Eluned Parrott: Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus ar 24 Ebrill, disgrifiodd y Fonesig Gillian Morgan sefyllfa lle mae

third sector organisations were funded to deliver programmes as a proxy for the Welsh Government. I have asked you before whether you considered the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association to be such a proxy organisation, but you have declined to answer. Are proxy arrangements such as this subject to the same auditing procedures as the programmes that are delivered directly by the Welsh Government?

mudiadau yn y trydydd sector yn cael eu cyllido i ddarparu rhaglenni fel dirprwy ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru. Rwyf wedi gofyn ichi o'r blaen a ydych yn ystyried Cymdeithas Lleiafrifoedd Ethnig Cymru Gyfan yn fudiad dirprwy o'r fath, ond rydych wedi gwrthod ateb. A yw trefniadau dirprwy fel hyn yn ddarostyngedig i'r un gweithdrefnau archwilio â'r rhaglenni sy'n cael eu darparu'n uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth Cymru?

Jane Hutt: Clearly, AWEMA does not accord to those kinds of proxy arrangements in terms of umbrella bodies, such as, for example, the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, which has a key role to play. However, it is clear from grant-giving arrangements to individual organisations that requirements in terms of further certification, for example, of grant claims is considered on a case by case basis.

Jane Hutt: Yn amlwg, nid yw AWEMA yn cydymffurfio â'r mathau hynny o drefniadau dirprwy o ran cyrff ymbarél, fel Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru er enghraifft, sydd â rôl allweddol i'w chwarae. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg o'r trefniadau rhoi grantiau i sefydliadau unigol bod gofynion o ran ardystio pellach, er enghraifft hawliadau grant, yn cael eu hystyried fesul achos.

Suzy Davies: Much third sector work is financed from public funds, which is a welcome state of affairs. However, concerns are being raised with me by front-line providers that a growing number of layers through which funding travels makes it rather difficult to follow, and has resulted in the duplication of provision. I have also heard some accusations of cronyism. Not every case is like that of AWEMA, but, in the current environment, transparency is essential. Therefore, how can you reassure front-line providers that money is not being wasted as it is filtered through several layers?

Suzy Davies: Arian cyhoeddus sy'n cyllido llawer o waith y trydydd sector, ac mae honno'n sefyllfa i'w chroesawu. Fodd bynnag, mae darparwyr rheng flaen yn mynegi pryder wrthyf fod y system braidd yn gymhleth wrth i'r broses gyllido gynnwys mwy a mwy o haenau, ac mae hynny wedi arwain at ddyblygu darpariaeth. Rwyf hefyd wedi clywed cyhuddiadau o roi ffafriaeth i gyfeillion. Nid yw pob achos fel achos AWEMA, ond mae tryloywder yn hanfodol yn y sefyllfa bresennol. Felly, sut y gallwch dawelu meddyliau darparwyr rheng flaen nad yw arian yn cael ei wastraffu wrth iddo gael ei hidlo drwy sawl haen?

Jane Hutt: We must have a balance in terms of governance and accountability, which results in process. I am happy to share with Members the template of a reward of funding grant letter that goes to all of the organisations that we fund to see what we require. The work that we are doing with the grants management project is to ensure that we have a corporate minimum standard of grants management across the Welsh Government.

Jane Hutt: Rhaid cael cydbwysedd o ran llywodraethu ac atebolrwydd, sy'n arwain at broses. Rwyf yn fodlon dangos templed i'r Aelodau o lythyr dyfarnu grant cyllido a anfonir at yr holl sefydliadau rydym yn eu cyllido i weld beth y mae arnom ei angen. Pwrpas y gwaith a wnawn gyda'r prosiect rheoli grantiau yw sicrhau bod gennym safon ofynnol gorfforaethol ar gyfer rheoli grantiau ar draws Llywodraeth Cymru.

Bethan Jenkins: Minister, in response to a question that I asked you on 21 March this year, you said that it was important to point out that there is no practical link between the

Bethan Jenkins: Weinidog, mewn ymateb i gwestiwn a ofynnais ichi ar 21 Mawrth eleni, dywedoch ei bod yn bwysig nodi nad oes cysylltiad ymarferol rhwng yr isadran

current equality, diversity and inclusion division and the former equality policy unit, which was criticised in reports on AWEMA. Yet, on the very same day, a request for information from the equality, diversity and inclusion division was turned down by the Welsh Government's deputy director for corporate governance and assurance, on the grounds that

cydraddoldeb, amrywiaeth a chynhwysiant bresennol a'r hen uned polisi cydraddoldeb, a fu'n destun beirniadaeth mewn adroddiadau ar AWEMA. Eto, ar yr un diwrnod, cafodd cais am wybodaeth gan yr isadran cydraddoldeb, amrywiaeth a chynhwysiant ei wrthod gan ddirprwy gyfarwyddwr isadran llywodraethu corfforaethol a sicrwydd Llywodraeth Cymru, ar y sail

'the release of information would prejudice the Auditor General's review into the Welsh Government's relationship with AWEMA'.

y byddai rhyddhau gwybodaeth yn niweidiol i adolygiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol o berthynas Llywodraeth Cymru ag AWEMA.

Which one of you is right?

Pa un ohonoch sy'n iawn?

Jane Hutt: It is important for Members to take note of the latest development with the Wales Audit Office report. It has written to the First Minister to inform him that the Chair of the Public Accounts Committee has been provided with a written update on the progress of the value for money study. The letter also informed the First Minister that the Wales Audit Office now expects to publish its report at the start of the autumn term. The Wales Audit Office's field work is under way and auditors have been meeting with key individuals as part of their inquiries. The Welsh Government is co-operating fully with the WAO in the course of the study and awaits this report in the autumn term accordingly.

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig bod yr Aelodau'n cymryd sylw o'r datblygiadau diweddaraf yng nghyswllt adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. Mae wedi ysgrifennu at y Prif Weinidog i roi gwybod iddo fod Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus wedi cael diweddariad ysgrifenedig ar ddatblygiad yr astudiaeth gwerth am arian. Roedd y llythyr hefyd yn rhoi gwybod i'r Prif Weinidog fod Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn awr yn disgwyl cyhoeddi ei adroddiad ddechrau tymor yr hydref. Mae gwaith maes Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn mynd rhagddo, ac mae'r archwilwyr wedi bod yn cael cyfarfodydd ag unigolion allweddol fel rhan o'u hymholiadau. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydweithredu'n llawn â Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ystod yr astudiaeth, ac yn aros i gael yr adroddiad hwn yn nhymor yr hydref.

Blaenoriaethau

Priorities

***3. Paul Davies:** Will the Minister outline her priorities for the next 12 months. OAQ(4)0145(FIN)*

***3. Paul Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y 12 mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0145(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: Our priority continues to be supporting growth and jobs in Wales. That is why we have allocated an additional £116.5 million in the supplementary budget, of which £88.2 million is to support strategic capital investment.

Jane Hutt: Cefnogi twf a swyddi yng Nghymru yw ein blaenoriaeth o hyd. Dyna pam rydym wedi dyrannu £116.5 miliwn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb atodol, ac mae £88.2 miliwn o hynny'n mynd tuag at gefnogi buddsoddiad cyfalaf strategol.

Paul Davies: I am grateful to the Minister for that answer. One of the key priorities in my constituency is the development of the Haven waterway enterprise zone, which I welcome very much. Given that the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and

Paul Davies: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Un o'r prif flaenoriaethau yn fy etholaeth i yw datblygu ardal fenter Dyfrffordd y Ddau Gleddau, ac rwyf yn croesawu hynny'n fawr. O gofio bod y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a

Science confirmed that the Haven waterway enterprise zone was announced almost two months ago, can the Minister tell us how the enterprise zone will be specifically financed, and what discussions has she had with the Minister for business on this specific issue?

Gwyddoniaeth wedi cadarnhau bod ardal fenter Dyfrffordd y Ddau Gleddau wedi cael ei chyhoeddi bron i ddeufis yn ôl, a all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut y bydd yr ardal fenter yn cael ei chyllido'n benodol, a pha drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael â'r Gweinidog Busnes ynghylch y mater penodol hwn?

Jane Hutt: I am sure that the Member will take the opportunity to ask questions of the Minister for business this afternoon with regard to her responsibilities for promoting the enterprise zones, particularly the important Haven waterway enterprise zone. My role is to support her in ensuring that levers and, indeed, infrastructural capital investments are appropriately allocated according to business cases made to me.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelod yn achub ar y cyfle i ofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Busnes y prynhawn yma yng nghyswllt ei chyfrifoldebau i hyrwyddo'r ardaloedd menter, yn enwedig ardal fenter Dyfrffordd y Ddau Gleddau, sy'n bwysig iawn. Fy rôl i yw ei chefnogi i sicrhau bod arian ysgogi ac, yn wir, buddsoddiadau cyfalaf seilwaith, yn cael eu dyrannu'n briodol yn unol â'r achosion busnes a gyflwynir imi.

Jocelyn Davies: One of the recommendations in the recent Finance Committee report on borrowing powers relates to the possibility of the Welsh Government drawing forward capital budgets for very large scale projects. Have you had any discussions with the Treasury on this matter?

Jocelyn Davies: Mae un o'r argymhellion yn adroddiad diweddar y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar bwerau benthyg yn ymwneud â'r posibilrwydd o Lywodraeth Cymru yn dwyn ymlaen gyllidebau cyfalaf ar gyfer prosiectau mawr iawn. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau â'r Trysorlys ynghylch y mater hwn?

Jane Hutt: I congratulate the Finance Committee and its Chair, Jocelyn Davies, for the report that we have received on borrowing powers, and I look forward to responding to it. Clearly, this forms part of the intergovernmental discussions that I have been having with the Chief Secretary to the Treasury on releasing our borrowing powers in Wales.

Jane Hutt: Hoffwn longyfarch y Pwyllgor Cyllid a'i Gadeirydd, Jocelyn Davies, ar yr adroddiad ar bwerau benthyg rydym wedi'i gael, ac rwyf yn edrych ymlaen at ymateb iddo. Yn amlwg, mae hyn yn rhan o'r trafodaethau rhynglywodraethol yr wyf wedi bod yn eu cael â Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys ynghylch rhyddhau ein pwerau benthyg yng Nghymru.

Peter Black: Minister, you will know that, last week, the UK Government announced a number of projects relating to tax increment financing, including the power for cities to raise funds for local infrastructure, devolved transport budgets and controls over the skills budget and so on. Why is the Welsh Government lagging so far behind the UK Government on this, in particular around tax increment financing?

Peter Black: Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi cyhoeddi nifer o brosiectau yr wythnos diwethaf sy'n ymwneud â threfn ariannu drwy gynyddrannau treth, gan gynnwys y pŵer i ddinasoedd godi arian ar gyfer seilwaith lleol, cyllidebau trafnidiaeth datganoledig a rheolaethau dros y gyllideb sgiliau ac ati. Pam y mae Llywodraeth Cymru gymaint ar ei hôl hi ar hyn o'i chymharu â Llywodraeth y DU, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt trefn ariannu drwy gynyddrannau treth?

Jane Hutt: We are certainly not lagging behind in terms of tax increment financing; I

Jane Hutt: Yn sicr nid ydym ar ei hôl hi o ran trefn ariannu drwy gynyddrannau treth;

can assure you of that. We are looking at the most appropriate use of it, along with considering all other levers to ensure that we can use innovative financing to help secure our capital budget.

gallaf eich sicrhau yn hynny o beth. Rydym yn ystyried beth yw'r ffordd fwyaf priodol o’i defnyddio, yn ogystal ag ystyried yr holl arian ysgogi arall i sicrhau y gallwn ddefnyddio prosesau cyllido arloesol i helpu i sicrhau ein cyllideb gyfalaf.

Peter Black: You say that you are not lagging behind, yet there are already pilot projects in Scotland, England has announced its projects and money is going into the cities to create jobs and investment there; you are still looking at it. When exactly are we going to have this sort of investment in Welsh cities?

Peter Black: Rydych yn dweud nad ydych ar ei hôl hi, ac eto mae prosiectau peilot eisoes wedi'u sefydlu yn yr Alban, mae Lloegr wedi cyhoeddi ei phrosiectau ac mae arian yn cael ei mynd i ddinasoedd i greu swyddi a buddsoddiad yno; rydych chi'n dal i ystyried y mater. Pryd yn union rydym yn mynd i gael y math hwn o fuddsoddiad mewn dinasoedd yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: I think that you are aware of the limitations of tax increment financing; I certainly reported on this to the Finance Committee. However, the finance spokesperson for the Welsh Liberal Democrats will have very much welcomed and certainly influenced the schemes that we are taking forward, such as the local government borrowing initiative, on which we are leading the way in the UK. We are using those opportunities to work closely with local government and to secure and lever in funding for a highways programme across the whole of Wales.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn meddwl eich bod yn ymwybodol o gyfyngiadau trefn ariannu drwy gynyddrannau treth; rwyf yn sicr wedi adrodd ar hyn wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid. Fodd bynnag, byddai llefarydd cyllid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi croesawu'n fawr y cynlluniau rydym yn bwrw ymlaen â hwy ac yn sicr wedi dylanwadu arnynt, fel menter benthyca llywodraeth leol, ac rydym yn arwain y ffordd ar hynny yn y DU. Rydym yn defnyddio'r cyfleoedd hynny i weithio'n agos gyda llywodraeth leol, ac i sicrhau a denu cyllid ar gyfer rhaglen priffyrdd ar draws Cymru gyfan.

Cydraddoldeb

Equality

***4. Rebecca Evans:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer darparu cydraddoldeb yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0152(FIN)*

***4. Rebecca Evans**: Will the Minister make a statement on her priorities for delivering equality in Wales. OAQ(4)0152(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: Our equality priorities are set out in chapter 8 of the programme for government. In addition, I launched the strategic equality plan in April, which will help us to deliver a positive difference to the people of Wales.

Jane Hutt: Mae ein blaenoriaethau cydraddoldeb wedi'u nodi ym mhennod 8 y rhaglen lywodraethu. Hefyd, gwneuthum lansio’r cynllun cydraddoldeb strategol ym mis Ebrill, a fydd yn ein helpu i wneud gwahaniaeth cadarnhaol i bobl Cymru.

Rebecca Evans: Thank you for that answer, Minister. A total of 38 Welsh athletes have been selected for Team GB for the London 2012 Paralympics and will compete across 13 sports. That continues Wales’s proud heritage as one of the world’s most prominent Paralympic nations. Will you join me in celebrating this, and outline how the Welsh Government is challenging disability in

Rebecca Evans: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae cyfanswm o 38 o athletwyr o Gymru wedi cael eu dewis yn Nhîm Prydain Fawr ar gyfer Gemau Paralympaidd Llundain 2012, a byddant yn cystadlu mewn 13 camp. Mae hynny'n parhau â threftadaeth falch Cymru fel un o wledydd Paralympaidd mwyaf blaenllaw'r byd. A wnewch ymuno â mi i ddathlu hyn, ac

sport?

amlinellu sut mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn herio anabledd mewn chwaraeon?

Jane Hutt: I certainly do join you in celebrating this. I am sure that everyone in the Chamber would want to congratulate the 38 Welsh athletes who have been selected to represent Team GB. That is a fantastic achievement and we want to thank their coaches and clubs and the volunteers who support the development of disability sport. I know that the Minister with responsibility for sports has already done that, but I wanted to make the point that working through Disability Sport Wales is the key route, with Sport Wales, to create more opportunities for people with a disability. Last year, it delivered over 1 million opportunities.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn sicr yn ymuno â chi i ddathlu hyn. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddai pawb yn y Siambr yn dymuno llongyfarch y 38 o athletwyr o Gymru sydd wedi cael eu dewis i gynrychioli Tîm Prydain Fawr. Mae hynny'n gamp aruthrol, a hoffem ddiolch i'w hyfforddwyr a'u clybiau ac i'r gwirfoddolwyr sy'n cefnogi datblygiad chwaraeon anabledd. Gwn fod y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am chwaraeon eisoes wedi gwneud hynny, ond roeddwn am wneud y pwynt mai gweithio drwy Chwaraeon Anabledd Cymru yw'r llwybr allweddol, gyda Chwaraeon Cymru, i greu mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl ag anabledd. Y llynedd, darparodd dros 1 miliwn o gyfleoedd.

Mohammad Asghar: An important priority in delivering equality is the provision of effective advice services. Those assist vulnerable people to understand and to exercise their rights to make informed choices. Will you provide an update on how the Welsh Government’s ministerial task and finish group on welfare reform intends to deliver efficient and effective advice services in Wales?

Mohammad Asghar: Un flaenoriaeth bwysig wrth sicrhau cydraddoldeb yw darparu gwasanaethau cynghori effeithiol. Mae'r rheini'n cynorthwyo pobl agored i niwed i ddeall ac i arfer eu hawliau i wneud dewisiadau cytbwys. A wnewch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y modd y mae grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen gweinidogol Llywodraeth Cymru ar ddiwygio lles yn bwriadu sicrhau gwasanaethau cynghori effeithlon ac effeithiol yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: I am sure that you will join with us to deprecate the cut to legal aid and the reduction in grant for advice services, which we are now trying to support. Spending cuts have also affected the Equality and Human Rights Commission, which will have a profound impact in Wales in terms of its advice-giving role. The Minister for Local Government and Communities and I have instigated a review of advice services and a strategic objective in our equality plan shows the commitment of the Welsh Government to tackle this issue.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymuno â ni i wrthwynebu’r toriadau cymorth cyfreithiol a'r lleihad yn y grant ar gyfer gwasanaethau cynghori, yr ydym yn ceisio eu cefnogi yn awr. Mae toriadau gwariant hefyd wedi effeithio ar y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol, a bydd hynny’n cael effaith ddifrifol yng Nghymru o ran ei rôl gynghori. Mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau a minnau wedi dechrau adolygiad o wasanaethau cynghori, ac mae amcan strategol yn ein cynllun cydraddoldeb yn dangos ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn.

Lindsay Whittle: Despite a miniscule drop in recent figures, unemployment has still soared by 17,000 since you entered office last year. What is particularly worrying is that a trend is being set in Wales of women increasingly bearing the brunt of the problem, with 15,000 women having lost their jobs since May 2011. That is not reflected in other

Lindsay Whittle: Er gwaethaf gostyngiad bach iawn yn y ffigurau diweddar, mae lefel diweithdra yn dal wedi cynyddu 17,000 ers ichi ddechrau ar eich swydd y llynedd. Yr hyn sy'n destun pryder mawr yw bod patrwm yn cael ei osod yng Nghymru lle mai menywod sy’n ysgwyddo’r broblem fwyfwy, gyda 15,000 o fenywod wedi colli eu swyddi

UK nations; I reiterate that it is a Welsh trend. Could you update the Assembly on what specific actions you are taking to tackle this issue?

ers mis Mai 2011. Nid yw hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yng ngwledydd eraill y DU; rwyf yn dweud eto mai patrwm yng Nghymru yw hyn. A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad am y camau penodol rydych yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn?

Jane Hutt: I know that you will join me in welcoming the Jobs Growth Wales scheme, which is now being initiated by the Deputy Minister for Skills and by the Minister for Education and Skills, to ensure that young people have opportunities—and there will be a good gender balance in terms of opportunities for young people—with 4,000 job and training opportunities this year and over the next three years. That will ensure that our young people, including young women, have opportunities. We are in this position as a result of the UK Government's policies and we have to do all that we can in the Welsh Government to secure an uplift for our young people—women in particular.

Jane Hutt: Gwn y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i groesawu cynllun Twf Swyddi Cymru, sy'n cael ei lansio gan y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau yn awr, i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael cyfleoedd—a bydd cydbwysedd da rhwng y rhywiau o ran cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc—gyda 4,000 o gyfleoedd hyfforddi a swyddi eleni a dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau bod ein pobl ifanc, gan gynnwys menywod ifanc, yn cael cyfleoedd. Rydym yn y sefyllfa hon o ganlyniad i bolisïau Llywodraeth y DU, ac mae'n rhaid i ni yn Llywodraeth Cymru wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau y bydd pethau'n gwella i'n pobl ifanc—ac i fenywod yn arbennig.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 5, OAQ(4)0154(FIN), is withdrawn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae Cwestiwn 5, OAQ(4)0154(FIN), wedi cael ei dynnu'n ôl.

Pwerau Benthyg

Borrowing Powers

6. Simon Thomas: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwerau benthyg Llywodraeth Cymru. OAQ(4)0142(FIN)*

6. Simon Thomas: *Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's borrowing powers. OAQ(4)0142(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: Mae trafodaethau yn parhau gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan ar alluogi Llywodraeth Cymru i fenthyca er mwyn buddsoddi mewn seilwaith a chefnogi'r economi**.**

Jane Hutt: Discussions with the Westminster Government on enabling the Welsh Government to borrow to invest in infrastructure and support the economy are continuing.

Simon Thomas: Fel rydych wedi'i ddweud, mae'r Prif Weinidog ei hun yn teimlo bod y pwerau benthyca hyn yn hanfodol i dwf economi Cymru. Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu yn benodol i drafod gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan, y tu allan i gomisiwn Silk, ynglŷn â chael y grymoedd benthyg hyn. Mae blwyddyn wleidyddol gyfan a blwyddyn gyllidol gyfan wedi mynd heibio; pryd rydych yn credu y cawn ni, yng Nghymru, y pwerau benthyg hollbwysig hyn?

Simon Thomas: As you have said, the First Minister himself feels that these borrowing powers are essential for Wales's economic growth. Your Government has specifically resolved to discuss with the Westminster Government, outwith the Silk commission, about the possibility of being given these borrowing powers. A full political year and a full financial year have passed; when do you think that we, in Wales, will have these crucial borrowing powers?

1.45 p.m.

Jane Hutt: We need borrowing powers to support the economic recovery. This follows

Jane Hutt: Mae angen pwerau benthyg arnom i gefnogi'r adferiad economaidd. Mae

up the previous question from Lindsay Whittle. Of course, Simon Thomas, you will know that those inter-governmental discussions with the Treasury are ongoing. We want to use our existing borrowing powers and, as you say, in parallel, the Silk commission is looking at devolving additional fiscal powers to Wales. The borrowing powers are the first step and we are progressing with those talks.

Paul Davies: In response to a question that I asked you about borrowing powers in a Finance Committee meeting on 16 May, you said:

'in the medium term, we think that our borrowing powers should be in a new and firmer framework and one that provides us with assurances that the UK Government will not restrict our borrowing powers in the future.'

Can you, therefore, tell us exactly what kind of framework you would like to see put in place?

Jane Hutt: Clearly, we have our borrowing powers. The point that I was making in the Finance Committee was that we had to ensure that we could use those borrowing powers with the agreement of the UK Government, to ensure that it did not have an impact on our block grant. That is the basis of our discussions with the Treasury and the Chief Secretary to the Treasury. We will, of course, look very closely at the Holtham commission in terms of the way in which we could use those borrowing powers. I particularly favour devolution of the broadest possible range of borrowing powers, but they have to be consistent with the UK Government's interest on the macro-economic level. It is also for the Silk commission to have a view on a broader framework for devolved borrowing, to be developed over time.

Paul Davies: As you are aware, Minister, both Scotland and Northern Ireland have borrowing limits, as defined in the Scotland Act 2012 and the reinvestment and reform initiative respectively. During your negotiations with the Treasury on the issue of

hyn yn dilyn y cwestiwn blaenorol gan Lindsay Whittle. Wrth gwrs, Simon Thomas, byddwch yn gwybod bod y trafodaethau rhynglywodraethol hynny â'r Trysorlys yn parhau. Rydym am ddefnyddio ein pwerau benthyg presennol ac ochr yn ochr â hynny mae'r Comisiwn Silk, fel y dywedwch, yn edrych ar ddatganoli pwerau ariannol ychwanegol i Gymru. Y pwerau benthyg yw'r cam cyntaf, ac rydym yn symud ymlaen â'r trafodaethau hynny.

Paul Davies: Mewn ymateb i gwestiwn a ofynnais ichi am bwerau benthyg yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar 16 Mai, dywedoch:

yn y tymor canolig, rydym yn credu y dylai ein pwerau benthyg fod mewn fframwaith newydd a chadarnach sy'n rhoi sicrwydd inni na fydd Llywodraeth y DU yn cyfyngu ein pwerau benthyg yn y dyfodol.

Felly, a allwch ddweud wrthym yn union pa fath o fframwaith y byddech yn dymuno ei weld yn cael ei roi ar waith?

Jane Hutt: Yn amlwg, mae gennym ein pwerau benthyg. Y pwynt roeddwn yn ei wneud yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid oedd ei bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau y gallem ddefnyddio'r pwerau benthyg hynny gyda chytundeb Llywodraeth y DU, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'n effeithio ar ein grant bloc. Dyna yw sail ein trafodaethau â'r Trysorlys a Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys. Wrth gwrs, byddwn yn edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y Comisiwn Holtham o ran y ffordd y gallem ddefnyddio'r pwerau benthyg hynny. Rwyf o blaid datganoli'r ystod ehangaf bosibl o bwerau benthyg yn arbennig, ond rhaid iddynt fod yn gyson â buddiant Llywodraeth y DU ar y lefel macro-economaidd. Hefyd, lle'r Comisiwn Silk yw llunio barn ar fframwaith ehangach ar gyfer benthyca datganoledig, i'w ddatblygu dros amser.

Paul Davies: Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae gan yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon derfynau benthyca, fel y diffinnir yn Neddf yr Alban 2012 ac yn y fenter ail-fuddsoddi a diwygio. Yn ystod eich negodiadau â'r Trysorlys ynghylch pwerau benthyg, a all y

borrowing powers, can the Minister confirm whether the Welsh Government is looking to gain these powers on the same level and with the same sorts of arrangements as the other UK devolved administrations?

Gweinidog gadarnhau a yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn gobeithio cael y pwerau hyn ar yr un lefel a chyda'r un math o drefniadau â gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill y DU?

Jane Hutt: Certainly. That is the basis on which I am having my discussions. It is very important that we look at the borrowing limits. For example, under the Scotland Act, Scotland will have a capital borrowing limit of £2.2 billion, which is about 8% of its total annual departmental expenditure limit. The figure for Northern Ireland is up to £3 billion. We need to ensure that we have a similar percentage limit for Wales, which would be worth around £1.2 billion. Of course, it has to accord to the projects that we want to finance with those borrowing powers.

Jane Hutt: Yn sicr. Dyna yw sail fy nhrafodaethau. Mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn edrych ar y terfynau benthyca. Er enghraifft, o dan Ddeddf yr Alban, bydd gan yr Alban derfyn benthyca cyfalaf o £2.2 biliwn, sef tua 8 y cant o gyfanswm ei therfyn gwariant adrannol blynyddol. Hyd at £3 biliwn yw'r ffigur ar gyfer Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym derfyn canran tebyg ar gyfer Cymru, a fyddai werth tua £1.2 biliwn. Wrth gwrs, mae'n rhaid ei fod yn cyd-fynd â'r prosiectau rydym yn dymuno eu cyllido gyda'r pwerau benthyg hynny.

Ardal Bae Abertawe

The Swansea Bay Region

7. David Rees: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer ardal Bae Abertawe dros y 12 mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0155(FIN)*

7. David Rees: *Will the Minister outline her priorities for the Swansea Bay region over the next 12 months. OAQ(4)0155(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: As in all parts of Wales, our priorities continue to be supporting the economic recovery in Wales, safeguarding and improving front-line public services and protecting the most vulnerable**.**

Jane Hutt: Fel ym mhob rhan o Gymru, cefnogi’r adferiad economaidd yng Nghymru, diogelu a gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus rheng flaen, ac amddiffyn y bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yw ein blaenoriaethau o hyd.

David Rees: Thank you for that answer, Minister. In my constituency, there are two permanent sites for Travellers, which have been in existence for many years. Clearly, as time moves on, there is a greater need to repair and update these sites to ensure that they remain fit for purpose. What obligations has the Welsh Government placed upon local authorities to maintain Traveller sites, to ensure that they meet the required standards? How will the Welsh Government encourage all groups to establish a greater integration of the residents of these sites with the communities within which they reside?

David Rees: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yn fy etholaeth i, ceir dau safle parhaol ar gyfer Teithwyr, sy'n bodoli ers blynyddoedd lawer. Yn amlwg, wrth i amser fynd heibio, mae mwy o angen atgyweirio a diweddaru'r safleoedd hyn er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn parhau'n addas i'r pwrpas. Pa rwymedigaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u gosod ar awdurdodau lleol i gynnal safleoedd ar gyfer Teithwyr, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn bodloni'r safonau gofynnol? Sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn annog pob grŵp i sicrhau gwell integreiddiad rhwng trigolion y safleoedd hyn a'r cymunedau lle maent yn byw?

Jane Hutt: I thank the Member for that question. Planning circular 76/94 sets out that local authorities should maintain existing Gypsy and Traveller sites, which is the point

Jane Hutt: Diolch i’r Aelod am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae cylchlythyr cynllunio 76/94 yn nodi y dylai awdurdodau lleol gynnal y safleoedd presennol ar gyfer Sipsiwn a

of your question, but should also make suitable arrangements for their maintenance. That can be by leasing them to other people or partners who are willing and able to maintain them. We also have a grant scheme for the refurbishment of existing sites, which is now a 100% grant-funding arrangement. It is important that, in the delivery of the Equality Act 2010, we are taking forward a community cohesion strategy for Wales in ‘Travelling to a Better Future: Gypsy and Traveller Framework for Action and Delivery Plan’, in terms of community cohesion and good relations.

Theithwyr, a dyna yw hanfod eich cwestiwn, ond y dylent hefyd wneud trefniadau addas ar gyfer eu cynnal a'u cadw. Gall hynny olygu eu prydlesu i bobl eraill neu i bartneriaid sy'n fodlon ac yn gallu eu cynnal. Mae gennym hefyd gynllun grant ar gyfer adnewyddu safleoedd presennol, sydd bellach yn drefniant sy'n cynnig 100 y cant o'r arian grant. Mae'n bwysig ein bod, wrth gyflwyno Deddf Cydraddoldeb 2010, yn bwrw ymlaen â strategaeth cydlyniant cymunedol Cymru yn ‘Teithio at Ddyfodol Gwell: Fframwaith Gweithredu a Chynllun Cyflenwi ar gyfer Sipsiwn a Theithwyr’, o ran cydlyniant cymunedol a pherthynas dda.

Byron Davies: Minister, it seems that, today, your Government will accept the premise of a city region concept. This will greatly enhance the attractiveness of Swansea bay and the surrounding region over the coming years and is welcomed wholeheartedly, if true. What are the financial implications of moving to a city region concept? What discussions have you had with officials and Ministers about this and have you outlaid any finance to support a regional model for strategic planning and development?

Byron Davies: Weinidog, mae'n ymddangos y bydd eich Llywodraeth, heddiw, yn derbyn y cynnig o gysyniad dinas-ranbarth. Bydd hyn yn cynyddu atyniad Bae Abertawe a'r cyffiniau yn sylweddol dros y blynyddoedd nesaf ac fe'i croesewir yn llwyr, os yw'n wir. Beth yw goblygiadau ariannol symud i gysyniad dinas-ranbarth? Pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael â swyddogion a Gweinidogion ynghylch hyn, ac a ydych wedi gwario unrhyw arian i gefnogi model rhanbarthol ar gyfer datblygu a chynllunio strategol?

Jane Hutt: I am sure that the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science will be pleased about your positive response, Byron Davies. We await her statement this afternoon, which I warmly welcome, and I will be working with her to support the aims and objectives to achieve a positive outcome in terms of those proposals for city regions.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth yn falch o'ch ymateb cadarnhaol, Byron Davies. Rydym yn aros am ei datganiad y prynhawn yma—ac rwyf yn croesawu hynny’n fawr—a byddaf yn gweithio gyda hi i gefnogi'r nodau a'r amcanion er mwyn sicrhau canlyniad cadarnhaol yng nghyswllt y cynigion hynny ar gyfer dinas-ranbarthau.

Bethan Jenkins: A yw’r Gweinidog wedi derbyn cyfathrebiad gan unrhyw un o’i chyd-weithwyr gweinidogol am gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer unrhyw wasanaethau iechyd yn ardal bae Abertawe?

Bethan Jenkins: Has the Minister received correspondence from any of her ministerial colleagues about additional funding for any health services in the Swansea bay area?

Jane Hutt: Clearly, we have had scrutiny of the supplementary budget last week in the Finance Committee, which was very valuable. I was able to make announcements of capital allocations under the Wales infrastructure investment plan this year, so there have been additional capital allocations in the budget for 2012-13.

Jane Hutt: Yn amlwg, rydym wedi craffu ar y gyllideb atodol yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ac roedd hynny'n ddefnyddiol iawn. Roeddwn yn gallu gwneud cyhoeddiadau ynghylch dyraniadau cyfalaf o dan y cynllun buddsoddi yn seilwaith Cymru eleni, felly cafwyd dyraniadau cyfalaf ychwanegol yn y gyllideb ar gyfer 2012-13.

Cyllid ar gyfer GIG Cymru

8. Darren Millar: *Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i ba mor ddigonol oedd y cyllid ar gyfer GIG Cymru wrth bennu'r gyllideb gyffredinol ar gyfer y portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. OAQ(4)0144(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: The priority that we place on front-line services was reflected in the additional £288 million allocated to the health service that was set out in the final budget approved in December.

Darren Millar: Emergency bailouts, or what you call brokerage, have left LHBs with even bigger deficits to make up this year. The Wales Audit Office has said that additional funding to manage these deficits is not sustainable, and we know that even what the Welsh Government feels is an appropriate efficiency savings target of 5% is being exceeded this year in terms of the stretch that you are expecting local health boards to take. Will you look again at your budget to see what you can do in order to alleviate the problems that your record-breaking cuts are causing the Welsh NHS?

Jane Hutt: The record-breaking cut to our budget by the UK Government—a 12% cut of £1.8 billion—has a huge impact on how we deliver our front-line services. The Wales Audit Office has recognised the achievement of NHS organisations in meeting their financial targets and the fact that we are taking a prudent course of action to support them. However, I must put the record straight: there has been no bailout in terms of the support for three local health boards. [*Interruption.*] If I may finish this point, Darren Millar, those health boards were allowed to draw down a small percentage of the future year's funding in order to provide some flexibility to manage their finances across the financial year end. There is an external review of these organisations' financial plans. This was flexibility that other public and private sector organisations would expect in the management of their finances.

Funding for the Welsh NHS

8. Darren Millar: *What consideration did the Minister give to the adequacy of funding for the Welsh NHS when setting the overall budget for the Health and Social Services portfolio. OAQ(4)0144(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: Cafodd y flaenoriaeth a roddwn i wasanaethau rheng flaen ei hadlewyrchu yn y £288 miliwn ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a nodwyd yn y gyllideb derfynol a gymeradwywyd fis Rhagfyr.

Darren Millar: Oherwydd bod rhai byrddau iechyd lleol wedi gorfod cael eu hachub ar frys—neu'r hyn rydych chi'n ei alw'n froceriaeth—mae gan fyrddau iechyd lleol hyd yn oed mwy o ddiffygion ariannol eleni. Mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wedi dweud nad yw cyllid ychwanegol i reoli'r diffygion hyn yn gynaliadwy, a gwyddom fod hyd yn oed yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei deimlo sy'n darged arbedion effeithlonrwydd priodol, sef 5 y cant, yn cael ei ymestyn eleni o ran yr hyn rydych yn disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd lleol ei gyflawni. A wnewch ailedrych ar eich cyllideb i weld beth y gallwch ei wneud i leddfu'r problemau y mae eich toriadau mwy nag erioed yn eu hachosi i GIG Cymru.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r toriad mwyaf erioed i'n cyllideb gan Lywodraeth y DU—£1.8 biliwn, sy'n 12 y cant o doriad—yn cael effaith enfawr ar y modd rydym yn darparu ein gwasanaethau rheng flaen. Mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wedi cydnabod cyflawniad sefydliadau'r GIG i gyrraedd eu targedau ariannol, a'r ffaith ein bod yn eu cefnogi mewn ffordd ddoeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid imi egluro'r sefyllfa'n iawn: ni chafodd y tri bwrdd iechyd lleol eu hachub. [*Torri ar draws.*] Os caf orffen y pwynt hwn, Darren Millar, caniatawyd i'r byrddau iechyd hynny ddwyn ymlaen ganran fach o gyllid y flwyddyn ganlynol er mwyn darparu rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd i reoli eu sefyllfa ariannol ar draws diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol. Ceir adolygiad allanol o gynlluniau ariannol y sefydliadau hyn. Hyblygrwydd oedd hyn, rhywbeth y byddai sefydliadau eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat

yn ei ddisgwyl wrth reoli eu sefyllfa ariannol.

Aled Roberts: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr wedi penderfynu trosglwyddo gwasanaethau trawma i Stoke. Mae'n debyg, o fewn yr ad-drefnu, y bydd gwasanaethau eraill yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Loegr. Fel rhan o'r cytundeb rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru a'r un yn Lloegr, mae'r gwasanaeth yn Lloegr yn mynnu taliadau trwy ganlyniadau. A yw eich adran wedi cael unrhyw wybodaeth gan y bwrdd iechyd ac a ydych yn fodlon bod ganddo'r cyllid i wneud yr holl drosglwyddo hwn?

Aled Roberts: You will be aware that Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board has decided to transfer trauma services to Stoke. It appears that, within the reorganisation, other services will be transferred to England. As part of the agreement between the NHS in Wales and in England, the service in England insists on results-based payments. Has your department received any information from the health board and are you content that it has adequate finance to make all these transfers?

Jane Hutt: These are important issues in terms of the transfer of patient services. Our financial arrangements and proprieties are not only acknowledged but delivered cross-Governmentally to safeguard patient services.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig o ran trosglwyddo gwasanaethau cleifion. Mae ein trefniadau ariannol a'n priodoldeb yn cael eu cydnabod a'u darparu ar draws y Llywodraeth er mwyn diogelu gwasanaethau cleifion.

Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau

Local Government and Communities

9. Jenny Rathbone: *Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i gymell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i gydweithio'n agosach wrth ddyrannu'r gyllideb gyffredinol ar gyfer Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau. OAQ(4)0148(FIN)*

9. Jenny Rathbone: *What consideration did the Minister give to incentivising public services to work more closely together when allocating the overall budget for Local Government and Communities. OAQ(4)0148(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: I work closely with the Minister for Local Government and Communities when setting the overall budget for the Welsh Government to understand the range of financial issues within his portfolio.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau wrth osod y gyllideb gyffredinol ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru er mwyn deall yr amrywiaeth o faterion ariannol yn ei bortffolio.

Jenny Rathbone: There is a wide range of variation in the way that local government carries out its duties. How are we using programmes like the invest-to-save fund to encourage the least-well-performing local authorities to rise up to the performance levels of the best-performing authorities?

Jenny Rathbone: Ceir amrywiaeth fawr o ran y ffordd y mae llywodraeth leol yn cyflawni ei dyletswyddau. Sut rydym yn defnyddio rhaglenni fel y gronfa buddsoddi i arbed i annog yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n perfformio waethaf i wella eu perfformiad er mwyn cyrraedd lefelau perfformio'r awdurdodau sy'n perfformio orau?

Jane Hutt: The Minister for Local Government and Communities has set up a public services leadership group to ensure that we have consistent national leadership on public services reform. The invest-to-save fund plays an important role. It offers a

Jane Hutt: Mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau wedi sefydlu grŵp arweinwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym arweiniad cenedlaethol cyson yng nghyswllt diwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae gan y gronfa

funding route to help public service organisations make the transition to more efficient and innovative forms of public service delivery, and £52 million has been invested to date.

buddsoddi i arbed ran bwysig i'w chwarae. Mae'n cynnig llwybr cyllido i helpu sefydliadau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i newid i ffyrdd mwy effeithlon ac arloesol o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac mae £52 miliwn wedi cael ei fuddsoddi hyd yma.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Minister, the recently published 'Shared Purpose—Shared Delivery' document highlights the centrality of collaboration and multi-agency working across Government, local government and other agencies. However, I am disappointed to see that your Government's substance misuse allocation has once again been shifted from the local government budget to the health budget. This is the third such journey that this particular spending programme area has made. Is it not the case that a game of fiscal ping pong is being played by the Welsh Government with regard to the substance misuse budget? What guarantees can you give that money transferred from the local government budget will go solely towards tackling substance misuse, and not towards financing yet another costly health board bailout?

Janet Finch-Saunders: Weinidog, mae'r ddogfen 'Cydamcanu—cydymdrechu' a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, yn tynnu sylw at elfen ganolog cydweithio a gweithio aml-asiantaeth ar draws y Llywodraeth, llywodraeth leol ac asiantaethau eraill. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn siomedig o weld bod dyraniad eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer camddefnyddio sylweddau unwaith eto wedi cael ei symud o'r gyllideb llywodraeth leol i'r gyllideb iechyd. Dyma'r trydydd tro i'r rhaglen wariant benodol hon gael ei symud fel hyn. Onid yw'n wir fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn chwarae gêm ping pong ariannol o ran y gyllideb camddefnyddio sylweddau? Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y bydd arian a drosglwyddir o'r gyllideb llywodraeth leol yn mynd yn gyfan gwbl tuag at fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau, ac nid tuag at gyllido'r gwaith drud o achub bwrdd iechyd arall?

Jane Hutt: Clearly, Janet Finch-Saunders does not understand the importance of joint financing and the shared objectives of the Welsh Government, in terms of delivering for some of the most vulnerable people in Wales with appropriate policy drivers for tackling substance misuse. That is clearly what is driving this kind of policy change and budgetary transfer.

Jane Hutt: Yn amlwg, nid yw Janet Finch-Saunders yn deall pa mor bwysig yw cyllido ar y cyd a chydamcanion Llywodraeth Cymru, o ran darparu ar gyfer rhai o'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yng Nghymru gyda sbardunwyr polisi priodol ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau. Mae'n amlwg mai dyna sy'n gyrru'r math hwn o newid polisi a throsglwyddo cyllidebol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, o ran llywodraeth leol yn darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a fyddech yn cytuno â mi ei bod yn bwysig bod llywodraeth leol yn cydweithio â phapurau newydd lleol er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl o fewn y sir berthnasol yn ymwybodol o'r gwasanaethau hynny? A fyddech yn condemnio llywodraeth leol a fyddai'n penderfynu peidio â hysbysebu mewn papur newydd lleol oherwydd ei bod yn anghytuno â phwyslais stori a ymddangosodd yn y papur hwnnw?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, regarding local government providing public services, would you agree with me that it is important that local government collaborates with local newspapers in order to ensure that people in the relevant county are aware of those services? Would you condemn local authorities that decide to stop advertising in a local newspaper because they disagree with the emphasis of a story that appeared in that newspaper?

Jane Hutt: I am not aware of a particular incident of that kind, although I am sure that you are locally. I think that this is a matter on

Jane Hutt: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o ddigwyddiad penodol o'r math hwnnw, ond rwyf yn siŵr eich bod chi'n ymwybodol o

which the Minister for Local Government and Communities should respond.

ddigwyddiad lleol o’r math hwnnw. Rwyf yn meddwl fod hwn yn fater y dylai'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ymateb iddo.

Troseddau Casineb

Hate Crime

10. Mohammad Asghar: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fynd i’r afael â throseddau casineb yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0146(FIN)*

10. Mohammad Asghar: *Will the Minister make a statement on tackling hate crime in Wales. OAQ(4)0146(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: The Welsh Government will deliver a hate crime framework for action in Wales in 2013. Extensive engagement has begun, and I have recently announced an online survey and research into the perpetrators of hate crime.

Jane Hutt: Bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn cyflwyno fframwaith gweithredu ar droseddau casineb yng Nghymru yn 2013. Mae'r gwaith ymgysylltu eang wedi dechrau, ac rwyf wedi cyhoeddi arolwg ar-lein ac ymchwil yn ddiweddar ynghylch y rheini sy'n cyflawni troseddau casineb.

Mohammad Asghar: Thank you for that reply, Minister. A recent report by Mencap Cymru revealed that nine out of 10 people with learning disabilities have experienced some form of bullying or disability hate crime. However, the number of people who report these crimes is far lower, because many victims are reluctant to come forward, for fear of attracting further abuse or of not being taken seriously. Do you agree, Minister, that people with a learning disability have a right to live independent lives, free of fear and abuse? Also, what are you doing to encourage the reporting of such hate crime in Wales?

Mohammad Asghar: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Dangosodd adroddiad diweddar gan Mencap Cymru bod naw o bob 10 person ag anableddau dysgu wedi profi rhyw fath o fwlio neu droseddau casineb ar sail anabledd. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer y bobl sy'n riportio'r troseddau hyn yn is o lawer, oherwydd mae nifer o ddioddefwyr yn gyndyn o sôn am y peth, gan eu bod ofn y byddai hynny'n arwain at fwy o gam-drin neu na fyddent yn cael eu cymryd o ddifrif. A ydych yn cytuno, Weinidog, bod gan bobl ag anableddau dysgu hawl i fyw bywydau annibynnol, heb fyw mewn ofn na phrofi camdriniaeth? Hefyd, beth ydych yn ei wneud i annog riportio troseddau casineb o'r fath yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: I certainly support that question. I am sure that the Member, along with other Members here, will be aware of the important work carried out by Mencap Cymru. I recently spoke at an event during Learning Disability Week. At that event, we launched the online survey, which provides organisations and people across Wales with the opportunity to provide information at an early stage. I also welcome the work that has been undertaken by Cardiff and Manchester universities to develop research in this important area.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn sicr yn cefnogi'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelod, ynghyd ag Aelodau eraill yma, yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith pwysig a wneir gan Mencap Cymru. Bûm yn siarad mewn digwyddiad yn ystod yr Wythnos Anableddau Dysgu yn ddiweddar. Yn y digwyddiad hwnnw, gwnaethom lansio'r arolwg ar-lein, sy'n rhoi cyfle i sefydliadau a phobl o bob cwr o Gymru ddarparu gwybodaeth yn gynnar. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu'r gwaith sydd wedi cael ei wneud gan brifysgolion Caerdydd a Manceinion i ddatblygu ymchwil yn y maes pwysig hwn.

Lindsay Whittle: Many cases of hate crime—whether they are in the context of

Lindsay Whittle: Mae nifer o achosion o droseddau casineb—boed yng nghyd-destun

disability, sexual orientation, ethnicity or otherwise—stem from social attitudes spawned at the roots of society, such as in schools. It is clear that action is needed in schools to guide and shape attitudes from the very outset. What assurances can you give, Minister, that the Welsh Government will be ensuring that schools in Wales are making every effort to prevent and help eliminate hate crime against vulnerable pupils?

anabledd, cyfeiriadedd rhywiol, ethnigrwydd neu gyd-destun arall—yn deillio o agweddau cymdeithasol sydd wrth wraidd cymdeithas, fel mewn ysgolion. Mae'n amlwg bod angen gweithredu mewn ysgolion i lywio a siapio agweddau o'r dechrau un. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei gynnig, Weinidog, y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwneud yn siŵr bod ysgolion yng Nghymru yn gwneud eu gorau glas i atal a helpu i ddileu troseddau casineb yn erbyn disgyblion agored i niwed?

2.00 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I welcome that question. This is a key priority across the Welsh Government in terms of portfolio responsibilities. We have stakeholder groups from across the protected characteristics to address these issues. There are nine policy areas, and tackling bullying in schools is a key part of that. Also, the work being taken forward through the Department for Education and Skills is clearly addressing the negative stereotypes and attitudes that need to be tackled.

Jane Hutt: Rwyf yn croesawu'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae hyn yn flaenoriaeth allweddol ar draws Llywodraeth Cymru o ran cyfrifoldebau portffolio. Mae gennym grwpiau rhanddeiliaid ar gyfer pob un o’r nodweddion gwarchodedig i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Ceir naw maes polisi, ac mae mynd i'r afael â bwlio mewn ysgolion yn rhan allweddol o hynny. Hefyd, mae'n amlwg bod y gwaith a wneir drwy'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn mynd i'r afael â'r stereoteipiau a'r agweddau negyddol y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy.

Cynlluniau Rheilffyrdd

Rail Schemes

11. Simon Thomas: *Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi’u cael ynghylch sicrhau cyllid ychwanegol i’r gyllideb Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar gyfer cynlluniau rheilffyrdd. OAQ(4)0141(FIN)*

11. Simon Thomas: *What representations has the Minister received regarding securing additional funding for the Local Government and Communities budget for rail schemes. OAQ(4)0141(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: Mae’r cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol yn nodi blaenoriaethau’r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar gyfer ei gyllideb drafnidiaeth.

Jane Hutt: The prioritised national transport plan sets out the priorities of the Minister for Local Government and Communities and his transport budget.

Simon Thomas: Mae dryswch cynyddol ymysg mudiadau sy’n chwilio am gyfleoedd i wella ein gwasanaethau rheilffordd—rwy’n sôn yn benodol am gynllun i gael gorsafoedd rheilffordd newydd yn Bow Street a Charno—ynglŷn ag ai o Lywodraeth Cymru y byddai’r arian yn dod ynteu drwy gonsortia trafnidiaeth rhanbarthol. A oes modd torri drwy’r dryswch hwn â bach o feddwl blaengar ar eich rhan fel y Gweinidog Cyllid ac edrych i sefydlu menter gyllidol newydd, tebyg i’r un ar gyfer trwsio’r ffyrdd gyda llywodraeth leol, a fyddai’n caniatáu i’r cynlluniau hyn fynd yn eu blaenau a pheidio â chael eu hoedi oherwydd aros am bwerau

Simon Thomas: There is increasing confusion among organisations seeking opportunities to improve our rail service—I am talking specifically about a plan for new railway stations in Bow Street and Carno—as to whether the funding would come from the Welsh Government or through the regional transport consortia. Could we eradicate some of this confusion with some innovative thinking on your part as Minister for Finance and look to establish a new funding enterprise, similar to that for repairing the roads with local government, that would allow these schemes to progress and not to be delayed while we await borrowing powers?

benthyca?

Jane Hutt: The national transport plan sets out the priorities and the spend that we allocate to important local developments—you mentioned Bow Street and Carno, and that will be a matter for the Minister for transport to respond to. You know that we have the £40 million Wales station improvement programme, including £21 million in structural funds. Indeed, we have rail infrastructure projects as well. Of course, it is key that we look at opportunities in terms of powers and responsibilities, particularly in relation to the feasibility of establishing the Wales and borders franchise on a not-for-dividend basis to give us more powers and levers.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol yn nodi'r blaenoriaethau a'r gwariant rydym yn ei ddyrannu ar gyfer datblygiadau lleol pwysig—gwaethoch sôn am Bow Street a Charno, a bydd hynny'n fater i'r Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth ymateb iddo. Gwyddoch fod gennym raglen gwella gorsafoedd Cymru, sydd werth £40 miliwn, gan gynnwys £21 o gronfeydd strwythurol. Yn wir, mae gennym brosiectau seilwaith rheilffyrdd hefyd. Wrth gwrs, mae'n allweddol ein bod yn edrych ar gyfleoedd yng nghyswllt pwerau a chyfrifoldebau, yn enwedig o ran pa mor ymarferol yw sefydlu masnachfraint Cymru a'r Gororau ar sail ddi-ddifidend i roi rhagor o bwerau ac opsiynau inni.

Russell George: Having questioned your colleague the Minister for transport on the subject of the hourly service on the Cambrian line last week, he seemed to suggest that there are certain financial barriers preventing the Government from delivering this project on schedule. I am trying to understand exactly what those barriers are. Is it that there is disagreement between the Government and Arriva Trains over what the total service cost should be, or is it that sufficient funding has not been allocated? Minister, what discussions have you had with the Minister for transport on this issue, and has your colleague asked you for any additional resources to assist in the delivery of the service?

Russell George: Ar ôl holi eich cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth, ynghylch y gwasanaeth bob awr ar lein y Cambrian yr wythnos diwethaf, roedd i'w weld yn awgrymu y ceir rhwystrau ariannol penodol sy'n rhwystro'r Llywodraeth rhag cyflawni'r prosiect hwn yn brydlon. Rwyf yn ceisio deall beth yn union yw'r rhwystrau hynny. A oes anghytundeb rhwng y Llywodraeth a Trenau Arriva ynghylch faint y dylai’r gwasanaeth ei gostio i gyd, neu a oes dim digon o arian wedi’i ddyrannu? Weinidog, pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael â'r Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth ynghylch y mater hwn, ac a yw'ch cyd-Weinidog wedi gofyn ichi am ragor o adnoddau i gynorthwyo i ddarparu’r gwasanaeth?

Jane Hutt: I mentioned opportunities in terms of feasibility for the Wales and borders franchise, and the Minister for Local Government and Communities, who is responsible for transport, is looking at the potential role of Welsh Government in the future of rail in Wales and examining the options. It is clear that we need to have the levers and tools to ensure that we can overcome those financial barriers.

Jane Hutt: Gwneuthum sôn am gyfleoedd o ran ymarferoldeb masnachfraint Cymru a'r Gororau, ac mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, sy'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth, yn edrych ar rôl bosibl Llywodraeth Cymru yn nyfodol rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru, ac yn ystyried yr opsiynau. Mae'n amlwg bod angen inni gael y dulliau a'r adnoddau er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn oresgyn y rhwystrau ariannol hynny.

Teuluoedd Sipsiwn a Theithwyr

Gypsy and Traveller Families

12. William Graham: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisïau Llywodraeth Cymru i hybu cydlyniant cymdeithasol rhwng teuluoedd sipsiwn a theithwyr a chymunedau*

12. William Graham: *Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government’s policies to promote social cohesion between gypsy and traveller families and communities*

yn Nwyrain De Cymru. OAQ(4)0153(FIN)

in South Wales East. OAQ(4)0153(FIN)

Jane Hutt: Enhancing community relations is a key objective as part of 'Travelling to a Better Future—A Gypsy and Traveller Framework for Action and Delivery Plan'.

Jane Hutt: Mae gwella cysylltiadau cymunedol yn un o amcanion allweddol 'Teithio at Ddyfodol Gwell—Fframwaith Gweithredu a Chynllun Cyflenwi ar gyfer Sipsiwn a Theithwyr'.

William Graham: I am grateful to the Minister for her reply.

William Graham: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb.

You will appreciate the need to provide adequate sites for travelling families, and you will also be aware that, in February this year, your Government allowed Gypsies to move to an unauthorised site on Tatton Road in Liswerry, Newport, as it had been alleged that their presence at another site was threatening a possible housing development. Minister, how will you restore community cohesion and confidence in the Liswerry community?

Byddwch yn gwerthfawrogi'r angen i ddarparu safleoedd addas ar gyfer teuluoedd teithiol, a byddwch hefyd yn ymwybodol bod eich Llywodraeth, ym mis Chwefror eleni, wedi caniatáu i Sipsiwn symud i safle anawdurdodedig ar Tatton Road yn Liswerry, Casnewydd, oherwydd honiad bod eu presenoldeb ar safle arall yn peryglu datblygiad tai posibl. Weinidog, sut y byddwch yn adfer cydlyniant cymunedol a hyder yng nghymuned Liswerry?

Jane Hutt: Welsh Government officials are working closely with the local authority to deal with these issues and to ensure that the objectives of 'Travelling to a Better Future' are delivered, not just for the Gypsy and Traveller communities, but to ensure community cohesion within community strategies. It is important to acknowledge the fact that the housing White Paper proposes to place a duty on local authorities to provide sites for Gypsies and Travellers where a need has been established. Also, we have marked in our strategic equality plan the importance in terms of our equality objectives of supporting the needs of Gypsies and Travellers.

Jane Hutt: Mae swyddogion Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydweithio'n agos gyda'r awdurdod lleol i ymdrin â'r materion hyn ac i sicrhau bod amcanion 'Teithio at Ddyfodol Gwell' yn cael eu cyflawni, nid yn unig er mwyn y cymunedau Sipsiwn a Theithwyr, ond hefyd er mwyn sicrhau cydlyniant cymunedol mewn strategaethau cymunedol. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod y ffaith bod y Papur Gwyn ar dai yn cynnig rhoi dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu safleoedd ar gyfer Sipsiwn a Theithwyr lle canfuwyd angen am hynny. Hefyd, rydym wedi nodi yn ein cynllun cydraddoldeb strategol pa mor bwysig ydyw bod ein hamcanion cydraddoldeb yn cefnogi anghenion Sipsiwn a Theithwyr.

Jocelyn Davies: The situation in Newport is of particular concern in relation to the provision of a permanent site. You probably know that the previous administration in Newport had five possibilities in mind. Therefore, would you agree that the new administration must address this as a matter of priority? Will you ensure that the grants that you mentioned in your reply to a question earlier will remain available in future years? Can I take it from your mention of the White Paper that this will be a statutory duty and that local authorities will have to provide sites if needs have been

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'r sefyllfa yng Nghasnewydd yn destun pryder mawr mewn perthynas â darparu safle parhaol. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn gwybod bod gan y weinyddiaeth flaenorol yng Nghasnewydd bum posibilrwydd mewn golwg. Felly, a fyddech yn cytuno ei bod yn rhaid i'r weinyddiaeth newydd ymdrin â hyn fel blaenoriaeth? A wnewch sicrhau bod y grantiau a grybwyllwyd gennych yn eich ateb i gwestiwn yn gynharach, yn parhau ar gael yn y dyfodol? Gan ichi sôn am y Papur Gwyn, a allaf dybio y bydd hyn yn ddyletswydd statudol ac y bydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau

identified?

lleol ddarparu safleoedd os oes anghenion wedi cael eu nodi?

Jane Hutt: It is important that the local authority undertakes a full accommodation needs assessment for Gypsies and Travellers in Newport and provides for that identified need in its local development plan. That applies to all authorities in Wales. We are at the early stages of consultation on the housing White Paper and I hope that we will secure a legislative duty on local authorities to provide sites for Gypsies and Travellers where a need has been established. I continue to provide 100% funding in terms of Gypsy site allocations. We have to get the appropriate proposals that meet the guidance from the local authorities. I am currently encouraging local authorities to look at this, and to perhaps look at need on a regional basis as well.

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig bod yr awdurdod lleol yn cynnal asesiad llawn o anghenion llety ar gyfer Sipsiwn a Theithwyr yng Nghasnewydd, ac yn darparu ar gyfer yr angen hwnnw a nodwyd yn ei chynllun datblygu lleol. Mae hynny'n berthnasol i bob awdurdod yng Nghymru. Rydym yng nghamau cyntaf yr ymgynghoriad ar y Papur Gwyn ar dai, ac rwyf yn gobeithio y byddwn yn sicrhau bod dyletswydd ddeddfwriaethol ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu safleoedd ar gyfer Sipsiwn a Theithwyr lle canfuwyd angen. Rwyf yn parhau i ddarparu 100 y cant o gyllid o ran dyraniadau ar gyfer safleoedd Sipsiwn. Mae'n rhaid inni gael cynigion priodol gan awdurdodau lleol sy'n bodloni'r canllawiau. Rwyf yn annog awdurdodau lleol i edrych ar hyn ar hyn o bryd, ac i edrych efallai ar anghenion ar sail ranbarthol hefyd.

The Presiding Officer: Question 13, OAQ(4)0151(FIN), has been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Mae Cwestiwn 13, OAQ(4)0151(FIN), wedi cael ei dynnu’n ôl.

Hybu Cydraddoldeb

Promoting Equality

14. William Powell: *Beth y mae’r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i hybu’r agenda cydraddoldeb yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0140(FIN)*

14. William Powell: *What is the Minister doing to promote the equality agenda in Wales. OAQ(4)0140(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: Chapter 8 of the programme for government and our strategic equality plan set out what the Welsh Government is doing to promote the equality agenda in Wales.

Jane Hutt: Mae pennod 8 y rhaglen lywodraethu a'n cynllun cydraddoldeb strategol yn nodi'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo'r agenda cydraddoldeb yng Nghymru.

William Powell: Thank you, Minister, for that answer. Research undertaken by Age Cymru has highlighted the fact that despite the commendable work undertaken by successive UK Governments in recent years, there is still a significant degree of age discrimination when it comes to accessing financial services, particularly insurance. What steps is the Welsh Government taking to supplement the wider UK strategy in this area to promote greater equality?

William Powell: Diolch, Weinidog, am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae ymchwil a gynhaliwyd gan Age Cymru wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith, er gwaethaf y gwaith clodwiw a wnaed gan Lywodraethau olynol y DU yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ceir cryn dipyn o wahaniaethu ar sail oedran o hyd o ran cael mynediad i wasanaethau ariannol, yn arbennig yswiriant. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i gryfhau strategaeth ehangach y DU yn y maes hwn i hybu mwy o gydraddoldeb?

Jane Hutt: I thank the Member for Mid and West Wales for that question. In response to an earlier question, I mentioned my concerns about changes that have been recently

Jane Hutt: Diolch i’r Aelod dros Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mewn ymateb i gwestiwn cynharach, soniais am fy mhryderon ynghylch newidiadau sydd

announced by the UK Government to the Equality and Human Rights Commission's remit and changes to legal aid, which will have a profound impact on Wales and our third sector. The Minister for local government has instigated a review of advisory services with my support. The review will include the consideration of advice, information and the advocacy needs of older people, as well as those with protected characteristics under the Equality Act 2010.

wedi cael eu cyhoeddi yn ddiweddar gan Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch cylch gwaith y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol a newidiadau mewn cymorth cyfreithiol, a fydd yn cael effaith fawr ar Gymru a'n trydydd sector. Mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol wedi gofyn am adolygiad o wasanaethau cynghori gyda fy nghefnogaeth i. Bydd yr adolygiad yn cynnwys ystyried anghenion cynghori, gwybodaeth ac eiriolaeth pobl hŷn, yn ogystal â'r rheini sydd â nodweddion gwarchodedig o dan Ddeddf Cydraddoldeb 2010.

Mohammad Asghar: Minister, the Equality and Human Rights Commission has highlighted the significant under-representation of women, ethnic minorities and disabled people in public appointments. What studies has the Welsh Government undertaken into this problem to discover what measures have been successful elsewhere, and what progress has been made in developing good practice guidance in partnership with other interested groups in Wales to achieve the best statistics in Wales?

Mohammad Asghar: Weinidog, mae'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod menywod, lleiafrifoedd ethnig a phobl anabl yn cael eu tangynrychioli'n sylweddol mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus. Pa astudiaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u cynnal ar y broblem hon i ganfod pa fesurau sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus mewn mannau eraill, a pha gynnydd a wnaed i ddatblygu canllawiau arfer da mewn partneriaeth â grwpiau eraill sydd â diddordeb yng Nghymru i sicrhau'r ystadegau gorau yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: We need to work with political parties, as well as others, to encourage more women to become active in local government and in other front-line political roles. Our strategic equality plan sets out our plans to promote gender equality and increase the number of women in public appointments. That also applies to minority ethnic candidates for public office. Indeed, the survey that we carried out on representativeness for local government included all issues related to gender, race, language, age and disability. We will be making a statement on the research undertaken in due course.

Jane Hutt: Mae angen inni weithio gyda phleidiau gwleidyddol, yn ogystal ag eraill, i annog mwy o fenywod i gamu ymlaen mewn llywodraeth leol ac mewn rolau gwleidyddol rheng flaen eraill. Mae ein cynllun cydraddoldeb strategol yn nodi ein cynlluniau i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb rhywiol, ac i gynyddu nifer y menywod mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus. Mae hynny hefyd yn berthnasol i ymgeiswyr o leiafrifoedd ethnig ar gyfer swyddi cyhoeddus. Yn wir, roedd yr arolwg a gynhaliom ar gynrychioldeb llywodraeth leol yn cynnwys yr holl faterion sy'n ymwneud â rhyw, hil, iaith, oedran ac anabledd. Byddwn yn gwneud datganiad am yr ymchwil a gynhaliwyd maes o law.

Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol

Health and Social Services Portfolio

15. Janet Finch-Saunders: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrannwyd i'r portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. OAQ(4)0143(FIN)*

15. Janet Finch-Saunders: *Will the Minister provide an update on the overall budget allocation for the Health and Social Services portfolio. OAQ(4)0143(FIN)*

Jane Hutt: In the first supplementary budget, which I published last month, I set out plans

Jane Hutt: Yn y gyllideb atodol gyntaf, a gyhoeddais fis diwethaf, amlinellais

to increase the total departmental expenditure line for health, social services and children from £6.469 billion to £6.545 billion.

gynlluniau i gynyddu cyfanswm y llinell wariant adrannol ar gyfer iechyd, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a phlant o £6.469 biliwn i £6.545 biliwn.

Janet Finch-Saunders: With an emphasis on the need to prioritise the public health agenda across Wales, I note that as a result of the supplementary budget there has been a cut of £500,000 to the public health budget. Why?

Janet Finch-Saunders: Gyda phwyslais ar yr angen i roi blaenoriaeth i agenda iechyd y cyhoedd ar draws Cymru, sylwais y bu toriad o £500,000 yng nghyllideb iechyd y cyhoedd yn sgil y gyllideb atodol. Pam?

Jane Hutt: In terms of the supplementary budget and the very valuable scrutiny that we had in the Finance Committee, there are adjustments in relation to the spend in the health main expenditure group. What is important is that we have increased the health and social services departmental expenditure line by some £80 million, and, in terms of the pressures and challenges for the health budget, this has been managed in order to meet the most important priority needs in health services in Wales.

Jane Hutt: O ran y gyllideb atodol a'r gwaith craffu gwerthfawr iawn a wnaethom yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ceir addasiadau mewn perthynas â'r gwariant yn y prif grŵp gwariant iechyd. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod wedi cynyddu'r llinell gwariant adrannol ar gyfer iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol tua £80 miliwn, ac, o ran y pwysau a'r heriau sy’n wynebu’r gyllideb iechyd, mae hyn wedi cael ei reoli er mwyn bodloni'r anghenion blaenoriaeth pwysicaf mewn gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru.

Cwestiynau i’r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth
Questions to the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science

Ardal Fenter Caerdydd

Cardiff Enterprise Zone

1. Jenny Rathbone: *Pa gynnydd sy’n cael ei wneud gyda datblygu Ardal Fenter Caerdydd. OAQ(4)0151(BET)*

1. Jenny Rathbone: *What progress is being made in developing the Cardiff Enterprise Zone. OAQ(4)0151(BET)*

The Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science (Edwina Hart): The board of the Cardiff Central enterprise zone is making good progress. It is developing a strategic plan for the zone, setting out the vision for the area, key priorities, infrastructure requirements and property considerations.

Y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth (Edwina Hart): Mae bwrdd ardal fenter Canol Caerdydd yn gwneud cynnydd da. Mae'n datblygu cynllun strategol ar gyfer yr ardal, gan nodi'r weledigaeth ar gyfer yr ardal, blaenoriaethau allweddol, gofynion seilwaith ac ystyriaethau o ran eiddo.

Jenny Rathbone: I hosted a breakfast meeting with businesses in Cardiff last week, and one of the concerns raised was about the lack of clear incentives for investors to invest in either infrastructure or manufacturing rather than the casino economy. Given the importance of investing in infrastructure and manufacturing I wondered whether the Minister could indicate what progress is being made to ensure that this sort of money is available to new businesses coming into

Jenny Rathbone: Cynheliais gyfarfod brecwast gyda busnesau yng Nghaerdydd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac un o'r pryderon a godwyd oedd y diffyg cymhellion clir i fuddsoddwyr fuddsoddi yn naill ai seilwaith neu weithgynhyrchu yn hytrach na'r economi casino. O ystyried pwysigrwydd buddsoddi mewn seilwaith a gweithgynhyrchu, roeddwn yn meddwl tybed a allai'r Gweinidog nodi pa gynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud i sicrhau bod y math hwn o arian ar gael i fusnesau newydd

the enterprise zone.

sy'n dod i mewn i'r ardal fenter.

Edwina Hart: Obviously, the Cardiff enterprise zone has been designated for financial and professional services. I do not regard those jobs in call centres and the high end of legal and professional services as the casino economy; I regard them as very good quality jobs. The relocation of Deloitte’s world-wide centre in Cardiff is to be commended. In terms of your wider question, I am pleased to say that I have had a letter this week from the Rt Hon Vince Cable MP concerning the issues around enterprise zones, particularly with regard to HM Revenue and Customs, and how it would monitor it and the complexities around that area. We await a reply from Danny Alexander, but we are carrying on with our constructive dialogue on these issues.

Edwina Hart: Yn amlwg, mae ardal fenter Caerdydd wedi ei dynodi ar gyfer gwasanaethau ariannol a phroffesiynol. Nid wyf yn ystyried bod y swyddi hynny mewn canolfannau galwadau a phen uchaf y gwasanaethau cyfreithiol a phroffesiynol yn rhan o'r economi casino; rwyf yn eu hystyried yn swyddi o ansawdd da iawn. Mae adleoli canolfan byd-eang Deloitte yng Nghaerdydd i'w ganmol. O ran eich cwestiwn yn gyffredinol, rwyf yn falch o ddweud fy mod wedi cael llythyr yr wythnos hon oddi wrth y Gwir Anrhydeddus Vince Cable AS yn ymwneud â'r materion sy'n codi ynghylch ardaloedd menter, yn enwedig o ran Cyllid a Thollau EM, a sut y byddai'n monitro hyn a'r cymhlethdodau yn y maes hwnnw. Rydym yn aros am ateb gan Danny Alexander, ond rydym yn dal i drafod y materion hyn mewn deialog adeiladol.

The Leader of the Opposition (Andrew R.T. Davies): Minister, the enterprise zone in Cardiff is a critical way of redeveloping the centre and offering it as a financial hub. In England, city deals have been offered to many cities, for example, Bristol, which is a major competitor to Cardiff. Given that the new authority here in Cardiff has chosen to go back to the drawing board, as it were, what discussions have you and your officials had to make sure that best value can be extracted from the £30 million that the Welsh Government has made available for the enterprise zone in Cardiff?

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Andrew R.T. Davies): Weinidog, mae'r ardal fenter yng Nghaerdydd yn ffordd bwysig o ailddatblygu'r canol a'i gynnig fel canolbwynt byd ariannol. Yn Lloegr, mae cytundebau dinas wedi cael eu cynnig i sawl dinas, er enghraifft Bryste, sydd yn gystadleuydd o bwys i Gaerdydd. O ystyried bod yr awdurdod newydd yma yng Nghaerdydd wedi dewis mynd yn ôl i'r cychwyn, fel petai, pa drafodaethau rydych chi a'ch swyddogion wedi'u cynnal i wneud yn siŵr bod modd cael y gwerth gorau o'r £30 miliwn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei sicrhau ar gyfer yr ardal fenter yng Nghaerdydd?

Edwina Hart: It is clear that we have to get best value for all the resources that we put into the Cardiff enterprise zone. We are having detailed discussions, particularly about infrastructure projects and what is required in terms of new property. Sometimes you need the ideal property to attract investment, and we are hopeful that we will be making statements early in the autumn regarding the arrangements with the council and the enterprise zone board. However, matters are in hand.

Edwina Hart: Mae'n amlwg bod yn rhaid inni gael y gwerth gorau ar gyfer yr holl adnoddau rydym yn ei roi i ardal fenter Caerdydd. Rydym wrthi’n cael trafodaethau manwl, yn enwedig am brosiectau seilwaith a'r hyn sy'n ofynnol o ran eiddo newydd. Weithiau mae angen yr eiddo delfrydol arnoch er mwyn denu buddsoddiad, ac rydym yn gobeithio y byddwn yn gwneud datganiadau yn gynnar yn yr hydref ynghylch y trefniadau gyda'r cyngor a'r bwrdd ardal fenter. Ond, mae pethau'n mynd rhagddynt.

The Leader of Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood): Aside from wanting assurances that the feeder Valleys will not be left behind in

Arweinydd Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood): Ar wahân i fod eisiau sicrwydd na fydd y Cymoedd cyfagos yn cael eu gadael ar ôl yn

your plans for developing the Cardiff enterprise zone, I would also like to see some provision for the establishment of co-operatives in that area. You will be aware of the Mondragón co-operative in the Basque country, with 100,000 members and a turnover of €7 billion. The financial aspect of Mondragón is crucial. Have you read the recent report by the Institute of Welsh Affairs and co-operative groups about Mondragón and the lessons that can be learned for Wales? Will you agree to give serious consideration to that report, and, in particular, the financial aspects of the Mondragón experience, in your future plans for the Cardiff enterprise zone?

eich cynlluniau ar gyfer datblygu ardal fenter Caerdydd, byddwn hefyd yn hoffi gweld rhywfaint o ddarpariaeth ar gyfer sefydlu mentrau cydweithredol yn yr ardal honno. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o fenter gydweithredol Mondragón yng ngwlad y Basg, sydd â 100,000 o aelodau a throsiant o €7 biliwn. Mae ochr ariannol Mondragón yn hanfodol. A ydych wedi darllen adroddiad diweddar y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig a grwpiau cydweithredol am Mondragón a'r gwersi y gellir eu dysgu ar gyfer Cymru? A wnewch chi gytuno i ystyried yr adroddiad hwnnw o ddifrif, ac, yn arbennig, yr agweddau ariannol ar brofiad Mondragón, yn eich cynlluniau yn y dyfodol ar gyfer ardal fenter Caerdydd?

Edwina Hart: Yes, I will certainly give detailed consideration to the report, which I am aware of, and of course I am aware of the work of Mondragón because of the history of the trade unions going out there before the establishment of the Wales Co-operative Centre. That was the basis of the trade unions establishing the co-op centre—the excellent results that they saw 30-odd years ago in the Basque country, and the development of the project there. We have to do more to deal with some of the financial issues around social enterprises and co-operatives, and I will certainly take on board the leader of Plaid Cymru’s comments on this.

Edwina Hart: Gwnaf, byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried yr adroddiad yn fanwl. Rwyf yn ymwybodol ohono, ac rwyf yn ymwybodol wrth gwrs o waith Mondragón oherwydd hanes yr undebau llafur yn mynd yno cyn sefydlu Canolfan Cydweithredol Cymru. Dyna oedd sail yr undebau llafur wrth iddynt sefydlu'r ganolfan gydweithredol—y canlyniadau rhagorol a welsant tua 30 o flynyddoedd yn ôl yng ngwlad y Basg, a datblygiad y prosiect yno. Rhaid inni wneud mwy i ymdrin â rhai o'r materion ariannol sy'n ymwneud â mentrau cymdeithasol a mentrau cydweithredol, a byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried sylwadau arweinydd Plaid Cymru ar hyn.

2.15 p.m.

Y Gemau Olympaidd a Pharalympaidd

The Olympic and Paralympic Games

2. Nick Ramsay: *Pa weithgaredd ychwanegol y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i ddenu buddsoddiad i Gymru yn ystod y Gemau Olympaidd a Pharalympaidd yn Llundain. OAQ(4)0162(BET)*

2. Nick Ramsay: *What extra activity is the Welsh Government taking part in to attract investment into Wales during the Olympic and Paralympic Games in London. OAQ(4)0162(BET)*

Edwina Hart: We are working hard to ensure that Wales benefits from the 2012 Olympic Games before, during and after the event through maximising the economic, sporting and cultural legacy for Wales, boosting tourism, and enhancing Wales’s global reputation.

Edwina Hart: Rydym yn gweithio'n galed i sicrhau bod Cymru'n elwa ar Gemau Olympaidd 2012 cyn, yn ystod ac ar ôl y digwyddiad drwy wneud y mwyaf o'r gwaddol economaidd, diwylliannol a chwaraeon i Gymru, hybu twristiaeth, a gwella enw da Cymru yn fyd-eang.

Nick Ramsay: I am sure that the Minister agrees that the Olympic Games’ coming to

Nick Ramsay: Rwyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn cytuno bod y Gemau

London offers the whole of the UK, including Wales, an exciting opportunity to maximise the benefit of the huge influx of tourists that we expect to see. The Scottish Government and VisitScotland are taking a proactive approach to showcasing their nation over the next few months by hosting events at the Scotland House location in London during the Olympics. I believe that the regions of England are also going down that line to make sure that they are marketed there. Concerns have been expressed to me that the Welsh Government is not intending to have that sort of presence in London during the Olympic and Paralympic Games. Is that the case? Do you intend Wales to have that necessary presence in London? I am sure that you agree that this is a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity that we should not miss.

Olympaidd wrth iddynt ddod i Lundain yn cynnig cyfle cyffrous i'r DU gyfan, gan gynnwys Cymru, sicrhau’r budd gorau posib yn sgîl y mewnlifiad enfawr o dwristiaid y disgwyliwn eu gweld. Mae Llywodraeth yr Alban a VisitScotland yn mynd ati'n rhagweithiol i ddangos eu cenedl dros y misoedd nesaf drwy gynnal digwyddiadau yn lleoliad Scotland House yn Llundain yn ystod y Gemau Olympaidd. Credaf fod rhanbarthau Lloegr hefyd yn gwneud rhywbeth tebyg i hynny er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr eu bod yn cael eu marchnata yno. Mynegwyd pryderon wrthyf nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwriadu cael presenoldeb o'r math hwnnw yn Llundain yn ystod y Gemau Olympaidd a Pharalympaidd. A yw hynny'n wir? A yw'n fwriad gennych sicrhau bod gan Gymru y presenoldeb angenrheidiol hwnnw yn Llundain? Rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno bod hyn yn gyfle unwaith mewn oes ac na ddylem ei golli.

Edwina Hart: The First Minister will shortly be opening the London office, and it is my intention, and that of others, to hold a series of meetings in London during the Olympic Games. We have worked very well with UK Trade and Investment to ensure that Welsh business interests are fully represented. Only last weekend, in fact, I hosted a business reception in London to coincide with the Wales Choir of the World event at the Royal Festival Hall. We are taking these opportunities very seriously.

Edwina Hart: Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn agor swyddfa Llundain yn fuan, ac mae'n fwriad gennyf, ac eraill, i gynnal cyfres o gyfarfodydd yn Llundain yn ystod y Gemau Olympaidd. Rydym wedi gweithio'n dda iawn gyda Masnach a Buddsoddi y DU i sicrhau bod buddiannau busnes Cymru'n cael eu cynrychioli'n llawn. A dweud y gwir, cynhaliais dderbyniad busnes yn Llundain y penwythnos diwethaf i gyd-fynd â digwyddiad Côr y Byd Cymru yn y Royal Festival Hall. Rydym yn mynd ati o ddifrif i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn.

Bethan Jenkins: Minister, last week, we heard Laura McAllister, the head of Sport Wales, tell us at a Public Affairs Cymru dinner about the legacy of the Olympics and the expectation that more people will try to engage with sport. Given that we have such strong links with biking and mountain biking in Wales, could we put a marketing strategy together for the people who want to engage with that sport post Olympics?

Bethan Jenkins: Weinidog, yr wythnos diwethaf, clywsom Laura McAllister, pennaeth Chwaraeon Cymru, yn dweud wrthym mewn cinio Materion Cyhoeddus Cymru am waddol y Gemau Olympaidd a'r disgwyl y bydd mwy o bobl yn ceisio cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon. O gofio bod gennym gysylltiadau mor gryf gyda beicio a beicio mynydd yng Nghymru, a allem lunio strategaeth farchnata ar gyfer y bobl sydd am gymryd rhan yn y math hwnnw o chwaraeon ar ôl y Gemau Olympaidd?

Edwina Hart: You raise an interesting point. Cycling and other activities are global in terms of where people want to go. I was speaking to a businessperson recently whose hobby was cycling. He talked about the

Edwina Hart: Rydych yn codi pwynt diddorol. Mae beicio a gweithgareddau eraill yn fyd-eang o ran lle mae pobl yn dymuno mynd. Roeddwn yn siarad â dyn busnes yn ddiweddar ac un o'i hobïau oedd beicio.

excellent facilities that we have in Wales, at Afan Argoed and elsewhere, and asked whether we were doing any work in this area. These are the issues that the tourism panel is looking at. It is a niche area and you would be surprised at how much money there is in it.

Soniodd am y cyfleusterau gwych sydd gennym yng Nghymru, yn Afan Argoed ac mewn mannau eraill, a gofynnodd a oeddem yn gwneud unrhyw waith yn y maes hwn. Mae'r panel twristiaeth yn edrych ar y materion hyn. Mae'n faes arbenigol a byddech yn synnu faint o arian sydd ynddo.

Gwella'r Economi

Improving the Economy

3. Julie Morgan: *Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i wella'r economi yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0159(BET)*

3. Julie Morgan: *What plans does the Minister have to improve the economy in Wales. OAQ(4)0159(BET)*

Edwina Hart: Thank you for that question, because the economy is in difficult times in Wales. My plans are to implement the programme for government, which sets out our priorities for improving the economy.

Edwina Hart: Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw, oherwydd mae hi'n gyfnod anodd ar yr economi yng Nghymru. Fy nghynlluniau yw gweithredu'r rhaglen lywodraethu, sy'n nodi ein blaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwella'r economi.

Julie Morgan: I thank the Minister for that response. In the light of the latest research showing that Barclays has reduced its level of lending to small and medium-sized enterprises while increasing its involvement in dubious trading activities, and in view of the importance of SMEs to Wales, what policies can she suggest to stimulate the economic recovery to fill the lending gap?

Julie Morgan: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Yng ngoleuni'r gwaith ymchwil diweddaraf sy'n dangos bod Barclays wedi lleihau ei lefel benthyca i fentrau bach a chanolig ond wedi cymryd mwy o ran mewn gweithgareddau masnachu amheus, ac o ystyried pwysigrwydd y busnesau bach a chanolig i Gymru, pa bolisïau y gall eu hawgrymu i ysgogi'r adferiad economaidd er mwyn llenwi'r bwlch benthyg?

Edwina Hart: As a Government, we are keen to promote the various options available to business to source funding that go beyond traditional lending. As part of that strategy, on top of the existing Finance Wales £150 million-worth JEREMIE fund, joint European resources for micro to medium enterprises, I have created a series of other complementary funds. My department also provides extensive advice, which can be found on our website. We are also trying to look at a website diagnostic tool to help business. I am also challenging the UK Government to build Wales's particular needs into its policy developments in this area. Everybody across the UK is agreed that we need to see banks lending more to SMEs and others.

Edwina Hart: Fel Llywodraeth, rydym yn awyddus i hyrwyddo'r amrywiol ddewisiadau sydd ar gael i fusnesau er mwyn iddynt gael gafael ar gyllid heblaw'r ffyrdd traddodiadol o fenthyca. Fel rhan o'r strategaeth honno, yn ogystal â chronfa JEREMIE bresennol Cyllid Cymru sydd yn werth £150 miliwn, adnoddau Ewropeaidd ar y cyd ar gyfer microfusnesau a busnesau maint canolig, rwyf wedi creu cyfres o gronfeydd ategol eraill. Mae fy adran hefyd yn darparu cryn dipyn o gyngor, ac mae modd ei weld ar ein gwefan. Rydym hefyd yn ceisio edrych ar gyfrwng diagnostig gwefan i helpu busnesau. Rwyf hefyd yn herio Llywodraeth y DU i gynnwys anghenion arbennig Cymru yn ei datblygiadau polisi yn y maes hwn. Mae pawb ar draws y DU yn cytuno bod angen inni weld banciau yn benthyca mwy i fusnesau bach a chanolig ac eraill.

On Barclays, the press has been awful, but we must also remember the large number of

Ynghylch Barclays, mae'r wasg wedi bod yn ofnadwy, ond mae'n rhaid inni gofio hefyd y

diligent and hard-working employees in Barclays bank who must not be tainted by any of the comments about what has happened in the higher management structures.

nifer fawr o weithwyr diwyd a gweithgar ym manciau Barclays. Rhaid gofalu rhag eu cynnwys yn y sylwadau am yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn y strwythurau uwch reoli.

Nick Ramsay: Minister, what discussions are you having, or do you intend to have, with Tata Steel Strip Products UK in the light of its recent announcement that it intends to scale down production at the plant in Port Talbot?

Nick Ramsay: Weinidog, pa drafodaethau rydych yn eu cael, neu a ydych yn bwriadu eu cael, gyda Tata Steel Strip Products UK yng ngoleuni ei gyhoeddiad diweddar ei fod yn bwriadu cynhyrchu llai yn y ffatri ym Mhort Talbot?

Edwina Hart: We have a constant, ongoing dialogue with Tata. Members will be aware of the strains within the global economy of the steel industry. I had a quick briefing with officials this morning about the further discussions, which will continue. I am sure that Members across the parties will agree that we must give what support we can to ensure that that valuable employer stays in Wales and that we are able to assist the company as much as we can.

Edwina Hart: Rydym yn cynnal deialog gyson a pharhaus gyda Tata. Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol o'r pwysau yn yr economi fyd-eang ar y diwydiant dur. Cefais gyfarfod sydyn gyda swyddogion y bore yma am y trafodaethau pellach, a fydd yn parhau. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau ar draws y pleidiau yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni roi cymaint o gymorth ag y gallwn i sicrhau bod y cyflogwr gwerthfawr hwnnw yn aros yng Nghymru a'n bod yn gallu cynorthwyo'r cwmni gymaint ag y gallwn.

Nick Ramsay: I am grateful to the Minister for that response, and, yes, we all agree that it is important that Tata Steel Strip Products be given as much support as possible. I am sure that you will agree that it is good news that it is not planning any immediate job losses, although it is concerning that it is planning to scale down operations in the light of market demand. I know that the Minister has no direct control over the global demand for steel—and I would not expect her to have, although maybe some people would—but will she reassure the Chamber and the employees of Tata Steel that the Welsh Government will give the maximum amount of support possible so that, hopefully, when conditions improve, they are in the best position to take advantage of any opportunities?

Nick Ramsay: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw, ac mae pob un ohonom yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig bod Tata Steel Strip Products yn cael cymaint o gefnogaeth ag y bo modd. Rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno ei bod yn newyddion da nad yw'n bwriadu cael gwared ar unrhyw swyddi ar unwaith, er mae'n destun pryder ei fod yn bwriadu cynhyrchu llai yn sgîl y galw yn y farchnad. Gwn nad oes gan y Gweinidog ddim rheolaeth uniongyrchol dros y galw am ddur yn fyd-eang—ac ni fyddwn yn disgwyl iddi fod, er efallai y byddai rhai pobl—ond a wnaiff hi roi sicrwydd i'r Siambr a gweithwyr Tata Steel y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhoi cymaint o gymorth ag sy'n bosibl fel eu bod, pan fydd pethau'n gwella, gobeithio, yn y sefyllfa orau i fanteisio ar unrhyw gyfleoedd?

Edwina Hart: If the Member and others had the opportunity to speak to Tata’s management on a regular basis, as I do, they would be told that the Welsh Government always supports it where it can and will continue to do so. There are an enormous number of jobs in this industry, which are well-paid jobs, and it is vital for the economy of Wales that these jobs remain here.

Edwina Hart: Pe byddai'r Aelod ac eraill yn cael cyfle i siarad â rheolwyr Tata yn rheolaidd, fel rwyf fi, byddent yn cael gwybod bod Llywodraeth Cymru bob amser yn ei gefnogi pan mae'n gallu ac y bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae nifer mawr iawn o swyddi yn y diwydiant hwn, ac maent yn swyddi sy'n talu'n dda, ac mae'n hanfodol i economi Cymru bod y swyddi hyn yn aros

yma.

Alun Ffred Jones: Bûm yn ymweld â Phrifysgol Glyndŵr yn Wrecsam yr wythnos diwethaf fel rhan o waith y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes. Mae’r brifysgol yn ymfalchïo yn ei gydweithio clòs â diwydiant lleol. Dywedwyd wrthym yn glir iawn mai un o wendidau’r economi leol oedd absenoldeb cwmnïau cynhenid a phencadlysoedd cwmnïau yn yr ardal. A yw’r Gweinidog yn rhannu’r pryder hwnnw gyda’r brifysgol?

Alun Ffred Jones: I visited Glyndŵr University in Wrexham last week as part of the work of the Enterprise and Business Committee. The university prides itself on its close collaboration with local industry. We were told clearly that one of the weaknesses of the local economy was the absence of indigenous companies and company headquarters in the area. Does the Government share the university’s concern?

Edwina Hart: Obviously, it has not made those concerns known to me, but I will certainly take the opportunity, now that you have raised them with me, to discuss any ideas that the university might have in that regard. I think that there is an important issue with ensuring that we have indigenous companies, but also that, if companies come to Wales, we take not only their production but their research and development and headquarters functions as well, because they also help the economy.

Edwina Hart: Yn amlwg, nid yw wedi rhoi gwybod imi am y pryderon hynny, ond byddaf yn sicr yn achub ar y cyfle, gan eich bod wedi'u codi gyda mi, i drafod unrhyw syniadau a allai fod gan y brifysgol parthed hynny. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig sicrhau bod gennym gwmnïau cynhenid, ond hefyd, os daw cwmnïau i Gymru, ein bod yn manteisio ar eu gwaith cynhyrchu yn ogystal â'u swyddogaethau ymchwil a datblygu a'u phencadlys hefyd, gan eu bod yn helpu'r economi hefyd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Un o amcanion hirdymor y Llywodraeth yw cynyddu lefelau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Yn anffodus, mae’r duedd wedi bod fel arall dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Un factor yn y ffigurau hynny yw pencadlysoedd, oherwydd dyna lle mae’r elw yn cael ei gofnodi. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Llywodraeth, felly, i sicrhau bod rhagor o gwmnïau cynhenid a bod cwmnïau yn dod â’u pencadlysoedd i Gymru?

Alun Ffred Jones: One of the Government’s long-term aims is to increase the levels of gross domestic product and gross value added. Unfortunately, the trend has been going the other way over the past 10 years. One factor in those figures is the siting of headquarters, because that is where the profits are reported. What plans does the Government have, therefore, to ensure that there are more indigenous companies and that companies base their headquarters in Wales?

Edwina Hart: That is important, and in reorganising the department we have been trying to ensure that we have the appropriate links at the highest level with the companies that we deal with currently and with those that we wish to attract. It is only by dealing in that diligent way with companies, potential investors and existing companies that we will achieve the outcomes that we all agree would be ideal for the Welsh economy.

Edwina Hart: Mae hynny'n bwysig, ac wrth ad-drefnu'r adran, rydym wedi bod yn ceisio sicrhau bod gennym y cysylltiadau priodol ar y lefel uchaf gyda'r cwmnïau rydym yn ymdrin â hwy ar hyn o bryd, a chyda'r rheini rydym yn dymuno eu denu. Dim ond drwy drafod yn ddyfal â chwmnïau, buddsoddwyr posibl a chwmnïau sydd eisoes yma y byddwn yn sicrhau'r canlyniadau a fyddai, ym marn pob un ohonom, yn ddelfrydol i economi Cymru.

Eluned Parrott: Encouraging innovation is critical to improving the economy, and skills are critical to that. Some 98% of students in English universities go on to work in England, 88.6% of students in Scottish

Eluned Parrott: Mae annog arloesedd yn hanfodol i wella'r economi, ac mae sgiliau yn hanfodol ar gyfer hynny. Mae 98 y cant o fyfyrwyr mewn prifysgolion yn Lloegr yn mynd ymlaen i weithio yn Lloegr, mae 88.6 y

universities go on to work in Scotland, but here in Wales, that figure is just 75%. What is the Minister doing to ensure that there are opportunities for the very best minds to stay in Wales to help us to grow our economy?

cant o fyfyrwyr mewn prifysgolion yn yr Alban yn mynd ymlaen i weithio yn yr Alban, ond yma yng Nghymru, dim ond 75 y cant yw'r ffigur hwnnw. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod cyfleoedd i'r bobl fwyaf galluog aros yng Nghymru i'n helpu i ddatblygu ein heconomi?

Edwina Hart: Welsh universities produce Welsh students of a very high calibre who are looking for jobs. It is the job of Government to ensure that we get as many high-quality jobs as possible into Wales to ensure that the appropriate graduates who are from Wales or who perhaps have come to college in Wales remain in Wales.

Edwina Hart: Mae prifysgolion Cymru yn meithrin myfyrwyr Cymreig o safon uchel iawn sy'n chwilio am swyddi. Gwaith y Llywodraeth yw sicrhau ein bod yn denu cymaint ag y bo modd o swyddi o ansawdd uchel i Gymru er mwyn sicrhau bod y graddedigion priodol a ddaw o Gymru neu sydd efallai wedi dod i goleg yng Nghymru yn aros yng Nghymru.

Eluned Parrott: I am sure that the Minister would agree that encouraging entrepreneurship among graduates is one good way of encouraging them to stay but also of boosting the economy. However, funding can be a difficult issue. Perhaps the Minister is aware of a firm called Funding Circle, which was launched in 2010 to match investors with entrepreneurs. To date, this small firm has matched over £39 million of private money from ordinary people, often less than £100 at a time, with more than 700 small firms. Has the Minister investigated such private individual-to-individual funding routes, and will she investigate this further?

Eluned Parrott: Rwyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod annog entrepreneuriaeth ymhlith graddedigion yn ffordd dda o'u hannog i aros, ond hefyd o roi hwb i'r economi. Fodd bynnag, gall cael arian fod yn fater anodd. Efallai bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o gwmni o'r enw Funding Circle, a lansiwyd yn 2010 i baru buddsoddwyr gydag entrepreneuriaid. Hyd yma, mae'r cwmni bach hwn wedi paru dros £39 miliwn o arian preifat gan bobl gyffredin, yn aml yn llai na £100 y tro, gyda dros 700 o gwmnïau bach. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi ymchwilio i lwybrau ariannu preifat o'r fath rhwng unigolion, ac a wnaiff hi ymchwilio ymhellach i hyn?

Edwina Hart: I have obviously met a number of ‘angels’ during my work as well, so I am aware of some the schemes that are available to lend to people to start up their particular businesses. However, I have always told officials that we must continue to look for more and innovative ways of making the appropriate introductions, and I would be very pleased to instigate some more work in that area.

Edwina Hart: Yn amlwg, rwyf wedi cwrdd â nifer o ‘angylion’ yn fy ngwaith hefyd, felly rwyf yn ymwybodol o ambell gynllun sydd ar gael i roi benthyg i bobl ddechrau eu busnesau penodol. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn wastad wedi dweud wrth swyddogion bod yn rhaid inni barhau i chwilio am fwy o ffyrdd a ffyrdd arloesol o wneud cyflwyniadau priodol, a byddwn yn falch iawn o annog rhagor o waith yn y maes hwnnw.

Vaughan Gething: Minister, we saw yesterday the clear priorities of the UK Government when the Chancellor went to Europe to fight for the right of banks to pay bankers unlimited bonuses. However, I want to return to the point raised in Julie Morgan’s supplementary question about the credit available to small and medium-sized

Vaughan Gething: Weinidog, ddoe gwelsom flaenoriaethau clir Llywodraeth y DU pan aeth y Canghellor i Ewrop i ymladd dros hawliau'r banciau i dalu taliadau bonws diderfyn i fancwyr. Fodd bynnag, rwyf am ddychwelyd at y pwynt a godwyd yng nghwestiwn atodol Julie Morgan am y credyd sydd ar gael i fusnesau bach a chanolig. Ar

businesses. At the start of this week, I met a local businessman, and the key point that he raised was the continuing problem of high street banks not providing credit to small and medium-sized businesses. I am interested, Minister, to hear what discussions you have had with banks directly and with the UK Government on trying to deliver on promises to ensure that credit gets to small and medium-sized businesses.

ddechrau'r wythnos hon, cyfarfûm â dyn busnes lleol. Y pwynt allweddol a gododd oedd y broblem barhaus nad oedd banciau'r stryd fawr yn darparu credyd i fusnesau bach a chanolig. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb clywed, Weinidog, pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael gyda'r banciau yn uniongyrchol a chyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch ceisio cyflawni'r addewidion i sicrhau bod credyd yn cyrraedd busnesau bach a chanolig.

Edwina Hart: I have expressed my concern directly on the impact that the strict lending criteria currently employed by the banks is having on businesses, particularly in Wales, but also across the UK. I have pressed the Treasury to provide a breakdown of the Project Merlin lending data for Wales, and we are disappointed that we have not had it yet, but I understand that we will be getting it in the future. It would be useful to look at the analysis of that. Getting the lending data will also help us to target the policy agenda. Therefore, it is important that we all continue to raise these points about the banks and their lending policy, because it is impacting on businesses all across Wales. We saw it at first hand when we launched some of our schemes, as some companies had full order books but were having difficulty with their banks over their overdraft facilities and so on. In fact, they had full order books and could get the business in.

Edwina Hart: Rwyf wedi mynegi fy mhryder yn uniongyrchol am yr effaith y mae'r meini prawf llym ar gyfer benthyca a ddefnyddir gan y banciau ar hyn o bryd yn ei chael ar fusnesau, yn enwedig yng Nghymru, ond hefyd ar draws y DU. Rwyf wedi pwyso ar y Trysorlys i ddarparu dadansoddiad o ddata benthyca Prosiect Merlin ar gyfer Cymru, ac rydym yn siomedig nad ydym wedi ei gael eto, ond rwyf ar ddeall y byddwn yn ei gael yn y dyfodol. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol edrych ar y dadansoddiad o hynny. Bydd cael y data benthyca hefyd yn ein helpu i dargedu'r agenda polisi. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod pob un ohonom yn parhau i godi'r pwyntiau hyn am y banciau a'u polisi benthyca, gan ei fod yn effeithio ar fusnesau ledled Cymru. Gwelsom hyn drosom ein hunain pan oeddem yn lansio rhai o'n cynlluniau. Roedd llyfrau archebion ambell gwmni yn llawn ond roeddent yn cael trafferth gyda'u banciau gyda'u hamodau gorddrafft ac ati. Yn wir, roedd eu llyfrau archebion yn llawn a byddent yn gallu cael y busnes.

Busnesau Bach yn Islwyn

Small Businesses in Islwyn

4. Gwyn R. Price: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i helpu busnesau bach yn Islwyn. OAQ(4)0155(BET)*

4. Gwyn R. Price: *Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Government is doing to help small businesses in Islwyn. OAQ(4)0155(BET)*

Edwina Hart: We have made clear commitments to support businesses throughout Wales, and our plans are set out in the programme for government.

Edwina Hart: Rydym wedi gwneud ymrwymiadau clir i gefnogi busnesau ledled Cymru, ac mae ein cynlluniau wedi'u nodi yn y rhaglen lywodraethu.

Gwyn R. Price: Thank you for that answer, Minister. When I speak to small businesses in Islwyn, they tell me two things: that access to bank finances is poor, and that customers are nervous about spending. I know that failure to act in respect of the former is a matter for

Gwyn R. Price: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Pan fyddaf yn siarad â busnesau bach yn Islwyn, maent yn dweud dau beth wrthyf: bod mynediad at gyllid banc yn wael, a bod cwsmeriaid yn nerfus am wario. Gwn mai Llywodraeth y DU sy'n gyfrifol am fethu

the UK Government, and its continued failure to get the banks to meet agreed targets is more than frustrating. However, do you agree with me that the recent announcement by DS Smith plc in Caerphilly to open a new centre with 100 jobs, with support from the Welsh Government, can only help consumer confidence across the borough?

â gweithredu ar y mater cyntaf, ac mae ei methiant parhaus i gael y banciau i gyrraedd targedau y cytunwyd arnynt yn rhwystredig a dweud y lleiaf. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cytuno â mi fod y cyhoeddiad diweddar gan DS Smith plc yng Nghaerffili i agor canolfan newydd gyda 100 o swyddi, gyda chefnogaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru, yn gymorth i ennyn hyder defnyddwyr ar draws y fwrdeistref?

Edwina Hart: Yes. We are obviously delighted about the jobs announcement. As a Government, we are able to put our money into assisting firms to open and retain employment. However, future employment is the way forward in this difficult period.

Edwina Hart: Ydw. Yn amlwg, rydym wrth ein bodd gyda'r cyhoeddiad am y swyddi. Fel Llywodraeth, rydym yn gallu rhoi ein harian i gynorthwyo cwmnïau i gynnig gwaith a'i gadw. Fodd bynnag, cyflogaeth i'r dyfodol yw'r ffordd ymlaen yn y cyfnod anodd hwn.

William Graham: Minister, I am sure that you will agree that Sirhowy Enterprise Way has provided an effective catalyst for economic and social development throughout Islwyn. It was, as you know, a design-build-finance-operate scheme. Will the Minister agree that we need to engage with all funding streams, particularly in the private sector, to ensure that we use every option to drive forward the economic regeneration of the area?

William Graham: Weinidog, rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod Ffordd Fenter Sirhywi wedi bod yn gatalydd effeithiol ar gyfer datblygiad economaidd a chymdeithasol drwy Islwyn gyfan. Roedd hyn, fel y gwyddoch, yn gynllun dylunio-adeiladu-ariannu-gweithredu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno bod angen inni weithio gyda'r holl ffrydiau ariannu, yn enwedig yn y sector preifat, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio pob opsiwn i fwrw ymlaen ag adfywiad economaidd yr ardal?

Edwina Hart: The point that William Graham makes about engagement with all funding streams, particularly in the private sector, is important. We need to have an appropriate mix of funds available to ensure that we have a prosperous economy, to keep people in jobs, and to allow further employment opportunities. I think that the point is well made.

Edwina Hart: Mae'r pwynt a wnaeth William Graham ynglŷn â gweithio gyda'r holl ffrydiau ariannu, yn enwedig yn y sector preifat, yn bwysig. Mae angen inni gael cymysgedd priodol o gyllid i sicrhau bod gennym economi ffyniannus, i gadw pobl mewn swyddi, ac i ganiatáu rhagor o gyfleoedd cyflogaeth. Mae'r pwynt yn un da, yn fy marn i.

Datblygiad SA1

The SA1 Development

5. Mike Hedges: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd gyda datblygiad SA1. OAQ(4)0150(BET)*

5. Mike Hedges: *Will the Minister provide a progress update on the SA1 development. OAQ(4)0150(BET)*

Edwina Hart: In addition to the completed developments already on site, the Welsh Government continues to actively promote SA1 as a destination for business and various further developments, and infrastructure works are currently under way.

Edwina Hart: Yn ogystal â'r datblygiadau a gwblhawyd eisoes ar y safle, mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn parhau i hyrwyddo SA1 fel cyrchfan ar gyfer busnes ac amrywiol ddatblygiadau pellach, ac mae gwaith seilwaith ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd.

Mike Hedges: As you are well aware, 1,800

Mike Hedges: Fel rydych yn ymwybodol,

jobs have been secured for the area, and former disused port land has been transformed to house office buildings, residential units and retail outlets. I have two questions: what future developments are expected in the area; and how can we ensure that the development of SA1 brings a benefit to the wider community of St Thomas?

sicrhawyd 1,800 o swyddi ar gyfer yr ardal, ac mae hen dir porthladd segur wedi cael ei drawsnewid ar gyfer swyddfeydd, unedau preswyl a mannau manwerthu. Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn: pa ddatblygiadau yn y dyfodol a ddisgwylir yn yr ardal; a sut y gallwn sicrhau bod datblygiad SA1 yn dod â budd i gymuned St Thomas yn gyffredinol?

Edwina Hart: Despite the current climate, we have some considerable activity in SA1, which shows the continued confidence of the developers and investors in SA1. The continued investment in the area is good news for the communities of St Thomas and Swansea. Future developments on site will provide some retail, residential and restaurant uses, together with a care facility, so matters are progressing satisfactorily on that site.

Edwina Hart: Er gwaethaf yr hinsawdd bresennol, mae gennym gryn dipyn o weithgarwch yn SA1, ac mae hyn yn dangos hyder parhaus y datblygwyr a'r buddsoddwyr yn SA1. Mae'r buddsoddiad parhaus yn yr ardal yn newyddion da i gymunedau St Thomas ac Abertawe. Bydd datblygiadau ar y safle yn y dyfodol yn arwain at rywfaint o adwerthu, llefydd preswylio a bwytai, ynghyd â chyfleuster gofal, felly mae pethau'n mynd rhagddynt yn foddhaol ar y safle hwnnw.

Byron Davies: Following on from Mike Hedges’s question, Minister, I have asked you previously in the Chamber about the lack of an enterprise zone in South Wales West. You first replied that you could not have zones in every constituency, which, of course, is a fair point. However, my argument has always been that there should be at least one in every region, and I feel that that is valid as there are only five regions. You said, responding to my last request some months ago, that you had plans for Swansea specifically. Will you announce those plans now, please, and will you consider supporting the SA1 development with either an enterprise zone or some other support from your Government?

Byron Davies: Yn dilyn cwestiwn Mike Hedges, Weinidog, rwyf wedi gofyn ichi o'r blaen yn y Siambr am ddiffyg ardal fenter yng Ngorllewin De Cymru. Eich ateb cyntaf oedd na allech gael ardaloedd ym mhob etholaeth, sydd, wrth gwrs, yn bwynt teg. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn wastad wedi dadlau y dylid cael o leiaf un ym mhob rhanbarth, ac rwyf yn teimlo bod hynny'n ddilys gan mai dim ond pum rhanbarth sydd. Gan ymateb i fy nghais diwethaf rai misoedd yn ôl, dywedoch fod gennych gynlluniau ar gyfer Abertawe yn benodol. A wnewch gyhoeddi'r cynlluniau hynny yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda, ac a wnewch ystyried cefnogi datblygiad SA1 gyda naill ai ardal fenter neu ryw fath o gymorth arall gan eich Llywodraeth?

Edwina Hart: When we have the discussion later on city regions and local authorities then have the opportunity to look at the outcomes of that report, we might see other proposals emerging from Swansea and other areas, about how they want to be part of the wider discussions on that agenda.

Edwina Hart: Pan fyddwn yn cael y drafodaeth yn nes ymlaen ar ddinas-ranbarthau a bod awdurdodau lleol yn cael cyfle wedyn i edrych ar ganlyniadau'r adroddiad hwnnw, efallai y gwelwn gynigion eraill yn dod i'r amlwg o Abertawe ac ardaloedd eraill, ynglŷn â sut y maent yn dymuno bod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau ehangach ar yr agenda honno.

2.30 p.m.

Bethan Jenkins: Weinidog, yn ardal SA1, mae cwmni teledu annibynnol llwyddiannus o’r enw Telesgop. A fyddech chi’n ystyried

Bethan Jenkins: Minister, in the SA1 area, there is a successful independent television company called Telesgop. Would you

edrych ar yr ardal honno ar gyfer datblygiadau digidol o’r fath, er mwyn i ni hybu’r diwydiant hwn, er mwyn iddo dyfu i’r dyfodol yng Nghymru?

consider looking at that area for the purpose of such digital developments so that we can promote this industry and ensure its growth in future in Wales?

Edwina Hart: I am sure that, as you have raised a point about a successful television company in Swansea, the Member for Llanelli will raise an issue about television companies in Llanelli. We will look at these issues in the round, and we will try to assist businesses whether they are in the enterprise zone or not.

Edwina Hart: Gan eich bod wedi codi pwynt am gwmni teledu llwyddiannus yn Abertawe, rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelod dros Lanelli yn codi mater am gwmnïau teledu yn Llanelli. Byddwn yn edrych ar bob agwedd ar y materion hyn, a byddwn yn ceisio cynorthwyo busnesau pa un ai a ydynt yn yr ardal fenter neu beidio.

Peter Black: In the distant past, when the Welsh Development Agency still existed, the plans for SA1 involved using capital receipts to put locked gates in so as to develop a marina there. Has that plan been abandoned, or is the intention still to go ahead with it?

Peter Black: Yn y gorffennol pell, pan oedd Asiantaeth Datblygu Cymru yn dal i fodoli, roedd y cynlluniau ar gyfer SA1 yn cynnwys defnyddio derbyniadau cyfalaf i osod giatiau cloi er mwyn datblygu marina yno. A gefnwyd ar y cynllun hwnnw, neu a oes bwriad i fwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun?

Edwina Hart: That plan has not crossed my desk since I have been the Minister for business, but I will certainly make enquiries for you.

Edwina Hart: Nid yw'r cynllun hwnnw wedi bod ar fy nesg ers imi fod yn Weinidog busnes, ond byddaf yn sicr yn gwneud ymholiadau ar eich rhan.

Cefnogi Cynhyrchwyr Bwyd

Support for Food Producers

6. Rebecca Evans: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru i gynhyrchwyr bwyd yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0161(BET)*

6. Rebecca Evans: *Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Government support for Welsh food producers. OAQ(4)0161(BET)*

The Deputy Minister for Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and European Programmes (Alun Davies): This Government is supporting Welsh food and drink processors and producers through a programme of measures, including capital support for investment in processing capacity, product development, innovation, programmes for business mentoring and market development. This includes increasing exports, support for brand development and raising consumer awareness. I am engaged in a series of meetings with the industry to prioritise future support.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd (Alun Davies): Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn cefnogi proseswyr a chynhyrchwyr bwyd a diod o Gymru drwy raglen o gamau, gan gynnwys cymorth cyfalaf ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn capasiti prosesu, datblygu cynnyrch, arloesi, rhaglenni ar gyfer mentora busnes a datblygu marchnad. Mae hyn yn cynnwys cynyddu allforion, cymorth ar gyfer datblygu brand a chodi ymwybyddiaeth defnyddwyr. Rwyf yn cymryd rhan mewn cyfres o gyfarfodydd gyda'r diwydiant i flaenoriaethu cymorth yn y dyfodol.

Rebecca Evans: Welsh food producers do us proud, providing us with some of the finest produce in the world. Could you go into further detail on how you are working with and listening to the industry to raise the

Rebecca Evans: Mae cynhyrchwyr bwyd o Gymru yn destun balchder, gan ddarparu rhai o'r cynnyrch gorau yn y byd inni. A allech fanylu mwy ar sut rydych yn gweithio gyda'r diwydiant ac yn gwrando arno er mwyn codi

profile of Welsh food in the media, grow its profile in major retailers, as well as building those export markets?

proffil bwyd o Gymru yn y cyfryngau, yn datblygu ei broffil gyda manwerthwyr mawr, yn ogystal â datblygu'r marchnadoedd allforio hynny?

Alun Davies: I agree with my friend from Mid and West Wales that the food we produce in Wales is world class. We are engaged in supporting producers across the country to ensure that their products are able to reach consumers at home and abroad. We have a programme of engagement with all the major retail and wholesale customers to enable Welsh-based processors and producers to gain listing for products and to develop relationships with their major accounts. We are also supporting Welsh producers to develop international trade links, which have recently included Dubai, Singapore, Shanghai, Washington, Barcelona, Paris and Amsterdam. There has also been support to open up trade in red meat with China. Tomorrow, I will be hosting a major seminar at the National Botanic Garden of Wales, in Carmarthenshire, to look at how we can further increase support for food producers across Wales.

Alun Davies: Rwyf yn cytuno gyda'm ffrind o Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru fod y bwyd rydym yn ei gynhyrchu yng Nghymru o'r radd flaenaf. Rydym wrthi'n cefnogi cynhyrchwyr ar draws y wlad i sicrhau bod eu cynhyrchion yn gallu cyrraedd defnyddwyr gartref a thramor. Mae gennym raglen o weithio gyda'r holl brif gwsmeriaid manwerthu a chyfanwerthu sy'n rhoi cyfle i gynnyrch proseswyr a chynhyrchwyr o Gymru gael eu henwi, ac iddynt feithrin perthynas gyda'r cwmnïau mawr. Rydym hefyd yn cefnogi cynhyrchwyr o Gymru i ddatblygu cysylltiadau masnach ryngwladol, ac mae'r rhain wedi cynnwys Dubai, Singapore, Shanghai, Washington, Barcelona, Paris ac Amsterdam yn ddiweddar. Hefyd mae cymorth wedi'i roi i gychwyn masnachu cig coch gyda Tsieina. Yfory, byddaf yn cynnal seminar pwysig yng Ngardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, i edrych ar sut y gallwn roi mwy o gefnogaeth i gynhyrchwyr bwyd ledled Cymru.

Russell George: I am pleased that the Minister for business has accepted the invitation to attend the Welcome to Wales reception at the world shooting championships, which are to be held in Montgomeryshire in a fortnight. I understand that an application has been sent to the Welsh Government for funding towards this reception, which will be a window to promote Wales and, in particular, Welsh produce, to the international teams that are competing. I wish to impress upon the Deputy Minister to ask officials to look favourably on this application; I am sure that you will agree that this event is an ideal opportunity to promote Welsh food and drink to countries around the world.

Russell George: Rwyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog busnes wedi derbyn y gwahoddiad i fynychu derbyniad Croeso i Gymru ym mhencampwriaethau saethu'r byd, a gaiff eu cynnal yn sir Drefaldwyn mewn pythefnos. Rwyf ar ddeall bod cais wedi cael ei anfon at Lywodraeth Cymru am gyllid i'r derbyniad hwn, a fydd yn ffenestr i hyrwyddo Cymru ac, yn benodol, cynnyrch o Gymru, ymhlith y timau rhyngwladol sy'n cystadlu. Hoffwn bwyso ar y Dirprwy Weinidog i ofyn i swyddogion edrych yn ffafriol ar y cais hwn; rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod y digwyddiad hwn yn gyfle delfrydol i hybu bwyd a diod o Gymru ymhlith gwledydd ledled y byd.

Alun Davies: The Member will be delighted to hear that I will be attending that event in place of my colleague the Minister for business. I look forward to that, and we will be able to discuss these matters then.

Alun Davies: Bydd yr Aelod yn falch iawn o glywed y byddaf yn mynd i’r digwyddiad hwnnw yn lle fy nghyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog busnes. Edrychaf ymlaen at hynny, a byddwn yn gallu trafod y materion hyn wedyn.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Tra’n

Lord Elis-Thomas: While I wish the Deputy

dymuno'n dda i'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn ei gydweithrediad â'i gyfaill, Tywysog Cymru, yn hyrwyddo bwyd Cymru, hoffwn ofyn iddo ehangu ar ei ddatganiad ysgrifenedig am y diwydiant llaeth y bore yma—ac yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am hwnnw. A all esbonio beth yn union y mae'n ei olygu ynglŷn ag aflwyddiant posibl y trafodaethau ar y cod ymarfer gwirfoddol, a'i fwriad i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i roi cynigion pecyn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar waith?

Minister well in his collaboration with his friend, the Prince of Wales, in promoting the food of Wales, I would like him to expand on his written statement on the dairy industry this morning—we are grateful for that statement. Could he explain what exactly he means in relation to the possible failure of the discussions on the voluntary code of practice, and his intention to introduce legislation to implement the proposals in the European Union package?

Alun Davies: Members will be aware that I issued a written statement this morning on the Welsh Government's support for the dairy industry. Members are also aware of the turmoil in the industry at the moment in terms of reductions in the price of milk. Members will also be aware that a meeting is taking place in Westminster today on the same subject. I made the statement this morning because I wanted to be clear, and I wanted to inform Members, since this is a matter of great public interest, about the actions that the Welsh Government is taking and has taken on this matter.

Alun Davies: Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol fy mod wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig y bore yma ynghylch cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru i'r diwydiant llaeth. Mae'r aelodau hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r trafferthion yn y diwydiant ar hyn o bryd o ran gostyngiadau ym mhris llaeth. Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol hefyd fod cyfarfod yn cael ei gynnal yn San Steffan heddiw ar yr un pwnc. Gwnes i'r datganiad y bore yma gan fy mod yn awyddus i fod yn glir, ac roeddwn am roi gwybod i'r Aelodau, gan fod hyn yn fater o ddiddordeb mawr i'r cyhoedd, am y camau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd ac wedi eu cymryd ar y mater hwn.

I hosted a Welsh dairy summit—I am not sure about the wording—in Aberystwyth last month, which was a significant event and in which we spoke to the industry about the support that it feels it needs and how the Welsh Government could best provide that support and intervention. As the Plaid Cymru spokesperson indicated, we have been involved in discussions with DEFRA and others on a voluntary code of practice on contracts that relate to milk supply. It is my view—and I have made this clear to the Chamber on previous occasions—that we should seek to develop this code of conduct in the dairy supply chain and we believe that it is a more powerful tool than the EU dairy package, although if the discussions on the voluntary code of practice do fail, then we will seek to introduce the EU package proposals in Wales. However, I want Members to be aware that we are working on a wide range of issues to provide support to the dairy sector specifically, but also for the wider dairy supply chain.

Cynheliais uwchgynhadledd llaeth Cymru—nid wyf yn siŵr am y geiriad—yn Aberystwyth y mis diwethaf. Roedd hwn yn ddigwyddiad arwyddocaol ac ynddo buom yn siarad â'r diwydiant am y gefnogaeth y mae'n teimlo sydd ei hangen arno a beth fyddai'r ffordd orau i Lywodraeth Cymru ddarparu'r gefnogaeth a'r ymyrraeth honno. Fel y dywedodd llefarydd Plaid Cymru, rydym wedi bod yn rhan o drafodaethau gyda DEFRA ac eraill ynghylch cod ymarfer gwirfoddol ar gontractau sy'n ymwneud â'r cyflenwad llaeth. Yn fy marn i—ac rwyf wedi datgan hyn yn glir wrth y Siambr ar achlysuron blaenorol—dylem geisio datblygu'r cod ymddygiad hwn yn y gadwyn cyflenwi llaeth ac rydym yn credu ei fod yn arf fwy pwerus na phecyn llaeth yr UE. Er, os bydd y trafodaethau ar y cod ymarfer gwirfoddol yn methu, yna byddwn yn ceisio cyflwyno cynigion pecyn yr UE yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, rwyf am i'r Aelodau fod yn ymwybodol ein bod yn gweithio ar ystod eang o faterion er mwyn darparu cefnogaeth i'r sector llaeth yn benodol, ond hefyd i'r gadwyn gyflenwi llaeth yn gyffredinol.

William Powell: Thank you very much, Deputy Minister, for that comprehensive answer. What specific steps have you taken to assess the impact of supply disruption or collapse on related food industries to the dairy sector? I am thinking particularly of areas such as cheese, butter and yoghurt. What are you undertaking to overcome potential difficulties?

William Powell: Diolch yn fawr iawn, Ddirprwy Weinidog, am yr ateb cynhwysfawr hwnnw. Pa gamau penodol rydych wedi'u cymryd i asesu'r effaith ar ddiwydiannau bwyd sy'n gysylltiedig â'r sector llaeth os terfir ar y cyflenwad neu os bydd diffyg cyflenwad? Rwyf yn meddwl yn benodol am bethau fel caws, menyn ac iogwrt. Beth rydych yn ei wneud i oresgyn anawsterau posibl?

Alun Davies: As I have made clear, we are looking at the whole dairy supply chain and not simply at one particular element of it. In terms of ensuring that there is fairness throughout the whole supply chain, I wrote to the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills in Westminster last month asking it to strengthen the role of the supermarket adjudicator and legislation that is currently being promoted in Westminster. In my view, the current legislation does not provide the strong adjudicator that is necessary to regulate the dairy supply chain, and we need to ensure that the adjudicator has the teeth and powers available to ensure that that supply chain has the regulation that ensures that each element of it is successful and able to derive a profit. I have asked both the coalition parties represented here today—the Liberal Democrats and the Conservatives—to support the Welsh Government in this; I am still waiting to hear where you all stand on the matter.

Alun Davies: Fel rwyf wedi'i ddatgan yn glir, rydym yn edrych ar y gadwyn gyflenwi llaeth gyfan ac nid dim ond ar un elfen benodol ohoni. O ran sicrhau bod tegwch ar draws y gadwyn gyflenwi gyfan, ysgrifennais at yr adran Busnes, Arloesedd a Sgiliau yn San Steffan y mis diwethaf yn gofyn iddi gryfhau rôl y dyfarnwyr archfarchnad a'r ddeddfwriaeth sy'n cael ei hyrwyddo yn San Steffan ar hyn o bryd. Yn fy marn i, nid yw'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol yn sicrhau bod gennym ddyfarnwr cryf sy'n angenrheidiol i reoleiddio'r gadwyn gyflenwi llaeth, ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod gan y dyfarnwr y grym a'r pwerau i sicrhau bod gan y gadwyn gyflenwi honno reoliadau sy'n sicrhau bod pob elfen ohoni yn llwyddiannus a'i bod yn gallu cael elw. Rwyf wedi gofyn i'r ddwy blaid yn y glymblaid a gynrychiolir yma heddiw—y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Ceidwadwyr—i gefnogi Llywodraeth Cymru ar hyn; rwyf yn dal i aros i glywed beth yw safbwynt pob un ohonoch ar y mater.

Hybu Mewnfuddsoddiad

Promoting Inward Investment

7. Mark Isherwood: *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i hybu mewnfuddsoddiad i Gymru. OAQ(4)0160(BET)*

7. Mark Isherwood: *What is the Welsh Government doing to promote inward investment in Wales. OAQ(4)0160(BET)*

14. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer denu Buddsoddi Uniongyrchol Tramor. OAQ(4)0163(BET)*

14. Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *Will the Minister make a statement on her priorities for attracting Foreign Direct Investment. OAQ(4)0163(BET)*

Edwina Hart: I recognise the importance of attracting inward investment into Wales to promote Wales as an ideal place in which to base new investment and secure jobs and growth. Wales has an attractive offer, including first-class infrastructure, a strong skills base and a competitive finance offer.

Edwina Hart: Rwyf yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd denu buddsoddiad o'r tu allan i Gymru i hyrwyddo Cymru fel lle delfrydol i leoli buddsoddiad newydd a sicrhau swyddi a thwf. Mae gan Gymru rhywbeth atyniadol i'w gynnig, gan gynnwys seilwaith o'r radd flaenaf, sylfaen sgiliau gref a chynnig cyllid cystadleuol.

Mark Isherwood: When the UK was the top destination for inward investment in the European Union, and second top internationally in 1997, Wales was top among the 12 UK regions. A new report from the European Commission Directorate General for Enterprise and Industry confirms that the UK retained top destination position for foreign direct investment in the EU in 2011, and that investors expect further improvements regarding UK attractiveness over the next three years. Unfortunately, Minister, Wales is now bottom of the 12 UK nations and regions in terms of its position as a destination for inward investment. Why is that, Minister?

Mark Isherwood: Pan arferai'r DU fod y prif gyrchfan yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer buddsoddi o'r tu allan, a'r ail uchaf yn rhyngwladol yn 1997, roedd Cymru ymhlith y 12 rhanbarth uchaf yn y DU. Mae adroddiad newydd gan Gyfarwyddiaeth Gyffredinol y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar gyfer Menter a Diwydiant yn cadarnhau bod y DU wedi aros yn un o'r prif gyrchfannau ar gyfer buddsoddi uniongyrchol tramor yn yr UE yn 2011, a bod buddsoddwyr yn disgwyl gwelliannau pellach o ran gallu'r DU i ddenu dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Yn anffodus, Weinidog, mae Cymru bellach ar waelod rhestr 12 gwlad a rhanbarth y DU o ran ei safle fel cyrchfan ar gyfer buddsoddi o'r tu allan. Beth yw'r rheswm dros hynny, Weinidog?

Edwina Hart: The Welsh Government has this year secured a number of foreign investments, including the US-owned specialist outsourcer of administrative services, which has chosen Cardiff bay as its European centre of excellence. These projects should boost Wales's position when the latest UK Government foreign direct investment figures are published later this year.

Edwina Hart: Eleni, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi sicrhau nifer o fuddsoddiadau tramor, gan gynnwys cwmni cyflenwyr allanol arbenigol o'r UDA sy'n cynnig gwasanaethau gweinyddol, sydd wedi dewis Bae Caerdydd fel ei ganolfan rhagoriaeth Ewropeaidd. Dylai'r prosiectau hyn roi hwb i sefyllfa Cymru pan gyhoeddir ffigurau diweddaraf Llywodraeth y DU ar fuddsoddiad uniongyrchol tramor yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, rydych chi wedi cyhoeddi y bydd 10 o deithiau masnach tramor yn digwydd er mwyn ceisio denu buddsoddiad i Gymru ac i hybu delwedd Cymru dramor. Pa fath o gwmnïau fydd yn mynd ar y teithiau hyn a pha sectorau fydd yn cael eu cynrychioli? Yn ddiweddar, dywedodd gŵr busnes wrthyf ei fod yn ofni nad oes digon o gwmnïau a fyddai'n berthnasol i'r math hyn o deithiau ar gael yng Nghymru bellach i ymgymryd â'r teithiau i gyd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, you have announced that there will be 10 overseas trade missions in order to try to attract investment to Wales and to promote the image of Wales overseas. What kind of companies will go on these missions and what sectors will be represented? Lately, a businessman told me that he fears that not enough companies that would be relevant to these missions are available in Wales now to take up all these missions.

Edwina Hart: Funnily enough, companies tell me that they would love to undertake these visits and think they are relevant. We are trying to identify where we are going in certain areas. I recently visited the Catalan people in Barcelona and talked about opportunities for business between us and Catalonia. One area that they were interested in was the creative industries, particularly

Edwina Hart: Yn rhyfedd ddigon, mae cwmnïau yn dweud wrthyf y byddent wrth eu bodd yn mynd ar y teithiau hyn ac maent yn meddwl eu bod yn berthnasol. Rydym yn ceisio gweld i ba gyfeiriad rydym yn mynd mewn meysydd penodol. Yn ddiweddar, ymwelais â Chatalaniaid ym Marcelona a buom yn siarad am gyfleoedd busnes rhyngom ni a Chatalonia. Un maes roedd

different markets and what we could learn from each other and whether there was any role for partnership. We have subsequently set up an arrangement with them to send some people out from the creative industries in Wales to talk to respective Catalan companies and vice versa. We have that expertise there. However, on the wider issue of trade delegations—not just those that I have announced—that we will be involved in with UK Trade and Investment, when we will look at areas like Brazil and Russia, it is important that we maximise companies that have any links at all with these countries because if they have a good relationship with a company in such a country, they might be able to help their suppliers in that chain. It is important that we invest in this and understand that we will have to pay money out to accumulate the benefits for the Welsh economy in the long term.

ganddynt ddiddordeb ynddo oedd y diwydiannau creadigol, yn arbennig y gwahanol farchnadoedd a beth y gallem ei ddysgu oddi wrth ein gilydd ac a oedd unrhyw rôl ar gyfer partneriaeth. Yn sgîl hynny rydym wedi llunio trefniant gyda hwy i anfon pobl o'r diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru i siarad gyda chwmnïau priodol o Gatalan ac fel arall. Mae gennym yr arbenigedd hwnnw yno. Fodd bynnag, o ran y dirprwyaethau masnachu—nid dim ond y rheini rwyf wedi'u cyhoeddi—y byddwn yn ymgymryd â hwy gyda Buddsoddi a Masnach y DU, pan fyddwn yn edrych ar leoedd fel Brasil a Rwsia, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn manteisio ar gymaint o gwmnïau ag y bo modd sydd ag unrhyw gysylltiad o gwbl gyda'r gwledydd hyn oherwydd os oes ganddynt berthynas dda gyda chwmni mewn gwlad o'r fath, mae'n bosibl y byddent yn gallu helpu eu cyflenwyr yn y gadwyn honno. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn buddsoddi yn hyn ac yn deall y bydd yn rhaid inni dalu arian i gronni'r manteision i economi Cymru yn yr hirdymor.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): You are on record as saying that we might not have got our branding right in the most recent past and that that might be one factor that has accounted for our decline from being good at attracting inward investment to unfortunately being at the bottom of the league table. What steps are you taking to address your own stated concerns about issues of branding, not just on trade missions, but in terms of that continued presence in world markets?

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Rydych wedi dweud ar goedd nad yw ein brandio, o bosibl, wedi bod yn gywir yn ddiweddar iawn ac mae'n bosibl y gall hynny fod yn un ffactor sy'n gyfrifol am ein dirywiad, o fod yn dda am ddenu buddsoddiad o'r tu allan i fod ar waelod tabl y gynghrair, yn anffodus. Pa gamau rydych yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon a fynegwyd gennych am faterion brandio, nid dim ond ar deithiau masnach, ond o ran y presenoldeb parhaus hwnnw ym marchnadoedd y byd?

Edwina Hart: I was honest when I spoke to the Chamber about the branding issue. You are right, and we are now appointing a branding specialist to look at how we brand Wales. However, it is important that we come up with an image that defines Wales: what is Wales? What does it stand for and what can it offer? We are hoping that, over the next few months, a brand will be developed by the person who we have employed. It is important that the people who we send out to represent Wales also understand what we mean. So, this is also about staff training and who goes out to represent us and about the type of literature that we provide and the

Edwina Hart: Roeddwn yn onest pan siaradais â'r Siambr am frandio. Rydych yn llygad eich lle, ac rydym yn penodi arbenigwr brandio yn awr i edrych ar sut rydym yn brandio Cymru. Ond, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cyflwyno delwedd sy'n diffinio Cymru: beth yw Cymru? Beth mae'n ei gynrychioli a beth y gall ei gynnig? Dros y misoedd nesaf, rydym yn gobeithio y caiff brand ei ddatblygu gan yr unigolyn a gyflogir gennym. Mae'n bwysig bod y bobl rydym yn eu hanfon i gynrychioli Cymru hefyd yn deall yr hyn a olygwn. Felly, mae hyn yn ymwneud â hyfforddi staff hefyd a phwy sydd yn ein cynrychioli, ac yn ymwneud â'r

image used in that literature as well as what we host and so on. So, it is a case of focusing on those issues over the next few months.

math o ddeunyddiau a ddarparwn a'r ddelwedd a ddefnyddir yn y deunydd hwnnw yn ogystal â'r hyn a drefnwn ac ati. Felly, mae'n fater o ganolbwyntio ar y materion hynny dros y misoedd nesaf.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I raised with the First Minister, the other day, the answer to a written question that you had sent me on locating all Welsh Government staff on the east coast of the USA rather than on the west coast, where, for example, Silicon Valley is located along with the film industry and many other types of businesses that we would be looking to attract to the UK and Wales. However, the Welsh Government has no representation there. Have you given any thought to relocating that staff footprint so that there is a Welsh presence on the west coast and we can promote Wales positively to the industries that we look to attract?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Y dydd o'r blaen, codais gyda'r Prif Weinidog yr ateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig roeddech wedi'i anfon ataf ynghylch lleoli holl staff Llywodraeth Cymru ar arfordir dwyreiniol yr UDA yn hytrach nag ar yr arfordir gorllewinol lle, er enghraifft, mae Silicon Valley wedi'i leoli ynghyd â'r diwydiant ffilmio a sawl math arall o fusnes y byddem yn awyddus i'w denu i'r DU ac i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru gynrychiolwyr yno. A ydych wedi meddwl o gwbl am ail-leoli staff fel bod presenoldeb o Gymru ar yr arfordir gorllewinol a'n bod yn gallu hyrwyddo Cymru mewn modd cadarnhaol ymhlith y diwydiannau rydym yn awyddus i'w denu?

Edwina Hart: The leader of the opposition makes a valid point, particularly in reference to the film industry. A Welsh company has already bought two companies in California. We also have strong links with Silicon Valley and people go to Seattle to see Microsoft. So, there are many issues relating to the west coast that we are currently considering and discussing. This might not be a question of relocating, but of additionality.

Edwina Hart: Mae gan arweinydd yr wrthblaid bwynt dilys, yn enwedig wrth gyfeirio at y diwydiant ffilm. Mae cwmni o Gymru eisoes wedi prynu dau gwmni yng Nghaliffornia. Mae gennym gysylltiadau cryf hefyd â Silicon Valley ac mae pobl yn mynd i Seattle i weld Microsoft. Felly, mae llawer o faterion yn ymwneud â'r arfordir gorllewinol ac rydym yn eu hystyried ac yn eu trafod ar hyn o bryd. Efallai na fydd hyn yn gwestiwn o ail-leoli, ond yn fater o ychwanegedd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Questions 8, OAQ(4)0156(BET), and 9, OAQ(4)0157(BET), have been withdrawn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 8, OAQ(4)0156(BET), a chwestiwn 9, OAQ(4)0157(BET), yn ôl.

Gwyddoniaeth

Science

10. Eluned Parrott: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0158(BET)*

10. Eluned Parrott: *Will the Minister make a statement on her priorities for science in Wales. OAQ(4)0158(BET)*

Edwina Hart: Our priorities for science in Wales are set out in the ‘Science for Wales’ strategy. This is a comprehensive blueprint for making the best of science, research, technology and innovation in Wales, showing our strong commitment to this agenda.

Edwina Hart: Mae ein blaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru wedi'u nodi yn y strategaeth ‘Gwyddoniaeth i Gymru’. Mae hon yn lasbrint cynhwysfawr ar gyfer gwneud y gorau o wyddoniaeth, ymchwil, technoleg ac arloesi yng Nghymru, gan ddangos ein hymrwymiad cryf i'r agenda hon.

Eluned Parrott: I agree, but the word, 'science' is sometimes used coterminously with the word, 'research', and the science strategy was clearly aimed at the development and improvement of science, technology, engineering and mathematics in Wales. Do you consider non-STEM-subjects academic research to be within your portfolio because it is not in that of the education Minister? If so, when can we expect to see a research strategy focusing on non-STEM subjects in Wales?

Eluned Parrott: Rwyf yn cytuno, ond weithiau defnyddir y gair 'gwyddoniaeth' ar yr un gwynt â'r gair 'ymchwil', a nod clir y strategaeth wyddoniaeth oedd datblygu a gwella gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianneg a mathemateg (STEM) yng Nghymru. A ydych yn cyfrif bod ymchwil academaidd pynciau nad ydynt yn bynciau STEM yn eich portffolio oherwydd nid yw ym mhortffolio'r Gweinidog Addysg? Os felly, pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl gweld strategaeth ymchwil sy'n canolbwyntio ar bynciau nad ydynt yn bynciau STEM yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: If the Member does not mind, I will give some further consideration to her questions. I would not want to shoot from the hip in providing an answer on my inclinations, because I feel that I need to discuss this with the chief scientific officer and others in Government before I attempt to answer that question.

Edwina Hart: Os nad oes gwahaniaeth gyda'r Aelod, byddaf yn ystyried ei chwestiynau ymhellach. Ni fyddwn am roi ateb byrbwyll o ran sut rwyf yn teimlo am hyn, gan fy mod yn credu bod angen imi drafod hyn gyda'r prif swyddog gwyddonol ac eraill yn y Llywodraeth cyn imi geisio ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw.

David Rees: As you say, the science strategy for Wales was published this year. It identifies the direction in which we are going, which I believe to be the right direction in terms of making science a leading economic growth factor. However, when will you publish a report on the progress of the science strategy, particularly in reference to the Stars Wales researchers who you identify in that strategy?

David Rees: Fel y dywedwch, cyhoeddwyd y strategaeth wyddoniaeth ar gyfer Cymru eleni. Mae'n nodi'r cyfeiriad yr ydym yn mynd iddo, a chredaf mai dyma'r cyfeiriad cywir o ran gwneud gwyddoniaeth yn un o brif ffactorau twf economaidd. Fodd bynnag, pryd y byddwch yn cyhoeddi adroddiad ar gynnydd y strategaeth wyddoniaeth, yn enwedig wrth gyfeirio at ymchwilwyr Sêr Cymru a nodir gennych yn y strategaeth?

Edwina Hart: You are referring to the Stars Wales programme, to which we have allocated a considerable amount of money. The chief scientific officer tells me that one day, someone will come on the horizon like a star and we have to nab them. However, the cash has to be in place to get them in to develop the strategy. So, if it is helpful to Members, in the autumn term, I will provide an update on the science strategy and on the issues that have been raised with me.

Edwina Hart: Rydych yn cyfeirio at y rhaglen Sêr Cymru, ac rydym wedi dyrannu swm sylweddol o arian i'r rhaglen honno. Mae'r prif swyddog gwyddonol yn dweud wrthyf y daw rhywun un diwrnod fel seren ac mae'n rhaid inni eu bachu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid i'r arian fod ar gael i'w denu er mwyn datblygu'r strategaeth. Felly, os yw o gymorth i Aelodau, yn nhymor yr hydref, byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y strategaeth wyddoniaeth ac am y materion a godwyd gyda mi.

2.45 p.m.

Nick Ramsay: I am sure that you will agree that some exciting science-related projects are going on in Wales at the moment. Eluned Parrott, other members of the Enterprise and Business Committee and I recently visited OpTIC in north Wales and Glyndŵr

Nick Ramsay: Rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod rhai prosiectau cyffrous sy'n gysylltiedig â gwyddoniaeth yn mynd rhagddynt yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Bu Eluned Parrott, aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes a minnau'n ymweld yn

University. We saw a segment of the 1.4m hexagonal mirror prototype that will go into the world’s largest telescope. I think that 700 or so segments will be created there overall. This is an exciting project, Minister, and I am sure that you are aware that OpTIC at Glyndŵr University would like to make north Wales a centre of excellence in optic technology and to be able to produce things like this mirror that are not being made anywhere else. That clearly does not fit into an enterprise zone, or a city region even. Can you tell us how you intend to support these sorts of developments, so that parts of Wales can lead the way in becoming centres of excellence for optic technology and other technologies?

ddiweddar ag OpTIC yn y gogledd ac ym Mhrifysgol Glyndŵr. Gwelsom ddarn o'r prototeip drych chweonglog 1.4m a fydd yn mynd i mewn i delesgop mwyaf y byd. Credaf y bydd oddeutu 700 o ddarnau'n cael eu creu yno i gyd. Mae hwn yn brosiect cyffrous, Weinidog, ac rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol y byddai OpTIC ym Mhrifysgol Glyndŵr yn hoffi gwneud gogledd Cymru yn ganolfan ragoriaeth ym maes technoleg optig ac i allu cynhyrchu pethau fel y drych hwn nad ydynt yn cael eu gwneud yn unrhyw le arall. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny yn ffitio i ardal fenter na dinas-ranbarth hyd yn oed. A allwch ddweud wrthym sut rydych yn bwriadu cefnogi'r mathau hyn o ddatblygiadau, fel y gall rhannau o Gymru arwain y ffordd wrth ddod yn ganolfannau rhagoriaeth ym maes technoleg optig a thechnolegau eraill?

Edwina Hart: I know that the Chief Scientific Adviser for Wales has been working closely with this absolutely fascinating and world-class project, in terms of what it is undertaking up there. We try to give as much support as we can through investment and so on, but I am more than happy to look at the issues.

Edwina Hart: Gwn fod Prif Gynghorydd Gwyddonol Cymru wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r prosiect diddorol hwn sydd o safon fyd-eang, o ran yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud yno. Rydym yn ceisio rhoi cymaint o gymorth ag y gallwn drwy fuddsoddi ac yn y blaen, ond rwyf yn fwy na pharod i edrych ar y materion.

Twristiaeth

Tourism

11. Simon Thomas: *Pa gymorth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei roi i dwristiaeth yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0154(BET)*

11. Simon Thomas: *What support does the Welsh Government give to tourism in Mid and West Wales. OAQ(4)0154(BET)*

Edwina Hart: We have allocated a total of £1.1 million to the South West Wales Tourism Partnership and to Tourism Partnership Mid Wales for 2012-13 for the promotion and development of their regional tourism priorities, which are aligned to our national priorities.

Edwina Hart: Rydym wedi dyrannu cyfanswm o £1.1 miliwn i Bartneriaeth Twristiaeth De Orllewin Cymru ac i Bartneriaeth Twristiaeth Canolbarth Cymru ar gyfer 2012-13 er mwyn hyrwyddo a datblygu eu blaenoriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol, sydd yn cyd-fynd â'n blaenoriaethau cenedlaethol.

Simon Thomas: I thank the Minister for that reply. Does she agree that the revitalisation and the use of many of our town centres, particularly historic town centres like Cardigan, with its castle, and Fishguard, as a port, will be key to keeping tourists and their spend in our local economies? When I talk to businesses in those sorts of towns, they mainly complain about business rates. I do

Simon Thomas: Diolch i’r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. A yw'n cytuno bod adfywio a defnyddio canol nifer o'n trefi, yn enwedig canol trefi hanesyddol fel Aberteifi, gyda'i chastell, ac Abergwaun, fel porthladd, yn allweddol i gadw twristiaid yn ein heconomïau lleol a'u cael i wario ynddynt? Pan fyddaf yn siarad â busnesau yn y mathau hynny o drefi, cwyno am ardrethi busnes y

not want to complain about business rates at this moment, but to ask the Minister whether there is a more creative way of using business rates and giving local businesses more bang for their bucks with business improvement districts, for example. Will she examine the Scottish model, which has slightly different and slightly wider legislation, to see whether there is a way to do something a bit different in Wales that brings tourist communities together? For example, on the west Wales coast, you could have a whole district from St Davids to Cardigan working together as a tourist attraction. I hope that she will look at such ideas as she goes forward.

maent yn bennaf. Nid wyf am gwyno am ardrethi busnes ar hyn o bryd, ond rwyf am ofyn i'r Gweinidog a oes ffordd fwy creadigol o ddefnyddio ardrethi busnes a rhoi mwy o werth am eu harian i fusnesau lleol gydag ardaloedd gwella busnes, er enghraifft. A wnaiff hi edrych ar fodel yr Alban, sydd â deddfwriaeth ychydig yn wahanol ac ychydig yn ehangach, i weld a oes modd gwneud rhywbeth ychydig yn wahanol yng Nghymru sy'n dod â chymunedau twristiaid at ei gilydd? Er enghraifft, ar arfordir gorllewin Cymru, gallech gael ardal gyfan o Dyddewi i Aberteifi yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd fel atyniad i dwristiaid. Gobeithio y bydd yn edrych ar syniadau o'r fath wrth iddi symud yn ei blaen.

Edwina Hart: The Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage and I have looked into the whole issue of heritage tourism and what more we can do to enhance it, particularly in areas such as those that you have outlined. We have an exciting report from Professor Morgan on business rates, which is allowing people to think outside the box. He is having further discussions, but I will be more than happy to put this suggestion into the mix before I make any final decisions on this, because it is a question of getting what is right for every area and every part of Wales to develop the industry. Tourism is integral to developing some parts of Wales and for employment opportunities. It is also a question of valuing that employment, so that hospitality is not seen as something that just anybody can do, but that people realise that it is a career and that you must have the appropriate standards to match.

Edwina Hart: Mae'r Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth a minnau wedi edrych ar yr holl fater o dwristiaeth treftadaeth a beth arall y gallwn ei wneud i'w gwella, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd tebyg i'r hyn rydych wedi'u nodi. Mae gennym adroddiad cyffrous gan yr Athro Morgan am ardrethi busnes, sy'n rhoi cyfle i bobl feddwl o bersbectif gwahanol. Mae'n cael trafodaethau pellach, ond byddaf yn fwy na pharod i ychwanegu'r awgrym hwn at y gweddill cyn imi wneud unrhyw benderfyniadau terfynol ar hyn, gan ei fod yn fater o gael yr hyn sy'n iawn i bob ardal a phob rhan o Gymru i ddatblygu'r diwydiant. Mae twristiaeth yn rhan annatod o ddatblygu rhai rhannau o Gymru ac ar gyfer cyfleoedd cyflogaeth. Mae hefyd yn fater o werthfawrogi'r gyflogaeth honno, fel nad yw lletygarwch yn cael ei weld fel rhywbeth y gall unrhyw un ei gynnig, ond bod pobl yn sylweddoli bod hyn yn yrfa a bod yn rhaid ichi gael y safonau priodol ar gyfer hynny.

Paul Davies: Minister, a number of concerns have been raised with me over the plans for new marine conservation zones off the coast of my constituency, particularly in relation to the effect that they will have on people’s livelihoods, and on tourism and on tourist operators. As you are aware, tourism is one of the key industries in my constituency and is of huge importance to the local economy. Can you tell us what discussions you have had with your colleague the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development on this issue, and what assessment you have

Paul Davies: Weinidog, mae sawl pryder wedi'i godi gyda mi ynghylch y cynlluniau ar gyfer parthau cadwraeth morol newydd oddi ar arfordir fy etholaeth, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r effaith y byddant yn ei chael ar fywoliaeth pobl, ac ar dwristiaeth ac ar gwmnïau twristiaeth. Fel y gwyddoch, twristiaeth yw un o'r prif ddiwydiannau yn fy etholaeth ac mae'n hynod bwysig i'r economi leol. A allwch ddweud wrthym pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael gyda'ch cyd-Aelod, Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy ar y mater hwn, a pha

made of the impact of these plans on the tourism industry in Pembrokeshire, so that they can be fed into the consultation process?

asesiad rydych wedi ei wneud o effaith y cynlluniau hyn ar y diwydiant twristiaeth yn sir Benfro, er mwyn iddynt fod yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori?

Edwina Hart: I have had the opportunity to mention the issues to my ministerial colleague, particularly around fishing and the impact on tourism when beaches are closed and people turn up with buckets and spades. We now have officials working together to look at some of the issues that I have raised in terms of some of the priorities that he has in his portfolio and the priorities that I have in mine.

Edwina Hart: Rwyf wedi cael cyfle i sôn am y materion wrth fy nghyd-Weinidog, yn enwedig pysgota a'r effaith ar dwristiaeth pan fydd traethau ar gau a phobl yn cyrraedd gyda'u bwcedi a rhaw. Erbyn hyn mae gennym swyddogion yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i edrych ar rai o'r materion rwyf wedi'u codi o ran rhai o'r blaenoriaethau sydd ganddo yn ei bortffolio a'r blaenoriaethau sydd gennyf yn fy mhortffolio.

The Presiding Officer: Question 12, OAQ(4)0153(BET), is withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 12, OAQ(4)0153(BET), yn ôl.

Polisi Pysgodfeydd

Fisheries Policy

13. Janet Finch-Saunders: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisi Pysgodfeydd Llywodraeth Cymru. OAQ(4)0152(BET*

13. Janet Finch-Saunders: *Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's Fisheries policy. OAQ(4)0152(BET)*

Alun Davies: The Welsh Government supports the development of viable and sustainable fisheries in line with the existing fisheries strategy, which has served the industry well, but I believe that it is now time to review that strategy to ensure that it is relevant for the current needs of Wales and for our role in Europe.

Alun Davies: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cefnogi'r gwaith o ddatblygu pysgodfeydd hyfyw a chynaliadwy yn unol â'r strategaeth pysgodfeydd bresennol, sydd wedi yn fuddiol i'r diwydiant, ond credaf ei bod yn hen bryd adolygu'r strategaeth honno yn awr er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn berthnasol i anghenion presennol Cymru ac i'n rôl yn Ewrop.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Thank you for that response, Deputy Minister. Concerns have been raised with me that unlit scallop dredges have allegedly been operating in the Pen Llŷn a'r Sarnau special area of conservation at night, causing potential damage to the marine environment. Vessel-tracking devices that enable the Welsh Government to monitor the movement of these ships operating in Welsh waters have been cited as an effective way of remedying potential illicit activities in these areas, and are required by EU regulation 404/2011. Will the Minister make a statement on the use of VTDs and assure the Chamber that all scallop-dredging vessels operating in Wales, whether they are Welsh boats or not, are compliant, so that this highly damaging practice can be monitored and prevented effectively?

Janet Finch-Saunders: Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Mae pryderon wedi'u codi gyda mi ynghylch honiadau bod llusgrwydi cregyn bylchog heb olau wedi cael eu defnyddio yn ardal cadwraeth arbennig Pen Llŷn a Sarnau yn y nos, gan achosi niwed posibl i'r amgylchedd morol. Dywedir bod dyfeisiau dilyn llongau sy'n galluogi Llywodraeth Cymru i fonitro symudiadau'r llongau hyn sy'n gweithredu yn nyfroedd Cymru yn ffordd effeithiol o atal gweithgareddau anghyfreithlon posibl yn yr ardaloedd hyn, ac mae'n ofynnol yn ôl rheoliad 404/2011 yr UE. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddefnyddio'r dyfeisiau dilyn llongau a rhoi sicrwydd i'r Siambr bod yr holl longau sy'n carthu cregyn bylchog sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru, pa un ai a ydynt yn gychod o Gymru neu beidio, yn cydymffurfio, fel bod modd monitro ac atal

yr arfer hynod niweidiol hwn yn effeithiol?

Alun Davies: I am sure that our enforcement regime throughout Welsh waters is sufficient to meet our statutory responsibilities and to ensure that the issues covered by the question are sufficiently well addressed. If the Member has any evidence of any such activity taking place in Welsh waters, I would be grateful if she could write to me with that evidence, and I will take the appropriate action.

Alun Davies: Rwyf yn siŵr bod ein trefn orfodi drwy holl ddyfroedd Cymru yn ddigonol i fodloni ein cyfrifoldebau statudol ac i sicrhau bod y materion a godir yn y cwestiwn yn cael digon o sylw. Os oes gan yr Aelod unrhyw dystiolaeth o unrhyw weithgaredd o'r fath yn digwydd yn nyfroedd Cymru, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai ysgrifennu ataf gan roi'r dystiolaeth honno, a gwnaf gymryd y camau priodol.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Yn dilyn y cytundeb a gafwyd yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â pholisi pysgodfeydd Ewropeaidd, a yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi cael cyfle i ystyried a oes modd symud ymlaen gyda'r posibilrwydd o sicrhau bod y moroedd Celtaidd yn is-ranbarth, neu yn ardal benodol, o fewn unrhyw ddatblygiad a fydd yn ymweud â physgota yn rhanbarthol ar hyd moroedd gorllewin Ewrop?

Lord Elis-Thomas: Following the recent agreement on the European fisheries policy, has the Deputy Minister had an opportunity to consider whether it would be possible to make progress on the possibility of ensuring that the Celtic seas are designated a sub-region, or a specific area, within any development on regional fishing in western European seas?

Alun Davies: The EU Agriculture and Fisheries Council of Ministers reached a common approach on key proposals on the reformed common fisheries policy in the early hours of 13 June. I represented the Welsh Government at that meeting. I was very pleased with the results and the agreement that we were able to reach, in terms of regionalisation and of wider issues relating to CFP reform. The Plaid Cymru spokesperson on these matters has identified a key issue that we need to get right. I believe that the new common fisheries policy will provide us with a statutory framework within which we can better manage the waters around our coast and those throughout the whole Irish sea. Clearly, these are matters that not only affect Wales, but other Governments and administrations. At the moment, I am looking at ways in which we can progress these matters. I certainly agree with the Member for Dwyfor Meirionydd that this would be a key policy objective for us and other administrations. It is certainly something that will be guiding my actions over the coming months.

Alun Davies: Yn ystod oriau mân 13 Mehefin, cytunodd Cyngor Gweinidogion yr UE ar gyfer Amaethyddiaeth a Physgodfeydd ar ffordd gyffredin o ymdrin â chynigion allweddol ar y polisi pysgodfeydd cyffredin diwygiedig. Roeddwn yn cynrychioli Llywodraeth Cymru yn y cyfarfod hwnnw. Roeddwn yn hapus iawn gyda'r canlyniadau a'r cytundeb y llwyddom i'w gyrraedd, o ran datganoli cyfrifoldeb i'r rhanbarthau ac o ran materion ehangach sy'n ymwneud â diwygio'r polisi pysgodfeydd cyffredin. Mae llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar y materion hyn wedi nodi mater allweddol ac mae angen inni ei gael yn iawn. Credaf y bydd y polisi pysgodfeydd cyffredin newydd yn rhoi fframwaith statudol inni y gallwn ei ddefnyddio i fynd ati'n well i reoli'r dyfroedd o amgylch ein harfordir a thrwy fôr Iwerddon i gyd. Yn amlwg, mae'r rhain yn faterion sydd yn effeithio ar Gymru yn ogystal ag ar Lywodraethau a gweinyddiaethau eraill. Ar hyn o bryd, rwyf yn edrych ar ffyrdd y gallwn symud ymlaen â'r materion hyn. Rwyf yn sicr yn cytuno â'r Aelod dros Ddwyfor Meirionnydd y byddai hyn yn amcan polisi allweddol inni ac i weinyddiaethau eraill. Mae'n sicr yn rhywbeth a fydd yn llywio fy nghamau gweithredu dros y misoedd nesaf.

Aled Roberts: Ddirprwy Weinidog, wrth

Aled Roberts: Deputy Minister, in looking at

ystyried y cynigion a wnaed ar gyfer parthau cadwraeth morol, a yw eich Llywodraeth chi wedi cael trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig neu Lywodraeth unrhyw wlad arall yn Ewrop ynglŷn â'r hawliau pysgota hanesyddol sydd gan wledydd eraill o fewn moroedd Cymru?

proposals for the marine conservation zones, has your Government had discussions with the United Kingdom Government or the Government of any other European country on the historic fishing rights of other countries in Welsh waters?

Alun Davies: The Member—and other Members—may be aware that I made a statement in March to the Chamber on my priorities for taking forward fisheries policies in Wales. I believe that the Member is referring to grandfather rights within inshore fisheries in Wales. It is my intention to make a further written statement on this matter before the summer recess. I have completed consultation on the matter. I have completed consideration of further legislation in this field. I hope to publish my decision on this issue next week. When I have done so, I hope that the way forward that we have identified will ensure that we have the sustainability that we need to protect our inshore fisheries, and will also provide the fishing industry along the Welsh coastline with an opportunity to grow and expand. I will be making a further written statement on these matters next week.

Alun Davies: Mae'n bosibl bod yr Aelod—ac Aelodau eraill—yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi gwneud datganiad i'r Siambr ym mis Mawrth ar fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer cyflwyno polisïau pysgodfeydd yng Nghymru. Rwyf yn credu bod yr Aelod yn cyfeirio at hawliau taid ar gyfer pysgodfeydd y glannau yng Nghymru. Mae'n fwriad gennyf wneud datganiad ysgrifenedig arall ar y mater hwn cyn toriad yr haf. Rwyf wedi cwblhau ymgynghoriad ar y mater. Rwyf wedi cwblhau'r gwaith o edrych ar ddeddfwriaeth bellach yn y maes hwn. Rwyf yn gobeithio cyhoeddi fy mhenderfyniad ar y mater hwn yr wythnos nesaf. Pan fyddaf wedi gwneud hynny, rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y ffordd ymlaen a nodwyd gennym yn sicrhau bod gennym y cynaliadwyedd angenrheidiol i warchod y pysgodfeydd ar ein glannau, ac y bydd hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i'r diwydiant pysgota ar hyd arfordir Cymru dyfu ac ehangu. Byddaf yn gwneud datganiad ysgrifenedig arall ar y materion hyn yr wythnos nesaf.

Hybu Twristiaeth

Promoting Tourism

15. Elin Jones*: Beth yw cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cymru i hybu twristiaeth. OAQ(4)0164(BET)*

***15. Elin Jones:** What are the Welsh Government's plans to promote tourism. OAQ(4)0164(BET)*

Edwina Hart: The programme for government sets out the actions being undertaken to promote Wales as a destination.

Edwina Hart: Mae'r rhaglen lywodraethu yn nodi'r camau sy'n cael eu cymryd i hyrwyddo Cymru fel cyrchfan.

Elin Jones: Cyhoeddodd Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru adroddiad yn ddiweddar sy'n dangos bod 90 y cant o ymwelwyr yn Lloegr yn Saeson a bod 50 y cant o ymwelwyr yn yr Alban yn Albanwyr, ond mai dim ond 20 y cant o ymwelwyr yng Nghymru sy'n Gymry. Sut mae'r Gweinidog am gynyddu nifer y Cymry sy'n ymweld ag ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru, ac sydd felly'n dwristiaid yn eu gwlad eu hunain?

Elin Jones: The Wales Tourism Alliance recently published a report showing that 90% of visitors in England are English and that 50% of visitors in Scotland are Scottish, but that only 20% of visitors in Wales are Welsh. How is the Minister going to increase the number of Welsh people who visit other parts of Wales, thereby becoming tourists in their own country?

Edwina Hart: I think that that is an exceptionally valid point, because we have to think more about where we holiday at home, and not just for the week or fortnight that people tend to take, but for short breaks, too. Wales is an enormously diverse country in the opportunities that it offers, despite being a small country.

Edwina Hart: Credaf fod hyn yn bwynt dilys iawn, oherwydd mae’n rhaid inni feddwl mwy am i le rydym yn mynd ar ein gwyliau gartref, ac nid dim ond am yr wythnos neu’r pythefnos y mae pobl yn tueddu i'w cymryd, ond pan fyddwn yn mynd ar wyliau byr hefyd. Mae Cymru'n wlad hynod amrywiol o ran y cyfleoedd y mae'n eu cynnig, er ei bod yn wlad fach.

We have done a lot on our outward and inward profile through Visit Wales’s ‘proper holidays’ campaigns and so on. We have picked up on telephone advertising, and we have done a lot of things around the Olympics and the Jubilee. It is certainly one of the issues that I will raise because, having looked at the English market to see how we can do more, we have to look at how we can be more loyal to our own country in the visits that we undertake.

Rydym wedi gwneud llawer ar ein proffil allanol a mewnol drwy ymgyrchoedd ‘gwyliau go iawn’ Croeso Cymru ac yn y blaen. Rydym wedi cychwyn hysbysebu dros y ffôn, ac rydym wedi gwneud llawer o bethau yn ymwneud â'r Gemau Olympaidd a'r Jiwbilî. Mae'n sicr yn un o'r materion y byddaf yn ei godi oherwydd, ar ôl edrych ar y farchnad yn Lloegr i weld sut y gallwn wneud mwy, mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar sut y gallwn fod yn fwy ffyddlon i'n gwlad eu hunain o ran ein hymweliadau.

Suzy Davies: What engagement do you plan to have with the industry beyond the tourism sector panel in devising your new tourism strategy?

Suzy Davies: Pa fath o ymgysylltu rydych yn bwriadu ei gael gyda'r diwydiant heblaw am y panel sector twristiaeth wrth lunio'ch strategaeth dwristiaeth newydd?

Edwina Hart: I have some regional tourism partnerships currently in existence, but I have asked for a review of their structures in light of the establishment of the tourism panel. I go out and about to visit individuals and so on, and I am invited to talk about some wider tourism issues. My officials engage all the time, and so does my panel.

Edwina Hart: Mae gennyf rywfaint o bartneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol ar hyn o bryd, ond rwyf wedi gofyn am adolygiad o'u strwythurau yn sgîl sefydlu'r panel twristiaeth. Byddaf yn mynd i ymweld ag unigolion ac yn y blaen, ac rwyf yn cael fy ngwahodd i siarad am faterion twristiaeth ehangach. Mae fy swyddogion yn ymgysylltu drwy'r amser, ac mae fy mhanel yn gwneud hynny hefyd.

Cwestiwn Brys
Urgent Question

Remploy

Mick Antoniw: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad brys ar y goblygiadau i Remploy yng Nghymru yn sgîl datganiad Maria Miller, Gweinidog Llywodraeth y DU dros Bobl Anabl, ar benderfyniad Bwrdd Remploy. EAQ(4)0167(ESK)*

Mick Antoniw: *Will the Minister make an urgent statement on the implications for Remploy in Wales following the statement by Maria Miller, the UK Government Minister for Disabled People, on the Remploy Board decision. EAQ(4)0167(ESK)*

The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews): This news is

Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau (Leighton Andrews): Mae hyn yn newyddion ofnadwy

devastating for workers, their families and communities in Wales. It is a grave disappointment to Members here who have worked to keep those factories open. Our priority now is to secure as many jobs as possible for displaced, disabled Remploy workers. I hope to make a full statement next week.

i weithwyr, eu teuluoedd a'u cymunedau yng Nghymru. Mae'n siom ddifrifol i Aelodau yma sydd wedi gweithio i gadw'r ffatrïoedd hynny ar agor. Ein blaenoriaeth nawr yw sicrhau cymaint â phosibl o swyddi i weithwyr anabl Remploy sydd wedi'u dadleoli. Gobeithiaf wneud datganiad llawn yr wythnos nesaf.

Mick Antoniw: I welcome the work that is being done behind the scenes to support Remploy workers. Obviously, your hands are tied to some degree by the refusal of the UK Government to devolve responsibility for Remploy. There has been an 80% ballot of Remploy workers for industrial action. These workers have conducted themselves with considerable dignity over the past months. Will you join me and other Assembly Members in supporting the workers at Remploy in the action that they take to fight for and protect their jobs?

Mick Antoniw: Croesawaf y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud yn y dirgel i gefnogi gweithwyr Remploy. Yn amlwg, mae eich dwylo wedi'u clymu i raddau gan fod Llywodraeth y DU yn gwrthod datganoli cyfrifoldeb am Remploy. Mae 80 y cant o weithwyr Remploy wedi pleidleisio o blaid gweithredu diwydiannol. Mae'r gweithwyr hyn wedi ymddwyn ag urddas sylweddol dros y misoedd diwethaf. A ymunwch â mi ac Aelodau Cynulliad eraill i gefnogi'r camau y mae gweithwyr Remploy yn eu cymryd i frwydro dros eu swyddi a'u hamddiffyn?

Leighton Andrews: Indeed. I am sure that a number of us will be joining workers in our constituencies at Remploy factories who are members principally of Unite or GMB. We have held a series of meetings with the trade unions and other interested parties, including the Wales Co-operative Centre, Social Firms Wales, private sector businesses with an interest in the work being undertaken in some of the factories, and local authority leaders who may be in a position to assist us in the work that we intend to take forward. As I said, I hope to have more to say next week, when we will have concluded some of the policy and legal issues that we are currently considering.

Leighton Andrews: Yn wir. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd nifer ohonom yn ymuno â gweithwyr yn ein hetholaethau mewn ffatrïoedd Remploy sy'n aelodau o Unite neu GMB yn bennaf. Rydym wedi cynnal cyfres o gyfarfodydd â'r undebau llafur a phartïon eraill â diddordeb, gan gynnwys Canolfan Cydweithredol Cymru, Cwmnïau Cymdeithasol Cymru, busnesau'r sector preifat â diddordeb yn y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud yn rhai o'r ffatrïoedd, ac arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol a all fod mewn sefyllfa i'n cynorthwyo gyda'r gwaith rydym yn bwriadu ei wneud. Fel y dywedais, gobeithiaf y bydd gennyf fwy i'w ddweud yr wythnos nesaf, pan fyddwn wedi cwblhau rhai o'r materion polisi a'r materion cyfreithiol rydym yn eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I look forward to your statement next week, Minister, when, as you have indicated, you will bring more information to the Chamber. A critical consideration now is to work to make sure that the funding that is there to support workers with training and in finding alternative employment is used to its best advantage. What sort of engagement will you have with the UK Government to make sure that the sums of £18 million and £8 million that have been allocated for these specific purposes can be best utilised here in Wales?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Edrychaf ymlaen at eich datganiad yr wythnos nesaf, Weinidog, pan, fel y dywedwch, y dewch â mwy o wybodaeth i'r Siambr. Un ystyriaeth hollbwysig nawr yw gwaith i sicrhau bod y cyllid sydd ar gael i gefnogi gweithwyr â hyfforddiant a dod o hyd i gyflogaeth arall yn cael ei ddefnyddio cystal â phosibl. Sut rydych am ymgysylltu â Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau bod y symiau o £18 miliwn ac £8 miliwn a ddyrannwyd at y dibenion penodol hyn yn cael eu defnyddio cystal â phosibl yma yng Nghymru?

Leighton Andrews: My officials have had a number of conversations just in the last week with officials in the Department for Work and Pensions about the use of funding to support Remploy workers, and they are very clear as to our views. I had a conversation yesterday on the statement made by the UK Minister for Disabled People on this subject as well, although she was not entirely across all of the detail.

Leighton Andrews: Mae fy swyddogion wedi cael nifer o sgyrsiau yn yr wythnos ddiwethaf â swyddogion yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau am ddefnyddio cyllid i gefnogi gweithwyr Remploy, ac mae ein safbwyntiau'n glir iawn iddynt. Cefais sgwrs ddoe am ddatganiad Gweinidog y DU dros Bobl Anabl am y pwnc hwn hefyd, er nad oedd hi'n gwbl gyfarwydd â'r manylion i gyd.

Lindsay Whittle: To counteract this blatant policy of discrimination, will you please make representations to the UK Minister for Disabled People, Maria Miller, that no Remploy factory will be closed in Wales until each potentially redundant worker has been found alternative employment? Can you convey to the Minister our thanks for her letter today and remind her, as Andrew R.T. Davies said, that this is not about money? For many of these workers, it is about feeling valued and having self-respect.

Lindsay Whittle: I wrthweithio'r polisi hwn o wahaniaethu amlwg, a wnewch sylwadau i Weinidog y DU dros Bobl Anabl, Maria Miller, na chaiff unrhyw ffatri Remploy ei chau yng Nghymru nes i gyflogaeth arall gael ei chanfod i bob gweithiwr a allai gael ei ddiswyddo? A allwch gyfleu ein diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei llythyr heddiw a'i hatgoffa, fel y dywedodd Andrew R.T. Davies, nad mater o arian yw hwn? I lawer o'r gweithwyr hyn, mae'n fater o deimlo eu bod yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi a chael hunan-barch.

3.00 p.m.

Leighton Andrews: I think that the UK Minister is in no doubt about the views of the Welsh Government in respect of the Remploy workers and factories in Wales. We have had—I think that I am right in saying—two meetings, telephone conversations and extensive correspondence on the subject. We are opposed to the closure of Remploy factories in Wales and have been from the beginning. We sought the devolution of the budgets for Remploy, which was not agreed by the UK Government. We will now look to see what we can do to support Remploy workers.

Leighton Andrews: Ni chredaf fod gan Weinidog y DU unrhyw amheuaeth am safbwyntiau Llywodraeth Cymru am weithwyr a ffatrïoedd Remploy yng Nghymru. Rydym wedi cael—credaf fy mod yn gywir wrth ddweud hyn—dau gyfarfod, sgyrsiau ar y ffôn a llawer o ohebiaeth am y pwnc. Rydym yn gwrthwynebu cau ffatrïoedd Remploy yng Nghymru ac rydym wedi gwneud hynny o'r dechrau. Gofynasom am ddatganoli cyllidebau Remploy, ac ni chytunodd Llywodraeth y DU â hynny. Nawr, ceisiwn weld beth y gallwn ei wneud i gefnogi gweithwyr Remploy.

Eluned Parrott: The loss of these jobs is incredibly sad and I am sure that the thoughts of all of those in the Chamber today will be with those affected and their families. As you rightly say, it is critically important that support is given to those individuals who find themselves in this difficult position. What discussion has the Welsh Government had with organisations such as Disability Wales, Diverse Cymru, Mind Cymru and Disability Rights UK about the best way to offer support to disabled workers?

Eluned Parrott: Mae colli'r swyddi hyn yn beth anhygoel o drist ac rwyf yn siŵr y bydd pawb yn y Siambr heddiw'n meddwl am y bobl y mae hyn wedi effeithio arnynt a'u teuluoedd. Fel y dywedwch, yn gywir, mae'n hollbwysig rhoi cefnogaeth i'r unigolion hynny sydd yn y sefyllfa anodd hon. Pa drafodaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i chael â sefydliadau megis Anabledd Cymru, Diverse Cymru, Mind Cymru a Hawliau Anabledd y DU am y ffordd orau o gefnogi gweithwyr anabl?

Leighton Andrews: We have had a number of conversations with a number of organisations, not confined to those listed. Many organisations have taken part—I mentioned Social Firms Wales and the Wales Co-operative Centre, but I could have mentioned RCT Homes and others—in helping us to explore opportunities for social enterprise solutions going forwards and in looking at other solutions. I have to say to the Member that it appears to be the price of Liberal Democrat opportunities for constitutional reform that is underpinning savage cuts in the welfare state in the United Kingdom.

Leighton Andrews: Rydym wedi cael nifer o drafodaethau â nifer o sefydliadau, nid dim ond y rhai a restrwyd. Mae llawer o sefydliadau wedi cymryd rhan—soniais am Gwmnïau Cymdeithasol Cymru a Chanolfan Cydweithredol Cymru, ond gallwn fod wedi sôn am RCT Homes ac eraill—yn y broses o'n helpu i archwilio cyfleoedd am ddatrysiadau menter gymdeithasol yn y dyfodol ac edrych ar ddatrysiadau eraill. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth yr Aelod ei bod yn ymddangos mai pris cyfleoedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am ddiwygio cyfansoddiadol sy'n tanategu'r toriadau creulon hyn yng ngwladwriaeth les y Deyrnas Unedig.

Mike Hedges: I have talked to a number of people who are about to lose their jobs in Remploy. Most of them are severely devastated and many of them fear that they will never work again. I think that that is really hitting home. Minister, you have made the offer of devolving Remploy to Wales. Is that offer still available to the Westminster Government? If the Liberal Democrats wanted to, could they threaten the Westminster Government so that it gets it done?

Mike Hedges: Rwyf wedi siarad â nifer o bobl sydd ar fin colli eu swyddi yn Remploy. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt wedi'u siomi'n aruthrol ac mae llawer ohonynt yn ofni na wnânt byth weithio eto. Credaf fod hynny'n eu taro'n galed iawn. Weinidog, rydych wedi cynnig datganoli Remploy i Gymru. A yw'r cynnig hwnnw'n dal i fod ar gael i Lywodraeth San Steffan? A allai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fygwth Llywodraeth San Steffan er mwyn achosi i hynny ddigwydd, pe baent yn dymuno gwneud hynny?

Leighton Andrews: My colleague the Member for Swansea East makes a telling point. He will be aware that I visited all the Remploy factories in Wales, along with some colleagues from here and from Westminster. We have discussed the challenges facing the workers in those factories, including the one in Swansea. Now that we are clear about the UK Government's decision on five of those factories, it is for us to look to what we can do to offer support to Remploy workers going forward as they seek alternative employment. If the UK Government—even at the eleventh hour—were to offer the devolution of the Remploy factories in Wales and the budgets that underpin them, we would be happy to look at what we could do to create a positive future going forward.

Leighton Andrews: Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Aelod Dwyrain Abertawe, yn gwneud pwynt pwysig. Bydd yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi ymweld â phob ffatri Remploy yng Nghymru, ynghyd â rhai o'm cydweithwyr o'r fan hyn ac o San Steffan. Rydym wedi trafod yr heriau sy'n wynebu gweithwyr y ffatrïoedd hynny, gan gynnwys yr un yn Abertawe. A ninnau bellach yn glir am benderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU am bump o'r ffatrïoedd hynny, mae gofyn inni edrych ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i gefnogi gweithwyr Remploy yn y dyfodol wrth iddynt geisio cyflogaeth arall. Pe bai Llywodraeth y DU—hyd yn oed ar yr unfed awr ar ddeg—yn cynnig datganoli ffatrïoedd Remploy yng Nghymru a'r cyllidebau sy'n eu tanategu, byddem yn hapus i edrych ar yr hyn y gallem ei wneud i symud ymlaen at ddyfodol cadarnhaol.

Peter Black: I congratulate the Minister on doing far more to help Remploy workers than Peter Hain, who closed 28 factories and put

Peter Black: Llongyfarchiadau i'r Gweinidog am wneud llawer mwy i helpu gweithwyr Remploy na Peter Hain, a gaeodd

2,000 workers on the dole. As regards the Bridgend Remploy factory—which is remaining open and for which the business plan has being accepted—there are some good social enterprises at that factory, including the one making animal bedding. What support can the Government give to them to make that a success?

28 o ffatrïoedd gan roi 2,000 o weithwyr ar y dôl. O ran ffatri Remploy Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr—sy’n aros ar agor gyda chynllun busnes wedi’i dderbyn ar ei chyfer—ceir rhai mentrau cymdeithasol da yn y ffatri honno, gan gynnwys yr un sy’n gwneud defnydd gwely i anifeiliaid. Pa gefnogaeth all y Llywodraeth ei rhoi iddynt i sicrhau bod hynny’n llwyddiant?

Leighton Andrews: I have visited the Bridgend factory and am aware of the different strands of work that exist within the factory, including the social enterprise that was referred to. We are exploring a number of options. It is too early to say that the future of that factory or the one in Croespenmaen is guaranteed. The business plans have been accepted at this stage, but there is further work to be done. Members can rest assured that we, as a Government, continue to give support—from my department and that of the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science—to the workers and the management teams who are looking at positive futures for their businesses.

Leighton Andrews: Rwyf wedi ymweld â ffatri Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ac rwyf yn ymwybodol o’r gwahanol fathau o waith sy’n bodoli yn y ffatri, gan gynnwys y fenter gymdeithasol y cyfeiriwyd ati. Rydym yn archwilio nifer o ddewisiadau. Mae’n rhy gynnar i ddweud bod sicrwydd i ddyfodol y ffatri honno na’r un yng Nghroespenmaen. Mae’r cynlluniau busnes wedi cael eu derbyn, ond mae mwy o waith i’w wneud. Gall Aelodau fod yn dawel eu meddyliau ein bod ni, fel Llywodraeth, yn parhau i roi cefnogaeth—gan fy adran a gan adran y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth—i’r gweithwyr a’r timau rheoli sy’n edrych ar ddyfodol cadarnhaol i’w busnesau.

David Rees: Minister, I welcome your visit to our factory in Baglan earlier this year. While it is sad that the closure of these five factories has been announced and only two have temporarily not been given a closure notice, two that were not originally included will now be included, and I understand that they are bringing forward the review of those. I ask you to ensure that you do not take your eye off the ball with those two, particularly those businesses that are looking to be profitable.

David Rees: Weinidog, croesawaf eich ymweliad â’n ffatri ym Maglan yn gynharach eleni. Er bod y cyhoeddiad am gau’r pum ffatri hyn yn drist, ac mai dim ond dwy sydd heb gael rhybudd cau dros dro, caiff dwy arall eu cynnwys nawr nad oeddent wedi’u cynnwys yn wreiddiol, a deallaf eu bod yn dwyn ymlaen y gwaith o adolygu’r rheini. Gofynnaf ichi sicrhau eich bod yn cadw eich llygad ar y bêl o ran y ddwy hynny, yn enwedig y busnesau sy’n edrych yn broffidiol.

Leighton Andrews: I think that my colleague the Member for Aberavon will accept that there is no danger of me taking my eye off the ball on this issue, not least because one of the two is in my own constituency, and is a successful business engaged in e-cycling—recycling computers, data cleansing, and so on. Also, I am aware that the management and workers at the factory in Baglan have ambitious plans for the development of their enterprise going forward as well. However, we will certainly be alert to the new challenge of looking at the future of those factories at an earlier stage.

Leighton Andrews: Credaf y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Aelod Aberafan, yn derbyn nad oes unrhyw berygl imi beidio â chadw fy llygad ar y bêl o ran y mater hwn, a hynny’n bennaf gan fod un o’r ddwy yn fy etholaeth, a’i fod yn fusnes llwyddiannus sy’n ymwneud ag e-gylchu—ailgylchu cyfrifiaduron, glanhau data ac ati. Rwyf hefyd yn ymwybodol bod gan reolwyr a gweithwyr y ffatri ym Maglan gynlluniau uchelgeisiol i ddatblygu eu menter i’r dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn sicr yn ymwybodol o’r her newydd o edrych ar ddyfodol y ffatrïoedd hynny’n gynharach.

Datganiad: Adroddiad y Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar Ddinas-ranbarthau
Statement: The City Regions Task and Finish Group

The Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science (Edwina Hart): I am delighted to be able to present Members with the task and finish group report on city regions. I must begin by thanking the group, led by Dr Elizabeth Haywood, for producing such a thorough report. When I established the city regions task and finish group, I gave it a very clear remit to consider the evidence for supporting city regions as drivers of economic growth. The group's members were drawn from across Wales and beyond, and the wealth of their knowledge and expertise is evident throughout the report.

Y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth (Edwina Hart): Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf allu cyflwyno adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar ddinas-ranbarthau i Aelodau. Rhaid imi ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r grŵp, o dan arweiniad Dr Elizabeth Haywood, am gynhyrchu adroddiad mor drwyadl. Pan sefydlais y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar ddinas-ranbarthau, rhoddais gylch gwaith clir iawn iddo i ystyried y dystiolaeth o blaid cefnogi dinas-ranbarthau i sbarduno twf economaidd. Daw aelodau'r grŵp o bob rhan o Gymru a thu hwnt, ac mae eu cyfoeth o wybodaeth ac arbenigedd yn amlwg drwy'r adroddiad i gyd.

I am sure that Members will agree that the group's efforts to engage with business and others are to be commended, and when combined with the examples and evidence it has gathered from other countries, it provides us with a comprehensive report to consider. I want to be clear from the outset that I welcome this report and feel that it will have a significant contribution to make to inform future policy.

Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau'n cytuno y dylid cymeradwyo ymdrechion y grŵp i ymgysylltu â busnesau ac eraill, ac o'i gyfuno â'r enghreifftiau a'r dystiolaeth y mae wedi'i gasglu o wledydd eraill, mae'n rhoi adroddiad cynhwysfawr inni ei ystyried. Hoffwn fod yn glir o'r dechrau fy mod yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn ac yn teimlo y gall gyfrannu'n sylweddol at roi sail i bolisïau yn y dyfodol.

The evidence in the report tells us that the world is undergoing the largest wave of urban growth in its history. In 2008, the world's urban population exceeded 50% of the total population for the first time, and this trend is accelerating. Welsh cities are not big when compared to other cities in the UK and beyond, and this has usually been considered a disadvantage. However, this report refers to emerging international evidence showing that a focus on medium-sized cities and their hinterlands may be better for equity, growth and efficiency than the growth strategy emphasised over the last few decades, focusing on big capitals of commerce. I believe that the quality of life that Welsh cities offer provides a genuine opportunity to tap into this growth.

Mae'r dystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad yn dweud wrthym bod y byd yn wynebu'r don fwyaf o dwf trefol yn ei hanes. Yn 2008, yr oedd poblogaeth drefol y byd yn uwch na 50 y cant o gyfanswm y boblogaeth am y tro cyntaf, ac mae'r duedd hon yn cyflymu. Nid yw dinasoedd Cymru'n fawr o gymharu â dinasoedd eraill yn y DU a thu hwnt, ac fel rheol ystyriwyd bod hyn yn anfantais. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfeirio at dystiolaeth ryngwladol newydd sy'n dangos y gall canolbwyntio ar ddinasoedd maint canolig a'u cefnwledydd fod yn well i degwch, twf ac effeithlonrwydd na'r strategaeth twf sydd wedi cael pwyslais dros y degawdau diwethaf ac yn canolbwyntio ar brifddinasoedd masnach mawr. Credaf fod yr ansawdd bywyd sydd ar gynnig yn ninasoedd Cymru'n rhoi cyfle gwirioneddol i fanteisio ar y twf hwn.

This report comes up with some clear recommendations. It recommends that city regions are recognised in south-east Wales and Swansea. These are the only two areas of Wales that have the critical population mass to support this approach.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn gwneud rhai argymhellion clir. Mae'n argymell cydnabod dinas-ranbarthau yn y de-ddwyrain ac yn Abertawe. Dyma'r unig ddwy ardal yng Nghymru â'r màs poblogaeth critigol i gynnal y dulliau hyn.

A city region in south-east Wales would comprise 1.4 million people—almost half the population of Wales. Focused around a modern, vibrant European capital city, the group has found that this region has a lot to offer, from developed urban settlements to outstanding countryside and coast within a small area.

Byddai dinas-ranbarth yn y de-ddwyrain yn cynnwys 1.4 miliwn o bobl—tua hanner poblogaeth Cymru. Byddai'r rhanbarth wedi'i ganoli o gwmpas prifddinas Ewropeaidd fodern a bywiog, ac mae'r grŵp wedi canfod bod ganddo lawer i'w gynnig, o setliadau trefol datblygedig i gefn gwlad rhagorol ac arfordir o fewn ardal fach.

Swansea bay also contains the critical population mass to sustain a city region, according to the report. Again, this area has a great deal to offer in terms of economic development and has recently become familiar to a worldwide audience of 500 million people in 200 countries, thanks to the success of Swansea City Football Club.

Mae bae Abertawe hefyd yn cynnwys màs poblogaeth critigol i gynnal dinas-ranbarth, yn ôl yr adroddiad. Eto, mae gan yr ardal hon lawer i'w gynnig o ran datblygiad economaidd ac yn ddiweddar daeth yn gyfarwydd i gynulleidfa fyd-eang o 500 miliwn o bobl mewn 200 o wledydd, diolch i lwyddiant Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Abertawe.

However, the report has found that connectivity around these regions can be an area of weakness, particularly in terms of transport, and recommended this an area of focus. The report also expresses concern about the ability of regions to think and plan strategically without a framework to support this. City regions around the world have responded by overcoming internal rivalry and competition to deliver benefits for a whole region. For example, the Lille city region in France is made up of 86 authorities working together for the region. In Bologna, the figure was 48, and closer to home, in Manchester, 10 authorities are working together for the benefit of the region.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad wedi canfod y gall cysylltedd o gwmpas y rhanbarthau hyn fod yn wendid, yn enwedig o ran trafnidiaeth, ac mae'n argymell canolbwyntio ar y maes hwn. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn mynegi pryder am allu rhanbarthau i feddwl a chynllunio'n strategol heb fframwaith i ategu'r prosesau hyn. Mae dinas-ranbarthau ledled y byd wedi ymateb drwy oresgyn cystadleuaeth fewnol i gyflenwi buddion i ranbarth cyfan. Er enghraifft, mae dinas-ranbarth Lille yn Ffrainc yn cynnwys 86 o awdurdodau sy'n cydweithio dros y rhanbarth. Yn Bologna, yr oedd y ffigwr yn 48, ac yn agosach atom ni, ym Manceinion, mae 10 awdurdod yn cydweithio er budd i'r rhanbarth.

Improving our strategic and regional working is a consistent theme of the report. From its content, this means in practical terms: considering utilising planning and housing to meet needs across regions; thinking about what skills are needed in particular regions; planning our transport infrastructure to enable our citizens and businesses to get around our regions quickly; and working together to achieve this.

Mae gwella ein gwaith strategol a rhanbarthol yn thema gyson yn yr adroddiad. O'i gynnwys, mae hyn yn golygu mewn termau ymarferol: ystyried defnyddio cynllunio a thai i ddiwallu anghenion ar draws rhanbarthau; meddwl pa sgiliau sydd eu hangen mewn rhanbarthau penodol; cynllunio ein seilwaith trafnidiaeth i alluogi ein dinasyddion a'n busnesau i symud o gwmpas ein rhanbarthau'n gyflym; a chydweithio i gyflawni hyn.

Other recommendations suggest using funding in different ways, again with a strategic and regional focus. This includes seeking greater flexibility in the next round of European funding to respond to the needs of city regions. Alongside our recent discussions with Commissioner Hahn, the European Commission has asked us to consider the urban dimension for the next round of structural funds. This report can contribute to that discussion. The report also recommends that the Welsh Government seeks to obtain borrowing powers to increase the total capital expenditure available to it.

Mae argymhellion eraill yn awgrymu defnyddio cyllid mewn ffyrdd gwahanol, eto gyda ffocws strategol a rhanbarthol. Mae hyn yn cynnwys ceisio mwy o hyblygrwydd yn y cylch nesaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd i ymateb i anghenion dinas-ranbarthau. Ochr yn ochr â'n trafodaethau diweddar â'r Comisiynydd Hahn, mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi gofyn inni ystyried dimensiwn trefol y cylch nesaf o gronfeydd strwythurol. Gall yr adroddiad hwn gyfrannu at y drafodaeth honno. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn argymell bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n ceisio cael pwerau benthyca i gynyddu cyfanswm y gwariant cyfalaf sydd ar gael iddi.

City regions is not the only approach towards spatial economic development that I am exploring. Tailoring how we support jobs and growth to the different local economic circumstances of Wales is a priority for me. I am therefore looking forward to informing Members about the work of the Powys local growth zones task and finish group next week. I am pleased that the group has acknowledged the economic development potential of new ways of working in north Wales, despite it not containing the needed critical mass to become a city region. The report expresses a clear belief that there is some immediate work that can be done in this area. I am grateful to the group for offering to work with business and organisations in north Wales to move this forward.

Nid dinas-ranbarthau yw'r unig ddull datblygu economaidd gofodol yr wyf yn ei archwilio. Mae teilwra'r ffordd rydym yn cefnogi swyddi a thwf i amgylchiadau economaidd lleol gwahanol Cymru yn flaenoriaeth imi. Felly, edrychaf ymlaen at roi gwybod i Aelodau am waith grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen parthau twf lleol Powys yr wythnos nesaf. Rwyf yn falch bod y grŵp wedi cydnabod potensial datblygu economaidd ffyrdd newydd o weithio yn y gogledd, er nad yw'n cynnwys y màs critigol sydd ei angen i ddod yn ddinas-ranbarth. Mae'r adroddiad yn mynegi cred glir y gellir gwneud rhywfaint o waith ar unwaith yn yr ardal hon. Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r grŵp am gynnig cydweithio â busnesau a sefydliadau yn y gogledd i symud ymlaen â hyn.

I am keen that Members have an opportunity to understand the content of the report and they will be invited to a briefing session with the chair after the summer recess. I am confident that this report will have significant influence on the future policy of the Welsh Government. We cannot deny the importance of our cities. Global trends show increasing urbanisation and Wales is very much a part of that. If there is an opportunity to take advantage of this to promote jobs and growth in Wales, then I will do so. I look forward to Members' contributions this afternoon.

Rwyf yn awyddus i Aelodau gael cyfle i ddeall cynnwys yr adroddiad a chânt eu gwahodd i sesiwn briffio gyda'r cadeirydd ar ôl toriad yr haf. Rwyf yn hyderus y caiff yr adroddiad hwn ddylanwad sylweddol ar bolisïau Llywodraeth Cymru yn y dyfodol. Ni allwn wadu pwysigrwydd ein dinasoedd. Mae tueddiadau byd-eang yn dangos mwy o drefoli ac mae Cymru'n sicr yn rhan o hynny. Os ceir cyfle i fanteisio ar hyn i hybu swyddi a thwf yng Nghymru, gwnaf hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at gyfraniadau Aelodau brynhawn heddiw.

Nick Ramsay: Minister, thank you for your statement. I also thank the task and finish group for its work on this wide-ranging and detailed report, which includes a lot of different factors. It mentions the possibility

Nick Ramsay: Weinidog, diolch am eich datganiad. Diolch hefyd i'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen am ei waith ar yr adroddiad eang a manwl hwn, sy'n cynnwys llawer o ffactorau gwahanol. Mae'n sôn am bosibilrwydd cael

of having mayors for city region areas and throws in the now-mandatory borrowing powers request, which seems to crop up from all sides of the Chamber in almost every debate at the moment, but nonetheless I can see why that is there.

meiri i ardaloedd dinas-ranbarthau ac yn cynnwys y cais am bwerau benthyca, sydd nawr yn orfodol ac yn ymddangos fel ei fod yn codi o bob ochr i'r Siambr ym mhob dadl bron ar hyn o bryd, ond er hynny, gallaf weld pam mae yno.

I turn to three aspects of the report that were picked up in your statement. Specialisation seems to be a key part of the city-region approach. There is a cross over with enterprise zone policy in specialisation. The report says that there should be a specialisation in certain areas such as housing or leisure, which is similar to enterprise zones. How is that feasible? You talk about Swansea and Newport—or south-east Wales, as I should say—which are pretty large areas. Is it feasible for them to specialise in particular areas? If so, how is that going to happen?

Trof at dair agwedd ar yr adroddiad a gafodd sylw yn eich datganiad. Mae'n ymddangos bod arbenigo'n rhan allweddol o syniad dinas-ranbarthau. Mae'n gorgyffwrdd â pholisi parthau menter o ran arbenigo. Mae'r adroddiad yn dweud y dylid arbenigo mewn rhai meysydd penodol megis tai neu hamdden, sy'n debyg i barthau menter. Sut y mae hynny'n ddichonadwy? Siaradwch am Abertawe a Chasnewydd—neu'r de-ddwyrain, dylwn ddweud—sy'n ardaloedd eithaf mawr. A yw'n ddichonadwy iddynt arbenigo mewn meysydd penodol? Os ydyw, sut y mae hynny am ddigwydd?

Secondly, your statement said that city regions must reflect economic reality not administrative or political boundaries. That is an interesting statement. I would be interested in hearing from you how you think that that could be achieved in practice. It seems to me that separating the administrative boundaries of local authority areas from this will be a challenge.

Yn ail, dywedodd eich datganiad fod rhaid i ddinas-ranbarthau adlewyrchu realiti economaidd, nid ffiniau gweinyddol neu wleidyddol. Mae hwnnw'n ddatganiad diddorol. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed gennych sut rydych yn meddwl y gellid cyflawni hynny'n ymarferol. Mae'n ymddangos imi y bydd gwahanu ffiniau gweinyddol ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol oddi wrth hyn yn her.

Thirdly, the report talks about ceding power, funding and decision making to a more regional level. Again, how do you envisage that happening? Is there not a potential contradiction here, in that if you are trying to drive a city-region approach, but then devolve the power and the funding to a local area, what is to stop that area from taking a different approach? I would be interested to hear how you think that can work.

Yn drydydd, mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am ildio grym, cyllid a phenderfyniadau i lefel fwy rhanbarthol. Eto, sut rydych yn gweld hynny'n digwydd? Onid oes posibilrwydd o wrth-ddweud yma? Os ydych yn ceisio cyflwyno dinas-ranbarthau, ond yna'n datganoli'r pŵer a'r cyllid i ardal leol, beth sydd am atal yr ardal honno rhag defnyddio dull gwahanol? Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed sut y credwch y gall hynny weithio.

I turn to the recommendations. Recommendations 1 and 2 are completely understandable. A city region in south-east Wales makes logical sense. There is discussion of interconnectivity in the report. Looking at south-east Wales at the moment, I am sure that you would agree that the future of the M4 and how we deal with the bottleneck at the Brynglas tunnels will be key to the development of south-east Wales as a

Trof at yr argymhellion. Mae argymhellion 1 a 2 yn gwbl ddealladwy. Mae dinas-ranbarth yn y de-ddwyrain yn gwneud synnwyr rhesymegol. Mae'r adroddiad yn trafod rhyng-gysylltedd. Wrth edrych ar y de-ddwyrain ar hyn o bryd, rwyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno y bydd dyfodol yr M4 a sut y gwnawn ymdrin â thagfeydd twnelau Brynglas yn allweddol i ddatblygu'r de-ddwyrain fel dinas-ranbarth. Pa drafodaethau

city region. What discussions are you having with the Minister for local government, who has transport within his brief, to try to deal with that part of the problem? The second recommendation to make Swansea bay a region also makes logical sense. I agree with you that, beyond those two areas, it is difficult to envisage where else the urban mass would come from in Wales to make it possible.

rydych yn eu cael â'r Gweinidog llywodraeth leol, sydd â briff sy'n cynnwys trafnidiaeth, i geisio ymdrin â'r rhan honno o'r broblem? Mae'r ail argymhelliad i wneud bae Abertawe yn rhanbarth hefyd yn gwneud synnwyr rhesymegol. Cytunaf â chi ei bod yn anodd rhagweld, y tu hwnt i'r ddwy ardal hynny, o ble arall y dôi'r màs trefol yng Nghymru i'w gwneud yn bosibl.

I would like to question you about some of the other recommendations. Recommendation 13 talks about transport, but makes no mention of airport policy or Cardiff Airport. Given the large amount of discussions about the future of Cardiff Airport in the media and in committees such as the Enterprise and Business Committee at the moment, it is very strange that there is no direct reference to airports. How do you envisage that tying in with a possible Government strategy on air?

Hoffwn eich holi am rai o'r argymhellion eraill. Mae argymhelliad 13 yn sôn am drafnidiaeth, ond nid yw'n sôn am bolisi meysydd awyr nac am Faes Awyr Caerdydd. O ystyried y nifer mawr o drafodaethau am ddyfodol Maes Awyr Caerdydd yn y cyfryngau ac mewn pwyllgorau megis y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhyfedd iawn nad yw'n cyfeirio'n uniongyrchol at feysydd awyr. Sut rydych yn gweld hynny'n cyd-fynd â strategaeth bosibl gan y Llywodraeth am awyr?

Recommendation 17 is that the Welsh Government should explore the full range of funding tools available. Borrowing was mentioned, but are there any other specific funding tools that you think the devolution of which to a city region would be helpful? On recommendation 19, I mentioned the idea of a mayor for a city region, but, I notice that this recommendation believes that the Welsh Government may do better to appoint a Minister for city regions. I am not entirely convinced, certainly not at this point, that a Minister would be the correct answer. In fact, I would have thought that a more local, ground-level, hands-on approach that could be taken by a person appointed locally would be a better way of approaching this. I am interested to hear your views on that part of the report.

Argymhelliad 17 yw y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru archwilio'r ystod lawn o offer cyllido sydd ar gael. Soniwyd am fenthyca, ond a oes unrhyw offer cyllido penodol eraill y credwch y byddai'n fuddiol eu datganoli i ddinas-ranbarth? O ran argymhelliad 19, soniais am syniad maer i ddinas-ranbarth, ond sylwaf fod yr argymhelliad hwn yn credu y gallai fod yn well i Lywodraeth Cymru benodi Gweinidog dinas-ranbarthau. Nid wyf yn gwbl argyhoeddedig, yn sicr ar hyn o bryd, mai Gweinidog fyddai'r ateb cywir. Yn wir, byddwn wedi meddwl y byddai'n well penodi unigolyn yn lleol i ddefnyddio dull lleol, ymarferol, ar lawr gwlad i wneud y gwaith hwn. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed eich safbwyntiau am y rhan honno o'r adroddiad.

3.15 p.m.

Recommendation 6 states that the Welsh Government should adapt or replace the Wales spatial plan. I am a bit of a fan of looking for where the Wales spatial plan crops up; there was a time when we had numerous debates, under the former Minister, Andrew Davies, about the spatial plan. Since he has gone, it seems to have disappeared or been swept under the Assembly rug.

Mae argymhelliad 6 yn datgan y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru fabwysiadu neu ddisodli cynllun gofodol Cymru. Rwyf yn eithaf hoff o gadw llygad am ymddangosiadau cynllun gofodol Cymru; yr oeddem yn arfer cael llawer o drafodaethau, o dan y cyn-Weinidog, Andrew Davies, am y cynllun gofodol. Ers iddo ef fynd, mae'n ymddangos bod y cynllun wedi diflannu neu gael ei roi o'r

Therefore, I would be interested to hear your view on whether the spatial plan—if you still have a copy of it somewhere—should be replaced or amended, or whether it was ever worth having in the first place. If we are going to keep it—I hear that it is gone—it is certainly recommended that this should somehow tie in with that, so I am interested to hear your thoughts on that recommendation

neilltu gan y Cynulliad. Felly, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed eich barn ynghylch a ddylid disodli neu ddiwygio'r cynllun gofodol—os oes copi ohono'n dal i fod gennych yn rhywle—neu a oedd yn werth ei gael yn y lle cyntaf. Os ydym am ei gadw—clywaf ei fod wedi mynd—yn sicr argymhellir y dylai hyn gyd-fynd ag ef rywsut, felly mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed eich meddyliau am yr argymhelliad hwnnw.

Finally, there is a discussion in the paper noting that city regions may not be the only approach to the allocation of spatial resources and doing things differently locally. Have you considered any other models and have you discussed with the task and finish group any other possible ways of progressing an alternative to a city regions model?

Yn olaf, ceir trafodaeth yn y papur sy'n nodi ei bod yn bosibl nad dinas-ranbarthau yw'r unig ddull o ddyrannu adnoddau gofodol a gwneud pethau'n wahanol yn lleol. A ydych wedi ystyried unrhyw fodelau eraill ac a ydych wedi trafod â'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen unrhyw ffyrdd posibl eraill o symud ymlaen â dewis arall yn lle model dinas-ranbarthau?

Edwina Hart: I think that from your contribution, Nick Ramsay, you can see that this report will take some time to digest and it will take time to look at the implications for all areas of Government policy. This report is very much the starting point and not the end game. I do not see myself necessarily agreeing to all of the recommendations. This is an evolving policy agenda. You asked whether this is the only approach, and that is what I have to focus on myself over the next few months: is this the only approach, or is there another approach that we can take?

Edwina Hart: Credaf, o'ch cyfraniad, Nick Ramsay, y gallwch weld y bydd yn cymryd cryn amser i amgyffred yr adroddiad hwn ac y bydd yn cymryd amser i edrych ar y goblygiadau i holl feysydd polisi'r Llywodraeth. Man cychwyn yw'r adroddiad hwn, nid y sefyllfa derfynol. Nid wyf o reidrwydd yn rhagweld y byddaf yn cytuno â phob argymhelliad. Mae'r agenda polisi yn esblygu. Gofynasoch ai hwn yw'r unig ddull, a dyna beth mae'n rhaid i minnau ganolbwyntio arno dros y misoedd nesaf: ai hwn yw'r unig ddull, ynteu a allem ddefnyddio dull arall?

I smiled at your wry comments on recommendation 6. Of course, all members of the Government take that policy to bed with us at night as our evening reading in terms of its development. However, the group had quite clear evidence that people felt that it is quite important to look at this area around planning, but that it was a policy that had to have teeth if you were utilising it. A strategic link to this planning lies behind the city regions model in Scotland, and that is what they felt. Therefore, this was reflected. I have written to the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development to develop this issue and to see what his comments will be on this particular area.

Gwenais wrth glywed eich sylwadau coeglyd am argymhelliad 6. Wrth gwrs, mae holl aelodau'r Llywodraeth yn mynd i'r gwely gyda'r polisi hwnnw i ddarllen gyda'r nos am ei ddatblygiad. Fodd bynnag, cafodd y grŵp dystiolaeth eithaf clir bod pobl yn teimlo ei bod yn bwysig edrych ar y maes hwn sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio, ond bod rhaid i'r polisi fod â dannedd er mwyn ichi ei ddefnyddio. Mae cyswllt strategol â'r gwaith cynllunio hwn y tu ôl i'r model dinas-ranbarthau yn yr Alban, a dyna oedd eu teimladau hwy. Felly, adlewyrchwyd hyn. Rwyf wedi ysgrifennu at Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy i ddatblygu'r mater hwn ac i weld beth fydd ei sylwadau am y maes penodol hwn.

You raised a number of very interesting points, particularly in terms of enterprise zone policy and whether that would need to be revised and looked at. Yes, there is a possibility that we will have to look at the working of enterprise zones if we are to implement the full report in terms of city regions.

Codasoch nifer o bwyntiau diddorol iawn, yn enwedig o ran polisi parthau menter ac a fyddai angen edrych ar hwnnw a'i ddiwygio. Ydy, mae'n bosibl y bydd rhaid inni edrych ar waith parthau menter er mwyn rhoi'r adroddiad llawn ar waith o ran dinas-ranbarthau.

On the point on specialisation in housing, these are exactly the areas on which we will have to have more discussion with regard to how it would work. However, the most interesting point that you made was in relation to the powerful statement about administrators—how it would be administered and how it would be done. That is the key. However, that should already be, and is, part of our agenda in trying to get local authorities to work together more. If this is to become a reality, we will have to look at how government works together and we will have to do more to encourage that.

O ran pwynt arbenigo ym maes tai, dyma'r union feysydd lle bydd angen inni gael mwy o drafodaethau am sut y byddai'n gweithio. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt mwyaf diddorol a wnaethoch oedd yr un am y datganiad pwerus am weinyddwyr—sut y câi ei weinyddu a sut y câi ei wneud. Mae hynny'n allweddol. Fodd bynnag, dylai hynny fod eisoes yn rhan o'n hagenda, ac mae, o ran ceisio perswadio awdurdodau lleol i gydweithio mwy. Er mwyn i hynny ddod yn realiti, bydd angen inni edrych ar sut y mae llywodraeth yn cydweithio a bydd rhaid inni wneud mwy i annog hynny.

The issue about ceding power is always a very difficult one, because when you have power and control, you rather like to keep hold of it. It is all very well when people talk about local democracy and accountability, but when you have the money and you want to pursue a certain policy, there is that contradiction—if we are being honest in this discussion today—about how it would be.

Mae'r mater am ildio pŵer yn un anodd bob tro, oherwydd pan mae gennych bŵer a rheolaeth, yr ydych yn eithaf awyddus i'w gadw. Mae'n ddigon teg i bobl siarad am ddemocratiaeth leol ac atebolrwydd lleol, ond pan mae'r arian gennych a'ch bod yn dymuno dilyn polisi penodol, ceir y gwrth-ddweud hwnnw—os ydym yn onest yn y drafodaeth hon heddiw—am sut y byddai pethau.

I will now turn to some of your specific points. You said that you have no difficulties with recommendations 1 and 2. In many ways, the questions as to why south-east Wales and why Swansea bay answer themselves in terms of this particular report. In relation to recommendation 3, there are obviously issues around transport, such as electrification of the railways, but there are also European funding issues. I have written to the Minister for transport regarding some of the issues relating to that area. You noted that, in recommendation 13, there is no reference to airport policy. That is because they were looking specifically at other areas. I think that it is important that we look at all transport policy in the context of the development of city regions.

Nawr, trof at rai o'ch pwyntiau penodol. Dywedasoch nad oes gennych anhawster ag argymhellion 1 a 2. Mewn llawer o ffyrdd, mae'r cwestiynau pam y de-ddwyrain a pham bae Abertawe'n ateb eu hunain o ran yr adroddiad penodol hwn. O ran argymhelliad 3, yn amlwg ceir materion yn ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth, megis trydanu'r rheilffyrdd, ond ceir materion yn ymwneud â chyllid Ewropeaidd hefyd. Rwyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog trafnidiaeth ynglŷn â rhai o'r materion yn y maes hwnnw. Nodasoch nad yw argymhelliad 13 yn cyfeirio at bolisi meysydd awyr. Y rheswm am hynny yw ein bod yn edrych yn benodol ar feysydd eraill. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar bolisi trafnidiaeth yn gyffredinol yng nghyd-destun datblygu dinas-ranbarthau.

In terms of the other recommendations that

O ran yr argymhellion eraill y tynasoch ein

you drew our attention to, you referred to recommendation 17, and Jane Hutt is already undertaking work to look at alternative models of getting money in as well as borrowing powers. On recommendation 19, questions very much arise about whether you have a Minister, a Mayor, what type of structure you have and whether it has to be dynamically led, or, 'We are only a population of 3 million, do we need all these other structures in place?' Those are definitely some of the questions. I very much hope that Members will take the opportunity, as Elizabeth Haywood will be available after recess to develop these ideas further. I will not be rushing to report back to Plenary with a 'yes' or 'no' on these recommendations, because I think that this report has opened up a whole new area that it would be wise for us to discuss across the parties and everywhere else to get a consensus and a feel for where we want to go.

sylw atynt, cyfeiriasoch at argymhelliad 17, ac mae Jane Hutt eisoes yn gweithio i edrych ar fodelau amgen o ddod ag arian i mewn yn ogystal â phwerau benthyca. O ran argymhelliad 19, mae cwestiynau pwysig i'w hateb o ran a ydych am gael Gweinidog, Maer, pa fath o strwythur sydd gennych ac a oes rhaid ei arwain yn ddynamig, ynteu, 'Dim ond 3 miliwn yw ein poblogaeth, a oes arnom angen y strwythurau eraill hyn i gyd?' Mae'r rheini'n sicr yn rhai o'r cwestiynau. Gobeithiaf yn fawr y bydd Aelodau'n cymryd y cyfle, gan y bydd Elizabeth Haywood ar gael ar ôl y toriad i ddatblygu'r syniadau hyn ymhellach. Nid wyf am ruthro i adrodd yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn gydag 'ie' neu 'na' am yr argymhellion hyn, oherwydd credaf fod yr adroddiad hwn wedi agor maes cwbl newydd y byddai'n ddoeth inni ei drafod ar draws y pleidiau ac ym mhobman arall i gael consensws ac ymdeimlad o ble yr hoffem fynd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn amlwg, mae'n dda iawn derbyn yr adroddiad ac ymateb cychwynnol y Gweinidog iddo. I ryw raddau, mae'r adroddiad yn dweud yr amlwg. Wedi'r cwbl mae degau o filoedd o bobl—tua 70,000 rwy'n credu—yn llifo o'r Cymoedd i Gaerdydd i weithio bob dydd, ac i raddau llai i Abertawe. Mae hynny'n arwain, yn naturiol, at sefyllfa lle bydd datblygiadau economaidd yn cael eu canoli ar y ddwy ddinas hyn. Derbyn yr anochel, mewn ffordd, yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn sy'n codi yw: beth mae hyn yn ei olygu o ran gwariant, blaenoriaethu a strategaeth y Llywodraeth? Mae'n codi nifer o gwestiynau, i ddweud y gwir. Os yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn yr adroddiad—mae'n ymddangos ei bod hi'n eithaf ffafriol i'r adroddiad, er ei bod hi'n dweud bod yn rhaid ystyried yr argymhellion yn ofalus fesul un—hoffwn glywed beth fydd yn newid o dderbyn y cysyniad o ddinas-ranbarthau. Gwyddom fod arian yn prinhau, felly os byddwch yn gwario rhagor neu ganolbwyntio gwariant mewn rhai ardaloedd, yn naturiol, bydd hynny'n cael effaith ar wariant mewn llefydd eraill. Er nad yw'r adroddiad yn cyfyngu ei hun i wariant, yn sicr, mae polisi fel hwn yn sicr o gael dylanwad pellgyrhaeddol ar ardaloedd eraill.

Alun Ffred Jones: Clearly, we welcome the report and the Minister's initial response to it. To some extent, the report states the obvious. After all, tens of thousands—around 70,000, I think—of people flow from the Valleys to Cardiff to work every day and, to a lesser degree, to Swansea. That naturally leads to a situation where economic development will be centred on these two cities. That is accepting the inevitable, in a way. However, the question that arises is: what does this mean in terms of expenditure, prioritisation and Government strategy? It raises a number of questions, if truth be told. If the Minister accepts the report—the Minister appears to be relatively well disposed towards the report, although she does say that she will need to consider the recommendations one by one and very carefully—I would like to hear what would change in accepting the concept of city regions. We know that funding is becoming scarce, so if you are going to spend more in certain areas or concentrate expenditure in certain areas, then, naturally, that will have an impact on expenditure in other areas. Although the report does not limit itself to expenditure, certainly, a policy such as this is sure to have a far-reaching effect on other areas.

Mae rhai o'r argymhellion yn hollol synhwyrol, wrth gwrs, o ran cael awdurdodau

Some of the recommendations are eminently sensible, of course, in terms of getting local

lleol i gydweithio'n fwy clos ar faterion fel cynllunio a thai, a hefyd cynllunio i wella'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd a chael rhagor a gwell trenau a gorsafoedd i'w groesawu, ond beth arall sy'n mynd i newid? Dyna'r cwestiynau yr hoffwn eu gofyn i'r Gweinidog.

authorities to collaborate more closely on such issues as planning and housing, and also planning to improve the railway network and to get more and better trains and stations is to be welcomed, but what else will change? These are the questions that I would like to ask the Minister.

I have a few questions based on the recommendations. Is this the final nail in the coffin of the expensive and time-consuming spatial plan? I thought that it had been put to bed in a recent circular, but perhaps you could clear that up. Will local planning authorities become defunct or will there be a super planning body sitting above the present local planning authorities? These are very real and practical questions if we are talking about greater integration and co-operation. That is an easy thing to say, but it is very difficult to achieve. Also, does the suggestion that big developments and economic projects should be centred on Cardiff and Swansea mean that such projects will not happen, for example, in traditional Valleys communities? Is that the thinking behind the report? That leads to another question: is it the vision that the Heads of the Valleys towns and villages become, in the main, dormitory communities, feeding the larger city conurbations? That would seem to be the logical conclusion of this thinking. With reference to recommendation 16, does this mean that more European funds should be targeted on the cities and on universities for the greater benefit of the whole region? These are difficult questions, but, if these recommendations are to mean anything, they will mean a change in policy and strategy, and that will have reverberations in the greater regions.

Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau'n seiliedig ar yr argymhellion. Ai hon yw'r hoelen olaf yn arch y cynllun gofodol drud a thrafferthus? Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod cylchlythyr diweddar wedi'i ddiweddu, ond efallai y gallech wneud hynny'n glir. A fydd awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yn mynd yn ddi-rym ynteu a fydd uwch gorff cynllunio'n eistedd uwchlaw'r awdurdodau cynllunio lleol presennol? Mae'r rhain yn gwestiynau ymarferol a real iawn os ydym yn sôn am fwy o integreiddio a chydweithredu. Mae'n hawdd dweud hynny, ond mae'n anodd iawn ei gyflawni. Hefyd, a yw'r awgrym y dylid canolbwyntio datblygiadau a phrosiectau economaidd mawr yng Nghaerdydd ac Abertawe yn golygu na fydd prosiectau o'r fath yn digwydd, er enghraifft, yng nghymunedau traddodiadol y Cymoedd? Ai dyna yw'r meddwl y tu ôl i'r adroddiad? Mae hynny'n arwain at gwestiwn arall: ai'r weledigaeth yw bod trefi a phentrefi Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn dod yn gymunedau noswylio, yn bennaf, i fwydo cytrefi'r dinasoedd mawr? Ymddengys mai dyna gasgliad rhesymegol y meddwl hwn. Gan gyfeirio at argymhelliad 16, a yw hyn yn golygu y dylid targedu mwy o gyllid Ewropeaidd ar y dinasoedd ac ar brifysgolion er budd y rhanbarth cyfan? Mae'r rhain yn gwestiynau anodd, ond, os yw'r argymhellion hyn am olygu unrhyw beth, byddant yn golygu newid polisïau a strategaethau, a chaiff hynny ei adlewyrchu yn y rhanbarthau mwy.

Edwina Hart: Alun Ffred Jones raises some of the key issues that we will have to wrestle with in Government before we decide whether to accept these recommendations. When I started down the road of looking at city regions, I recognised, straight away, that Pandora's box was opened in terms of the discussions that arose with the panel and Elizabeth Haywood. Some of the questions that you have asked came to the fore: does it affect resources elsewhere, does it affect how

Edwina Hart: Mae Alun Ffred Jones yn codi rhai o'r materion allweddol y bydd rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hwy yn y Llywodraeth cyn penderfynu a ydym am dderbyn yr argymhellion hyn. Pan ddechreuais edrych ar ddinas-ranbarthau, sylwais ar unwaith eu bod yn agor blwch Pandora o ran y trafodaethau a gododd gyda'r panel a gydag Elizabeth Haywood. Codwyd rhai o'r cwestiynau rydych wedi'u gofyn: a yw'n effeithio ar adnoddau mewn mannau eraill, a yw'n

organisations work together and does it mean that you are abandoning parts of Wales in creating of city regions? That is what some people say when they see this report. I do not think that it means any of that in terms of what we need to do. Looking at the hinterlands to city regions, the emphasis in a city-region approach will be on the region. If you look at the Wales spatial plan, you will see that it recognises managing pressures for all parts of the city region, not simply the urban centres, is quite important. For instance, looking at south-east Wales, it suggested directing resources towards selected growth areas in the Valleys as well as in Cardiff. You have to look at it in that way. Implementing measures to improve connectivity between them, such as the electrification of the Valleys lines, has the potential to benefit both areas. Therefore, we have to look at this discussion in that way.

effeithio ar sut y mae sefydliadau'n cydweithio ac a yw'n golygu eich bod yn anghofio rhai rhannau o Gymru wrth greu dinas-ranbarthau? Dyna beth mae rhai pobl yn ei ddweud wrth weld yr adroddiad hwn. Ni chredaf ei fod yn golygu dim o'r pethau hynny o ran yr hyn sydd angen inni ei wneud. Wrth edrych ar gefnwledydd y dinas-ranbarthau, bydd pwyslais y dull dinas-ranbarthau ar y rhanbarthau. Os edrychwch ar gynllun gofodol Cymru, gwelwch ei fod yn cydnabod ei bod yn bwysig rheoli pwysau pob rhan o'r ddinas-ranbarth, nid dim ond y canol trefol. Er enghraifft, wrth edrych ar y de-ddwyrain, awgrymodd gyfeirio adnoddau tuag at ardaloedd twf dethol yn y Cymoedd yn ogystal ag yng Nghaerdydd. Rhaid ichi edrych arno fel yna. Gallai rhoi mesurau ar waith i wella'r cysylltedd rhyngddynt, megis trydanu rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd, fod o fudd i'r ddwy ardal. Felly, rhaid inni edrych ar y drafodaeth hon fel yna.

Different parts of a city region have different contributions to make and will benefit in different ways. Space requirements mean that some new manufacturing activity will not be able to take place in a certain corridor. You have to go to outlying areas to develop that, but the proximity of the city can attract that development, for good economic and social reasons. That is why, I think, the report tried to tackle the issues around housing, because that is easier to attack in the wider city region context.

Mae gan wahanol rannau dinas-ranbarth wahanol gyfraniadau i'w gwneud, a byddant yn elwa mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Mae gofynion lle'n golygu na fydd rhywfaint o weithgarwch cynhyrchu newydd yn gallu digwydd mewn coridor penodol. Rhaid ichi fynd i ardaloedd allanol i ddatblygu hynny, ond mae'r ffaith bod y ddinas yn agos yn gallu denu'r datblygiad hwnnw, am resymau economaidd a chymdeithasol da. Dyna pam, credaf, y ceisiodd yr adroddiad roi sylw i'r materion sy'n ymwneud â thai, oherwydd mae'n haws ymosod ar hynny yng nghyd-destun ehangach y dinasoedd-ranbarthau.

On the planning policy agenda, I note that my colleague John Griffiths was listening with interest to your comments. We are already discussing what changes to planning John may or may not propose and what we need to do to look at the needs of industry and of individuals. This fits quite nicely into that particular dialogue. However, you are correct, we will have to look at expenditure prioritisation, and my colleague Alun Davies has already started to look at the use of structural funds, because the city region is a concept discussed all across Europe. The European Union understands the city region concept and how it works. We have to reflect that in our discussions with Europe on how we might move forward on structural funds.

O ran yr agenda polisi cynllunio, nodaf fod fy nghydweithiwr John Griffiths yn gwrando ar eich sylwadau â diddordeb. Rydym eisoes yn trafod pa newidiadau i gynllunio y gallai John eu cynnig, a'r hyn sydd angen inni ei wneud i edrych ar anghenion diwydiant ac unigolion. Mae hynny'n cyd-fynd yn eithaf taclus â'r ddeialog benodol honno. Fodd bynnag, rydych yn gywir, bydd rhaid inni edrych ar flaenoriaethu gwariant, ac mae fy nghydweithiwr Alun Davies eisoes wedi dechrau edrych ar ddefnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol, gan fod y dinas-ranbarth yn gysyniad sy'n cael ei drafod ledled Ewrop. Mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn deall cysyniad dinas-ranbarthau a sut y mae'n gweithio. Rhaid inni adlewyrchu hynny yn ein

trafodaethau ag Ewrop am sut y gallem symud ymlaen o ran cronfeydd strwythurol.

All these recommendations are up for discussion. I like the report, because it is a good read in many ways. On a personal level, I like some of the stuff that has come out of it, but I have to be cognisant of all the policy levers across Government and the needs and requirements of everyone before I make any recommendations on the decision process.

Caiff yr argymhellion hyn i gyd eu trafod. Rwyf yn hoff o'r adroddiad, gan ei bod yn braf ei ddarllen mewn nifer o ffyrdd. Ar lefel bersonol, rwyf yn hoff o rywfaint o'r pethau a ddaeth ohono, ond rhaid imi fod yn ymwybodol o'r holl sbardunau polisi yn y Llywodraeth ac o anghenion a gofynion pawb cyn gwneud unrhyw argymhellion am y broses benderfynu.

Eluned Parrott: I, too, thank the Minister for her statement today and also for sight of this report in advance. It is a very detailed report and I am sure that it will provide us with food for thought for many months yet, let alone for many minutes in the Chamber today. The report paints a very honest picture of Wales's economic situation, but gives us a positive and, I think, persuasive case for developing effective city regions as an engine room for the growth of the Welsh economy. It is this future vision that I would like to discuss over the coming months.

Eluned Parrott: Rwyf fi, hefyd, yn diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad heddiw a hefyd am gael gweld yr adroddiad hwn ymlaen llaw. Mae'n adroddiad manwl iawn ac rwyf yn siŵr y rho ddigon inni feddwl amdano am fisoedd eto, heb sôn am y munudau yn y Siambr heddiw. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi darlun gonest iawn o sefyllfa economaidd Cymru, ond mae'n rhoi achos cadarnhaol, a pherswadiol yn fy marn i, dros ddatblygu dinas-ranbarthau effeithiol fel ystafell injan i dwf economi Cymru. Hoffwn drafod y weledigaeth hon o'r dyfodol dros y misoedd nesaf.

The relative weakness of our transport network is recognised in the report. We are awaiting an announcement that could be a crucial link to this, but we must also look beyond the electrification debate, assuming that we get electrification, to the way in which other aspects of our transport network link together to serve our city regions, because they use them as such even now. There will be some raised eyebrows that only two viable city regions have been identified and that both of them are in the south. The economic and demographic arguments for this seem very sound, but I am sure that there will be political pressure to ensure that this economic focus does not exclude other parts of Wales. Therefore, I would like to ask whether the Minister is in agreement with the report over the two suggested city regions and how she plans to ensure that those areas outside the suggested city regions do not feel overlooked. Also, will the Minister explore models that encourage a regional approach to economic development across other areas of Wales—the Powys enterprise zone might be one such model—and look at ways in which they could potentially be tailored to the

Mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod gwendid cymharol ein rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth. Rydym yn disgwyl am gyhoeddiad a allai fod yn gysylltiad hollbwysig â hyn, ond rhaid inni hefyd edrych y tu hwnt i'r ddadl am drydanu, gan gymryd y cawn drydanu, at y ffordd y mae agweddau eraill ar ein rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth yn cydgysylltu i wasanaethu ein dinas-ranbarthau, oherwydd cânt eu defnyddio felly hyd yn oed nawr. Caiff rhai aeliau eu codi gan y ffaith mai dim ond dau ddinas-ranbarth ddichonadwy sydd wedi'u canfod, a bod y ddau ohonynt yn y de. Mae'r dadleuon economaidd a demograffig o blaid hyn yn ymddangos yn gadarn iawn, ond rwyf yn siŵr y ceir pwysau gwleidyddol i sicrhau nad yw'r ffocws economaidd hwn yn eithrio rhannau eraill o Gymru. Felly, hoffwn ofyn a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno â'r adroddiad o ran y ddau ddinas-ranbarth a awgrymir a sut y mae hi'n bwriadu sicrhau nad yw'r ardaloedd y tu allan i'r dinas-ranbarthau a awgrymwyd yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu heithrio. Hefyd, a wnaiff y Gweinidog archwilio modelau sy'n annog dulliau rhanbarthol o ddatblygu economaidd mewn ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru—gallai

specific demographic profile of those regions?

parth menter Powys fod yn un model o'r fath—ac edrych ar ffyrdd posibl o'u teilwra i broffil demograffig penodol y rhanbarthau hynny?

This report is wide-ranging and comprehensive, and it crosses several ministerial portfolios. The implications, if you take it on board in one great big chunk, are vast. I note, however, that you have not given us a timetable for making a formal response, as others have mentioned. Over what kind of timescale will you be discussing these issues with your ministerial colleagues? If you accept much, or all, of it in principle, when might we expect the Welsh Government's first action plan for city regions, or its own response to city regions, to be brought before the Assembly?

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn un eang a chynhwysfawr, ac mae'n croesi sawl portffolio gweinidogol. Mae'r goblygiadau, o'i amgyffred mewn un darn mawr, yn helaeth. Nodaf, fodd bynnag, nad ydych wedi rhoi amserlen inni ar gyfer rhoi ateb ffurfiol, fel y dywedodd eraill. Dros ba fath o amserlen y byddwch yn trafod y materion hyn â'ch cyd-Weinidogion? Os derbyniwch lawer ohono, neu'r cyfan, mewn egwyddor, pryd y gallem ddisgwyl i gynllun gweithredu cyntaf Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer dinas-ranbarthau, neu ei ymateb ei hun i ddinas-ranbarthau, gael ei gyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad?

3.30 p.m.

I have a final, perhaps slightly cheeky, question. You mention in your statement that internal tensions within regions can be a challenge. However, from a Cardiff girl to a Swansea girl, may I point out that there are also concerns in the report about the potential for interregional tensions between Swansea and Cardiff? I know that that is hard to imagine, given the long-term history of love and mutual respect that the two cities have, as exemplified perhaps by our football fans. However, overcoming these tensions will be the key to making this a success. Therefore, how do you expect to approach this tricky, political issue?

Mae gennyf gwestiwn terfynol ac efallai ei fod ychydig yn ddigywilydd. Dywedwch yn eich datganiad y gall tensiynau mewnol o fewn rhanbarthau fod yn her. Fodd bynnag, gan ferch o Gaerdydd i ferch o Abertawe, a gaf nodi bod yr adroddiad hefyd yn mynegi pryderon am y potensial am densiynau rhyngranbarthol rhwng Abertawe a Chaerdydd? Gwn ei bod yn anodd dychmygu hynny, o ystyried yr hanes hir o gariad a pharch rhwng y ddwy ddinas; efallai fod ein cefnogwyr pêl-droed yn enghraifft benigamp o hynny. Fodd bynnag, bydd goresgyn y tensiynau hyn yn allweddol os yw hyn am lwyddo. Felly, sut rydych yn disgwyl ymdrin â'r mater gwleidyddol astrus hwn?

Edwina Hart: I based this report, and I wanted it done, purely on the economics of how to achieve jobs and investment, which is what we need. To a degree, I realise that politics overlies everything, but we must concentrate on what is best for us in how we can attract jobs and kick-start the economy. Regions working together is an important issue, both for rail electrification all the way down to Swansea and for European Union funding, and I believe that we can work together across the two regions. However, as a Swansea girl, of course, I am in the premier league, so I am happy about some of these issues. I can say that safely now, as my

Edwina Hart: Seiliais yr adroddiad hwn, ac yr oeddwn am iddo gael ei wneud, yn gwbl ar economeg sut i gyflawni swyddi a buddsoddi, sef yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom. I raddau, sylwaf fod gwleidyddiaeth uwchben popeth, ond rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar yr hyn sydd orau inni o ran denu swyddi a sbarduno'r economi. Mae rhanbarthau'n cydweithio'n fater pwysig, o ran trydanu'r rheilffordd yr holl ffordd i Abertawe ac o ran cyllid Undeb Ewropeaidd, a chredaf y gallwn gydweithio ar draws y ddau ranbarth. Fodd bynnag, fel merch o Abertawe, rwyf, wrth gwrs, yn yr uwch gynghrair, felly rwyf yn hapus am rai o'r materion hyn. Gallaf ddweud hynny'n

colleague, Leighton Andrews, who is a Cardiff City supporter, is not in the Chamber. [*Laughter.*] However, to be serious, this is a serious report—and I believe that today's contributions have indicated that—given its implications for long-term policy.

ddiogel nawr, gan nad yw fy nghyd-Weinidog, Leighton Andrews, sy'n gefnogwr Caerdydd, yn y Siambr. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, a bod yn ddifrifol, mae hwn yn adroddiad difrifol—a chredaf fod cyfraniadau heddiw wedi dangos hynny—o ystyried ei oblygiadau i bolisïau hirdymor.

Your point about north Wales is interesting. Like you, I feel that the evidence in the report is overwhelmingly that there can be only two city regions. The report's authors did not find sufficient evidence to support a city region in north-east Wales and west Cheshire. However, they identified strong potential regarding what could be done on some collaboration issues in the north, including higher education collaboration, the potential of Wrexham, particularly, as an urban centre, as well as the Deeside enterprise zone, and the potential for an automotive cluster.

Mae eich pwynt am y gogledd yn un diddorol. Fel chi, teimlaf fod y dystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad yn dangos yn gryf iawn mai dim ond dau ddinas-ranbarth all fod. Ni ddaeth awduron yr adroddiad o hyd i ddigon o dystiolaeth i gefnogi dinas-ranbarth yn y gogledd-ddwyrain a gorllewin swydd Caer. Fodd bynnag, daethant o hyd i botensial cryf am rywfaint o gydweithredu yn y gogledd, gan gynnwys cydweithredu mewn addysg uwch, potensial Wrecsam, yn benodol, fel canolfan drefol, yn ogystal â pharth menter Glannau Dyfrdwy, a'r potensial am glwstwr modurol.

They also want to strengthen the links with the Mersey-Dee Alliance, and we must always recognise, as with other issues here, that we have a border. I do not like saying this, as some people do not like it, but our links are east-west and west-east. That is what happens in areas across north and mid Wales and with us, so it is important that we recognise that. However, there will be discussions, and people will be upset that this report does not make a political judgment. However, Dr Hayward and her team were not asked to do that. They were asked to assess the evidence and to come forward with some ideas on city regions.

Hoffent hefyd gryfhau'r cysylltiadau â Chynghrair Mersi a'r Ddyfrdwy, a rhaid inni gydnabod drwy'r amser, fel gyda materion eraill yma, bod gennym ffin. Nid wyf yn hoff o ddweud hyn, gan nad yw rhai pobl yn hoff o'i glywed, ond mae ein cysylltiadau'n rhedeg o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin ac o'r gorllewin i'r dwyrain. Dyna beth sy'n digwydd mewn ardaloedd ledled y gogledd a'r canolbarth a gyda ni, felly mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod hynny. Fodd bynnag, ceir trafodaethau, a bydd pobl wedi'u siomi nad yw'r adroddiad hwn yn gwneud dyfarniad gwleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, ni ofynnwyd i Dr Hayward a'i thîm wneud hynny. Gofynnwyd iddynt asesu'r dystiolaeth a chyflwyno rhai syniadau am ddinas-ranbarthau.

I am about to start discussions with my Cabinet colleagues over the next few weeks about the areas that knock them in the face, as it were, or which could cause problems for where we are going. Therefore, I want clarity in my own mind by the time we come back in September about the direction of travel. However, it might be useful—and I had a useful suggestion from Nick Ramsay on this earlier—if I tabled a motion for general debate in the Chamber on the report first before coming to you with my conclusions, so that, when you have had the opportunity to

Rwyf ar fin dechrau trafodaethau â'm cydweithwyr yn y Cabinet dros yr wythnosau nesaf am y meysydd a allai eu taro yn eu hwynebau, fel petai, neu a allai achosi problemau o ran i le'r ydym yn mynd. Felly, hoffwn gael eglurder yn fy meddwl fy hun erbyn inni ddychwelyd ym mis Medi am ein cyfeiriad teithio. Fodd bynnag, efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol—a chefais awgrym defnyddiol am hyn gan Nick Ramsay yn gynharach—cyflwyno cynnig am ddadl gyffredinol yn y Siambr am yr adroddiad yn gyntaf cyn dod atoch gyda'm casgliadau, fel

mull it over, we can have a better discussion to get more views. I might consider that, and then timetable some definitive comments on the recommendations towards the middle of next term. There might also be budgetary issues involved, which I would have to take into account. Therefore, that is as straightforward as I can be on this occasion, with this new report and all these ideas coming forward.

y gallwn gael trafodaeth well i gael mwy o safbwyntiau ar ôl ichi gael cyfle i'w ystyried. Efallai yr ystyriaf hynny, ac yna amserlennu rhai sylwadau pendant am yr argymhellion tua chanol y tymor nesaf. Efallai y ceir materion yn ymwneud â'r gyllideb hefyd, a byddai'n rhaid imi ystyried y rheini. Felly, ni allaf ddweud mwy na hynny ar yr achlysur hwn, gyda'r adroddiad newydd hwn a'r holl syniadau hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno.

Julie Morgan: I am pleased to hear what the Minister has had to say today. A general debate in the autumn term would be welcome. However, does the Minister agree that, in order to develop city regions, we need reliable population statistics? In Cardiff, there are two different estimates for the next 25 years. One is for an increase of 27% in the population, estimated by consultants employed by the previous city council, and the other is for an increase of 42%, based on Government statistics. I do not know how we can plan for a city region when there is such a conflict in the figures being produced. How could she help to reach an agreed figure, so that we know how to plan for this area as a city region?

Julie Morgan: Rwyf yn falch o glywed yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i ddweud heddiw. Byddai croeso i ddadl gyffredinol yn nhymor yr hydref. Fodd bynnag, a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod arnom angen ystadegau poblogaeth dibynadwy er mwyn datblygu dinas-ranbarthau? Yng Nghaerdydd, ceir dau amcangyfrif gwahanol ar gyfer y 25 mlynedd nesaf. Mae un amcangyfrif gan ymgynghorwyr a gyflogwyd gan y cyngor dinas blaenorol yn rhoi cynnydd o 27 y cant yn y boblogaeth, a'r llall sy'n seiliedig ar ystadegau'r Llywodraeth yn rhoi cynnydd o 42 y cant. Nid wyf yn gwybod sut y gallwn gynllunio ar gyfer dinas-ranbarth a chymaint o wrthdaro rhwng y ffigurau sy'n cael eu cynhyrchu. Sut y gallai helpu i gyrraedd ffigur y cytunir arno, fel ein bod yn gwybod sut i gynllunio ar gyfer yr ardal hon fel dinas-ranbarth?

Edwina Hart: You make a broader point than just that on population statistics. It is important that we have faith in the statistics that we use all the time in quite complex reports such as this. I will discuss with my statisticians and those who advise Dr Haywood how we can look at some of the population issues that arise from that. However, it is quite true that we will have to look at the demographic trends and at where people will be if we are to make some of this stack up, particularly when looking at the broader issues, such as housing and flows in the work population.

Edwina Hart: Gwnewch bwynt ehangach na'r un am ystadegau poblogaeth yn unig. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym ffydd yn yr ystadegau a ddefnyddiwn drwy'r amser mewn adroddiadau eithaf cymhleth fel hwn. Trafodaf â'm hystadegwyr a'r rheini sy'n cynghori Dr Haywood sut y gallwn edrych ar rai o'r materion poblogaeth sy'n codi o hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddigon gwir y bydd rhaid inni edrych ar y tueddiadau demograffig ac ar ble bydd pobl os ydym am i rywfaint o hyn wneud synnwyr, yn enwedig wrth edrych ar y materion ehangach, megis tai a llif y boblogaeth waith.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I welcome the report, and I appreciate that it is a new report, but I am a little concerned about the digesting of it and about working across Government. When we look at what is going on the other side of Offa's Dyke, we see the announcement last week of 'city deals' for eight cities across England, Bristol being one of them—and the

Andrew R.T. Davies: Croesawaf yr adroddiad, a gwerthfawrogaf ei fod yn adroddiad newydd, ond rwyf yn pryderu ychydig am ei amgyffred ac am weithio ar draws y Llywodraeth. Pan edrychwn ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar yr ochr draw i Glawdd Offa, gwelwn y cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf am 'fargeinion dinasoedd' i wyth

enterprise zone has already kicked off there. If we are not careful, we will have a lot of planning and policy formation going on but not a great offering for companies to come to Wales to invest. I wish you well in your endeavours here, but sometimes you as Minister have to take a punt on something and decide which way to go with it, so that we can compete on the playing field.

dinas ar draws Lloegr, a bod Bryste yn un ohonynt—ac mae'r parth menter eisoes wedi dechrau yno. Os nad ydym yn ofalus, bydd gennym lawer o gynllunio a ffurfio polisïau'n digwydd ond ni fydd gennym gynnig da i gwmnïau ddod i Gymru i fuddsoddi. Dymunaf bob lwc ichi yn eich ymdrechion yma, ond weithiau rhaid ichi fel Gweinidog roi cynnig ar rywbeth a dewis i ba gyfeiriad i fynd ag ef, fel y gallwn gystadlu ar y maes chwarae.

On planning, we might agree or disagree with what is going on in England, but planning policy there has been reformed to make it simpler. This report also touches on the complexity of planning, but we have another two years to wait until the Minister here brings forward his Bill, and so I have concerns about the time frame to which you are working, given what the competition is doing in the field.

O ran cynllunio, gallwn gytuno neu anghytuno â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr, ond mae polisi cynllunio yno wedi'i ddiwygio i'w wneud yn symlach. Mae'r adroddiad hwn hefyd yn cyffwrdd ar gymhlethdod cynllunio, ond mae gennym ddwy flynedd arall o aros i'r Gweinidog gyflwyno ei Fil yma, felly mae gennyf bryderon am yr amserlen rydych yn gweithio ynddi, o ystyried beth mae'r gystadleuaeth yn ei wneud yn y maes.

Edwina Hart: Industry asks me for the simplification of planning policy all the time. I know that those concerns are heard by and understood by the Minister with responsibility for planning. It is not just a question of the whole planning legislation; it is about what else you can do within the current arrangements to help and assist. I take that point on board.

Edwina Hart: Mae diwydiant yn gofyn imi symleiddio polisi cynllunio drwy'r amser. Gwn fod y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio'n clywed y pryderon hynny ac yn eu deall. Nid dim ond deddfwriaeth gynllunio sydd o dan sylw yma; mae'n ymwneud â beth arall y gallwch ei wneud o fewn y trefniadau presennol i helpu a chynorthwyo. Derbyniaf y pwynt hwnnw.

With regard to what is going on, we are having a discussion about the city regions. It started as quite an academic thing, but it becomes quite real when you start to see these recommendations, and I do not think that that impacts on whether we have a successful enterprise zone in Cardiff. We have had a lot of interest in the Cardiff enterprise zone, and what we can offer by way of the skills of individuals and training packages are making the difference. I held a meeting recently in London with professional services, having held one before with financial services, and the level of interest in bringing operations here is really quite high, so I do not think that it will impact on that.

O ran beth sy'n digwydd, rydym yn cael trafodaeth am y dinas-ranbarthau. Dechreuodd fel rhywbeth eithaf academaidd, ond mae'n dod yn eithaf real pan ddechreuwch weld yr argymhellion hyn, ac ni chredaf fod hynny'n effeithio ar lwyddiant ein parth menter yng Nghaerdydd. Rydym wedi cael llawer o ddiddordeb ym mharth menter Caerdydd, ac mae'r hyn y gallwn ei gynnig o ran sgiliau unigolion a phecynnau hyfforddiant yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Cynhaliais gyfarfod yn ddiweddar yn Llundain â gwasanaethau proffesiynol, ar ôl imi gynnal un â gwasanaethau ariannol, ac mae cryn dipyn o ddiddordeb mewn dod â gweithredoedd i'r fan hon, felly ni chredaf y bydd yn effeithio ar hynny.

However, we need to take some time to look at this report because the implications are vast across the piece. For example, it will

Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni gymryd rhywfaint o amser i edrych ar yr adroddiad hwn oherwydd mae'r goblygiadau'n eang

have implications for how we deal with the European structural fund policy, if we have another round. If I can, I would like to develop a consensus here on the use of city regions and their benefits in this context, rather than having political warfare and picking bits off. In the recommendations, I would like to see wholehearted agreement on how we can move forward and how Government policy can develop. I will then know where the lines are drawn in the sand. I can assure you, however, that if I do not agree with where those lines are drawn, and if I want to do one of the other things if I think that you are all wrong, I will.

drwyddo i gyd. Er enghraifft, bydd yn creu goblygiadau i'r ffordd rydym yn ymdrin â pholisi'r gronfa strwythurol Ewropeaidd, os cawn gylch arall. Os gallaf, hoffwn ddatblygu consensws yma am ddefnyddio dinas-ranbarthau a'u buddion yn y cyd-destun hwn, yn hytrach na chael rhyfel gwleidyddol a thynnu darnau i ffwrdd. Yn yr argymhellion, hoffwn weld cytundeb llwyr am sut y gallwn symud ymlaen a sut y gall polisi'r Llywodraeth ddatblygu. Yna, byddaf yn gwybod ble mae'r llinellau yn y tywod. Gallaf eich sicrhau, fodd bynnag, os nad wyf yn cytuno â ble mae'r llinellau hynny, ac os hoffwn wneud un o'r pethau eraill os credaf eich bod i gyd yn anghywir, y gwnaf hynny.

Sandy Mewies: I can perfectly understand the concentration and results of this report that there will be two city regions in the south, and the reasons behind that. I am understandably more concerned about what will happen in north-east Wales. It is what is not said here that I would like to see expanded on in future. I certainly support the move for a general debate here when people have had time to look at this in depth and at the possible repercussions for other areas.

Sandy Mewies: Gallaf ddeall yn iawn bod canlyniadau'r adroddiad hwn yn canolbwyntio ar ddau ddinas-ranbarth yn y de, a'r rhesymau am hynny. Yn ddealladwy, rwyf yn pryderu mwy am beth fydd yn digwydd yn y gogledd-ddwyrain. Yn y dyfodol, hoffwn weld ehangu ar y pethau na chawsant eu dweud yma. Yn sicr, rwyf o blaid cynnal dadl gyffredinol yma ar ôl i bobl gael amser i edrych yn fanwl ar hyn ac ar yr ôl-effeithiau posibl i ardaloedd eraill.

I am afraid that I will be speaking parochially now. I live in Flintshire, my constituency is in Flintshire, and Flintshire is generally regarded as a wealthy part of Wales. In fact, the rural part of Flintshire, as you know and understand, Minister, is not as wealthy by any means. There are pockets of real poverty and deprivation there. What I would like to see included in the debate for the future is how we will achieve some consistency. We will have Deeside enterprise zone to our left, and we already know, as you have said, that there are great cross-border issues with people travelling in and out of England and Wales. Some money comes in and some goes out.

Mae arnaf ofn fy mod am siarad yn blwyfol nawr. Rwyf yn byw yn sir y Fflint, mae fy etholaeth yn sir y Fflint, ac ystyrir yn gyffredinol bod sir y Fflint yn rhan gyfoethog o Gymru. Yn wir, nid yw rhan wledig sir y Fflint, fel rydych yn gwybod ac yn deall, Weinidog, mor gyfoethog o bell ffordd. Ceir pocedi o dlodi ac amddifadedd gwirioneddol yno. Yr hyn yr hoffwn ei weld wedi'i gynnwys yn y ddadl ar gyfer y dyfodol yw sut y cawn rywfaint o gysondeb. Bydd gennym barth menter Glannau Dyfrdwy ar y chwith inni, ac rydym eisoes yn gwybod, fel y dywedasoch, fod materion trawsffiniol mawr o ran pobl yn teithio i mewn ac allan o Gymru a Lloegr. Mae rhywfaint o arian yn dod i mewn a rhywfaint yn mynd allan.

What I am sure of is that, in the area from my constituency towards the coast, a main issue that would have to be dealt with to ensure that the gap does not increase is transport. I am sure that this is an issue for everybody, but transport is a real issue in my area. It is wonderful to create jobs, and I hope that jobs will be created—and I understand how they

Rwyf yn siŵr, yn yr ardal rhwng fy etholaeth a'r arfordir, mai un mater pwysig y byddai angen rhoi sylw iddo i sicrhau nad yw'r bwlch yn cynyddu yw trafnidiaeth. Rwyf yn siŵr bod hyn yn wir am bawb, ond mae trafnidiaeth yn dipyn o broblem yn fy ardal. Mae'n wych creu swyddi, a gobeithiaf y caiff swyddi eu creu—a deallaf sut y gellid eu creu

could be in academia and so on—but the problem that we face is how do the people get to the jobs? The A55 in one way is a reasonable thoroughfare, but, as you know, a lot of places are extremely inaccessible to get to places such as Deeside industrial estate. If this is to go ahead as a development, could we have, as part of the workshops or future development and debate, a look at the possible impacts everywhere else? That is not to say that I do not support this work. It is one step on the way, but it is also important that we look at the impact that we could make on other parts.

ym maes academia ac ati—ond y broblem sy'n ein hwynebu yw sut y mae pobl yn cyrraedd y swyddi? Mae'r A55 yn ffordd resymol mewn un ffordd, ond, fel y gwyddoch, mae llawer o lefydd yn anodd iawn eu cyrraedd o lefydd megis ystâd ddiwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy. Os yw hyn am ddigwydd fel datblygiad, a allem gael, fel rhan o'r gweithdai neu'r datblygiadau a'r dadleuon yn y dyfodol, golwg ar yr effeithiau posibl ym mhobman arall? Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad wyf o blaid y gwaith hwn. Mae'n un cam ar hyd y ffordd, ond mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn edrych ar yr effaith y gallem ei chael ar rannau eraill.

Edwina Hart: Thank you for that reflective and thoughtful contribution. You are articulating what many Members think about the worries in their constituencies about what impact this will have, and how they do not see themselves as part of the global plan for city regions. That is why it is so important to consider, as you drive a region to greater prosperity, how to get the balance right between what it sucks in, what it does, and how it benefits others elsewhere. I would be pleased to speak to Dr Elizabeth Haywood about whether she is prepared to undertake further work on some of the points that you raise. She will be undertaking some consultation meetings formally during the summer. She will hold a meeting with Members when we come back after the summer recess, and will hold further meetings with businesses, trade unions and with the Welsh Local Government Association and so on.

Edwina Hart: Diolch am y cyfraniad myfyriol a meddylgar hwnnw. Rydych yn mynegi'r hyn y mae nifer o Aelodau'n ei feddwl am y pryderon yn eu hetholaethau am yr effaith a gaiff hyn, ac nad ydynt yn gweld eu hunain yn rhan o'r cynllun byd-eang ar gyfer dinas-ranbarthau. Dyna pam mae mor bwysig ystyried, wrth ichi yrru rhanbarth at fwy o ffyniant, sut i gael y cydbwysedd cywir rhwng yr hyn y mae'n ei ddenu i mewn, yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud, a sut y mae o fudd i bobl eraill mewn mannau eraill. Hoffwn siarad â Dr Elizabeth Haywood i gael gwybod a yw'n fodlon gwneud mwy o waith am rai o'r pwyntiau a godwch. Bydd hi'n cynnal rhai cyfarfodydd ymgynghori ffurfiol yn ystod yr haf. Bydd hi'n cynnal cyfarfod ag Aelodau pan ddown yn ôl ar ôl toriad yr haf, a bydd hi'n cynnal cyfarfodydd pellach â busnesau, undebau llafur, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac ati.

Your points on transport are valid. When we talk about city regions, people tend to think about Cardiff or Swansea. I do not see it like that, as I said in response to Alun Ffred Jones. I see it as the centres that you get in the Valleys and elsewhere. This is about how people connect with one another and the flows between home and work. Those will be the key elements in this.

Mae eich pwyntiau am drafnidiaeth yn rhai dilys. Pan siaradwn am ddinas-ranbarthau, mae pobl yn tueddu i feddwl am Gaerdydd neu Abertawe. Nid wyf yn eu gweld fel yna, fel y dywedais wrth ateb Alun Ffred Jones. Rwyf yn eu gweld fel y canolfannau a gewch yn y Cymoedd ac mewn mannau eraill. Mae'n ymwneud â sut y mae pobl yn cysylltu â'i gilydd a'r llifoedd rhwng y cartref a'r gwaith. Dyna fydd elfennau allweddol hyn.

Darren Millar: Thank you, Minister, for your statement today. I read with interest the parts of the report that relate to north-east Wales. South Denbighshire, which forms a large part of my constituency, is in that

Darren Millar: Diolch, Weinidog, am eich datganiad heddiw. Darllenais â diddordeb y rhannau o'r adroddiad sy'n sôn am y gogledd-ddwyrain. Mae de sir Ddinbych, sy'n rhan fawr o fy etholaeth, yn y rhanbarth

region. I am disappointed that there is a recommendation for only two city regions, because we need a focus on north-east Wales so that we do not fall behind.

hwnnw. Rwyf yn siomedig mai dim ond dau ddinas-ranbarth a argymhellwyd, oherwydd mae angen ffocws ar y gogledd-ddwyrain i'n hatal rhag mynd ar ei hôl hi.

We welcome very much the Deeside enterprise zone announcement. Many of my constituents travel to Deeside for employment and beyond it, into Chester, Liverpool and Manchester. I support the comments made, particularly by Sandy Mewies, on the transport infrastructure. The report makes reference to the need for a direct link to Liverpool as far as rail services are concerned. I am pleased that it has had a mention in the report, because I have been raising that issue for some time.

Rydym yn croesawu'n fawr y cyhoeddiad am barth menter Glannau Dyfrdwy. Mae llawer o fy etholwyr yn teithio i Lannau Dyfrdwy i weithio, a thu hwnt i Gaer, Lerpwl a Manceinion. Cefnogaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd, yn enwedig gan Sandy Mewies, am y seilwaith trafnidiaeth. Mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio at yr angen am gyswllt rheilffordd uniongyrchol â Lerpwl. Rwyf yn falch bod yr adroddiad wedi sôn am hynny, oherwydd rwyf wedi bod yn codi'r mater hwnnw ers cryn amser.

There are bottlenecks on the A55 trunk road and it is very busy, particularly in the summer. I flag that up as an issue that needs to be discussed because there is a danger of north-east Wales falling behind other parts of Wales if there is a specific focus just on the south. Indeed, there is no doubt that there will be some resentment if there are significant efforts in the south to improve economic prosperity and the contribution of urban areas to the economy but no similar effort is made in the north. I know that you are aware of those tensions, Minister, and that we are all acutely aware of the sometimes ill-conceived perception that decisions made in this place are biased to south Wales. However, it is a factor that people consider, so could you re-emphasise to your officials, when they sit down to look at this document and at how to bring these things into reality, the need for them to consider what separate efforts we might be able to make in respect of north-east Wales? It may not be the development of a city zone, but perhaps we could do other things to improve the lot of that particular part of Wales.

Ceir tagfeydd ar gefnffordd yr A55 ac mae'n brysur iawn, yn enwedig yn yr haf. Soniaf am hynny fel mater sydd angen ei drafod oherwydd y perygl y bydd y gogledd-ddwyrain yn mynd ar ei hôl hi o gymharu â rhannau eraill o Gymru os ceir ffocws penodol ar y de'n unig. Yn wir, nid oes amheuaeth y ceir rhywfaint o ddrwgdeimlad os ceir ymdrechion sylweddol yn y de i wella ffyniant economaidd a chyfraniad ardaloedd trefol at yr economi heb ymdrechion tebyg yn y gogledd. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r tensiynau hynny, Weinidog, a'n bod i gyd yn ddigon ymwybodol o'r canfyddiad, sy'n anghywir ar adegau, bod penderfyniadau a wneir yma'n ffafrio'r de. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ffactor y mae pobl yn ei ystyried, felly a allech bwysleisio eto wrth eich swyddogion, pan fyddant yn eistedd i edrych ar y ddogfen hon ac ar sut i droi'r pethau hyn yn realiti, fod angen iddynt ystyried pa ymdrechion ar wahân y gallem eu gwneud ar gyfer y gogledd-ddwyrain? Efallai nad datblygu dinas-ranbarth fyddai, ond efallai y gallem wneud pethau eraill i wella sefyllfa'r rhan benodol honno o Gymru.

Edwina Hart: As a Government Minister, I am cognisant of economic development needs and requirements throughout Wales. In north Wales, Deeside, Ynys Môn and Snowdonia are all enterprise zones. Given the population numbers of those places, they have done really quite well. 'City region' is just a name and is not the only approach to economic development. As I indicated in my statement, I have undertaken work to

Edwina Hart: Fel un o Weinidogion y Llywodraeth, rwyf yn ymwybodol o anghenion a gofynion datblygu economaidd ledled Cymru. Yn y gogledd, ceir parthau menter Glannau Dyfrdwy, Ynys Môn ac Eryri. O ystyried niferoedd poblogaeth y mannau hynny, maent wedi gwneud yn dda iawn. Dim ond enw yw 'dinas-ranbarth' ac nid dyna'r unig ddull datblygu economaidd. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, rwyf wedi

consider tailored measures for different places, particularly Powys.

gweithio i ystyried mesurau wedi'u teilwra ar gyfer mannau gwahanol, yn enwedig Powys.

3.45 p.m.

That work will help to tailor other considerations, in terms of the development of policy in Wales. For me, the report identifies the fact that, based on the experience of city regions, areas outside of them can benefit from this approach being adopted. I think that the report looked at Stuttgart. That example focused on the growth of the city and keeping the green and rural corridors outside intact. This helped the redistribution of funding in the long run, which was quite an important point in that report. A study from north-east England found that increasing and better provision in the city region forced improvements in surrounding rural areas. If we look at Wales in that context, we can see the benefits of this. Also, the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage told Assembly Members, in the context of the commitment to rural Wales, about what we are going to do in the rural context. There are a lot of issues around this that we need to look at very carefully. However, we have to recognise that just because you are in a city region, it does not mean that something is going to happen, and that you have to see the city region for what it is. It is there to access funds, deal with things and deal with particular economic issues.

Bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n helpu i deilwra ystyriaethau eraill, o ran datblygu polisi yng Nghymru. I mi, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi, yn seiliedig ar brofiad dinas-ranbarthau, y gall ardaloedd y tu allan iddynt elwa o fabwysiadu'r dull hwn. Credaf fod yr adroddiad yn edrych ar Stuttgart. Yr oedd yr enghraifft honno'n canolbwyntio ar dwf y ddinas ac ar gynnal y coridorau gwyrdd a gwledig y tu allan iddi. Helpodd hyn i ailddosbarthu cyllid yn hirdymor, sef un o bwyntiau pwysicaf yr adroddiad hwnnw. Canfu astudiaeth o ogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr fod mwy o ddarpariaeth, a darpariaeth well, yn y dinas-ranbarth yn gorfodi gwelliannau yn yr ardaloedd gwledig o'i gwmpas. Os edrychwn ar Gymru yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, gallwn weld buddion hyn. Hefyd, dywedodd y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth wrth Aelodau'r Cynulliad, yng nghyd-destun yr ymrwymiad i Gymru wledig, am yr hyn rydym yn mynd i'w wneud yn y cyd-destun gwledig. Mae nifer o faterion yn gysylltiedig â hyn a bydd angen inni edrych arnynt yn ofalus iawn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod, dim ond am eich bod mewn dinas-ranbarth, nid yw hynny'n golygu bod rhywbeth am ddigwydd, a rhaid ichi weld beth yw diben y dinas-ranbarth. Mae yno i roi mynediad at gyllid, ymdrin â phethau ac ymdrin â materion economaidd penodol.

Jocelyn Davies: Minister, I agree with you about how important names are. When Newport was awarded city status, there was great hope and optimism that this would mark a new dawn for the economic prospects of the area. When you develop this policy, will you look at how important identity is and how Newport will be able to preserve its distinct identity when your city region is centred on Cardiff? I know that you would agree with me that identity, and belonging to your locality, is important. We heard from a Cardiff girl earlier on, and we have heard from a Swansea girl, and of course I am a Valleys girl. I cannot imagine describing myself as a Cardiff city region girl. That is not going to trip off the tongue. We need to ensure that names are important and that

Jocelyn Davies: Weinidog, cytunaf â chi am bwysigrwydd enwau. Pan roddwyd statws dinas i Gasnewydd, yr oedd llawer o obaith ac optimistiaeth y byddai hynny'n nodi gwawr newydd i ragolygon economaidd yr ardal. Pan ddatblygwch y polisi hwn, a edrychwch ar bwysigrwydd hunaniaeth a sut y gall Casnewydd gadw ei hunaniaeth ei hun pan mae eich dinas-ranbarth yn canolbwyntio ar Gaerdydd? Gwn y byddech yn cytuno â mi fod hunaniaeth, a pherthyn i'ch ardal leol, yn bwysig. Clywsom gan ferch o Gaerdydd yn gynharach, ac rydym wedi clywed gan ferch o Abertawe, ac wrth gwrs merch o'r Cymoedd wyf fi. Ni allaf ddychmygu disgrifio fy hun fel merch o ddinas-ranbarth Caerdydd. Ni fydd hynny'n llithro oddi ar y tafod. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod enwau'n

people can keep an identity, based on their locality, that they are comfortable with.

bwysig ac y gall pobl gadw hunaniaeth, yn seiliedig ar eu hardal leol, y maent yn gyfforddus ag ef.

Edwina Hart: Jocelyn Davies has gone to the heart of the matter regarding what the public perception will be in terms of this discussion. This is about identity. In Wales, we keep to our identities in terms of where we have been to school and the way we talk about things. When I talk about where I went to school, I tell people that I am an old Gowertonian. People wonder what a Gowertonian is, but many other people know what a Gowertonian is. People are very proud of where they went to school and what they have done. We are like that as a nation. However, the issue with the city region is that it is not just about focusing on Cardiff, but about focusing on every other part of that region where there can be growth and opportunities. We have to get the message across. When you look at a city region, you are looking at an entity that is there to harness economic development and growth and to provide a better structure in terms of managing the economy and getting development. However, I take on board the comments that the Member made about identity.

Edwina Hart: Mae Jocelyn Davies wedi mynd at galon y mater o ran sut y bydd y cyhoedd yn dehongli'r drafodaeth hon. Mae'n fater o hunaniaeth. Yng Nghymru, rydym yn cadw ein hunaniaeth o ran i le'r aethom i'r ysgol a'r ffordd y byddwn yn siarad am bethau. Pan siaradaf am i le'r es i'r ysgol, dywedaf wrth bobl fy mod yn gyn-ddisgybl ysgol Tre-gŵyr. Nid yw rhai pobl wedi clywed am ysgol Tre-gŵyr, ond mae llawer o bobl eraill wedi clywed amdani. Mae pobl yn falch iawn o'r ysgol yr aethant iddi ac o'r hyn y maent wedi'i wneud. Dyna sut genedl ydym ni. Fodd bynnag, y peth gyda'r dinas-ranbarth yw nad yw'n ffocysu ar Gaerdydd yn unig, ond ei fod yn ffocysu ar bob rhan arall o'r rhanbarth hwnnw lle gellir cael twf a chyfleoedd. Rhaid inni gyfleu'r neges honno. Pan edrychwch ar ddinas-ranbarth, rydych yn edrych ar endid sydd yno i harneisio datblygiad a thwf economaidd ac i ddarparu strwythur gwell o ran rheoli'r economi a chael datblygiad. Fodd bynnag, derbyniaf sylwadau'r Aelod am hunaniaeth.

Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol i'r Cyfraniad a Wneir gan Fferyllfeydd Cymunedol i Wasanaethau Iechyd yng Nghymru
The Health and Social Care Committee's Inquiry into the Contribution of Community Pharmacy to Health Services in Wales

Cynnig NDM5033 Mark Drakeford

Motion NDM5033 Mark Drakeford

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol ar ei ymchwiliad i'r cyfraniad a wneir gan fferyllfeydd cymunedol i wasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mai 2012.

Notes the report of the Health and Social Care Committee on its Inquiry into the contribution of community pharmacy to health services in Wales, which was laid in the Table Office on 17 May 2012.

Mark Drakeford: Cynigiaf y cynnig.

Mark Drakeford: I move the motion.

Yn ystod etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad, ychydig dros flwyddyn yn ôl, cyhoeddodd pob plaid yn y Siambr hon ymrwymiad

At the last Assembly elections, just over a year ago, every party in this chamber provided a manifesto commitment, of one

maniffesto, ar ryw ffurf neu'i gilydd, i roi mwy o rôl i wasanaethau fferylliaeth gymunedol yng ngwasanaethau iechyd Cymru yn y dyfodol. Cam naturiol, felly, oedd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol newydd neilltuo lle yn ein rhaglen waith i archwilio'r cynnig hwn yn fanwl. Y canlyniad yw'r adroddiad sydd o'ch blaen heddiw.

sort or another, to expanding the part to be played by community pharmacy services in future health provision in Wales. It seemed a natural step, therefore, for the newly formed Health and Social Care Committee to identify an early place in our work programme to subject this proposition to detailed examination. The result is the report you have before you today.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn seiliedig, fel y buasech yn ei ddisgwyl, ar dystiolaeth arbenigol nifer fawr o unigolion a sefydliadau yng Nghymru a'r tu hwnt. Mae'n elwa o'r cymorth a gafodd y pwyllgor gan ei staff ei hun, a nododd y prif faterion ac a ddaeth i gasgliadau ynglŷn â nhw. Rydym yn parhau i fod yn ddiolchgar iawn iddynt. Rydym yn ddiolchgar hefyd i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb adeiladol i'r adroddiad.

It is the product, as you would expect, of the expert evidence provided by a large number of individuals and organisations, from Wales and beyond. It draws on the assistance that the committee received from our own staff in identifying key issues and coming to conclusions about them. We were, and remain, very grateful to them all. We are grateful, too, to the Minister for her constructive response to the report.

Roedd rhan o'r broses o grynhoi'r cynnwys wedi'i seilio ar y ffaith bod y pwyllgor yn parhau i fod yn benderfynol o gynhyrchu adroddiad sy'n canolbwyntio ar nifer fechan o gasgliadau ac argymhellion gwirioneddol allweddol. Mae corff yr adroddiad yn cynnwys set ehangach o faterion sydd, fe gredwn, yn haeddu ystyriaeth bellach gan Lywodraeth Cymru, Mae'r crynodeb ar y ddwy dudalen gyntaf, fodd bynnag, yn nodi'r materion hynny yr ydym yn credu y bydd yn rhaid canolbwyntio arnynt i ddatblygu rhaglen gynhyrchiol ar gyfer fferylliaeth gymunedol yn y dyfodol.

Part of the process of distillation was sharpened by the committee's continuing determination to produce a report that focuses a small number of really key conclusions and recommendations. The body of the report includes a wider set of issues that, we believe, deserve further consideration by the Welsh Government. The two-page summary at the start, however, identifies those issues that we believe are inescapable, if a productive agenda for community pharmacy is to be developed for the future.

Ein prif gasgliad yw bod rhagor y gallai, ac y dylai, fferylliaeth gymunedol ei wneud i gyfrannu at wasanaethau iechyd Cymru yn y dyfodol. Wedi dweud hyn, y mae set o faterion mwy penodol y mae angen rhoi sylw iddynt os yw gwir botensial fferylliaeth gymunedol am gael ei wireddu, ac at y materion hyn yr wyf am droi yn awr.

Our central conclusion is to endorse the proposition that there is more that community pharmacy could, and should, contribute to future health services in Wales. Having said that, there is a set of more detailed matters that require attention if the real potential that these services possess is to be realised, and it is to these matters that I now turn.

Underneath the headline of believing that more could and should be done through community pharmacies in the future, our report looks at a number of key advantages that we think this sector possesses, at a number of reservations that we have, arising from the evidence we received, and then at a number of key matters that we think need to be attended to for the future.

O dan y pennawd sy'n dweud ein bod yn credu y gellid ac y dylid gwneud rhagor drwy gyfrwng fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn y dyfodol, mae ein hadroddiad yn edrych ar nifer o'r prif fanteision sydd gan y sector hwn yn ein barn ni, ac ar nifer o amheuon sydd gennym, sy'n codi o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom, ac wedyn ar nifer o faterion allweddol y tybiwn fod angen rhoi sylw iddynt yn y dyfodol.

Among the advantages put to us, and which we endorse, is the accessibility of community pharmacies. There are 710 of them in Wales and, on average, the network will deal with more than 50,000 individual cases every single day. We believe that they also have an ability to serve hard-to-reach groups, as there are community pharmacists in rural towns and villages. They serve deprived populations, and they serve those who do not have a GP and those who struggle to see GPs during opening hours.

Un o'r manteision a grybwyllwyd wrthym, ac yr ydym yn ei gefnogi, yw bod fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn hwylus. Mae 710 ohonynt yng Nghymru ac, ar gyfartaledd, bydd y rhwydwaith yn ymdrin â mwy na 50,000 o achosion unigol bob dydd. Credwn eu bod hefyd yn gallu gwasanaethu grwpiau anodd eu cyrraedd, oherwydd bod fferyllwyr cymunedol ar gael mewn trefi a phentrefi gwledig. Maent yn gwasanaethu poblogaethau di-fraint, ac maent yn gwasanaethu'r rheini nad oes ganddynt feddyg teulu a'r rheini sy'n straffaglu i weld meddygon teulu yn ystod eu horiau agor.

They offer a relatively anonymous service. The Family Planning Association, for example, told us that that was very important for receipt of the morning-after pill and other services in that field.

Maent yn cynnig gwasanaeth cymharol anhysbys. Dywedodd y Gymdeithas Cynllunio Teulu wrthym, er enghraifft, fod hynny'n bwysig iawn ar gyfer cael y bilsen bore wedyn a gwasanaethau eraill yn y maes hwnnw.

We were also convinced about the contribution that community pharmacists can make to the public health agenda. This is partly because, as Public Health Wales reported last year, there is a greater concentration of community pharmacists in areas of relative deprivation. The public health contribution of community pharmacy is an area where the committee was encouraged by evidence of what has already been achieved and also anxious that lessons should be learned to achieve even greater impact in the future. We think that the contribution of community pharmacy in this area is best realised when public health is pursued in an active and a campaigning way. We agreed with the Minister when she told us that the full impact of community pharmacy involvement in the public health agenda was yet to be captured. As a result, we recommended that consistent participation of the sector be secured for the next round of public health campaigns, both national and local.

Cawsom ein hargyhoeddi hefyd ynglŷn â'r cyfraniad y gall fferyllwyr cymunedol ei wneud at yr agenda iechyd cyhoeddus. Y rheswm dros hyn yn rhannol, fel yr adroddodd Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru y llynedd, yw bod mwy o grynodiad o fferyllwyr cymunedol mewn ardaloedd o amddifadedd cymharol. Mae cyfraniad fferylliaeth gymunedol at iechyd cyhoeddus yn faes lle'r oedd y pwyllgor yn cael ei galonogi gan y dystiolaeth o'r hyn sydd wedi'i gyflawni eisoes a lle'r oedd hefyd yn awyddus i wersi gael eu dysgu er mwyn sicrhau dylanwad mwy byth yn y dyfodol. Credwn mai'r enghraifft orau o gyfraniad fferylliaeth gymunedol yn y maes hwn yw pan fydd yn ymgyrchu'n frwd ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus. Roeddem yn cytuno â'r Gweinidog pan ddywedodd wrthym nad oeddem eto wedi manteisio'n llawn ar ddylanwad fferylliaeth gymunedol wrth iddi ymwneud â'r agenda iechyd cyhoeddus. Felly, ein hargymhelliad oedd y dylid sicrhau bod y sector yn cyfrannu'n gyson yng nghylch nesaf yr ymgyrchoedd iechyd cyhoeddus, a hynny'n genedlaethol ac yn lleol.

If those are some of the key strengths of the sector, we had some reservations as well. We were not as convinced as some of the advocates of community pharmacy that

Os dyna rai o brif gryfderau'r sector, roedd gennym ambell amheuaeth hefyd. Ni chawsom ein hargyhoeddi gymaint ag yr oedd rhai o ladmeryddion fferylliaeth

pharmacists are routinely available out of normal working hours or at weekends. We accepted the evidence they gave us that there are cost benefits to be obtained from greater use of community pharmacists, but we thought that the case was oversimplified. It is not enough simply to say that if you move work from GPs to community pharmacies, that in itself will create savings—it does not. There are potential savings to be obtained further down the line if that means that GPs have more time to do the things that only GPs can do, but we thought that a more sophisticated sense of where those cost savings might be realised was needed in the future.

gymunedol fod fferyllwyr ar gael yn rheolaidd y tu allan i oriau gweithio arferol neu dros y penwythnos. Roeddem yn derbyn y dystiolaeth a roesant inni y gallai defnyddio rhagor ar fferyllwyr cymunedol arbed costau, ond credem fod y ddadl wedi'i gorsymleiddio. Nid yw'n ddigon dweud y bydd symud gwaith oddi wrth feddygon teulu i fferyllfeydd cymunedol, yn creu arbedion ynddo'i hun—nid yw hynny'n wir. Efallai y gellid arbed arian yn nes ymlaen os bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd gan feddygon teulu fwy o amser i wneud y pethau na all neb ond meddygon teulu eu gwneud, ond credem fod angen dealltwriaeth fwy soffistigedig ynglŷn ag ymhle y gellid gwireddu'r arbedion hynny yn y dyfodol.

Also, we were concerned by evidence of differences in the level of service between different community pharmacies. It is one of the reasons we made a key recommendation that there should be an obligation on all community pharmacists to place a prominent notice in their premises identifying the range of services available at that pharmacy. There is more work to be done in ensuring that both the range and the quality of community pharmacy services across the sector are brought up to the level already achieved by the best.

At hynny, roeddem yn poeni am dystiolaeth ynglŷn â gwahaniaethau yn lefel y gwasanaeth a ddarperid gan wahanol fferyllfeydd cymunedol. Dyma un o'n rhesymau dros wneud prif argymhelliad y dylai fod yn ddyletswydd ar bob fferyllydd cymunedol i osod hysbysiad amlwg yn eu fferyllfa'n dangos yr ystod o wasanaethau sydd ar gael yno. Mae rhagor o waith i'w wneud i sicrhau bod ystod gwasanaethau fferylliaeth gymunedol a'u hansawdd ar draws y sector gystal â'r safon a gyflawnir eisoes gan y goreuon.

Looking to the future, we echoed the conclusions reached by the task and finish group, set up by the previous health Minister, in that there is a need for a greater standardisation of services to meet needs that occur everywhere across Wales. The current Minister, in her evidence to us, equally made clear her preference for a greater number of services to be delivered against a single national specification. As a result, we emphasise in our report that the Welsh Government should take a lead in setting national priorities and ensuring their development. In that context, we warmly welcome the Welsh Government’s encouragement of all local health boards to consider community pharmacies as providers of flu vaccinations over the coming winter. We think that this could help to drive up vaccination rates and make good use of the professional abilities of pharmacists. It will also provide a testing bed for the generally agreed proposition that national leadership is

Ac edrych tua'r dyfodol, roeddem yn ategu casgliadau'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, a sefydlwyd gan y Gweinidog iechyd blaenorol, sef bod angen rhagor o safoni gwasanaethau er mwyn diwallu anghenion sy'n codi ledled Cymru. Yn ei thystiolaeth inni, roedd y Gweinidog presennol, yn yr un modd, yn ei gwneud yn glir y byddai'n well ganddi hithau weld nifer fwy o wasanaethau'n cael eu darparu'n unol ag un fanyleb genedlaethol. Felly, rydym yn pwysleisio yn ein hadroddiad y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru afael yn yr awenau drwy sefydlu blaenoriaethau cenedlaethol a sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu datblygu. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, rydym yn croesawu'n gynnes anogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru i bob bwrdd iechyd lleol ystyried fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn ddarparwyr brechiadau ffliw yn y gaeaf sy'n dod. Credwn y gallai hyn fod o gymorth i gynyddu'r cyfraddau brechu ac i ddefnyddio galluoedd proffesiynol fferyllwyr yn dda. Bydd hefyd yn gyfrwng i brofi'r ddadl a

needed to bring about local service change.

dderbynnir yn gyffredinol fod angen arweiniad cenedlaethol er mwyn gwireddu newid mewn gwasanaethau lleol.

There are a number of other matters that we identified as important for the future. Remuneration is important. Currently, the remuneration of community pharmacists is based on volume as opposed to quality of service. All five LHBs that responded to our inquiry favoured a change in that area. Scotland has already introduced a banded capitation payment system. We took evidence from pharmacy representatives from Scotland, by which we were much impressed and which strongly endorsed the shift towards serviced-based rather than volume-based remuneration.

Nodwyd nifer o bethau eraill gennym a oedd yn bwysig ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae taliadau'n bwysig. Ar hyn o bryd, seilir taliadau fferyllwyr cymunedol ar foliwm yn hytrach nag ar ansawdd y gwasanaeth. Roedd pob un o'r pum BILl a ymatebodd i'n hymchwiliad o blaid newid yn y maes hwnnw. Mae'r Alban eisoes wedi cyflwyno system taliadau fesul pen ar sail bandiau. Cawsom dystiolaeth gan gynrychiolwyr o'r maes fferylliaeth yn yr Alban, a gwnaethant argraff fawr arnom. Roedd y dystiolaeth honno'n cymeradwyo'n gryf symud at daliadau ar sail gwasanaeth yn hytrach nag ar sail foliwm.

If there was one issue that we, as a committee, felt ran as a thread through some of these issues for the future, it was a sense of disagreement between different professional interests that operate in and around the field of community pharmacy. Improvements need to be made for the future that lies in the hands of the professions themselves. There are other areas, however, where the greater contribution, which we believe is there to be realised, relies on securing agreement not only in the community pharmacy profession, but with other health professionals. Disagreements between the community pharmacy sector and doctors' representatives were highlighted throughout the inquiry. Our view was that inter-professional disputes are holding back the resolution of some important issues, such as the extent to which community pharmacists should have access to patient information. The clear evidence that we took from the Welsh Government's chief information officer was that there was no technological reason why pharmacists should not access relevant patient information via individual healthcare records. The barrier is not technological. It relies on the professions agreeing among themselves on what should be shared.

Os oedd un edefyn yr oeddem ni'r pwyllgor yn teimlo'i fod yn dirwyn drwy rai o'r materion hyn at y dyfodol, ymdeimlad o anghytundeb oedd hynny rhwng gwahanol fuddiannau proffesiynol sy'n gweithredu ym maes fferylliaeth gymunedol ac yn ei gyffiniau. Mae angen gwelliannau ar gyfer y dyfodol sydd yn nwylo'r proffesiynau eu hunain. Mae meysydd eraill, fodd bynnag, lle y bydd sicrhau cyfraniad mwy, ac rydym yn credu bod modd gwireddu'r cyfraniad hwnnw, yn dibynnu ar sicrhau cytundeb, nid dim ond o fewn proffesiwn y fferyllwyr cymunedol, ond gyda gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill ym maes iechyd. Tynnwyd sylw at anghytundebau rhwng y sector fferylliaeth gymunedol a chynrychiolwyr meddygon drwy gydol yr ymchwiliad. Ein barn ni yw bod anghydfodau rhwng y proffesiynau'n rhwystr rhag datrys rhai materion o bwys, megis i ba raddau y dylai fferyllwyr cymunedol allu cael gafael ar wybodaeth am gleifion. Y dystiolaeth glir a gawsom gan brif swyddog gwybodaeth Llywodraeth Cymru oedd nad oedd rheswm technolegol pam na ddylai fferyllwyr gael gafael ar wybodaeth berthnasol am gleifion drwy weld cofnodion gofal iechyd unigol. Nid technoleg sy'n rhwystro hyn. Mae'n dibynnu ar y proffesiynau'n cytuno ymhlith ei gilydd ynglŷn â'r hyn y dylid ei rannu.

Positively, in that area, we believe that the decision to introduce a national minor ailments scheme, underpinned by a patient registration system, offers a real and practical

Yn y cyswllt hwnnw, un peth cadarnhaol yn ein barn ni yw bod y penderfyniad i gyflwyno cynllun cenedlaethol ar gyfer mân anhwylderau, a system cofrestru cleifion yn

opportunity for that information-sharing issue to be resolved. Our conclusion was that access to summary patient records by community pharmacists was the correct course to pursue in future. As regards addressing other inter-professional tensions that we identified as holding back the contribution that community pharmacists could make to the future of primary care teams, there is a job for the Government to do in bringing about the discussions necessary to their resolution. The key responsibility lies in the hands of the professions themselves and the bodies that represent them. In one of our recommendations, we say that it is a responsibility that they need to exercise more positively and with a greater sense of urgency.

sail iddo, yn cynnig cyfle gwirioneddol ac ymarferol i ddatrys yr anhawster rhannu-gwybodaeth hwnnw. Ein casgliad oedd mai'r llwybr cywir i'w ddilyn yn y dyfodol fyddai bod fferyllwyr cymunedol yn gallu gweld cofnodion cryno am gleifion. O ran mynd i'r afael â'r tensiynau eraill rhwng y proffesiynau a oedd i bob golwg yn rhwystro fferyllwyr cymunedol rhag cyfrannu at ddyfodol timau gofal sylfaenol, gwaith y Llywodraeth yw hwyluso'r trafodaethau sy'n angenrheidiol i'w datrys. Y proffesiynau eu hunain a'r cyrff sy'n eu cynrychioli sy'n bennaf gyfrifol. Yn un o'n hargymhellion, dywedwn fod hwn yn gyfrifoldeb y mae angen iddynt fynd i'r afael ag ef ag agwedd fwy cadarnhaol a mwy o ymdeimlad o frys.

4.00 p.m.

To conclude, this is a report that provides a positive endorsement of the contribution that community pharmacy makes now, and the extended contribution that it could make in future. Our recommendations identify a set of practical actions that need to be taken to realise that potential in full. We are pleased that the Government’s response accepts all our recommendations, and we hope that the report will find favour with the wider Assembly this afternoon.

I gloi, adroddiad yw hwn sy'n ategu'n gadarnhaol y cyfraniad a wneir gan fferylliaeth gymunedol yn awr, a'r cyfraniad estynedig y gallai ei wneud yn y dyfodol. Mae ein hargymhellion yn nodi set o gamau ymarferol y mae angen eu cymryd i wireddu'r potensial hwnnw'n llawn. Rydym yn falch bod y llywodraeth, wrth ymateb, yn derbyn ein hargymhellion i gyd, ac rydym yn gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn ehangach yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad y prynhawn yma.

Darren Millar: I would like to welcome this report on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives and take this opportunity to thank the committee Chair for the way in which he conducted this inquiry, and indeed the committee staff for their support to all Assembly Members on that committee, particularly during the report’s compilation. It was a wide-ranging inquiry, and it is fair to say that we left no stone unturned in looking at this issue, but there was good reason for that: community pharmacies have a huge role to play in the NHS in the future and, at the moment, that role is being undermined for some of the reasons that I will come to in a moment.

Darren Millar: Hoffwn groesawu'r adroddiad hwn ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig gan achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor am y ffordd y cynhaliodd yr ymchwiliad hwn, ac yn wir i staff y pwyllgor am eu cefnogaeth i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar y pwyllgor hwnnw, yn enwedig adeg llunio'r adroddiad. Roedd yn ymchwiliad eang ei gwmpas, ac mae'n deg dweud nad adawsom yr un garreg heb ei throi wrth edrych ar y mater hwn, ond roedd rheswm da dros hynny: mae gan fferyllfeydd cymunedol rôl enfawr i'w chwarae yn y GIG yn y dyfodol ac, ar hyn o bryd, mae'r rôl honno'n cael ei thanseilio am rai o'r rhesymau y dof atynt mewn munud.

Community pharmacies are very much at the centre of communities in Wales and provide varied services such as smoking cessation and needle exchange, which people are often not fully aware of. However, pharmacies are

Mae fferyllfeydd cymunedol i raddau helaeth iawn yng nghanol cymunedau yng Nghymru ac maent yn darparu gwasanaethau amrywiol megis gwasanaethau atal ysmygu a chyfnewid nodwyddau. Yn aml iawn, ni fydd

highly visible and accessible to most people across the country. Their consistent high street presence makes them well trusted by the public. There is no doubt in my mind that they can contribute a great deal more in terms of the public service in the future.

pobl yn llwyr ymwybodol o hyn. Serch hynny, mae fferyllfeydd yn amlwg iawn ac yn hwylus iawn i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl drwy'r wlad. Mae eu presenoldeb cyson ar y stryd fawr yn golygu bod y cyhoedd yn ymddiried yn fawr ynddynt. Nid oes amheuaeth yn fy meddwl na allant gyfrannu llawer mwy o ran y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol.

The potential of the community pharmacy network to deliver health services has long been underestimated. It has been easy to overlook community pharmacies, particularly during that period of significant growth in the NHS budget between 1997 and 2007. When you consider the fact that the health budget is now under pressure, it is time to look at the ability of community pharmacies to provide services to the people of Wales in the future. There are opportunities to provide services more efficiently through the use of community pharmacies. There is an interesting table on pages 19 and 20 of the report based on evidence provided by Community Pharmacy Wales about the opportunities to save money and provide services more efficiently. It goes through five factors, including medicines management, which could save £10 million a year for the Welsh taxpayer, the introduction of the minor ailments scheme, to which we know the Government is committed, and where we look forward to the roll-out saving £30 million, and others that could save more. It is important that we do what we can to realise those financial benefits for the Welsh NHS, particularly at this time when budgets are shrinking.

Mae potensial rhwydwaith y fferyllfeydd cymunedol i ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd wedi cael ei danbrisio ers tro. Mae wedi bod yn hawdd anwybyddu fferyllfeydd cymunedol, yn enwedig yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw o dwf sylweddol yng nghyllideb y GIG rhwng 1997 a 2007. Pan ystyriwch y ffaith fod y gyllideb iechyd bellach o dan bwysau, mae'n bryd edrych ar allu fferyllfeydd cymunedol i ddarparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl Cymru yn y dyfodol. Mae cyfleoedd i ddarparu gwasanaethau'n fwy effeithlon drwy ddefnyddio fferyllfeydd cymunedol. Mae tabl diddorol ar dudalennau 19 ac 20 o'r adroddiad sydd wedi'i seilio ar dystiolaeth a ddarparwyd gan Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru ynglŷn â'r cyfleoedd i arbed arian a darparu gwasanaethau'n fwy effeithlon. Mae'n sôn am bum ffactor, gan gynnwys rheoli meddyginiaethau, a allai arbed £10 miliwn y flwyddyn i'r trethdalwr yng Nghymru, cyflwyno'r cynllun mân anhwylderau, y gwyddom fod y Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo iddo, cynllun yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at ei ledaenu gan arbed £30 miliwn, a chynlluniau eraill a allai arbed rhagor. Mae'n bwysig inni wneud yr hyn a allwn i wireddu'r buddion ariannol hynny i GIG Cymru, yn enwedig yn awr a chyllidebau'n crebachu.

The issue of the public being aware of the services provided in their community pharmacy was important. It is clear that, because there is inconsistency across Wales in terms of the range of services provided at each community pharmacy, the public is often confused about what is available when it goes through the door. The very simple recommendation to display a notice of those services was something that we felt strongly about. Post offices do this on a regular basis. There is a range of services that everybody knows is available in the local post office, but we do not have a similar system for

Roedd sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn ymwybodol o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperid yn eu fferyllfa gymunedol yn bwysig. Mae'n amlwg, oherwydd bod anghysondeb ledled Cymru o ran ystod y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ym mhob fferyllfa gymunedol, fod y cyhoedd yn aml yn ddryslyd ynglŷn â'r hyn sydd ar gael wrth gamu drwy'r drws. Roedd yr argymhelliad syml iawn ynglŷn ag arddangos hysbysiad yn rhestru'r gwasanaethau hynny'n rhywbeth yr oeddem yn teimlo'n gryf yn ei gylch. Bydd swyddfeydd post yn gwneud hyn yn rheolaidd. Mae ystod o wasanaethau y mae pawb yn gwybod eu bod ar gael yn y

community pharmacies. We look forward to that being introduced, given that the Government has agreed to accept that recommendation.

swyddfa bost leol, ond nid oes gennym system debyg ar gyfer fferyllfeydd cymunedol. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld cyflwyno hynny, gan fod y Llywodraeth wedi cytuno i dderbyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw.

We were concerned about the views that community pharmacists and GPs held about their respective silos, and the tensions between those two professions. It seemed to me that that was a major barrier to making progress on community pharmacies playing a greater role in the provision of NHS services, and I look forward to hearing the Minister's response. Obviously, I have seen the written response, but I want to hear the Minister's response on how the Welsh Government might be able to help overcome some of those barriers in order that we can have more community pharmacy involvement in the delivery of services. There is no doubt that there needs to be a relationship of trust. GPs highlighted the fact that they felt that community pharmacists lacked diagnostic experience. They have to be able to trust community pharmacists to refer people on to their GPs when necessary.

Roeddem yn poeni am farn fferyllwyr cymunedol a meddygol teulu am eu meysydd ynysig hwy eu hunain ac am y tensiynau rhwng y ddau broffesiwn hynny. Roedd yn ymddangos i mi fod hynny'n rhwystr mawr a oedd yn atal fferyllfeydd cymunedol rhag camu ymlaen i chwarae rôl fwy yn narparu gwasanaethau'r GIG, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ymateb y Gweinidog. Mae'n amlwg fy mod wedi gweld yr ymateb ysgrifenedig, ond rwyf am glywed ymateb y Gweinidog ynglŷn â sut y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru fod o gymorth o ran goresgyn rhai o'r rhwystrau hynny er mwyn i fferyllfeydd cymunedol gyfrannu mwy at ddarparu gwasanaethau. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes angen perthynas o ymddiriedaeth. Tynnodd meddygon teulu sylw at y ffaith eu bod yn teimlo nad oedd gan fferyllwyr cymunedol brofiad diagnostig. Rhaid iddynt allu ymddiried mewn fferyllwyr cymunedol i gyfeirio pobl at eu meddygon teulu lle bo angen.

To close, Minister, it would be interesting to hear about the community pharmacy contract in your response. You said that the existing contract serves the people of Wales well, but will you keep that contract under review? If there comes a time when you feel that it does not serve the people of Wales well, I would welcome a commitment that you will look at the introduction of a Wales-only contract. Can you mention the opportunity that community pharmacies present in providing and supporting the over-50s health checks? You refer to that in your response to the committee and it would be interesting to learn more.

I gloi, Weinidog, byddai'n ddiddorol clywed am y contract fferylliaeth gymunedol yn eich ymateb. Dywedasoch fod y contract presennol yn gwasanaethu pobl Cymru'n dda, ond a wnewch barhau i adolygu'r contract hwnnw? Os daw adeg pan deimlwch nad yw'n gwasanaethu pobl Cymru'n dda, byddwn yn croesawu ymrwymiad y byddwch yn ystyried cyflwyno contract i Gymru'n unig. A allwch grybwyll y cyfle y mae fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn ei gynnig i ddarparu a chefnogi'r profion iechyd dros 50? Rydych yn cyfeirio at hynny yn eich ymateb i'r pwyllgor a byddai'n dda cael gwybod rhagor.

Lynne Neagle: The basic message underpinning this committee report is an important one. Given their place at the heart of so many Welsh towns and villages, and set against the context of significant service change and the move towards ever more treatment, care and rehabilitation within community settings, pharmacies can and should play a far bigger role in the future Welsh NHS. While the committee explored

Lynne Neagle: Mae'r neges sylfaenol sy'n sail i'r adroddiad hwn gan y pwyllgor yn un pwysig. A chofio'u bod wrth galon cynifer o drefi a phentrefi Cymru, a'r cyd-destun sef bod y gwasanaeth yn newid yn sylweddol a'r symudiad at ddarparu mwy a mwy o driniaeth, gofal ac adsefydlu yn y gymuned, gall fferyllfeydd chwarae rhan fwy o lawer yn GIG Cymru yn y dyfodol ac y dylent wneud hynny. Er bod y pwyllgor wedi

many initiatives and examples of good practice during its inquiry—innovation that we can look to learn from and seek to build upon nationally—we have to start by recognising that there are some significant challenges that first need to be overcome.

archwilio llu o gynlluniau ac enghreifftiau o arferion da yn ystod ei ymchwiliad—arloesi y gallwn ddisgwyl dysgu yn ei sgîl a cheisio adeiladu arno'n genedlaethol—rhaid inni ddechrau drwy gydnabod bod nifer o anawsterau sylweddol y mae angen eu goresgyn yn gyntaf.

Take the establishment of a national minor ailments scheme for example, which this report recommends and the Welsh Government has agreed to take forward on an incremental basis. I believe that it is a sensible move that should help free up the valuable time of GPs and patients alike. However, if a national roll out is to be successful, we must learn lessons from a similar initiative that has been pioneered in Torfaen since 2006. In advance of this debate, I visited a busy community pharmacy in Cwmbrân. It has been participating in the local scheme for years, but only 70 patients a month use the service. It might sound obvious, but, on a basic level, this relatively low take up helps underline the importance of one of the key recommendations of this report: we simply have to ensure that all community pharmacies are advertising the full range of services that they offer. That could be something as straightforward as a prominently displayed poster, or more innovative approaches, taking advantage of the opportunities that social and traditional media can offer. The evidence that I saw during my visit made it clear to me that word of mouth and referrals from staff at GP surgeries is not going to lead to the kind of take-up levels that we need. This is not because people do not want to access these kinds of services at their local pharmacy; it is simply because they do not know about them.

Cymerwch sefydlu cynllun cenedlaethol ar gyfer man anhwylderau er enghraifft, y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ei argymell ac y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cytuno i fwrw ymlaen ag ef fesul cam. Credaf ei fod yn gam call a ddylai gynorthwyo i ryddhau amser gwerthfawr meddygon teulu a chleifion ill dau. Serch hynny, er mwyn i'r cynllun gael ei ledaenu'n llwyddiannus, rhaid inni ddysgu gwersi yn sgîl cynllun arloesol tebyg yn Nhor-faen er 2006. Cyn y ddadl hon, ymwelais â fferyllfa gymunedol brysur yng Nghwmbrân. Mae wedi bod yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllun lleol ers blynyddoedd, ond dim ond 70 claf y mis sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaeth. Efallai fod hyn yn amlwg, ond ar lefel sylfaenol, mae'r ffaith mai nifer gymharol fach fel hyn sy'n manteisio ar y gwasanaeth yn gymorth i bwysleisio pwysigrwydd un o brif argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn: rhaid inni sicrhau bod pob fferyllfa gymunedol yn hysbysebu ystod lawn y gwasanaethau y mae'n eu cynnig. Gallai hynny fod yn rhywbeth mor syml ag arddangos poster mewn man amlwg, neu ddulliau mwy arloesol, gan fanteisio ar gyfleoedd cyfryngau cymdeithasol a thraddodiadol. Yn sgîl y dystiolaeth a welais wrth ymweld, roedd yn amlwg i mi na wnaiff gwybodaeth ar dafod leferydd ac atgyfeirio gan staff meddygfeydd sicrhau bod y niferoedd y mae eu hangen arnom yn manteisio ar y gwasanaethau hyn. Nid nad yw pobl am gael y mathau hyn o wasanaethau yn eu fferyllfa leol yw'r rheswm; yn syml, y rheswm yw nad ydynt yn gwybod amdanynt.

Locally, I understand that the fact that the health board has been expected to meet the cost of prescriptions prescribed through the ailments scheme has meant that it has been reluctant to allow pharmacies to advertise the scheme. Indeed, I understand that it led to it nearly withdrawing the scheme altogether at one point. Learning from that experience, ensuring that appropriate mechanisms are in

Yn lleol, caf ar ddeall fod y ffaith ei bod yn ddisgwyliedig i'r bwrdd iechyd dalu am gost presgripsiynau a roddir drwy'r cynllun anhwylderau wedi golygu ei fod yn gyndyn o ganiatáu i fferyllfeydd hysbysebu'r cynllun. Yn wir, caf ar ddeall iddo bron arwain at derfynu'r cynllun yn llwyr ar un adeg. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn dysgu yn sgîl y profiad hwnnw, ac yn sicrhau bod mecanweithiau

place to eradicate any financial disincentives, is essential if we are to establish an effective national minor ailments scheme. It will not take off without the full backing of local health boards. We must have their full buy-in.

priodol ar waith i ddileu unrhyw wrthgymhellion ariannol, er mwyn sefydlu cynllun cenedlaethol effeithiol ar gyfer mân anhwylderau. Ni all hyn lwyddo heb gefnogaeth lawn byrddau iechyd lleol. Rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn llwyr o'i blaid.

I am pleased that, in her response to our committee’s report, the Minister has emphasised the need for close monitoring and evaluation of the expanding role of community pharmacies. There is nothing wrong with taking stock and asking searching questions about flagship schemes. I was also concerned to hear about the poor take-up of the discharge medicines review service during my recent visit. It is an important policy that meets a genuine unmet need. I am sure that we all agree that ensuring that patients who have been discharged from hospital are taking the correct medicines is vital, especially when we know that around 40% of all patients are found to have a discrepancy on their first repeat prescription following discharge.

Rwyf yn falch o ddweud, wrth iddi ymateb i adroddiad ein pwyllgor, bod y Gweinidog wedi pwysleisio bod angen monitro a gwerthuso'n ofalus rôl gynyddol fferyllfeydd cymunedol. Nid oes dim o'i le ar ystyried y sefyllfa a gofyn cwestiynau sy'n procio am gynlluniau blaenllaw. Roeddwn yn poeni hefyd yn ystod fy ymweliad diweddar o glywed am y diffyg manteisio ar y gwasanaeth adolygu meddyginiaethau wrth ryddhau. Mae'n bolisi pwysig sy'n diwallu angen go iawn a hwnnw heb ei ddiwallu cyn hyn. Rwyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cytuno bod sicrhau bod cleifion sydd wedi cael eu rhyddhau o'r ysbyty yn cymryd y meddyginiaethau cywir yn hollbwysig, yn enwedig pan wyddom fod presgripsiwn amlroddadwy cyntaf oddeutu 40 y cant o'r holl gleifion yn anghywir ar ôl iddynt gael eu rhyddhau.

The fact that the take-up has been so disappointing in my patch is particularly worrying given that the electronic discharge process at hospitals within the health board’s area is far more advanced than in other parts of Wales. Part of the problem seems to centre on the classic problems of communication that are highlighted again and again in this report. Different parts of the NHS are failing to share information effectively with each other for the benefit of patients. The limited pharmacy access to patient records that our committee has advocated could make a real difference.

Mae'r ffaith bod cyn lleied wedi manteisio ar y gwasanaeth hwn yn fy ardal i'n destun pryder arbennig a chofio bod y broses rhyddhau electronig a ddefnyddir yn ysbytai ardal y bwrdd iechyd yn fwy datblygedig o lawer nag y mae mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Rhan o'r broblem i bob golwg yw'r hen anawsterau cyfathrebu hynny sy'n cael eu hamlygu dro ar ôl tro yn yr adroddiad hwn. Nid yw gwahanol rannau'r GIG yn rhannu gwybodaeth yn effeithiol â'i gilydd er budd cleifion. Gallai galluogi fferyllwyr i weld rhywfaint o gofnodion cleifion, fel yr argymhellwyd gan ein pwyllgor, wneud gwahaniaeth go iawn.

However, the failure of this scheme to get off the ground properly is also symptomatic of that wider lack of understanding that I have touched upon already. Despite the growing range of responsibilities being taken on by community pharmacies—minor ailments, medicine-use reviews, their role in public health campaigns and the delivery of vaccination programmes—for too many people out there, a pharmacy is just a place where you pick up your prescription after a

Serch hynny, mae'r ffaith bod y cynllun hwn heb lwyddo i gael ei draed dano'n iawn hefyd yn symptom o'r diffyg dealltwriaeth ehangach hwnnw yr wyf eisoes wedi'i grybwyll. Er bod fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn ysgwyddo ystod gynyddol o gyfrifoldebau—mân anhwylderau, adolygiadau o ddefnyddio meddyginiaethau, eu rôl mewn ymgyrchoedd iechyd cyhoeddus a darparu rhaglenni brechu—i ormod o bobl yn ein cymdeithas, dim ond lle i godi'ch presgripsiwn ar ôl

visit to the GP. Tackling that fundamental lack of awareness will be essential if we are truly to forge an even bigger role for Welsh community pharmacies in the future.

ymweld â'r meddyg teulu yw fferyllfa. Bydd yn hanfodol mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg ymwybyddiaeth sylfaenol hwnnw er mwyn creu rôl fwy byth i fferyllfeydd cymunedol Cymru yn y dyfodol.

Lindsay Whittle: I would like to start by saying how useful the debate in the Health and Social Care Committee was. I, too, would like to thank all of those who attended to give evidence, particularly the Minister, who I know is extremely busy. I would also like to thank the Chair for guiding us so ably through the many sessions.

Lindsay Whittle: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddweud pa mor ddefnyddiol oedd y ddadl yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol. Hoffwn innau hefyd ddiolch i bawb a ddaeth yno i roi tystiolaeth, yn enwedig y Gweinidog, sydd, mi wn, yn eithriadol o brysur. Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Cadeirydd hefyd am ein tywys mor fedrus drwy'r sesiynau niferus.

My party favours creating a national pharmacy for Wales and, of course, we fully recognise the invaluable work that pharmacists undertake. We had some really interesting evidence on the relationships between GPs and pharmacists. I thought that it was fascinating. Pharmacists, of course, are the experts in medicine and have a unique role in the safe and effective delivery of pharmaceutical care. We are aware, and we were made aware during the evidence sessions, that some pharmacists have special interests—for example, in treating diabetes. I think that we need to carry out an audit of where and how many community pharmacists can offer such specialisms and liaise with general practitioners as well.

Mae fy mhlaid o blaid creu gwasanaeth fferylliaeth genedlaethol i Gymru, ac, wrth gwrs, rydym yn llwyr sylweddoli'r gwaith amhrisiadwy a wneir gan fferyllwyr. Clywsom dystiolaeth wirioneddol ddiddorol am y berthynas rhwng meddygon teulu a fferyllwyr. Roeddwn i'n meddwl bod hynny'n ddiddorol ofnadwy. Fferyllwyr, wrth gwrs, yw'r arbenigwyr ym maes meddyginiaeth ac mae ganddynt rôl unigryw o ran darparu gofal fferyllol diogel ac effeithiol. Rydym yn gwybod, a chawsom wybod yn ystod y sesiynau tystiolaeth, fod gan rai fferyllwyr ddiddordebau arbennig—er enghraifft ym maes trin diabetes. Credaf fod angen inni gynnal archwiliad i weld ymhle a sut y gall llawer o fferyllwyr cymunedol gynnig gwasanaethau arbenigol fel hyn a chysylltu â meddygon teulu hefyd.

It is vital that we encourage the development of this extra service. These extra services will help us not only to become a healthier nation, but may even save us money from an already struggling health budget. There is evidence that although people regularly collect their medicines, some do not always take their medicines and tablets and, if they do, they have no idea of the purpose of that medicine or those tablets. I hope that community pharmacies will add these issues to an educational programme. My party welcomes the proposals and is delighted that the Welsh Government has reacted so positively to all seven recommendations.

Mae'n hollbwysig inni annog datblygu'r gwasanaeth ychwanegol hwn. Bydd y gwasanaethau ychwanegol hyn nid yn unig yn ein cynorthwyo i ddod yn genedl iachach, ond fe allant hyd yn oed arbed arian inni ar gyllideb iechyd sydd eisoes yn straffaglu. Er y bydd pobl yn casglu eu meddyginiaethau'n rheolaidd, mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos na fydd rhai ohonynt bob tro'n cymryd eu meddyginiaeth a'u tabledi, ac os byddant, na fydd ganddynt syniad o gwbl beth yw diben y feddyginiaeth neu'r tabledi hynny. Rwyf yn gobeithio y gwnaiff fferyllfeydd cymunedol ychwanegu'r materion hyn at raglen addysgu. Mae fy mhlaid yn croesawu'r cynigion ac wrth ei bodd bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymateb mor gadarnhaol i bob un o'r saith argymhelliad.

Let us really make this happen. A good start would be to lay down national standards and ensure that all of Wales is covered. We cannot afford a postcode lottery, as this is too important. One of the questions that I would like to ask the Minister is how she will ensure that the recommendations are taken forward at an all-Wales level to ensure this consistency. Does she intend to work with the professional bodies to take forward the recommendations?

Gadewch inni sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd. Man cychwyn da fyddai pennu safonau cenedlaethol a sicrhau bod pob rhan o Gymru'n cael ei chynnwys. Ni allwn fforddio loteri cod post, oherwydd mae hyn yn rhy bwysig. Un o'r cwestiynau yr hoffwn ei ofyn i'r Gweinidog yw sut y gwnaiff sicrhau y bwrir ymlaen â'r holl argymhellion ar lefel Cymru gyfan er mwyn sicrhau'r cysondeb hwn. A ydw'n bwriadu gweithio gyda'r cyrff proffesiynol i fwrw ymlaen â'r argymhellion?

We have to ensure that pharmacists are represented at the appropriate level within the health boards. It is vital that the public is offered the opportunity for private consultations within every community pharmacy. I am also in favour of evaluating the benefits that patients will receive from this service and also how cost-effective it will be. The co-operation of the local health boards is vital and the case can be made for their budgets to be ring-fenced so that they cannot argue that they could not afford to commission such a specialist service. In the end, I believe that it will boil down to the fact that they cannot afford not to commission this service. I commend the idea that we expand the concept of community pharmacies in Wales.

Rhaid inni sicrhau bod fferyllwyr yn cael eu cynrychioli ar y lefel briodol yn y byrddau iechyd. Mae'n hollbwysig bod cyfle'n cael ei gynnig i'r cyhoedd gael ymgynghoriad preifat ym mhob fferyllfa gymunedol. Rwyf hefyd o blaid gwerthuso'r budd a gaiff cleifion yn sgîl y gwasanaeth hwn a pha mor gost-effeithiol y bydd. Mae cydweithrediad y byrddau iechyd lleol yn hollbwysig a gellid dadlau o blaid neilltuo'u cyllidebau fel na fyddai modd iddynt ddadlau na allent fforddio comisiynu gwasanaeth arbenigol o'r fath. Maes o law, credaf mai pen draw hyn fydd na allant fforddio peidio â chomisiynu'r gwasanaeth hwn. Cymeradwyaf y syniad y dylem ehangu cysyniad fferyllfeydd cymunedol yng Nghymru.

Peter Black: Although I am not a member of the Health and Social Care Committee and did not take part in this review, I am, of course, a lifelong user of community pharmacies and appreciate very much the work that they do. Since becoming an Assembly Member, I have also had a number of contacts with community pharmacists in my own region and have seen the services that they provide. I have seen in particular the extra value that they are able to add to the health service, which is invaluable and well worth enhancing and building upon wherever possible.

Peter Black: Er nad wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol ac na fu gennyf ran yn yr adolygiad hwn, yr wyf, wrth gwrs, yn un sydd wedi defnyddio fferyllfeydd cymunedol ar hyd fy oes ac rwyf yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr y gwaith y maent yn ei wneud. Ers imi ddod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad, rwyf hefyd wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â nifer o fferyllwyr cymunedol yn fy rhanbarth i fy hun ac wedi gweld y gwasanaethau y maent yn eu darparu. Rwyf wedi gweld yn benodol y gwerth ychwanegol y maent yn gallu ei gynnig i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, sy'n amhrisiadwy ac yn sicr yn werth ei ategu ac adeiladu arno ym mha le bynnag sy'n bosibl.

Where community pharmacies are based in more traditional and older buildings, it is often difficult to provide those services because of a lack of space, particularly not having a consultation room where pharmacists can deal with the patient or person coming to see them about a particular

Lle y bydd fferyllfeydd cymunedol wedi'u lleoli mewn adeiladau mwy traddodiadol a hŷn, mae'n aml yn anodd iddynt ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny oherwydd diffyg lle, yn enwedig os nad oes ystafell ymgynghori ar gael i fferyllwyr allu ymdrin â'r claf neu'r sawl sy'n dod i'w gweld ynglŷn â phroblem

problem. I went to a community pharmacy in one area in my region, in Mumbles, where although the building is fairly old, the pharmacist still manages to offer advice on substance misuse and treatment. That particular community pharmacist has also passed a course that allows him to prescribe, if necessary. I do not think that there has been much reference to that element of their work in terms of prescribing pharmacists and how much they can add to that. The more work that they are able to do, the better it is in terms of developing a proper primary-care-led health service based in the local community.

benodol. Ymwelais â fferyllfa gymunedol mewn un ardal yn fy rhanbarth, yn y Mwmbwls, lle mae'r fferyllydd, er bod yr adeilad yn weddol hen, yn dal i allu cynnig cyngor am gamddefnyddio sylweddau a thriniaeth ar gyfer hynny. Mae'r fferyllydd cymunedol arbennig hwnnw hefyd wedi pasio cwrs sy'n ei alluogi i ragnodi os bydd angen. Ni chredaf fod llawer o sôn wedi bod at yr elfen honno o'u gwaith, sef fferyllwyr sy'n rhagnodi, a faint y gallant ei ychwanegu yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Po fwyaf y gallant ei wneud, gorau fydd hi o ran datblygu gwasanaeth iechyd priodol sy'n cael ei dywys gan ofal sylfaenol a hynny yn y gymuned leol.

4.15 p.m.

I welcome the fact that the Minister has accepted all the recommendations of the committee. I am particularly pleased with the acceptance of recommendation 1, as this will mean real, practical measures to help raise awareness. One of the key issues highlighted in the report is that there is a lack of awareness among the general population about what services are available at community pharmacies. That has been highlighted by a number of Members in this debate. Until I started to engage with community pharmacies as an Assembly Member, I was certainly unaware of the huge range of services that are available. However, as I said just a few minutes ago, that is variable depending on the pharmacy concerned and the limitations of the premises that they are working from. Certainly, where community pharmacies are developed alongside new primary care centres, the scope and potential of those particular shops and pharmacies is much greater. There is a case for modernising premises wherever possible, so that that is able to be delivered. If we are really going to provide as many services as we can in the community, and as near to people’s homes as possible, we have to make sure that we maximise the use made of those community pharmacies to relieve pressure on other parts of the NHS. I know from the discussions that I have had that the pharmacists themselves are very keen on that particular agenda.

Rwyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn pob un o argymhellion y pwyllgor. Rwyf yn arbennig o falch ei bod wedi derbyn argymhelliad 1, oherwydd y bydd hyn yn golygu camau ymarferol go iawn a fydd o gymorth i godi ymwybyddiaeth. Un o'r prif faterion y tynnwyd sylw ato yn yr adroddiad yw bod diffyg ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith y boblogaeth yn gyffredinol ynglŷn â pha wasanaethau sydd ar gael mewn fferyllfeydd cymunedol. Mae nifer o Aelodau wedi sôn am hynny yn y ddadl hon. Nes imi ddechrau meithrin cysylltiad â fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad, yn sicr nid oeddwn i'n ymwybodol o'r ystod enfawr o wasanaethau sydd ar gael. Serch hynny, fel y dywedais ychydig funudau yn ôl, mae hynny'n amrywio a dibynnu ar y fferyllfa o dan sylw a chyfyngiadau'r adeilad lle maent yn gweithio. Yn sicr, lle y caiff fferyllfeydd cymunedol eu datblygu ochr yn ochr â chanolfannau gofal sylfaenol newydd, mae cwmpas a photensial y siopau a'r fferyllfeydd arbennig hynny'n fwy o lawer. Mae dadl o blaid moderneiddio adeiladau lle bynnag y bo modd, er mwyn gallu cyflawni hynny. Er mwyn inni'n wir allu darparu cynifer o wasanaethau ag sy'n bosibl yn y gymuned, a'r rheini mor agos at gartrefi pobl ag sy'n bosibl, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar sut y defnyddir y fferyllfeydd cymunedol hynny i liniaru'r pwysau ar rannau eraill o'r GIG. Gwn yn sgîl y trafodaethau yr wyf wedi'u cael fod y fferyllwyr eu hunain yn gefnogol iawn i'r

agenda arbennig honno.

In a similar vein, I welcome the acceptance of recommendation 5, which recommends the consistent participation of community pharmacies across Wales in the next round of public health campaigns. Community pharmacies are ideally placed to do this sort of work. They are very much rooted in virtually every community around Wales and they are able to provide health advice and offer support to people on a regular basis. As I said, I often see queues of people going into pharmacies. Where they are able to get privacy in a particular room, that is a bonus in terms of that pharmacy. It does, however, beg the question as to why the Government is so keen to see consistent participation in this arena now, when this should have been going on for some years. Obviously, we are pleased that the Government is taking this seriously, but I do wonder why it is taking so long to get this up and running in terms of that particular recommendation.

Ar drywydd tebyg, rwyf yn croesawu bod argymhelliad 5 wedi'i dderbyn, sy'n argymell bod fferyllfeydd cymunedol ledled Cymru yn cyfrannu'n gyson at gylch nesaf yr ymgyrchoedd iechyd cyhoeddus. Mae fferyllfeydd cymunedol mewn sefyllfa ddelfrydol i wneud y math hwn o waith. Mae ganddynt wreiddiau cadarn iawn ym mhob cymuned bron drwy Gymru ac maent yn gallu darparu cyngor am iechyd a chynnig cymorth i bobl yn rheolaidd. Fel y dywedais, byddaf yn aml yn gweld ciwiau o bobl yn mynd i mewn i fferyllfeydd. Lle y gallant gael sylw preifat mewn ystafell arbennig, mae hynny'n fonws o ran o fferyllfa honno. Serch hynny, mae'n codi'r cwestiwn ynglŷn â pham mae'r Llywodraeth mor awyddus i'w gweld yn cymryd rhan yn gyson yn y maes hwn yn awr, pan ddylai hyn fod wedi digwydd ers sawl blwyddyn. Mae'n amlwg ein bod yn falch bod y Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynglŷn â hyn, ond mae'n gwneud i rywun feddwl pam mae'n cymryd cymaint o amser i roi'r argymhelliad penodol hwnnw ar waith.

I am also pleased that there has been acknowledgment that community pharmacists need access to summary patient records, for those who are registered with a community pharmacy. Information sharing and the use of technology is going to be of immense importance for the future development of the delivery of health services. That information sharing is not just a problem for community pharmacies; it is a problem across the whole of the health and social care field. Often, you find different computer systems in use that do not talk to each other. Doctors do not necessarily have access to computer systems in hospitals if they are a GP in primary care and they certainly do not have access to social care records. That is something that we need to do, obviously without embarking on too great a scale of an ICT project, which often proves to be quite disastrous, as has been demonstrated in England.

Rwyf yn falch hefyd o weld cydnabyddiaeth bod angen i fferyllwyr cymunedol allu gweld cofnodion cryno am gleifion, ar gyfer y rheini sydd wedi cofrestru gyda fferyllfa gymunedol. Bydd rhannu gwybodaeth a defnyddio technoleg yn gam eithriadol o bwysig er mwyn datblygu gwasanaethau iechyd yn y dyfodol. Nid problem i fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn unig yw'r rhannu gwybodaeth hwnnw; mae'n broblem ym mhob rhan o'r maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yn aml, gwelwch wahanol systemau cyfrifiadurol yn cael eu defnyddio nad ydynt yn siarad â'i gilydd. Ni fydd meddygon bob tro'n gallu mynd at systemau cyfrifiadurol ysbytai os ydynt yn feddygon teulu mewn gofal sylfaenol ac yn sicr ni allant weld cofnodion gofal cymdeithasol. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei wneud, yn amlwg heb gychwyn ar brosiect TGCh ar raddfa rhy fawr, sy'n aml yn eithaf trychinebus, fel y dangoswyd yn Lloegr.

Finally, I very much welcome this report. I hope that the Minister is able to put the recommendations into place as soon as possible. The committee would probably appreciate regular updates as to how this is

Yn olaf, rwyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn yn fawr iawn. Rwyf yn gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog roi'r argymhellion ar waith cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Mae'n debyg y byddai'r pwyllgor yn gwerthfawrogi cael

being put in place. Community pharmacies can add a huge amount of value to the health and social care field and I think that, if they are given that opportunity, they will take it with both hands.

diweddariadau rheolaidd ynglŷn â sut mae hyn yn cael ei roi ar waith. Gall fferyllfeydd cymunedol ychwanegu gwerth enfawr at faes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a chredaf, os rhoddir y cyfle hwnnw iddynt, y byddant yn ei fachu â'u dwy law.

Keith Davies: Nid wyf yn Aelod o’r pwyllgor ychwaith, ond, fel Peter Black, rwy’n falch fy mod wedi cael y cyfle i fanteisio ar y gwasanaeth. Dim ond un neu ddau o bwyntiau rwyf eisiau eu codi: un yn ymwneud â chydweithio ac un yn ymwneud â chyfrifoldeb.

Keith Davies: I am not a member of the committee either, but, like Peter Black, I am pleased to have had the opportunity to take advantage of the service. I want to raise only one or two points: one relating to collaboration and one relating to responsibility.

Arwyddair Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru yw ‘Gorau chwarae, cyd chwarae’. Os yw hynny’n ffordd inni lwyddo yn rhyngwladol yn y byd pêl-droed, mae’n hynod o addas yn y Gymru ddatganoledig. Mae’r egwyddor hon yn sail i argymhellion y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol. Mae’r egwyddor hefyd, rwy’n falch i ddweud, yn sail i ymateb y Gweinidog i’r adroddiad. Er enghraifft, yn y pedwerydd paragraff o’r ymateb, mae’r Gweinidog yn nodi mai un o themâu allweddol y pwyllgor yw’r angen am gydweithio agosach rhwng meddygon teulu a fferyllwyr cymunedol. Dyna’r egwyddor unwaith eto: ‘Gorau chwarae, cyd chwarae’. Serch hynny, mae pen draw i’r hyn y gall y Gweinidog ei hun ei gyflawni. Yn ôl y Gweinidog, bydd Llywodraeth Cymru’n gwneud popeth yn ei gallu i wella’r hinsawdd sy’n gwneud cydweithio yn bosibl, ond, yn y pen draw, mae’r Gweinidog yn datgan ei bod yn cytuno 100 y cant â chasgliadau’r pwyllgor wrth ddweud mai’r byrddau iechyd lleol sydd â’r prif gyfrifoldeb.

The motto of the Football Association of Wales is ‘the best play is team play’. If that is a way for us to suceed internationally in the football world, it is exceptionally important in the Wales of devolution. This principle is the basis of the Health and Social Care Committee’s recommendations. The principle is also, I am pleased to say, the basis of the Minister’s response to the report. For example, in the fourth paragraph of the response, the Minister notes that one of the committee’s key themes is the need for closer collaboration between general practitioners and community pharmacists. That is the principle again: ‘the best play is team play’. Despite that, there is a limit to what the Minister herself can acheive. According to the Minister, the Welsh Government will do everything it can to improve the climate that makes collaboration possible, but, in the end, the Minister states that she agrees 100% with the committee’s conclusions in saying that the local health boards have the main responsibility.

Yn fy etholaeth yn Llanelli, rydym eisoes wedi elwa o fferyllwyr cymunedol ac rydym yn gobeithio, cyn bo hir, y bydd gennym feddyg teulu yn rhannu meddygfa yng nghanol y dref gyda chwmni Boots. Nid oes rheol anfeidrol yn dweud y dylai meddygfa a fferyllfa fod ar wahân yn ddaearyddol. Wedi’r cyfan, iechyd y claf sy’n bwysig ac nid y pellter rhwng un gwasanaeth a’r llall. Hynny yw, dylai byrddau iechyd lleol wneud yn siŵr bod gofal am y claf yn y gymuned yn dibynnu ar dîm sy’n cynnwys gofal uniongyrchol a gofal cymunedol, a’r ddau fath o ofal yn cydweithio’n agos. Mewn termau eraill, mae’n dibynnu ar y meddyg

In my constituency in Llanelli, we have already benefited from community pharmacists and we hope, before long, that we will have a GP sharing a surgery in the town centre with Boots. There is no set rule that says that a surgery and a pharmacy should be located separately. After all, the patient’s health is what is important, not the distance between one service and the other. That is, local health boards should make sure that care for the patient in the community depends upon a team that includes direct care and community care, with the two types of care working closely together. In other words, it depends upon the GP and the

teulu a'r fferyllydd i gydweithio wrth anelu at yr un nod.

pharmacist to work together to acheive the same goal.

Yn y dyfodol, felly, y tîm a fydd yn bwysig ac nid yr unigolion. Nid am Dr Finlay, Dr Cameron neu hyd yn oed Dr Kildare y bydd dramâu'r ganrif hon fel roeddent yn yr ugeinfed ganrif. Dyma ni unwaith eto yn tynnu ein hysbrydiolaeth o'r meysydd chwarae. Mae pob cefnogwr rygbi neu bêl droed yn gwybod bod y garfan yn bwysicach na'r tîm. Dyfnder y garfan ac nid gallu amryddawn un person sy'n creu llwyddiant. Os yw hynny'n wir am ddynion Chris Coleman, mae'n wir am y dynion a'r menywod sy'n gwasanaethu Cymru ym mhob agwedd. 'Gorau chwarae, cyd chwarae.'

In the future, therefore, the team, not the individuals, will be important. The dramas of this century will not be about Dr Finlay, Dr Cameron or even Dr Kildare, as they were in the twentieth century. Here we once again draw inspiration from the playing fields. Every rugby or football supporter knows that the squad is more important than the team. The depth of the squad and not the abilities of one person is what creates success. If that is true about Chris Coleman's men, it is true of the men and women who serve Wales in all aspects. 'The best play is team play'.

William Graham: May I reiterate my colleagues' thanks to the Chair and the clerks for the way in which the committee was conducted? I also express my thanks to the witnesses, not only for the clarity of their evidence but—it does not quite come out in the report—for the distinct difference in emphasis in the evidence of the RPS and the GPs, particularly those who have rural prescribing practices. Nevertheless, community pharmacy remains a valuable asset to the NHS in Wales, with pharmacists being the medicine experts available to the public in their local communities. The Welsh Conservatives strongly believe in local health services for local people. Patients should not have to travel far for care.

William Graham: A gaf ategu diolch fy nghyd-Aelodau i'r Cadeirydd ac i'r clercod am y ffordd y cynhaliwyd y pwyllgor? Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r tystion, nid dim ond am eglurdeb eu tystiolaeth ond—ac nid yw hyn i'w weld yn glir yn yr adroddiad—am y gwahaniaeth pwyslais amlwg yn nhystiolaeth y Gymdeithas Fferyllol Frenhinol a'r meddygon teulu, yn enwedig y rheini y mae ganddynt bractisiau rhagnodi yng nghefn gwlad. Serch hynny, mae fferylliaeth gymunedol yn dal yn gaffaeliad gwerthfawr i'r GIG yng Nghymru, a fferyllwyr yw'r arbenigwyr ar feddyginiaeth sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd yn eu cymunedau lleol. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn credu'n gryf mewn gwasanaethau iechyd lleol i bobl leol. Ni ddylai cleifion orfod teithio ymhell i gael gofal.

The community pharmacy contractual framework has the potential to support a more integrated and clinical role for this workforce, but needs the support and imagination of NHS service planners and the financial backing of secured funding streams for new clinical services to achieve its full potential. Community pharmacies are often patients' first point of contact with healthcare professionals and services. Regardless of demography or geography, community pharmacies operate throughout Wales and are one of a limited number of providers of publicly funded services with a remaining presence on the high street.

Gallai fframwaith contractaidd fferylliaeth gymunedol fod yn gefn i rôl fwy integredig a chlinigol i'r gweithlu hwn, ond mae angen cefnogaeth a dychymyg cynllunwyr gwasanaethau'r GIG a chefnogaeth ariannol llifau ariannu sicr ar gyfer gwasanaethau clinigol newydd er mwyn iddo gyflawni ei botensial yn llawn. Fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn aml yw man cyswllt cyntaf cleifion â gweithwyr proffesiynol a gwasanaethau gofal iechyd. Ni waeth am ddemograffeg neu ddaearyddiaeth, mae fferyllfeydd cymunedol ar waith ledled Cymru a dyma un o'r ychydig ddarparwyr gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu hariannu'n gyhoeddus sy'n dal i'w weld ar y stryd fawr.

It is currently estimated, as our Chairman has already recorded, that on an average day, the network of community pharmacies across Wales deals with more than 50,000 individual cases. Significant barriers to realising the full potential of community pharmacy lie both within the profession and between professional groups in the health service. It is our view that work needs to be done in community pharmacy to bring the standard of the whole network up to the standard of the best. In other words, good practice should become standard practice.

Amcangyfrifir ar hyn o bryd, fel y mae ein Cadeirydd wedi'i gofnodi eisoes, y bydd rhwydwaith ein fferyllfeydd cymunedol drwy Gymru'n ymdrin â mwy na 50,000 o achosion unigol ar ddiwrnod arferol. Mae rhwystrau sylweddol rhag gwireddu potensial llawn fferylliaeth gymunedol i'w gweld o fewn y proffesiwn a hefyd rhwng grwpiau proffesiynol y gwasanaeth iechyd. Ein barn ni yw bod angen gwneud gwaith ym maes fferylliaeth gymunedol i godi safon y rhwydwaith cyfan nes ei fod cystal â'r goreuon. Mewn geiriau eraill, dylai arferion da ddod yn arferion safonol.

With the Welsh Government planning to cut the health budget in Wales by more than £0.5 billion in real terms over the next three years, there are real concerns that patients are facing a reduction in GP provision. They serve communities in under-doctored areas, and I will use an example of Lloyds Pharmacy, which has demonstrated the vital role that pharmacy can plan in addressing these potential health inequalities. Such firms are keen to broaden their involvement in delivering new primary care services, where the pharmacist makes a greater contribution to public health and supports people with long-term conditions. Through the pharmacy contract, they are able to provide enhanced services that are commissioned through local health boards.

Gan fod Llywodraeth Cymru'n bwriadu torri'r gyllideb iechyd yng Nghymru fwy na £0.5 biliwn mewn termau real dros y tair blynedd nesaf, mae'n destun pryder gwirioneddol bod cleifion yn wynebu gostyngiad o ran darpariaeth meddygon teulu. Maent yn gwasanaethu cymunedau mewn ardaloedd lle nad oes digon o feddygon, a defnyddiaf enghraifft o Lloyds Pharmacy, sydd wedi dangos y rôl hollbwysig y gall fferyllfa ei chwarae wrth fynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldebau iechyd posibl hyn. Mae cwmnïau o'r fath yn awyddus i ehangu eu hymwneud â darparu gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol newydd, lle y bydd y fferyllydd yn cyfrannu'n helaethach at iechyd cyhoeddus ac yn cynorthwyo pobl sy'n dioddef o gyflyrau tymor hir. Drwy'r contract fferylliaeth, gallant ddarparu gwasanaethau ychwanegol a gomisiynir drwy'r byrddau iechyd lleol.

Although it is important to remember the financial savings that are sometimes claimed to arise by increasing the scope of community pharmacies, they are not as easy to substantiate or realise, albeit the scope for savings does exist. The Royal Pharmaceutical Society provision for pharmacy is that pharmacies should be the universally accessible front-line clinical providers of all aspects of pharmaceutical care and should be responsible for all aspects of medicines' use and management. The RPS advocates that community pharmacists should be the healthcare professionals trusted by patients to take care of their every pharmaceutical need, and the provisions of the community pharmacy contractual framework should be used and developed in innovative ways to

Er ei bod yn bwysig cofio am yr arbedion ariannol yr honnir weithiau sy'n deillio o gynyddu maes gwaith fferyllfeydd cymunedol, nid yw mor rhwydd cadarnhau na gwireddu'r arbedion hynny, er bod lle i arbed arian. Mae'r Gymdeithas Fferyllol Frenhinol yn dweud mai fferyllfeydd a ddylai ddarparu'r gwasanaeth clinigol rheng-flaen i bawb ar gyfer pob agwedd ar ofal fferyllol ac mai hwy a ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am bob agwedd ar ddefnyddio a rheoli meddyginiaethau. Mae'r gymdeithas yn argymell mai fferyllwyr cymunedol a ddylai ysgwyddo rôl gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol y mae cleifion yn ymddiried ynddynt i ofalu am eu holl anghenion fferyllol ac y dylid defnyddio a datblygu darpariaethau fframwaith gontractaidd

help achieve this, while increasing the clinical dimension of community pharmacy services. This particular function has often been described as the high street health centre, with the advantage of being able to cater for the well and the unwell. The RPS appreciates that community pharmacies should be mainstreamed into Government regeneration policy, as well as healthcare policy and delivery. Local chemists are accessible for people looking for professional healthcare and treatment, but are also proactive in the form of public health campaigns, particularly in respect of contraceptive advice.

fferylliaeth gymunedol mewn ffyrdd arloesol er mwyn cynorthwyo i gyflawni hyn. Ar yr un pryd, dylid cryfhau dimensiwn clinigol gwasanaethau fferylliaeth gymunedol. Mae'r swyddogaeth benodol hon wedi cael ei disgrifio'n aml yn ganolfan iechyd ar y stryd fawr, sydd â'r fantais o allu darparu ar gyfer y rhai sy'n iach a'r rhai sy'n sâl. Mae'r gymdeithas yn cydnabod y dylid cynnwys fferyllfeydd cymunedol ym mhrif lif polisi adfywio'r Llywodraeth, yn ogystal ag mewn polisi gofal iechyd ac wrth ddarparu'r gofal hwnnw. Mae fferyllwyr lleol yn hwylus i bobl sy'n chwilio am ofal iechyd a thriniaeth broffesiynol, ond maent hefyd yn rhagweithiol wrth gynnal ymgyrchoedd iechyd cyhoeddus, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt cyngor atal cenhedlu.

The Welsh Conservatives recommend that the Welsh Government provides a clear national lead for the future development of community pharmacy services, to ensure that the necessary policies and structures are in place to secure delivery. This should include nationally agreed priorities for the service, and a centrally driven direction for its development. Ultimately, it is a matter for local health boards to prioritise taking proactive action to secure the best use of co-operation and joint working between pharmacists and GPs. We believe that this report is an important milestone in the growth of national community pharmacy health services in Wales. May I echo the thoughts of the chair of Community Pharmacy Wales, in saying that the report adds an identification of the strategic role of the Government itself in ensuring that the potential of pharmacies is realised for the improvement of health services, and in ensuring a consistently high standard of services, so that these are commissioned from community pharmacies nationally across Wales, which will reduce the remaining instances of postcode commissioning of services?

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn argymell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ddarparu arweiniad cenedlaethol amlwg ar gyfer datblygu gwasanaethau fferylliaeth gymunedol yn y dyfodol, er mwyn sicrhau bod y polisïau a'r strwythurau angenrheidiol ar waith i sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu cyflawni. Dylai hyn gynnwys blaenoriaethau y cytunir arnynt yn genedlaethol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth, a chyfeiriad sy'n cael ei yrru o'r canol i'w ddatblygu. Yn y pen draw, gwaith byrddau iechyd lleol yw blaenoriaethu camau rhagweithiol i sicrhau'r defnydd gorau ar y cydweithredu a'r cydweithio rhwng fferyllwyr a meddygon teulu. Credwn fod yr adroddiad hwn yn garreg filltir bwysig yn nhwf gwasanaethau iechyd fferylliaeth gymunedol genedlaethol yng Nghymru. A gaf ategu'r meddyliau cadeirydd Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru, pan ddywedodd fod yr adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at rôl strategol y Llywodraeth ei hun o ran sicrhau bod potensial fferyllfeydd yn cael ei wireddu er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau iechyd, ac wrth sicrhau safon gyson uchel o wasanaethau, er mwyn i'r rhain gael eu comisiynu gan fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn genedlaethol ledled Cymru, gan leihau'r enghreifftiau sy'n weddill lle y bydd gwasanaethau'n cael eu comisiynu ar sail cod post?

Nick Ramsay: I will be brief because many of the points that I was going to make have already been made. I echo William Graham’s comments in welcoming this report. The Welsh Conservatives, for a long time, have

Nick Ramsay: Byddaf yn gryno oherwydd mae llawer o'r pwyntiau yr oeddwn am eu gwneud wedi cael eu gwneud eisoes. Ategaf sylwadau William Graham yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig

recognised the importance of community pharmacies as a crucial part of the national health service in Wales and local communities. In fact, it is difficult to imagine health provision in Wales without them. That is why we welcome this report and the route map ahead on how to strengthen community pharmacies. In opening, Mark Drakeford spoke about the three As—I suppose you could call it the AAA credit rating—of community pharmacies, referring to accessibility, anonymity and the agenda for public health. Those three areas are very important aspects of what community pharmacies can do.

ers tro wedi cydnabod pwysigrwydd fferyllfeydd cymunedol fel rhan hanfodol o'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru ac mewn cymunedau lleol. A dweud y gwir, mae'n anodd dychmygu'r ddarpariaeth iechyd yng Nghymru hebddynt. Dyna pam yr ydym yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn a'r map trywydd o'n blaen sy'n dangos sut mae cryfhau fferyllfeydd cymunedol. Wrth agor, soniodd Mark Drakeford am dair A—mae'n debyg y gallech alw hyn yn radd gredyd AAA—fferyllfeydd cymunedol gan gyfeirio at sicrhau eu bod ar gael yn hwylus, eu bod yn anhysbys, ac at yr agenda iechyd cyhoeddus. Mae'r tri maes hynny'n agweddau pwysig iawn ar yr hyn y gall fferyllfeydd ei wneud.

I would like to pick up on a very important point that was made about that second ‘A’, and the way that people can go to community pharmacies and feel more anonymous than they can with their GPs. This is an example of how it is important that we recognise that there are things that community pharmacies are doing very well at the moment. I noticed that recommendation 7 of the report talks about giving access to community pharmacies to summary patient records. That would be a helpful development, I am sure, and there are reasons for that recommendation being there, but it does not take a rocket scientist to work out that if you are giving community pharmacies access to those kinds of records, you are naturally increasing their knowledge of the patients who are going there. I am not saying that that is a bad thing, and I am not saying that we cannot use patient records and community pharmacies to deliver better services in the future. However, we have to be careful that, in standardising and spreading good practice, we do not throw the baby out with the bath water and lose some of the key elements that have made community pharmacies as successful as they have been in Wales. I am just putting that out there. I am sure that the committee has looked into all of these issues, but I am pleased that we are giving support to what is a very important aspect of health provision in Wales, and one that, with Welsh Government support, can go from strength to strength.

Hoffwn sôn am bwynt pwysig iawn a wnaethpwyd am yr ail o'r rheini, ac am sut y gall pobl fynd i'w fferyllfeydd cymunedol a theimlo'n fwy anhysbys nag y byddant wrth ymweld â'u meddyg teulu. Dyma enghraifft o bwysigrwydd cydnabod bod fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn gwneud rhai pethau'n dda iawn ar hyn o bryd. Sylwais fod argymhelliad 7 o'r adroddiad yn sôn am sicrhau bod fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn gallu gweld cofnodion cryno am gleifion. Byddai hynny'n ddatblygiad o fudd, rwyf yn sicr, ac mae rhesymau dros gynnwys yr argymhelliad hwnnw, ond nid oes angen athrylith i ddeall eich bod, wrth godi'r llen ar y math hwn o gofnodion i fferyllfeydd cymunedol, yn naturiol yn golygu y bydd ganddynt fwy o wybodaeth am y cleifion sy'n mynd yno. Nid dweud yr wyf fod hynny'n beth drwg, ac nid wyf yn dweud na allwn ddefnyddio cofnodion cleifion a fferyllfeydd cymunedol i sicrhau gwell gwasanaethau yn y dyfodol. Serch hynny, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus, wrth safoni a lledaenu arferion da, nad ydym yn taflu'r llo a chadw'r brych ac yn colli rhai o'r prif elfennau sydd wedi gwneud fferyllfeydd cymunedol mor llwyddiannus ag y maent wedi bod yng Nghymru. Crybwyll y peth yr wyf, dyna'r cyfan. Rwyf yn siŵr bod y pwyllgor wedi ystyried y materion hyn i gyd, ond rwyf yn falch ein bod yn cefnogi'r hyn sydd yn agwedd bwysig iawn ar y ddarpariaeth iechyd yng Nghymru ac yn un a all, gyda chefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru, fynd o nerth i nerth.

The Minister for Health and Social

Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

Services (Lesley Griffiths): I would like to thank Members for their contributions this afternoon, and I would especially like to thank the members of the Health and Social Care Committee for their work on this inquiry. All seven of the recommendations were accepted, as they reflect our current approach to the community pharmacy agenda, and I am pleased that there is common understanding on key issues.

Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths): Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma, a hoffwn ddiolch yn arbennig i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol am eu gwaith ar yr ymchwiliad hwn. Derbyniwyd pob un o'r saith argymhelliad, gan eu bod yn adlewyrchu ein hymagwedd bresennol at yr agenda fferylliaeth gymunedol, ac yr wyf yn falch bod dealltwriaeth gyffredin ynglŷn â'r prif faterion.

Daeth y Llywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 4.27 p.m.
The Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) came to the Chair at 4.27 p.m.

The Welsh Government is committed to strengthening primary and community care and the role of community pharmacists in that context. Our agenda of introducing national services—such as the new discharge medicines reviews, targeted medicines reviews and the emergency contraception service—are designed to capitalise on the greater reach that community pharmacists can have in our communities.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwymo i gryfhau gofal sylfaenol a chymunedol a rôl fferyllwyr cymunedol yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Nod ein hagenda wrth gyflwyno gwasanaethau cenedlaethol—megis yr adolygiadau newydd ar feddyginiaethau wrth ryddhau o'r ysbyty, adolygiadau wedi'u targedu o feddyginiaethau, a'r gwasanaeth atal cenhedlu mewn argyfwng—yw manteisio ar y ffaith bod fferyllwyr cymunedol yn gallu cyrraedd mwy o bobl yn ein cymunedau.

The committee picked up on the need for closer collaboration between health professionals, particularly between general practitioners and community pharmacists. I absolutely agree with the conclusion that the responsibility for achieving effective collaboration rests with the health boards and health professionals. As Mark Drakeford, the committee Chair, said in his opening remarks, there is more that could and should be done. I can certainly assure Keith Davies that this is the message that I give to local health boards, and I have seen growing evidence of better collaboration between the two sets of professionals over the past year, but I did particularly like the football analogy.

Soniodd y pwyllgor fod angen mwy o gydweithredu rhwng gweithwyr proffesiynol iechyd, yn enwedig rhwng meddygon teulu a fferyllwyr cymunedol. Rwyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r casgliad mai cyfrifoldeb y byrddau iechyd a'r gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yw sicrhau cydweithrediad effeithiol. Fel y dywedodd Mark Drakeford, Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, mae rhagor y gellid ac y dylid ei wneud. Gallaf sicrhau Keith Davies yn bendant mai dyma'r neges y byddaf yn ei chyfleu i fyrddau iechyd lleol, ac yr wyf wedi gweld tystiolaeth gynyddol o well cydweithredu rhwng y ddwy set o weithwyr proffesiynol dros y flwyddyn diwethaf, ond roeddwn yn arbennig o hoff o'r gymhariaeth bêl-droed.

4.30 p.m.

I particularly welcome the commitment given by the Royal Pharmaceutical Society and the Royal College of General Practitioners in their joint statement on working together to minimise inter-professional barriers. Both the RPS and the Welsh Pharmaceutical

Rwyf yn croesawu'n arbennig yr ymrwymiad gan y Gymdeithas Fferyllol Frenhinol a Choleg Brenhinol y Meddygon Teulu yn eu datganiad ar y cyd ynglŷn â chydweithio er mwyn lliniaru rhwystrau rhwng y proffesiynau. Mae'r Gymdeithas a Phwyllgor

Committee have given a commitment to working with us on our agenda and, in particular, on working with other health professionals to foster closer working arrangements at the local level. However, as the Welsh Government, we have a responsibility to set the framework—one that is centred on the patient. Later this year we will be issuing a delivery plan for a strengthened primary and community care service. A key element will be a focus on integrated working and new models of care. I expect LHBs and health professionals to work with us on delivering that for the benefit of the people of Wales.

Fferyllol Cymru ill dau wedi ymrwymo i weithio gyda ni ar ein hagenda ac, yn benodol i weithio gyda gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill ym maes iechyd i feithrin trefniadau gweithio mwy clos yn lleol. Serch hynny, mae gennym ni, Lywodraeth Cymru, gyfrifoldeb i lunio'r fframwaith—un sy'n canolbwyntio ar y claf. Yn ddiweddarach eleni, byddwn yn cyhoeddi cynllun cyflawni ar gyfer gwasanaeth gofal sylfaenol a chymunedol cryfach. Un o'i brif elfennau fydd canolbwyntio ar weithio integredig a modelau gofal newydd. Rwyf yn disgwyl i BILlau a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol weithio gyda ni i wireddu hynny er budd pobl Cymru.

I will now respond to some specific comments by Members. Mark Drakeford mentioned that there are 710 community pharmacists across Wales, and they do play an important role in the wider health family. The points raised by Mark and by Nick Ramsay in relation to anonymity, particularly with regard to emergency contraception services, were important and valid.

Rwyf am ymateb yn awr i ambell sylw penodol gan yr Aelodau. Soniodd Mark Drakeford fod 710 o fferyllwyr cymunedol ledled Cymru, ac maent yn chwarae rôl bwysig yn y teulu iechyd ehangach. Mae'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Mark a chan Nick Ramsay ynglŷn â bod yn anhysbys, yn enwedig gyda golwg ar wasanaethau atal cenhedlu brys, yn rhai pwysig a dilys.

On influenza vaccination, I want to see more work done so that we can reach our target rates, because we have not done that. I think that community pharmacies have an important role to play there—again, it is an area where we will see greater collaboration between general practitioners and pharmacists. Guidance has been issued to health boards and my officials have written to local health boards outlining my expectations in this area, and they continue to work with LHBs to ensure that pharmacies play an active part in what I believe is a key public health objective.

O ran brechu ar gyfer y ffliw, rwyf am weld rhagor o waith yn cael ei wneud er mwyn inni gyrraedd ein cyfraddau targed, oherwydd nid ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Credaf fod gan fferyllfeydd cymunedol rôl bwysig i'w chwarae yn hynny—unwaith eto, dyma faes lle y gwelwn fwy o gydweithredu rhwng meddygon teulu a fferyllwyr. Cyhoeddwyd canllawiau i'r byrddau iechyd ac mae fy swyddogion wedi ysgrifennu at y byrddau iechyd lleol yn sôn am fy nisgwyliadau yn y maes hwn, ac maent yn dal i weithio gyda BILlau i sicrhau bod fferyllfeydd yn chwarae rhan frwd yn yr hyn sydd, yn fy marn i, yn un o amcanion allweddol iechyd cyhoeddus.

Several Members referred to the minor ailments scheme and in particular to the IT infrastructure. I am not at all surprised that our chief information officer said that IT is not a barrier to this. It is absolutely key to achieving an integrated primary and community healthcare service. It will be essential to the successful delivery of the minor ailments scheme too, and we are doing scoping work for the development of a secure IT platform for community pharmacy—in fact, it is nearly finalised. I will then have to

Cyfeiriodd sawl Aelod at y cynllun mân anhwylderau ac yn benodol at y seilwaith TG. Nid yw'n syndod imi o gwbl bod ein prif swyddog gwybodaeth wedi dweud nad yw TG yn rhwystr yn y cyswllt hwn. Mae'n gwbl allweddol er mwyn sicrhau gwasanaeth gofal iechyd sylfaenol a chymunedol integredig. Bydd yn hanfodol er mwyn gwireddu'r cynllun mân anhwylderau'n llwyddiannus hefyd, ac rydym yn gwneud gwaith cwmpasu i ddatblygu llwyfan TG cadarn ar gyfer fferylliaeth gymunedol—a dweud y gwir,

consider the most effective and cost-effective way of taking the work forward. Once we have established this secure IT platform, it will allow us to progress patient registration with pharmacies and it will provide an opportunity to deliver much more complex packages of care to support patients.

mae bron wedi'i gwblhau. Yna, bydd yn rhaid imi ystyried y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol a chost-effeithiol o fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith. Ar ôl inni sefydlu'r llwyfan TG cadarn hwn, bydd yn caniatáu inni fwrw ymlaen i gofrestru cleifion gyda fferyllfeydd a bydd yn gyfle inni ddarparu pecynnau gofal mwy cymhleth o lawer i gynorthwyo cleifion.

Lynne Neagle made an important point about community pharmacists needing to promote their work and their services much more widely. This is something that we need to think about as we roll out our minor ailments scheme.

Gwnaeth Lynne Neagle bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â bod angen i fferyllwyr cymunedol hyrwyddo'u gwaith a'u gwasanaethau'n ehangach o lawer. Dyma rywbeth y bydd angen inni feddwl amdano wrth inni ledaenu ein cynllun mân anhwylderau.

I can assure Lindsay Whittle that I am very happy to work with professional bodies to take the committee’s recommendations forward. As I stated before, there is a real common understanding on the key issues.

Gallaf sicrhau Lindsay Whittle fy mod yn hapus iawn i weithio gyda chyrff proffesiynol er mwyn bwrw ymlaen ag argymhellion y pwyllgor. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, mae cyd-ddealltwriaeth wirioneddol ynglŷn â'r prif faterion.

William Graham mentioned rural areas. We are certainly exploring the potential impact of wider community pharmacy services and the minor ailments scheme, as this will increase access to services, particularly in rural areas.

Crybwyllodd William Graham ardaloedd gwledig. Yn sicr, rydym yn archwilio effaith bosibl gwasanaethau fferylliaeth cymunedol ehangach a'r cynllun mân anhwylderau, oherwydd bydd hyn yn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar gael yn fwy hwylus, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

My evidence to the committee and the written response to the committee’s report detail all the work we are doing to develop community pharmacy services. In summary, there has been substantial investment and a broadening of the services offered in community pharmacies. As we take forward our programme for government commitments, we will see the role of community pharmacies extending further, particularly as we implement the new minor ailments scheme.

Mae fy nhystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor a'r ymateb ysgrifenedig i adroddiad y pwyllgor yn manylu ynglŷn â'r holl waith yr ydym yn ei wneud i ddatblygu gwasanaethau fferylliaeth gymunedol. Yn gryno, mae cryn fuddsoddi ac ehangu wedi bod yn y gwasanaethau a gynigir mewn fferyllfeydd cymunedol. Wrth inni fwrw ymlaen ag ymrwymiadau ein rhaglen lywodraethu, byddwn yn gweld rôl fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn ymestyn eto, yn enwedig wrth inni roi'r cynllun mân anhwylderau newydd ar waith.

The Welsh Government is committed to building on the achievements to date and ensuring our programmes and policies enable community pharmacy to contribute to a strengthened primary and community care service for the benefit of people in Wales. I am very pleased to reiterate that we have protected the budget for the NHS in Wales.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwymo i adeiladu ar y llwyddiannau hyd yn hyn ac i sicrhau bod ein rhaglenni a'n polisïau yn galluogi fferylliaeth gymunedol i gyfrannu at wasanaeth gofal sylfaenol a chymunedol cryfach er budd pobl Cymru. Rwyf yn falch iawn o ategu ein bod wedi amddiffyn y gyllideb ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru.

Mark Drakeford: Briefly, I just want to pick up on the points that all contributors to the

Mick Drakeford: Yn gryno, rwyf am gyfeirio at y pwyntiau a wnaeth yr holl

debate made that added to the points that I was able to make in the beginning. I will very quickly do that.

gyfranwyr at y ddadl a oedd yn ychwanegu at y pwyntiau y llwyddais innau i'w gwneud ar y dechrau. Gwnaf hynny'n gyflym iawn.

I thought that Darren Millar put his finger on something very important in the very beginning_when he described community pharmacists as an underestimated service. In the past, they have been underestimated—sometimes by Government, sometimes by other professionals, and sometimes by people who use the service. Part our report is about trying to release their potential so that they are not underestimated in the future.

Roeddwn yn meddwl bod Darren Millar wedi rhoi ei fys ar rywbeth pwysig iawn yn y dechrau'n deg—wrth iddo ddweud bod gwasanaeth fferyllwyr cymunedol yn cael ei danbrisio. Yn y gorffennol maent wedi cael eu tanbrisio—weithiau gan Lywodraeth, weithiau gan weithwyr proffesiynol eraill, ac weithiau gan bobl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaeth. Mae a wnelo rhan o'n hadroddiad â cheisio rhyddhau eu potensial fel na fyddant yn cael eu tanbrisio yn y dyfodol.

Lynne added to that point when she said that we need to ensure that we make full use of the services that community pharmacists already provide. There are things that they do now where that potential is not taken up properly. Lindsay Whittle emphasised the education role of community pharmacists in making sure that people know how to take their medicines in the best possible way and that they understand the treatments that they are being prescribed. He drew attention this afternoon—as he did regularly throughout the inquiry—to the importance of privacy within community pharmacies and having places where people can go to get the advice that they need without having to get it in front of other people who are using the pharmacy for other purposes.

Ychwanegodd Lynne at y pwynt hwnnw pan ddywedodd fod angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau y bydd fferyllwyr cymunedol eisoes yn eu darparu i'r eithaf. Maent yn gwneud rhai pethau yn awr lle nad yw'r potensial hwnnw'n cael ei ddefnyddio'n iawn. Pwysleisiodd Lindsay Whittle rôl addysgu fferyllwyr cymunedol o ran sicrhau bod pobl yn gwybod sut mae cymryd eu meddyginiaethau yn y ffordd orau posibl a'u bod yn deall y triniaethau sy'n cael eu rhoi iddynt ar bresgripsiwn. Tynnodd sylw y prynhawn yma—fel y gwnaeth yn rheolaidd drwy'r ymchwiliad—at bwysigrwydd preifatrwydd mewn fferyllfeydd cymunedol a chael mannau lle y gall pobl fynd i gael y cyngor sydd ei angen arnynt heb orfod ei gael yng ngŵydd pobl eraill sy'n defnyddio'r fferyllfa at ddibenion eraill.

Peter Black picked up that theme too and reminded us that community pharmacists have a new role as independent prescribers. That adds to their capacity to contribute to the health service in the future.

Cododd Peter Black y thema honno hefyd a'n hatgoffa fod gan fferyllwyr cymunedol rôl newydd fel rhagnodwyr annibynnol. Mae hynny'n ychwanegu at eu gallu i gyfrannu at y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y dyfodol.

Diolch yn fawr i Keith am ein hatgoffa mai ‘gorau chwarae cyd chwarae’. Dyma ddywediad arall i chi, Keith: ‘nid da lle gellir gwell’. Mae honno’n thema yn yr adroddiad. Mae’r bobl sy’n gweithio ym maes fferylliaeth gymunedol ar eu gorau pan eu bod yn cydweithio.

I thank Keith for reminding us of the motto, ‘the best play is team play’. Here is another for you, Keith: ‘there is always room for improvement’. That is a theme in the report. The people working in community pharmacy are at their best when they collaborate.

William Graham drew an important point to the surface regarding the potential of community pharmacies to contribute to the long-term care of people with chronic

Tynnodd William Graham sylw at bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â photensial fferyllfeydd cymunedol i gyfrannu at ofal tymor hir pobl sydd â chyflyrau cronig. Mae eu statws fel

conditions. Their status as high-street health centres makes them ideally suited to doing that in the future, as he said. Lastly, just to reiterate what Nick Ramsay said, we sometimes underestimate the stigma that some people with some conditions can experience in sitting in GP waiting rooms, with everyone else asking them, ‘What is wrong with you today, then?’ and ‘Why are you here?’, whereas there is greater anonymity of service in a community pharmacy.

canolfannau iechyd ar y stryd fawr yn golygu eu bod mewn lle delfrydol i wneud hynny yn y dyfodol, fel y dywedodd. Yn olaf, ac ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd Nick Ramsay, byddwn weithiau'n tanbrisio'r stigma a wynebir gan rai pobl sy'n dioddef o rai cyflyrau wrth iddynt eistedd yn ystafelloedd aros meddygon teulu, a phawb arall yn gofyn iddynt, 'Beth sy'n bod arnoch chi heddiw, ta?' a 'Pham rydych chi yma?', lle mae gwasanaeth fferyllfa gymunedol yn fwy anhysbys.

Diolch yn fawr i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl y prynhawn yma.

I thank everyone who has contributed to the debate this afternoon.

I thank the Minister in particular for the positive way in which she has responded to our report. We have said that we will return to this topic in the future and we look forward to seeing the gains that we think are there to be realised being reported to us then.

Diolch i'r Gweinidog yn benodol am ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'n hadroddiad. Rydym wedi dweud y byddwn yn dychwelyd at y pwnc hwn yn y dyfodol, ac rydym yn edrych ymlaen at gael adroddiad bryd hynny ynglŷn â'r enillion sydd, yn ein barn ni, yno i'w gwireddu.

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is to note the Health and Social Care Committee’s report. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Llywydd: Y cynnig yw ein bod yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Derbynnir y cynnig felly yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.

Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer

The Presiding Officer: Before we move to the next item, I wish to announce the result of the legislative ballot held earlier today. I am pleased to announce that Darren Millar may seek the Assembly’s agreement to introduce a Member-proposed Bill on a chewing gum levy. Congratulations.

Y Llywydd: Cyn inni symud at yr eitem nesaf, rwyf am gyhoeddi canlyniad y bleidlais ddeddfwriaethol a gynhaliwyd yn gynharach heddiw. Rwyf yn falch o gyhoeddi y caiff Darren Millar geisio cytundeb y Cynulliad i gyflwyno Bil a gynigir gan Aelod ynglŷn ag ardoll gwm cnoi. Llongyfarchiadau.

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deisebau ar Reoli Sŵn o Dyrbinau Gwynt
The Petitions Committee’s Report on Control of Noise from Wind Turbines

Cynnig NDM5036 William Powell

Motion NDM5036 William Powell

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deisebau ar Reoli Sŵn Tyrbinau Gwynt, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Mai 2012.

Notes the report of the Petitions Committee on the Control of Noise from Wind Turbines, which was laid in the Table Office on 30 May 2012.

William Powell: I move the motion.

William Powell: Cynigiaf y cynnig.

It is a great privilege to introduce the debate today. The purpose of the Petitions Committee is to increase democratic participation and to provide a platform that enables individuals to raise awareness of issues in the Assembly. I thank my colleagues on the committee—Bethan Jenkins, Russell George and Joyce Watson—for their efforts to help to fulfil that purpose and their ongoing work. I would also like to thank colleagues in the Chamber who are former Members of the committee—Christine Chapman, Sandy Mewies, and Andrew R.T. Davies—as well as former Assembly Members who started the development of this work during the third Assembly.

Mae'n fraint fawr cyflwyno'r ddadl heddiw. Pwrpas y Pwyllgor Deisebau yw cynyddu cyfranogaeth ddemocrataidd a darparu llwyfan sy'n galluogi unigolion i godi ymwybyddiaeth o faterion yn y Cynulliad. Diolch i'm cyd-Aelodau ar y pwyllgor—Bethan Jenkins, Russell George a Joyce Watson—am eu hymdrechion yn helpu i gyflawni'r pwrpas hwnnw ac am eu gwaith parhaus. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Siambr sy'n gyn Aelodau o'r pwyllgor—Christine Chapman, Sandy Mewies, ac Andrew R.T. Davies—yn ogystal â chyn Aelodau'r Cynulliad a ddechreuodd ddatblygu'r gwaith hwn yn ystod y trydydd Cynulliad.

The petitions system here in Wales is seen as strong and substantive in the way that it enables people to have their voices heard at the heart of the Assembly. The committee engages in a lot of outreach work so that we can reach out to the people of Wales and encourage them to bring forward issues that matter to them in their communities. We have recently been to north Wales where we met with petitioners and held a formal committee meeting and, in the next few weeks, we will be at the Cardiff Multicultural Mela, next Sunday, the Royal Welsh Show, and the National Eisteddfod. I hope that the Petitions Committee’s ability to focus its attention on the experiences of people on such a seemingly narrow issue as the noise emissions from windfarms enables the committee to feed into and inform the wider work of Assembly committees.

Ystyrir y system deisebau yma yng Nghymru'n system gref ac yn system o sylwedd am ei bod yn galluogi i bobl gael llais wrth galon y Cynulliad. Bydd y pwyllgor yn gwneud llawer o waith yn y maes er mwyn inni allu estyn allan at bobl Cymru a'u hannog i gyflwyno materion sydd o bwys iddynt yn eu cymunedau. Rydym wedi bod yn y gogledd yn ddiweddar gan gyfarfod â deisebwyr a chynnal cyfarfod pwyllgor ffurfiol ac, yn yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf, byddwn yng ngŵyl Mela Amlddiwylliannol Caerdydd, ddydd Sul nesaf, yn Sioe Frenhinol Cymru, ac yn yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol. Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd gallu'r Pwyllgor Deisebau i ganolbwyntio'i sylw ar brofiadau pobl yng nghyswllt mater sydd mor ymddangosiadol gyfyng â'r sŵn sy'n dod o ffermydd gwynt yn galluogi'r pwyllgor i fwydo i waith ehangach pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad a'i oleuo.

In July 2011, the Petitions Committee was presented with a petition that called for

Ym mis Gorffennaf 2011, cyflwynwyd deiseb i'r Pwyllgor Deisebau a oedd yn galw am

‘a statute controlling the noise nuisance from wind turbines during anti-social hours.’

‘ddeddf er mwyn rheoli sŵn o dyrbinau gwynt sy’n peri diflastod yn ystod oriau anghymdeithasol’

Petitioners called for

‘the implementation of respite periods during which time turbines would be switched off.’

Initially, the committee wrote to the Minister on this issue. In his response, he indicated that although he did not think that the guidelines needed to change, he would give further consideration to evidence and engage in discussion on the issues around windfarm and wind turbine noise. The committee welcomes the Welsh Government’s positive approach in that regard.

However, the committee decided to launch a consultation exercise of its own so that we could get a better steer and understand more fully the scale of the problem here in Wales. We encouraged individuals to write in and tell us if they were affected by noise from wind turbines. The responses surprised us. We were told that some people who live adjacent to certain wind turbines could no longer enjoy simple pleasures, such as sitting in their garden in the sun. Others were afraid that their homes would be devalued if they complained about the issue, and that they would lose out financially, with their property and livelihood blighted. Others were so affected by a persistent whine from the turbines close to their homes that they found it difficult or impossible to sleep at night, leading to physical health problems and, indeed, sometimes mental health problems. On reading the responses, the committee knew that it had to take the issue further.

The committee was clear from the outset that the issue of noise from wind turbines was quite distinct from wider issues around technical advice note 8 and the wider issue of energy policy. The committee was neither theologically pro-wind energy nor anti-wind energy; this was a separate issue that needed to be dealt with as such, and needed close attention. Many of the petitioners told us that they just wished to be heard and to have their issues understood—to share their experiences and feel that their needs were being considered by the planners, the wind turbine companies and, ultimately, the decision

Galwodd y deisebwyr am

‘gychwyn cyfnodau o seibiant pan fydd tyrbinau gwynt yn cael eu diffodd.’

Yn y lle cyntaf, ysgrifennodd y pwyllgor at y Gweinidog ynglŷn â hyn. Yn ei ymateb, dywedodd, er nad oedd yn meddwl bod angen newid y canllawiau, y byddai'n ystyried y dystiolaeth eto ac yn cynnal trafodaeth ynglŷn â'r materion sy'n gysylltiedig â ffermydd gwynt a sŵn tyrbinau gwynt. Mae'r pwyllgor yn croesawu agwedd gadarnhaol Llywodraeth Cymru yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

Serch hynny, penderfynodd y pwyllgor lansio'i ymarfer ymgynghori ei hun er mwyn cael gwell llyw ar bethau ac er mwyn deall yn llawnach beth oedd maint y broblem yma yng Nghymru. Anogwyd unigolion i ysgrifennu atom a dweud a oedd sŵn tyrbinau gwynt yn effeithio arnynt. Cawsom ein synnu gan yr ymatebion. Dywedwyd wrthym fod rhai pobl sy'n byw wrth ymyl rhai tyrbinau gwynt penodol nad oeddent yn gallu mwynhau pleserau syml rhagor, megis eistedd yn eu gardd yn yr haul. Roedd eraill yn ofni y byddai gwerth eu tai'n gostwng petaent yn cwyno am y broblem, ac y byddent ar eu colled yn ariannol, a'u heiddo a'u bywoliaeth yn cael eu difetha. Roedd swnian parhaus y tyrbinau a oedd yn agos at eu cartrefi'n effeithio gymaint ar bobl eraill nes ei bod yn anodd neu'n amhosibl iddynt gysgu'r nos, ac roedd hynny'n creu problemau o ran eu hiechyd corfforol ac, yn wir broblemau o ran eu hiechyd meddwl. Wrth ddarllen yr ymatebion, gwyddai'r pwyllgor ei bod yn rhaid iddo fynd â'r mater ymhellach.

Roedd y pwyllgor yn glir o'r dechrau'n deg bod problem sŵn tyrbinau gwynt yn rhywbeth a oedd ar wahân yn llwyr i'r materion ehangach sy'n gysylltiedig â nodyn cyngor technegol 8 a mater ehangach polisi ynni. Nid oedd y pwyllgor, o ran egwyddor, nac o blaid ynni'r gwynt nac yn ei erbyn; roedd hwn yn fater ar wahân ac yr oedd angen ymdrin ag ef felly, a rhoi sylw manwl iddo. Dywedodd llawer o'r deisebwyr wrthym mai'r cyfan yr oeddent yn awyddus i'w weld oedd bod rhywun yn gwrando arnynt ac yn deall eu problemau—bod rhywun yn rhannu eu profiadau a theimlo bod

makers here in Cardiff bay.

y cynllunwyr, cwmnïau'r tyrbinau gwynt, ac yn y pen draw, y sawl sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau yma ym mae Caerdydd, yn ystyried eu hanghenion.

So the committee visited one of the areas affected: Gwyddgrug in Carmarthenshire. We were joined on that occasion by local Assembly Member, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, who gave us the benefit of his own insight and personal knowledge of this matter, which has been a major topic in his mailbox for some considerable time. At the meeting, we were told by one lady that she no longer slept in her bedroom but had had to move to the back of her house because of the problems that she encountered with windfarm noise. In fact, she moved to a room overlooking a main road, because the noise from the road was less intrusive and disturbed her sleep less than the noise coming from the turbines. Another petitioner told us that

Felly, aeth y pwyllgor i ymweld ag un o'r ardaloedd yr effeithir arni: Gwyddgrug yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Daeth yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, i ymuno â ni ar yr achlysur hwnnw, gan roi cyfle inni glywed ei safbwynt ef a'i hun a'i wybodaeth bersonol ynglŷn â'r mater, sydd wedi bod yn destun o bwys yn ei flwch llythyrau ers tro. Yn y cyfarfod, dywedodd un fenyw wrthym nad oedd yn cysgu yn ei llofft rhagor, ond iddi orfod symud i gefn y tŷ oherwydd y problemau yr oedd yn eu hwynebu gyda sŵn y fferm wynt. A dweud y gwir, roedd wedi symud i ystafell a oedd yn wynebu'r ffordd fawr, oherwydd bod sŵn y ffordd yn tarfu llai ac yn amharu llai ar ei chwsg nag yr oedd y sŵn a ddeuai o'r tyrbinau. Dywedodd deisebydd arall wrthym

‘it is not necessarily the volume of the noise that is the disturbing factor; it is the nature of the noise—it is incessant, repetitive, pulsating, whooshing and roaring.’

nad foliwm y sŵn o reidrwydd yw'r ffactor sy'n tarfu; ond natur y sŵn—mae'n ddi-baid, yn ailadroddus, yn curo, yn hisian ac yn rhuo.

Some petitioners were angry and felt that their concerns had been consistently ignored, dismissed and, in some cases, treated lightly. Efforts had been made to monitor the noise disturbance, but the committee heard that data gathering could be onerous for those hosting the monitoring equipment. We were also told that the data were often disregarded if it had been raining, for example, despite the fact that the noise was often at its worst in wet weather.

Roedd rhai deisebwyr yn ddig ac yn teimlo bod eu pryderon wedi cael eu hanwybyddu'n gyson, a'u diystyru, ac, mewn ambell achos, wedi'u trin yn ysgafn. Roedd ymdrechion wedi bod i fonitro'r tarfu gan y sŵn, ond clywodd y pwyllgor y gallai casglu'r data fod yn feichus i'r sawl sy'n cadw'r offer monitro. Dywedwyd wrthym hefyd fod y data'n aml yn cael eu hanwybyddu petasai'n bwrw glaw, er enghraifft, er gwaethaf y ffaith mai mewn tywydd gwlyb yn aml yr oedd y sŵn ar ei waethaf.

It was for that reason that the committee welcomed the Welsh Government’s acceptance in principle of the committee’s recommendation to involve petitioners in the Institute of Acoustics working group on this issue to establish best practice on noise assessment. A greater understanding of the experiences of those affected by this noise could only be a positive thing, and that is to be welcomed. It would certainly reassure those living close to turbines that their concerns are not being dismissed, as they had originally suggested in their response to us.

Dyna pam yr oedd y pwyllgor yn croesawu bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n derbyn argymhelliad y pwyllgor mewn egwyddor, sef cynnwys deisebwyr yng ngweithgor y Sefydliad Acwsteg sy'n ymwneud â'r mater hwn er mwyn sefydlu'r arferion gorau ar gyfer asesu sŵn. Byddai deall profiadau'r rhai y mae'r sŵn hwn yn effeithio arnynt yn sicr yn beth cadarnhaol, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Byddai'n sicr yn tawelu meddwl y rheini sy'n byw'n agos at dyrbinau nad yw eu pryderon yn cael eu diystyru, fel yr oeddent wedi'i awgrymu'n wreiddiol yn eu hymateb

inni.

4.45 p.m.

On behalf of the committee, I welcome the Minister's positive approach to the issue. Although there is a degree of disappointment that he has been unable to accept three of the recommendations, and has accepted only one recommendation in part, we hope to hear in his response today that these matters will remain under review and will receive the attention that they deserve.

Ar ran y pwyllgor, rwyf yn croesawu agwedd gadarnhaol y Gweinidog at y mater. Er ei bod yn destun siom i raddau nad yw wedi gallu derbyn tri o'r argymhellion ac mai dim ond un argymhelliad, a hynny'n rhannol, y mae wedi'i dderbyn, rydym yn gobeithio clywed yn ei ymateb heddiw y caiff y materion hyn eu hadolygu'n barhaus ac y cânt y sylw y maent yn eu haeddu.

At this point, I again thank the committee members for their work and the superb clerking team for the support that they gave in the drafting of the report and with all the practical arrangements for our evidence sessions and the sessions held in the Assembly. The people to whom we spoke were frank and honest with us as they shared their difficulties. It was moving for us to hear their concerns, giving us an opportunity to make sure that they were addressed here in this building. I just hope that the experiences that they shared with us will help us to improve the experiences of others who find themselves neighbours to such windfarm developments in future.

Ar y pwynt hwn, rwyf am ddiolch unwaith eto i aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu gwaith ac i'r tîm clercio rhagorol am eu cymorth wrth ddrafftio'r adroddiad a chyda'r holl drefniadau ymarferol ar gyfer ein sesiynau tystiolaeth a'r sesiynau a gynhaliwyd yn y Cynulliad. Roedd y bobl y buom yn siarad â hwy'n ddi-flewyn-ar-dafod ac yn onest â ni wrth sôn am eu hanawsterau. Roedd clywed eu pryderon yn brofiad teimladwy inni, ac yn gyfle i sicrhau eu bod yn cael sylw yma yn yr adeilad hwn. Nid wyf ond yn gobeithio y bydd profiadau y soniwyd wrthym amdanynt yn gymorth inni wella profiadau pobl eraill sy'n eu cael eu hunain yn gymdogion i ddatblygiadau ffermydd gwynt tebyg yn y dyfodol.

Joyce Watson: I start by thanking my fellow Petitions Committee members. We are a small group, but we have clocked up many miles on the road together by now. We have travelled around the country, talked to petitioners, and seen at first hand the issues that affect them. As a regional Member, I am used to travelling—and William Powell will also appreciate that. I am glad of the company.

Joyce Watson: Rwyf am ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'm cyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor Deisebau. Grŵp bychan ydym, ond rydym wedi teithio filltiroedd lawer ar y ffordd gyda'n gilydd erbyn hyn. Rydym wedi teithio o gwmpas y wlad, wedi siarad â deisebwyr, ac wedi gweld o lygad y ffynnon yr anawsterau sy'n eu hwynebu. A minnau'n Aelod rhanbarth, rwyf yn gyfarwydd â theithio—a bydd William Powell yn gwerthfawrogi hynny hefyd. Rwyf yn falch o'r cwmni.

The variety of petitions that we consider is wide ranging, but what I hope they all have in common is the shared benefit of having a direct link between the National Assembly and the Welsh people. It has been a progressive and democratic addition to devolution. On this occasion, we visited a number of sites during the inquiry and held a committee meeting in Carmarthen town, at the Halliwell Centre at the University of

Byddwn yn ystyried amrywiaeth eang o ddeisebau, ond un peth sy'n gyffredin iddynt i gyd, gobeithio, yw'r cyd-fudd a ddaw yn sgîl gael cysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a phobl Cymru. Mae wedi bod yn ychwanegiad blaengar a democrataidd at ddatganoli. Y tro hwn, cawsom ymweld â nifer o safleoedd yn ystod yr ymchwiliad a chynhaliwyd cyfarfod pwyllgor yn nhref Caerfyrddin, yng

Wales Trinity Saint David. I pay tribute to, and thank, those who turned up, took the time and made a huge effort to speak to us and present information to us. The conversations that we had and the evidence that we took convinced me of the need to listen more carefully to the experience and expertise of those local people.

Nghanolfan Halliwell ym Mhrifysgol Cymru y Drindod Dewi Sant. Rwyf am roi teyrnged a diolch i'r sawl a ddaeth yno, gan roi o'u hamser a gwneud ymdrech enfawr i siarad â ni a chyflwyno gwybodaeth inni. Drwy'r sgyrsiau a gawsom a'r dystiolaeth a glywsom, fe'm hargyhoeddwyd bod angen gwrando'n fwy gofalus ar brofiad ac arbenigedd y bobl leol hyn.

I am encouraged that the Minister has accepted the need to scrutinise the skills of those commissioning and considering noise assessments. It needs to be looked at. More importantly, it should also influence the decisions of local planners. It cannot be lip service. It cannot be power without influence. The details matter. The planning process can sideline local people and ignore local knowledge too easily and too often. However, we cannot lose sight of the big picture either. I fully support the Government’s low-carbon commitment and applaud the resolve that this Government has shown to deliver on its ambitions for renewable energy targets.

Mae'n fy nghalonogi bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn bod angen craffu ar sgiliau'r sawl sy'n comisiynu ac yn ystyried asesiadau sŵn. Mae angen edrych ar hyn. Yn bwysicach byth, dylai hefyd ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau cynllunwyr lleol. Nid rhywbeth arwynebol ddylai hyn fod. Ni all fod yn bŵer heb ddylanwad. Mae'r manylion yn bwysig. Mae'n rhy hawdd i'r broses cynllunio wthio pobl leol i'r cyrion ac anwybyddu gwybodaeth leol. Mae hyn yn digwydd yn rhy aml. Serch hynny, ni allwn ychwaith golli golwg ar y darlun mawr. Rwyf yn llwyr gefnogi ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i sicrhau ynni sy'n rhad ar garbon ac rwyf yn cymeradwyo'r penderfyniad y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi'i dangos i wireddu ei huchelgais o ran targedau ynni adnewyddadwy.

I agree that we must always carefully examine the detail and cost-benefit of different technologies, but we must also be honest about what we are arguing for or against. Even putting aside the reality of climate change, surely it makes sense for Wales to invest in sustainable energy. In conclusion, I welcome the fact that people came forward, gave of their time and provided additional information, and that the Minister has acknowledged, at least in part, their efforts.

Rwyf yn cytuno ei bod yn rhaid inni archwilio manylion a chostau a buddion gwahanol dechnolegau'n ofalus bob tro, ond rhaid inni fod yn onest hefyd ynglŷn â'r hyn yr ydym yn dadlau o'i blaid neu yn ei erbyn. Hyd yn oed os rhoddwn realiti newid yn yr hinsawdd o'r neilltu, siawns nad yw'n beth doeth i Gymru fuddsoddi mewn ynni cynaliadwy. I gloi, rwyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod pobl wedi dod ger ein bron, wedi rhoi o'u hamser ac wedi darparu gwybodaeth ychwanegol, a bod y Gweinidog wedi cydnabod, o leiaf yn rhannol, eu hymdrechion.

Russell George: As a member of the Petitions Committee, I am pleased to contribute to this debate this afternoon. I also take this opportunity to put on record my thanks to the clerking team who ably assisted us in the preparation and publication of this report. I particularly thank those who provided evidence to help us to formulate this piece of work.

Russell George: A minnau'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor Deisebau, rwyf yn falch o gael cyfrannu at y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma. Rwyf am achub ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i gofnodi fy niolch i'r tîm clercio a fu'n ein cynorthwyo'n fedrus i baratoi a chyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn. Diolch yn arbennig i'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth i'n cynorthwyo i lunio'r darn hwn o waith.

As the Chair has already said, for those citizens who are directly affected by wind turbine noise, it is an incredibly emotive subject. Having listened to some of the very personal evidence given to us, and having been to Carmarthen to listen and speak to residents, which is just one area in Wales that has been significantly impacted by the development of onshore wind turbines, we, as politicians and representatives of the people of Wales, must ask ourselves whether we are putting the health and wellbeing of our citizens at risk in the pursuit of one specific form of renewable technology. We heard about incidents of regular sleep deprivation, headaches, palpitations, panic attacks, psychological impairments, as well as reports of high levels of stress and depression. Some might say that this is subjective or anecdotal evidence, and that these are just a few people who are prone to the effects of low-frequency noise. However, if you add this evidence to other such evidence, not just in other parts of the UK but around the world, you will see that there is a picture being painted here of a major public health risk, particularly if Governments are hellbent on the pursuit of windfarm overdevelopment.

Fel y mae'r Cadeirydd wedi dweud eisoes, i'r dinasyddion hynny y mae sŵn tyrbinau gwynt yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol arnynt, mae'n bwnc anhygoel o emosiynol. Ar ôl gwrando ar rywfaint o'r dystiolaeth bersonol iawn a roddwyd inni, ac ar ôl bod yng Nghaerfyrddin yn gwrando ar drigolion ac yn siarad â hwy, a honno ond yn un ardal yng Nghymru y mae datblygu tyrbinau gwynt ar y tir wedi effeithio'n sylweddol arni, rhaid i ni, wleidyddiion a chynrychiolwyr pobl Cymru, ofyn inni'n hunain a ydym yn peryglu iechyd a lles ein dinasyddion wrth fynd ar drywydd un ffurf benodol ar dechnoleg adnewyddadwy. Clywsom am enghreifftiau o golli cwsg rheolaidd, cur pen, crychguriad y galon, pyliau o banig, anhwylderau seicolegol, yn ogystal ag adroddiadau am gryn straen meddwl ac iselder. Mae'n bosibl y byddai rhai'n dweud mai tystiolaeth oddrychol neu anecdotaidd yw hon, ac mai ychydig o bobl yw'r rhain yn unig sy'n tueddu i ddioddef yn sgîl effeithiau sŵn amledd-isel. Serch hynny, os ychwanegwch y dystiolaeth hon at dystiolaeth debyg arall, nid dim ond mewn rhannau o'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond o bob cwr o'r byd, fe welwch fod darlun yn cael ei greu yma o berygl mawr i iechyd y cyhoedd, yn enwedig os yw Llywodraethau'n benderfynol o fynd ar drywydd gorddatblygu ffermydd gwynt.

That is why I was pleased that the *British Medical Journal* published a piece of research back in March that showed that this is now featuring on the research radar of medical experts who are prepared to examine this issue in more detail. I believe that it is incumbent on the Government and this institution to put the health and wellbeing of our citizens as the No. 1 priority in all that we do. In this case, that means putting in place all the safeguards necessary to protect those people living close to wind turbines who are subject to the noise pollution that they cause. Therefore, I was, of course, disappointed that the Government could not accept the majority of these recommendations. While I accept that there are some technical elements that could prevent their direct and immediate implementation, I am convinced that the principles behind the recommendations could have been agreed to.

Dyna pam roeddwn yn falch bod y *British Medical Journal* wedi cyhoeddi darn o ymchwil yn ôl ym mis Mawrth a oedd yn dangos bod hyn bellach wedi ymddangos ar radar ymchwil yr arbenigwyr meddygol sy'n barod i archwilio'n fanylach i'r mater hwn. Credaf ei bod yn ddyletswydd ar y Llywodraeth ac ar y sefydliad hwn i wneud iechyd a lles ein dinasyddion yn brif flaenoriaeth ym mhopeth a wnawn. Yn yr achos hwn, mae hynny'n golygu rhoi'r holl gamau diogelu angenrheidiol ar waith i warchod y bobl hynny sy'n byw'n agos at dyrbinau gwynt ac sy'n dioddef y llygredd sŵn a achosir ganddynt. Felly, wrth gwrs, roeddwn yn siomedig na allai'r Llywodraeth dderbyn y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion hyn. Er fy mod yn derbyn bod ambell elfen dechnegol a allai ein rhwystro rhag eu rhoi ar waith yn syth ac ar unwaith, rwyf yn argyhoeddedig y gallesid cytuno ar yr egwyddorion sy'n sail i'r argymhellion.

I particularly want to focus on the first two recommendations. Stating that recommendation 1 cannot be implemented because the Government's planning guidance is not statutory is, frankly, a poor response. I believe that we should be affording the people living near wind turbines some standard levels of protection. While the report states a distance of 500m, I personally believe that we should be looking at the upper end of that recommendation, at 1500m as the minimum standard distance. The Government talks in its response about ensuring that best practice is followed. Perhaps, then, it should look at what is being done in Australia, specifically the state of Victoria, where the Government last year implemented planning policy that means that, on any new windfarm development, there has to be a minimum of a 2 km setback buffer zone to protect local residents from turbine noise. It came to the conclusion, using evidence from the reports that it had commissioned, that it was a problem and it acted accordingly to mitigate the potential health risk. I believe that the Welsh Government should be showing leadership here and should provide clear guidance for developers and local planning authorities to ensure that sufficient levels of protection are implemented.

Rwyf am ganolbwyntio'n benodol ar y ddau argymhelliad cyntaf. A bod yn blaen, ymateb gwael yw dweud nad oes modd rhoi argymhelliad 1 ar waith oherwydd nad yw canllawiau cynllunio'r Llywodraeth yn statudol. Credaf y dylem fod yn rhoi lefelau safonol o warchodaeth i'r bobl sy'n byw wrth ymyl tyrbinau gwynt. Er bod yr adroddiad yn nodi pellter o 500m, rwyf fi'n credu'n bersonol y dylem fod yn ystyried pen uchaf yr argymhelliad hwnnw, sef 1500m yn bellter safonol lleiaf. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn sôn yn ei hymateb am sicrhau bod yr arferion gorau'n cael eu dilyn. Efallai felly, y dylai edrych ar yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud yn Awstralia, yn enwedig yn nhalaith Victoria, lle y rhoddodd y Llywodraeth bolisi cynllunio ar waith y llynedd sy'n golygu ei bod yn rhaid cael parth clustogi o 2km o leiaf ar gyfer unrhyw ddatblygiad fferm wynt newydd er mwyn gwarchod trigolion lleol rhag sŵn tyrbinau. Ei chasgliad oedd, ar sail tystiolaeth yr adroddiadau yr oedd wedi'u comisiynu, ei bod yn broblem a gweithredodd yn unol â hynny i liniaru'r perygl posibl i iechyd. Credaf y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru fod yn dangos arweiniad yma ac yn rhoi canllawiau clir i ddatblygwyr ac awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i sicrhau eu bod y rhoi digon o warchodaeth ar waith.

In relation to recommendation 2, it should be clear to us all that, despite developers working to these regulations, noise pollution still exists and is a real problem. Therefore, the ETSU-R-97 guidance needs to be examined. While I appreciate that the Welsh Government has no direct control over that, it could and should be raising these concerns with the UK Government. Of course, if we were to have a thorough review of technical advice note 8, we could look at the guidance in a holistic way. However, as that is not forthcoming, I am pleased, in a way, that events have overtaken the recommendations, and that the UK Department of Energy and Climate Change is examining the ETSU-R-97 guidance, because you need only speak to environmental health officers to know that many are unhappy to use this guidance, which was produced in the mid-1990s. I would not be at all surprised to learn that many unsafe noise conditions have been agreed to by planning inspectors and local

O ran argymhelliad 2, dylai fod yn glir inni ei gyd, er bod datblygwyr yn gweithio ar sail y rheoliadau hyn, bod llygredd sŵn yn bodoli o hyd a'i fod yn broblem go iawn. Felly, mae angen archwilio canllawiau ETSU-R-97. Er fy mod yn sylweddoli nad oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru reolaeth uniongyrchol dros hynny, gallai a dylai fod yn codi'r pryderon hyn gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Wrth gwrs, petaem yn adolygu nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn drwyadl, gallem edrych ar y canllawiau o'u cwr. Serch hynny, gan nad yw hynny'n digwydd, rwyf yn falch, mewn ffordd, bod digwyddiadau wedi goddiweddyd yr argymhellion, a bod Adran Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd y Deyrnas Unedig yn archwilio canllawiau ETSU-R-97, oherwydd nid oes ond angen ichi siarad â swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd i wybod bod llawer ohonynt yn anhapus yn defnyddio'r canllawiau hyn, a gyhoeddwyd yng nghanol yr 1990au. Ni fyddwn yn synnu clywed o gwbl bod arolygwyr cynllunio ac

planning authorities, meaning that residents in proximity to windfarms may be suffering undue noise nuisance without the means to challenge that. This view has been supported by the recent publication of a report by Cox, Unwin and Sherman, which states that ETSU-R-97 is out of date, is discredited and is incapable of protecting people from a level of noise that damages their health.

awdurdodau cynllunio lleol wedi cytuno droeon i ganiatáu sefyllfa lle mae lefel y sŵn yn anniogel, gan olygu y gall trigolion sy'n agos at ffermydd gwynt fod yn dioddef niwsans sŵn gormodol heb allu ei herio. Mae'r adroddiad diweddar a gyhoeddwyd gan Cox, Unwin a Sherman yn cefnogi hyn. Mae'n dweud bod canllawiau ETSU-R-97 wedi mynd heibio i'w dyddiad, nad oes fawr o barch iddynt ac na allant warchod pobl rhag lefel sŵn sy'n niweidio'u hiechyd.

Do I have more time, Presiding Officer?

A oes gennyf ragor o amser, Lywydd?

The Presiding Officer: No. [*Laughter.*]

Y Llywydd: Nac oes [*Chwerthin.*]

Russell George: In conclusion, then, I just want to emphasise point 53 of the report, because it sums up the report in a nutshell.

Russell George: I gloi, felly, yr wyf am bwysleisio pwynt 53 o'r adroddiad yn unig, oherwydd mae'n crynhoi'r adroddiad i'r dim.

‘The Committee feels that it is imperative that the health and wellbeing of people living close to wind turbines is protected, and that the guidelines used when assessing planning applications for, and the operation of, windfarms should uphold this principle.’

Teimla'r pwyllgor ei bod yn rhaid amddiffyn iechyd a lles pobl sy'n byw'n agos at dyrbinau gwynt, ac y dylai'r canllawiau a ddefnyddir wrth asesu ceisiadau cynllunio ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt, a'u gweithredu, ategu'r egwyddor hon.

The Presiding Officer: You should not ask that question of me, really. [*Laughter.*]

Y Llywydd: Ni ddylech ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw imi a dweud y gwir. [*Chwerthin.*]

Bethan Jenkins: Diolch i fy nghyd-aelodau o’r pwyllgor ac i’r clercod am weithio mor galed ar yr adroddiad hwn. Mae’r adroddiad yn cyfiawnhau’r hyn y mae llawer o ymgyrchwyr wedi ymladd drosto ers nifer o flynyddoedd, ac mae’n dda gweld bod y pryderon hynny’n cael eu cydnabod yn y modd hwn. Cyflwynwyd y ddeiseb gychwynnol gan un o etholwyr Rhodri Glyn Thomas AC, fel y soniwyd yn gynharach, ac mae llawer o’r hyn a drafodwyd yn ystod yr ymchwiliad hwn wedi dod gan etholwyr yn ystod cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus yng Nghaerfyrddin.

Bethan Jenkins: I thank my fellow committee members and the clerks for working so hard on this report. The report justifies what many campaigners have been fighting for for many years, and it is good to see that those concerns are now being recognised. The initial petition was submitted by one of the constituents of Rhodri Glyn Thomas AM’s, as was mentioned earlier, and much of what has been discussed during this inquiry has emerged from the contributions of constituents during the public meetings held in Carmarthen.

Mae tri o’r pedwar argymhelliad yn ymwneud â’r union beth y mae Rhodri Glyn Thomas a’i gydweithiwr yn ei etholaeth, Jonathan Edwards AS, wedi galw amdano ers blynyddoedd, ac wedi galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i weithredu arno. Roedd y rhan fwyaf o bobl a ymatebodd i’r ymgynghoriad yn cwyno bod sŵn y melinau gwynt yn amharu ar eu cwsg, fel y dywedwyd yn gynharach, gan arwain at

Three of the four recommendations relate to exactly what Rhodri Glyn Thomas and his constituency colleague, Jonathan Edwards MP, have been calling for for many years, calling on the Welsh Government and the UK Government to take action on this. Most of those who responded to the consultation complained that the noise of the turbines interfered with their sleep, as was said earlier, leading to headaches, interrupted sleep and

gur pen, cwsg aflonydd a phroblemau seicolegol, hyd yn oed. Fel y dywedwyd yn gynharach gan Russell, mae’r erthygl am sŵn tyrbinau gwynt a gyhoeddwyd yn y *British Medical Journal* ar 8 Mawrth eleni yn dangos bod tyrbinau gwynt yn cael eu gosod yn agos at dai a bod cwynion wedi dod i’r amlwg am effeithiau ar iechyd, yn enwedig cwsg aflonydd. Dywedodd pobl ar nifer o adegau fod y sŵn yn annioddefol, fel trên stêm yn ceisio adeiladu mwy o stêm neu fel hofrennydd uwch eu pennau. Mae llawer o bobl hefyd yn dweud nad lefel y sŵn oedd y broblem o reidrwydd, ond presenoldeb parhaol y sŵn hwnnw. Cafwyd adroddiadau hefyd o darfu ar agweddau eraill ar fywyd pobl, fel pobl a oedd yn methu â threulio amser yn eu gerddi. Dywedodd un ffermwr, sy’n byw 815m i ffwrdd o fferm wynt, ei fod weithiau’n ei chael hi’n amhosibl gweithio ar y fferm. Rwy’n siŵr bod y ffermwyr yn ein mysg yn cydnabod hynny yn fwy na mi.

O ran argymhellion 1 a 2, cynigiwyd clustogfa o 1,500m yn gyntaf gan Blaid Cymru: cyflwynodd y Cynghorydd Linda Davies Evans, sy’n cynrychioli ward Llanfihangel-ar-arth yn sir Gaerfyrddin, gynnig i’r cyngor sir newid y polisi cynllunio lleol. Cafodd y cynnig hwnnw ei gefnogi yn unfrydol gan y cyngor, a dangosodd y Cynghorydd Evans arweinyddiaeth wrth geisio newid cyfarwyddyd cynllunio lleol pan oedd yr alwad am bolisi cenedlaethol wedi mynd heb ei hateb.

Mae mwy o bellter rhwng tai a thyrbinau yn cael ei annog yn yr Alban, yn bennaf oherwydd yr effaith weledol. Mae nodyn cyngor cynllunio 45 yr Alban yn cyfateb i’n nodyn cyngor technegol ni, ac yn nodi bod 2km yn fwy tebygol o ddarparu pellter derbyniol rhwng tyrbinau a thai. Dywedodd arbenigwr acwstig o Hayes McKenzie Partnership Ltd mewn adroddiad diweddar:

‘In very quiet background noise environments, separation distances as large as 1500 metres might be required to be compliant with the limits set within ETSU-R-97. However, in noisy environments, such as close to a motorway, the separation distances can be much closer, to the point where traffic noise can completely mask wind turbine noise although one is only positioned 50m

even psychological problems. As was said earlier by Russell, the article that was published in the *British Medical Journal* on 8 March this year demonstrated that wind turbines are being placed close to homes and that complaints have emerged because of the impacts on people’s health, particularly in the form of sleep problems. It was said on many occasions that the noise was unbearable, like a steam train building up a head of steam, or like a helicopter hovering overhead. Many people also said that it was not necessarily the level of the noise that was a problem, but its persistent presence. There were also reports of interference with other aspects of people’s lives, such as people not being able to spend time in their gardens. One farmer, living 815m away from a windfarm, told us that he sometimes finds it impossible to carry out work on the farm. I am sure that the farmers among us would have a greater appreciation of that than I do.

On recommendations 1 and 2, a buffer zone of 1,500m was first proposed by Plaid Cymru: Councillor Linda Davies Evans, who represents the Llanfihangel-ar-arth ward in Carmarthenshire, proposed a motion to the county council to change the local planning policy. That motion was supported unanimously by the council, and Councillor Evans showed great leadership in trying to change local planning guidance when the call for a national policy went unanswered.

A greater distance between homes and turbines is encouraged in Scotland, mainly because of the visual impact. Planning advice note 45 in Scotland corresponds to our technical advice note, and it notes that 2km is more likely to be an acceptable distance between turbines and homes. An acoustic expert from Hayes McKenzie Partnership Ltd said in a recent report:

Mewn amgylcheddau lle mae'r sŵn cefndir yn dawel iawn, efallai y bydd angen i'r pellter gwahanu fod gymaint â 1500 metr er mwyn cydymffurfio â'r terfynau a bennir yn ETSU-R-97. Serch hynny, mewn amgylcheddau swnllyd, megis yn agos at draffordd, gall y pellter gwahanu fod yn llai o lawer, hyd at y pwynt lle y gall sŵn traffig guddio sŵn tyrbinau gwynt yn llwyr er na fydd rhywun

from the wind turbine.’

ond 50m oddi wrth y tyrbin gwynt.

Ni allai’r deisebwyr gytuno’n fwy â’r sylw hwn, ac maent yn ei ystyried yn un o ganlyniadau mwyaf arwyddocaol y ddeiseb. Eu dadl nhw yw y byddai sŵn amgylchynol tyrbinau yn caniatáu gweithredu heb gyfyngiad ar safleoedd tir brown, gan arbed y defnyddwyr miliynau mewn llinellau trawsyrru, gwaith tir, lloriau caled graean ac yn y blaen, gan sicrhau bod ardaloedd gwledig yn cael eu diogelu’n ddigonol.

The petitioners could not have agreed more with that comment, and they considered it to be one of the more significant outcomes of the petition. Their argument is that the ambient noise of turbines would allow development without limitation on brownfield sites, saving the users millions in transmitter lines, landscaping, hard standing and so on, while ensuring that rural areas were adequately safeguarded.

Mae’n bwysig inni sefydlu dull brwsh bras o ran yr holl ffermydd gwynt newydd i osgoi costau astronomig i awdurdodau lleol pan fyddant yn gweithredu ar sail achos i achos. I wneud hyn, mae angen pellter derbyniol a chyffredin rhwng tyrbinau gwynt mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

It is important that we take a broad-brush approach to all new windfarms to avoid the astronomical costs to local authorities when working on a case-by-case basis. In so doing, an acceptable and accepted separation distance between wind turbines is required in rural areas.

Mae argymhelliad 3 yn hanfodol. Mae nifer o ymatebwyr wedi dweud wrth y pwyllgor bod diffygion gyda’r tyrbinau yn creu mwy o broblemau sŵn. Mae hefyd yn fater o synnwyr cyffredin: os bydd rhywbeth yn mynd o’i le gyda’ch car, er enghraifft, ni fyddwch yn gyrru’r car nes iddo gael ei adfer. Yn achos tyrbinau gwynt, os ydynt yn ddiffygiol, mae angen i’r allyriadau sŵn gael eu stopio neu i’r tyrbinau gael eu diffodd.

Recommendation 3 is crucial. Many of the respondents told the committee that defects with the turbines created even more noise problems. It is also a matter of common sense: if something goes wrong with your car, for instance, you would not drive it until it was fixed. In the case of wind turbines, if they are defective, the noise emissions need to be stopped or the turbines need to be switched off.

5.00 p.m.

Mae’n warthus bod trigolion yn gallu colli cwsg o ganlyniad i dyrbinau diffygiol. Mae hyn hefyd yn codi cwestiynau ynghylch yr angen i swyddogion cynllunio yn lleol gael mwy o bwerau er mwyn ymdrin â chorfforaethau mawr rhyngwladol nad ydynt, ar nifer o adegau ar lawr gwlad, yn cyfathrebu gyda phobl leol neu’n rhoi gofynion pobl leol ar ben yr agenda. Felly, rwy’n erfyn ar y Gweinidog i edrych ar hyn. Rwyf hefyd yn diolch i bawb am y cyfraniadau heddiw.

It is a disgrace that residents can lose sleep as a result of defective turbines. This also raises questions as to whether there is a need for planning officers at a local level to have greater powers in order to deal with large international corporations that do not, in many cases at grass-roots level, communicate with local people or place the requirements of local people at the forefront of their agendas. Therefore, I would urge the Minister to look at this. I thank everyone for the contributions made today.

Angela Burns: Hospitals and wind turbines—there is little that is more emotive to the average constituent, as I am sure many of us will know from our postbags and the people who come to see us. It is because people care about their landscape and the environment in which they live. This is an absolute hornets’ nest, and I am grateful to

Angela Burns: Ysbytai a thyrbinau gwynt—prin bod dim byd sy'n ennyn mwy o emosiwn yn yr etholwr cyffredin, fel y bydd llawer ohonom yn gwybod rwyf yn siŵr yn sgîl ein bagiau post a'r bobl sy'n dod i'n gweld. Y rheswm dros hynny yw oherwydd bod pobl yn poeni am eu tirwedd a'r amgylchedd lle y maent yn byw. Dyma ichi nyth cacwn go

the Petitions Committee for taking forward this petition, because it is incredibly important. Minister, I will be honest with you, I read the Government's response to the Petitions Committee and I was shocked at what I thought was the intransigent reaction that came forward, which is so unlike you.

iawn, ar rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Pwyllgor Deisebau am fwrw ymlaen â'r ddeiseb hon, oherwydd mae'n eithriadol o bwysig. Weinidog, byddaf yn onest â chi, darllenais ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r Pwyllgor Deisebau ac fe'm syfrdanwyd gan yr hyn a oedd yn fy ngolwg i'n ymateb anghymodlon, gan fod hynny mor groes i'ch natur.

I have a couple of questions that I will ask you to try to explain better. We all know how important it is that the noise from turbines does not affect people unduly, and, in fact, the *British Medical Journal* was very clear in its evidence in this regard. It said that there is real evidence

Rwyf am ofyn ychydig o gwestiynau ichi gan ofyn ichi geisio esbonio pethau'n well. Gwyddom i gyd pa mor bwysig yw hi nad yw sŵn tyrbinau'n effeithio'n ormodol ar bobl, ac, yn wir, roedd y *British Medical Journal* yn glir iawn yn ei dystiolaeth yn y cyswllt hwn. Dywedodd fod tystiolaeth go iawn

'of a strong link between wind turbine noise, ill health, and disruption of sleep.'

bod cysylltiad cryf rhwng sŵn tyrbinau gwynt, afiechyd a tharfu ar gwsg.

It is extraordinary, because you can go and visit some wind turbines and stand right next to them or in the houses right next to them and there is no problem. The person living there has no issues at all, and yet, because of topography and perhaps the types of ground—I do not know, I am not an expert—you could go to another location and it is a nightmare. I have been in houses where you can hear that constant thrumming. I appreciate the measuring of decibels and all the rest of it, but there is something about that mechanical noise in that it is unrelenting and it gets into you, into your bones, and you feel it. Therefore, I have great sympathy for people who have been put into that situation.

Mae'n rhyfeddol, oherwydd gallwch fynd i ymweld â rhai tyrbinau gwynt a sefyll wrth eu hymyl neu yn y tai sydd wrth eu hymyl ac nid oes problem. Ni fydd y sawl sy'n byw yno'n cael problemau o gwbl, ac eto i gyd, oherwydd topograffi ac efallai'r mathau o dir—ni wn i, nid wyf yn arbenigwr—gallech fynd i fan arall ac mae'n hunllef. Rwyf wedi bod mewn tai lle y gallwch glywed yr hymian cyson hwnnw. Rwyf yn sylweddoli bod modd mesur desibelau ac ati, ond mae rhywbeth ynglŷn â'r holl sŵn mecanyddol hwnnw sy'n ddidrugaedd ac yn mynd at eich gwraidd, i'ch esgyrn, a byddwch yn ei deimlo. Felly, mae gennyf gydymdeimlad mawr â phobl sydd wedi cael eu rhoi yn y sefyllfa honno.

To come to the Government's response, the reason why I call it intransigent is because I accept that, for statutory and technical reasons, you may not have been able to accept some of the Petitions Committee's recommendations, but I would have hoped that you might have been able to look at different ways of trying to address some of these issues. For example, on the separation of distances, has any work been undertaken that correlates different types or builds of turbines, or different materials in turbines or different heights of turbines according to distance or topography? A couple of years ago, I did a small body of work on this that looked at how short, fat turbines have a different type of noise to the tall, elegant

A throi at ymateb y Llywodraeth, rwyf yn ei alw'n anghymodlon oherwydd fy mod yn derbyn, am resymau statudol a thechnegol—nad oeddech wedi gallu derbyn rhai o argymhellion y Pwyllgor Deisebau o bosibl, ond byddwn wedi gobeithio y gallech fod wedi edrych ar wahanol ffyrdd o geisio mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r pethau hyn. Er enghraifft, yng nghyswllt y pellter gwahanu, a oes unrhyw waith wedi'i wneud sy'n cymharu gwahanol fathau o dyrbinau neu wahanol fathau o adeiladwaith, neu wahanol ddeunyddiau mewn tyrbinau neu dyrbinau o wahanol daldra yn ôl pellter neu dopograffi? Ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, gwneuthum ychydig o waith ar hyn a oedd yn edrych ar sut mae tyrbinau byr, tew'n creu sŵn o fath

ones. There are enormous differences now in the way that turbines are built. All this impacts on the kind of noise that they generate, but, more importantly, how you feel that noise. That is something else that we must not forget: noise is not all about hearing. You feel noise. We all feel the spoken word and we all feel the heard word.

gwahanol i'r rhai tal, gosgeiddig. Mae gwahaniaethau enfawr erbyn hyn yn y ffordd yr adeiledir tyrbinau. Mae hyn i gyd yn effeithio ar y math o sŵn y maent yn ei gynhyrchu, ond, yn anad dim, ar sut y byddwch yn teimlo am y sŵn hwnnw. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth arall na ddylem anghofio amdano: nid dim ond clywed sŵn y byddwch chi. Byddwch yn teimlo sŵn. Byddwn i gyd yn teimlo'r gair llafar a byddwn i gyd yn teimlo'r gair a glywir.

To turn quickly to the recommendations of the Petitions Committee and your response to them, Minister, I understand that technical issues mean that you cannot accept recommendation 1, but what could you do to offer more guidance? You say that the guidance is there for the local planning authorities to take account of, and yet, I have instances in my patch of where three incredibly noisy wind turbines get planning permission, right next door to a small housing estate where everyone cannot sleep, and yet you get a farmer who wants one on his farm, which nobody will hear, and he gets rejected. Given that we are going for a low carbon economy, why on earth does that kind of situation exist?

A throi'n gyflym at argymhellion y Pwyllgor Deisebau a'ch ymateb iddynt, Weinidog, rwyf yn deall bod y materion technegol yn golygu na allwch dderbyn argymhelliad 1, ond beth y gallech ei wneud i gynnig rhagor o ganllawiau? Rydych yn dweud bod y canllawiau yno i'r awdurdodau cynllunio lleol roi sylw iddynt, ac eto i gyd, mae gennyf enghreifftiau yn fy ardal i lle mae tri thyrbin gwynt anhygoel o swnllyd yn cael caniatâd cynllunio, a hynny drws nesa i ystâd dai fechan lle na all neb gysgu. Eto i gyd pan fydd ffarmwr am gael tyrbin ar ei fferm, un na fydd neb yn ei glywed, fe'i gwrthodir. A chofio ein bod yn anelu at gael economi sy'n rhad ar garbon, pam ar y ddaear mae'r math hwnnw o sefyllfa'n bodoli?

I would like to drill down on recommendation 2 about a good practice guide on noise assessment and who judges and how you judge what an ambient noise is. I heard Bethan Jenkins's contribution; I will not even try to mention that incredibly long policy document that she talked about, ET-something-or-other. I know that that has some of the decibels levels and guidance in it, but, again, it is incredibly subjective. Whether it is day or night, rural or urban and, in fact, the age of people matter as to how differently you interpret noise. Stronger guidance is extremely important.

Hoffwn fanylu ar argymhelliad 2 ynglŷn ag arweiniad arferion da ar gyfer asesu sŵn a phwy sy'n barnu a sut mae barnu beth yw sŵn amgylchynol. Clywais gyfraniad Bethan Jenkins; ni wnaf hyd yn oed geisio crybwyll y ddogfen bolisi anhygoel o hir honno y soniodd amdani, ET-rywbeth neu'i gilydd. Gwn fod honno'n sôn am rai o lefelau'r desibelau a'i bod yn cynnwys canllawiau, ond, unwaith eto, mae'n anhygoel o oddrychol. Ai dydd ynteu nos yw hi, ai gwledig ynteu drefol ac, yn wir faint yw oedran pobl—mae'r rhain i gyd yn effeithio ar sut y byddwch yn dehongli sŵn mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig cael canllawiau cryfach.

I would like to touch briefly on recommendation 4. I am especially disappointed about this. You have accepted it in principle, Minister, which seems like a win for the Petitions Committee, yet the one group of people with whom you will not consult is Joe Public. Joe Public has an awful lot to say on this subject. I note that you are

Hoffwn grybwyll yn fras argymhelliad 4. Rwyf yn arbennig o siomedig ynglŷn â hyn. Rydych wedi'i dderbyn mewn egwyddor, Weinidog, sydd i bob golwg yn fuddugoliaeth i'r Pwyllgor Deisebau, eto i gyd, yr un grŵp o bobl na wnewch ymgynghori ag ef yw'r cyhoedd. Mae gan y cyhoedd lawer iawn i'w ddweud am y pwnc

going to talk to local authority planners, environmental health officers and applicants, whom I suggest are laughing all the way to the bank. I would really like you to have another look at how you might be able to get the opinions of ordinary people. We need wind turbines. No-one is against them, in terms of what they can do for the future of our planet. However, they have to be able to be put in place without destroying the lives of the people who live near them.

hwn. Sylwaf eich bod yn bwriadu siarad â chynllunwyr awdurdodau lleol, swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd ac ymgeiswyr, sydd, mi hoffwn awgrymu, yn chwerthin yr holl ffordd i'r banc. Byddwn yn wir yn hoffi ichi gael golwg arall ar sut y gallech geisio barn pobl gyffredin. Mae angen tyrbinau gwynt arnom. Nid oes neb yn eu herbyn, o ran yr hyn y gallant ei wneud ar gyfer dyfodol ein planed. Serch hynny, rhaid gallu eu rhoi ar waith heb ddifetha bywyd y bobl sy'n byw'n agos atynt.

The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths): I will begin by thanking the committee for its report, and by thanking the committee Chair and Members, as well as Angela Burns, for their contributions today. It is in the context of the transition towards low carbon electricity generation, outlined in ‘Energy Wales’, and our expectations for our energy system to meet high environmental objectives and standards, that we should consider these matters. Those sorts of issues very much form part of the Welsh Government’s sustainable approach to energy, which reflects our central organising principle of sustainable development and our ambitions to improve the wellbeing of the people of Wales, including those living close to existing or proposed windfarms. Therefore, I believe that a debate on noise issues associated with wind turbines is timely.

Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths): Rwyf am ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r pwyllgor am ei adroddiad, a thrwy ddiolch i Gadeirydd ac Aelodau'r Pwyllgor, yn ogystal ag i Angela Burns, am eu cyfraniadau heddiw. Dylem ystyried y materion hyn yng nghyd-destun y cyfnod pontio at gynhyrchu trydan rhad ar garbon, fel y'i disgrifir yn 'Ynni Cymru', a'n disgwyliadau i'n system ynni gyflawni amcanion a safonau amgylcheddol uchel. Mae'r mathau hynny o faterion yn elfen fawr o ymagwedd gynaliadwy Llywodraeth Cymru at ynni, sy'n adlewyrchu ein hegwyddor drefniadaethol ganolog sef datblygu cynaliadwy a'n huchelgais i wella lles pobl Cymru, gan gynnwys lles y rheini sy'n byw'n agos at ffermydd gwynt sydd yno eisoes neu rai sydd yn yr arfaeth. Felly, credaf ei bod yn bryd inni drafod y problemau sŵn sy'n gysylltiedig â thyrbinau gwynt.

There are a number of complex technical issues relating to this subject that mean that we are not able to accept the first three recommendations. There are also other factors that lead to that conclusion. These issues concern technical advice note 8, ETSU-R-97 noise guidelines and statutory planning guidance. The Welsh Government’s planning policy and guidance is not statutory, and it is produced to facilitate the operation of the planning system. This is relevant to recommendations 1 and 3. There is not a fixed 500m separation distance required between dwellings and turbines. The guidance contained in TAN 8 was offered to assist local planning authorities to refine the boundaries of the strategic search areas and not individual turbines. It recognises that, even within the context of the strategic search

Mae nifer o faterion technegol cymhleth yn berthnasol i'r pwnc hwn sy'n golygu na allwn dderbyn y tri argymhelliad cyntaf. Mae ffactorau eraill hefyd sy'n arwain at y casgliad hwnnw. Mae a wnelo'r materion hyn â nodyn cyngor technegol 8, canllawiau sŵn ETSU-R-97 a chanllawiau cynllunio statudol. Nid yw polisi a chanllawiau cynllunio Llywodraeth Cymru yn statudol, ac fe'u cyhoeddir i hwyluso gweithrediad y system cynllunio. Mae hyn yn berthnasol i argymhellion 1 a 3. Nid oes gofyn cael pellter gwahanu penodedig o 500m rhwng anheddau a thyrbinau. Cynigiwyd y canllawiau sydd yn TAN 8 i gynorthwyo awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i fireinio ffiniau'r ardaloedd chwilio strategol ac nid ar gyfer tyrbinau unigol. Maent yn cydnabod, hyd yn oed o fewn cyd-destun ffiniau'r ardal chwilio strategol, y

area boundaries, such a threshold should be applied flexibly. This relates to some of the points that Angela Burns rightly mentioned. The noise impacts of wind turbines depend on many factors, such as the type of turbine, the topography of the land, and local wind speeds and direction, for example. This means that a rigid separation distance is not appropriate.

dylid rhoi trothwy o'r fath ar waith mewn ffordd hyblyg. Mae hyn yn berthnasol i rai o'r pwyntiau a grybwyllwyd gan Angela Burns ac roedd yn llygad ei lle. Mae effeithiau sŵn tyrbinau gwynt yn dibynnu ar lawer o ffactorau, megis y math o dyrbin, topograffi'r tir, a chyflymder a chyfeiriad y gwynt lleol, er enghraifft. Mae hyn yn golygu nad yw'n briodol pennu pellter gwahanu haearnaidd.

These noise impacts need to be considered in their local context, and decisions based upon local evidence. In some instances, a 500m separation distance may be unacceptably close to some properties in terms of local impacts, whereas in other cases, the impact of turbines within a 500m radius may be imperceptible. A distance of 500m is currently considered a typical separation distance between a wind turbine and residential property to avoid unacceptable noise impacts, but this is a purely indicative figure. TAN 8 states that well-designed windfarms should be located so that increases in ambient noise levels around noise-sensitive developments are kept to acceptable levels in relation to existing background noise. This will normally be achieved through good design of the turbines, and through allowing sufficient distance between the turbines and any existing noise-sensitive development. If applied in a rigid manner, a 500m separation distance could lead to overly conservative results and could unnecessarily hinder the development of renewable energy projects that are so important to Wales and the world.

Mae angen ystyried effeithiau sŵn fel hyn yn eu cyd-destun lleol, a seilio'r penderfyniadau ar dystiolaeth leol. O dan rai amgylchiadau, gall pellter gwahanu o 500m fod yn annerbyniol o agos at rai adeiladau o ran yr effaith a gânt yn lleol, ond mewn achosion eraill, efallai na fydd neb yn sylwi ar effaith tyrbinau sydd o fewn radiws o 500m. Ar hyn o bryd, ystyrir pellter o 500m yn bellter gwahanu nodweddiadol rhwng tyrbin gwynt ac eiddo preswyl er mwyn osgoi effaith sŵn annerbyniol, ond ffigur dangosol yw hwn yn llwyr. Dywed TAN 8 bod cynllunio ffermydd gwynt yn dda'n golygu eu lleoli mewn man sy'n sicrhau bod unrhyw gynnydd yn lefelau'r sŵn amgylchynol yng nghyffiniau datblygiadau sy'n sensitif i sŵn yn cael ei gadw ar lefel dderbyniol mewn perthynas â'r sŵn cefndir sydd yno eisoes. Llwyddir i sicrhau hyn fel rheol drwy gynllunio'r tyrbinau'n dda, a thrwy adael digon o bellter rhwng y tyrbinau ac unrhyw ddatblygiad sy'n sensitif i sŵn. Os rhoddir hyn ar waith mewn ffordd haearnaidd, gallai pellter gwahanu 500m arwain at ganlyniadau gorgeidwadol a pheri rhwystr diangen rhag datblygu prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy sydd mor bwysig i Gymru ac i'r byd.

Regarding recommendation 3, conditions can be attached to a permission in order to make a development acceptable. However, while this can include restrictions on the operating hours, the use of conditions needs to be appropriately applied to be legally defensible, so they must be necessary, relevant, reasonable and enforceable. Local authority statutory nuisance powers can be used to deal with windfarm noise complaints and noise from faulty turbines, as planning permission in itself does not prevent a statutory nuisance from being found and action taken. The Environmental Protection Act 1990 places a duty on a local authority to investigate complaints of statutory nuisance, including

O ran argymhelliad 3, gellir rhoi amodau ynghlwm wrth ganiatâd er mwyn gwneud datblygiad yn dderbyniol. Serch hynny, er y gall hyn gynnwys cyfyngiadau ar yr oriau gweithredu, mae angen rhoi'r amodau ar waith mewn ffordd briodol fel y gellir eu cyfiawnhau'n gyfreithiol, felly rhaid iddynt fod yn angenrheidiol, yn berthnasol, yn rhesymol a rhaid gallu eu gorfodi. Gellir defnyddio pwerau niwsans awdurdodau statudol i ymdrin â chwynion am sŵn ffermydd gwynt a sŵn o dyrbinau sydd â nam arnynt, gan nad yw caniatâd cynllunio ynddo'i hun yn rhwystr rhag canfod niwsans statudol a chymryd camau. Mae Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 yn rhoi

noise.

dyletswydd ar awdurdod lleol i ymchwilio i gwynion ynglŷn â niwsans statudol, gan gynnwys sŵn.

A statutory noise nuisance will occur where it can be concluded that the effect is prejudicial to health or that a nuisance exists that is interfering with a person's ordinary use or enjoyment of their land—all of which is highly relevant to the points that Members have mentioned in terms of the complaints made. Where a local authority has concluded that a noise issue constitutes a nuisance or is prejudicial to health, it must generally serve an abatement notice on the perpetrator. Failure to comply with the notice may result in prosecution. Local authorities have additional powers through the Noise Act 1996, under which they must take reasonable steps to investigate complaints of noise between 11 p.m. and 7 a.m..

Bydd niwsans sŵn statudol yn digwydd lle y gellir casglu bod yr effaith yn amharu ar iechyd neu lle y bydd niwsans yn bodoli sy'n amharu ar y ffordd y bydd rhywun fel rheol yn defnyddio neu'n mwynhau eu tir—ac mae hynny i gyd yn berthnasol iawn i'r pwyntiau y mae'r Aelodau wedi'u crybwyll o ran y cwynion a gafwyd. Lle y bydd awdurdod lleol wedi casglu bod problem sŵn yn achosi niwsans neu ei fod yn niweidiol i iechyd, rhaid iddo fel rheol gyflwyno hysbysiad atal i'r sawl sy'n gyfrifol. Oni chydymffurfir â'r rhybudd, gall hynny arwain at erlyn. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol bwerau ychwanegol o dan Ddeddf Sŵn 1996, lle y mae'n rhaid iddynt gymryd camau rhesymol i ymchwilio i gwynion ynglŷn â sŵn rhwng 11 p.m. a 7 a.m.

Recommendation 2 has been rejected because ETSU-R-97 remains the agreed, scientifically based standard for assessment of noise nuisance by decision makers throughout the UK. It describes a framework for the measurement of windfarm noise and gives indicative noise levels calculated to offer a reasonable degree of protection to residents, without placing unreasonable restrictions on windfarm development or adding unduly to the costs and administrative burdens on windfarm developers or planning authorities.

Gwrthodwyd Argymhelliad 2 oherwydd mai ETSU-R-97 o hyd yw'r safon wyddonol y cytunwyd arni ar gyfer asesu niwsans sŵn gan benderfynwyr ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n disgrifio fframwaith ar gyfer mesur sŵn ffermydd gwynt ac mae'n cynnig lefelau sŵn dangosol sydd wedi'u cyfrifo i gynnig gwarchodaeth resymol i drigolion heb osod cyfyngiadau afresymol ar ddatblygiadau ffermydd gwynt neu ychwanegu'n ormodol at gostau a beichiau gweinyddol datblygwyr ffermydd gwynt neu awdurdodau cynllunio.

As has been recognised in contributions made today, this recommendation has been superseded following the commissioning of consultants Hayes McKenzie by the Department of Energy and Climate Change to review ETSU-R-97, in April 2011. The Hayes McKenzie study found that the fundamental approach to assessing wind turbine noise presented by the ETSU-R-97 guidance was still relevant, but that there were issues associated with variations in quality of noise assessments. The Welsh Government has since been working with the Department of Energy and Climate Change and the Institute of Acoustics to produce a good practice guide on the effective use of the ETSU guidance. We expect a consultation on this good practice guide to be undertaken by the autumn. We believe that

Fel y cydnabuwyd yn y cyfraniadau heddiw, mae'r argymhelliad hwn wedi'i oddiweddyd yn sgîl comisiynu'r ymgynghorwyr Hayes McKenzie gan yr Adran Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd i adolygu ETSU-R-97, ym mis Ebrill 2011. Canfu astudiaeth Hayes McKenzie fod yr ymagwedd sylfaenol at asesu sŵn tyrbinau gwynt a gyflwynir yng nghanllawiau ETSU-R-97 yn dal yn berthnasol ond bod problemau ynghlwm wrth yr amrywiadau yn ansawdd yr asesiadau sŵn. Ers hynny, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi bod yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd a chyda'r Sefydliad Acwsteg i gyhoeddi arweiniad arferion da ar ddefnyddio canllawiau ETSU yn effeithiol. Disgwyliwn y cynhelir ymgynghoriad ar yr arweiniad arferion da hyn erbyn yr hydref. Credwn mai'r canllawiau yw'r ffordd fwyaf priodol o

the guidance is still the most appropriate way of assessing wind turbine noise and that it is capable of addressing lower ambient noise levels in different locations. The forthcoming guide should be of assistance to decision makers and local communities.

hyd o asesu sŵn tyrbinau gwynt a'u bod yn gallu rhoi sylw i lefelau sŵn amgylchynol is mewn gwahanol leoliadau. Dylai'r arweiniad sydd ar y gweill fod yn gymorth i benderfynwyr ac i gymunedau lleol.

In association with this, and in conclusion, the fourth recommendation of the Petitions Committee has been accepted in principle. We accept that there needs to be meaningful consultation on the good practice guide produced by the Institute of Acoustics. The Hayes McKenzie research indicates that the skills of those commissioning and considering noise assessments need to be improved. We must ensure that the work will be of benefit to local authority planners, environmental health officers and applicants to produce greater consistency in noise assessments in future.

Yn gysylltiedig â hyn, ac i gloi, derbyniwyd pedwerydd argymhelliad y Pwyllgor Deisebau mewn egwyddor. Rydym yn derbyn bod angen cael ymgynghoriad ystyrlon ynglŷn â'r arweiniad arferion da a gyhoeddwyd gan y Sefydliad Acwsteg. Mae ymchwil Hayes McKenzie yn dangos bod angen gwella sgiliau'r rheini sy'n comisiynu ac yn ystyried asesiadau sŵn. Rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd y gwaith o fudd i gynllunwyr awdurdodau lleol, swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd ac ymgeiswyr er mwyn iddynt fod yn fwy cyson wrth asesu sŵn yn y dyfodol.

William Powell: I thank everybody who has contributed to today’s debate; there have been some really excellent contributions. I also thank the Minister for his response. I will consider some of the contributions in turn.

William Powell: Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl heddiw; mae sawl cyfraniad gwirioneddol ragorol wedi bod. Diolch hefyd i'r Gweinidog am ei ymateb. Ystyriaf rai o'r cyfraniadau yn eu tro.

In opening her contribution, Joyce Watson stressed the vital importance, which I had also referred to, of local knowledge and specific local experience in this issue. She rightly paid tribute to the petitioners who took such time to gather their thoughts and to present their experiences in such a compelling way. At the same time, however—I would concur with this—the importance of renewable energy targets, to which the Minister referred, must never be forgotten. We must not lose sight of the wider context in considering these matters.

Wrth agor ei chyfraniad, pwysleisiodd Joyce Watson pa mor hanfodol bwysig, ac yr oeddwn innau wedi cyfeirio at hyn, yw gwybodaeth leol a phrofiad lleol penodol yn y cyswllt hwn. Roedd yn llygad ei lle'n rhoi teyrnged i'r deisebwyr a dreuliodd gymaint o amser yn casglu eu meddyliau ac yn cyflwyno'u profiadau mewn ffordd a wnaeth gymaint o argraff arnom. Ar yr un pryd, fodd bynnag,—a byddwn yn cytuno â hyn—rhaid inni beidio byth ag anghofio pwysigrwydd y targedau ynni adnewyddadwy, y cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog ato. Rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar y cyd-destun ehangach wrth ystyried y materion hyn.

5.15 p.m.

Russell George, who is a frequent commentator on the wider issues around TAN 8, drilled down into the specifics of windfarm noise, and properly so. He gave a forensic analysis of the different aspects of the recommendations and the disappointment that he feels, which I referred to earlier, that the Government has been unable to accept

Aeth Russell George, sy'n sylwebu'n aml ar y materion ehangach sydd ynghlwm wrth TAN 8, at wraidd agweddau penodol sŵn ffermydd gwynt, a theg oedd hynny. Cawsom ddadansoddiad fforensig ganddo ar wahanol agweddau'r argymhellion a'i siom, y cyfeiriais innau ato gynnau, na fu modd i'r Llywodraeth dderbyn yr argymhellion yn

the recommendations in a fuller fashion. Specifically, the issues around the ETSU-R-97 guidance, and concerns about its validity, were major topics in his remarks. Tomorrow, in the context of a meeting that I have secured with the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change, Ed Davey, I will present a copy of the Petitions Committee’s report and urge him to engage with our Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development on taking these issues forward. That will hopefully bear some fruit for the petitioners.

llawnach. Yn benodol, y materion sy'n ymwneud â chanllawiau ETSU-R-97, a phryderon ynglŷn â'u dilysrwydd, oedd rhai o'r prif bynciau yn ei sylwadau. Yfory, yng nghyd-destun cyfarfod yr wyf wedi llwyddo i'w drefnu gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd, Ed Davey, byddaf yn cyflwyno copi o adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deisebau ac yn pwyso arno i drafod y materion hyn gyda'n Gweinidog Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy ni a bwrw ymlaen â hwy. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n dwyn rhywfaint o ffrwyth i'r deisebwyr.

I thank Bethan Jenkins for her contribution, laying out the fact that these are long-standing issues, particularly in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr, as well as in other parts of Wales. She gave an evocative account of the problems that are faced by residents and empathised with the experiences of the local farming community and those who shared their experiences with us. It is good practice by developers of any repute to switch off faulty turbines when a problem is identified. Therefore, it would not have been too much to have looked to the Government on this occasion to endorse that and to give it a degree more rigour than just a voluntary code.

Diolch i Bethan Jenkins am ei chyfraniad, a'i chyfeiriad at y ffaith bod y problemau hyn wedi bodoli ers tro, yn enwedig yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr, yn ogystal ag mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Clywsom hanes dirdynnol ganddi am y problemau a wynebir gan drigolion ac roedd yn cydymdeimlo â phrofiadau'r gymuned ffermio leol a'r rheini a soniodd wrthym am eu profiadau hwythau. Mae'n arfer da i ddatblygwyr, pwy bynnag y bônt, ddiffodd tyrbinau sydd â nam arnynt pan fydd problem yn codi. Felly, ni fyddai wedi bod yn ormod disgwyl i'r Llywodraeth yn y cyswllt hwn, ategu hynny a rhoi ychydig mwy o ddannedd iddo na dim ond cod gwirfoddol.

In her contribution, Angela Burns expressed grave disappointment with the aspects of our recommendations that did not find favour with the Welsh Government and went into the technical issues around the advances in technology and the fact that there is not a one-size-fits-all approach and that we need a case-by-case approach to the problems that exist. She also referred to the importance of consistency in decision making in this area.

Yn ei chyfraniad hithau, dywedodd Angela Burns ei bod yn hynod siomedig nad ymatebodd Llywodraeth Cymru'n ffafriol i rai agweddau ar ein hargymhellion gan sôn am y materion technegol sy'n ymwneud â'r datblygiadau mewn technoleg a'r ffaith nad yw'r un ateb o reidrwydd yn addas ym mhobman a bod angen ymdrin â'r problemau fesul achos. Cyfeiriodd hefyd at bwysigrwydd cysondeb wrth wneud penderfyniadau yn y maes hwn.

Finally, I turn to the Minister’s response. We are grateful to the Minister for explaining the context of the Government’s response to our recommendations in considerable detail, particularly the key role of the Hayes McKenzie recommendations that emanated from the recent study commissioned by the Department of Energy and Climate Change on windfarm noise. These issues will need to be taken forward. The fact that recommendation 4 has been accepted in principle is to be welcomed, and is welcomed

Yn olaf, trof at ymateb y Gweinidog. Rydym yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am esbonio cyd-destun ymateb y Llywodraeth i'n hargymhellion mewn cryn fanylder, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt rôl allweddol argymhellion Hayes McKenzie a ddeilliodd o'r astudiaeth ddiweddar a gomisiynwyd gan yr Adran Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd ar sŵn ffermydd gwynt. Bydd angen bwrw ymlaen â'r materion hyn yn awr. Mae'r ffaith bod argymhelliad 4 wedi'i dderbyn mewn egwyddor i'w groesawu, ac mae'r pwyllgor

by the committee, but it is a matter of regret for me that those who are going to be invited to participate in the work of the acoustics forum will be, in some ways, the usual suspects and that we are not sending a more positive invitation to the kind of people who brought the petition to us in the first place—communities, town and community councils and other groups. In the longer term, I would look to identifying a route whereby they can have a say and continue to feel that their voices are being heard in this vital area. Thank you to everyone who has contributed today in whatever way that they have spoken. This is an important issue, which we will continue to monitor.

yn ei groesawu, ond mae'n resyn gennyf fi mai'r rheini a wahoddir i gymryd rhan yng ngwaith y fforwm acwsteg, mewn ambell ffordd, fydd yr un hen rai ac nad ydym yn anfon gwahoddiad mwy cadarnhaol i'r math o bobl a ddaeth â'r ddeiseb ger ein bron yn y lle cyntaf—cymunedau, cynghorau tref a chymuned a grwpiau eraill. Yn y tymor hwy, byddwn yn awyddus i weld llwybr lle y gallant hwy gael llais a dal i deimlo bod eu lleisiau'n cael eu clywed yn y maes hollbwysig hwn. Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu heddiw ym mha ffordd bynnag y maent wedi siarad. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig, a byddwn yn dal i'w fonitro.

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is to note the Petitions Committee’s report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The proposal is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Llywydd: Y cynnig yw ein bod yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deisebau. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbynnir y cynnig felly yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.

Dadl Plaid Cymru
Plaid Cymru Debate

Y Rhwydwaith Rheilffyrdd
The Railway Network

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

Y Llywydd: Rwyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

Cynnig NDM5035 Jocelyn Davies

Motion NDM5035 Jocelyn Davies

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i archwilio modelau eraill dielw o berchnogaeth dros y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd sy’n esgor ar y manteision mwyaf posibl i’r cyhoedd ac i deithwyr.

Calls on the Welsh Government to explore alternative not for profit models of ownership of the railway network that deliver maximum benefit for the public and passengers.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cynigiaf y cynnig. Diolch yn fawr am y cyfle i gyflwyno’r cynnig hwn gerbron y Cynulliad.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move the motion. Thank you for the opportunity to introduce this issue before the Assembly.

Yn 2003, enillodd Arriva Trains Wales

In 2003, Arriva Trains Wales won the Wales

masnachfraint rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r gororau am gyfnod o 15 mlynedd. Er y bydd y fasnachfraint yn para tan 2018, mae'n rhaid ei hadnewyddu cyn hynny. Mae'n rhaid gwneud penderfyniad erbyn 2015—yn ystod cyfnod y pedwerydd Cynulliad—a dyna pam rydym wedi dod â'r cynnig gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw, i alw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i archwilio modelau eraill dielw o berchnogaeth dros y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd sy'n esgor ar y manteision mwyaf posibl i'r cyhoedd ac i deithwyr.

and borders rail franchise for a period of 15 years. Although the franchise lasts until 2018, it has to be renewed before then. A decision has to be taken by 2015—during this fourth Assembly—which is why we have brought this motion forward, calling on the Welsh Government to investigate other not-for-profit models of ownership for the railway network that deliver maximum benefit for the public and passengers.

Mae'r cyfrifoldeb a'r gyllideb o £140 miliwn ar gyfer 2011-12 wedi eu datganoli ac mae'r Llywodraeth yn cyfrannu tua £30 miliwn yn ychwanegol i'r gyllideb hon. Yn anffodus, nid yw'r holl bwerau sy'n ymwneud â'r fasnachfraint wedi eu datganoli. Wedi i'r Prif Weinidog, Carwyn Jones, gyfaddef nad oedd gan ei blaid fonopoli ar syniadau da, ymgais yw'r ddadl hon i geisio datblygu'r dadleuon a nodi tir cyffredin o fewn y Siambr.

The responsibility and the budget of £140 million for 2011-12 are devolved, and the Government contributes £30 million in addition to that budget. Unfortunately, not all the powers associated with the franchise are devolved. Given that the First Minister, Carwyn Jones, admitted that his party did not have a monopoly on good ideas, this debate is an attempt to develop the arguments and identify common ground within the Chamber.

Prif symbyliad y drafodaeth i ni ym Mhlaid Cymru yw profiad ein gweinidogion mewn Llywodraeth. Er i Ieuan Wyn Jones fuddsoddi'n helaeth yn y gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth, roedd cryn anfodlonrwydd gydag Arriva a'r fasnachfraint. Soniodd Ieuan am '*decade of overcrowding*' ac am yr angen i ddiwygio'r fasnachfraint. Mae Plaid Cymru o'r farn nad yw'r trefniant presennol yn cynnig digon i drethdalwyr Cymru.

The main impetus for the debate for us in Plaid Cymru arises from the experience of our Ministers in Government. Despite Ieuan Wyn Jones investing heavily in transport services there was a great deal of dissatisfaction with both Arriva and the franchise. Ieuan mentioned a 'decade of overcrowding', and the need to reform the franchise. Plaid Cymru is of the view that the current arrangement does not offer enough to the taxpayers of Wales.

Nid yw hyn yn feirniadaeth o fath yn y byd ar staff na rheolwyr y cwmni; mae'n feirniadaeth ar y cytundeb. Nid oedd dyletswydd ar Arriva i gynnig gwasanaeth ychwanegol, felly Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sydd wedi bod yn buddsoddi mwy na'r angen yn y llinellau ychwanegol a cheisio delio â materion capasiti.

This is not any kind of criticism of the company's staff or managers, but it is a criticism of the agreement. Arriva was not duty bound to offer additional services, so it was the Assembly Government that invested more than was necessary in the additional lines, and tried to deal with capacity issues.

Mae Plaid Cymru wedi bod yn glir ers ein maniffesto yn 2011:

Plaid Cymru has been clear since our manifesto in 2011:

'Mae angen trawsnewid masnachfraint rheilffyrdd Cymru. Byddwn yn ceisio sicrhau bod cyfrifoldeb am y gwasanaeth yn ei gyfanrwydd yn cael ei drosglwyddo i Lywodraeth Cymru a byddwn yn creu cwmni nid-am-elw-dosbarthadwy i redeg y gwasanaeth'.

'The rail franchise agreement for Wales needs a complete overhaul. We will seek to ensure that the responsibility for the service is transferred entirely to the Welsh Government and we will create a not-for-distributable-profit company to run the service'.

Y cefndir i hyn oll yw'r ddadl ehangach ym Mrhydain lle mae'r Blaid Lafur yn dechrau cynnig syniadau ychydig yn wannach na rai Plaid Cymru ond sy'n symud i'r un cyfeiriad. Mae Maria Eagle wedi cynnig model tebyg i un y Blaid ac mae nifer o undebau llafur wedi galw am ail-genedlaetholi'r wasanaeth.

The background to all of this is the wider debate in Britain where the Labour Party is beginning to suggest ideas that are a little weaker than those of Plaid Cymru but which move in the same direction. Maria Eagle has proposed a model similar to Plaid Cymru's and a number of unions have called for the renationalisation of the service.

Mae'r system reilffyrdd bellach yn gwbl ddibynnol ar arian cyhoeddus ac mae'n iawn inni fynnu mwy o'r fasnachfraint. Er y bydd nifer o rwystrau cyfreithiol i'w goresgyn, mae'n bwysig dechrau ar y gwaith yn awr, nid aros a gobeithio efallai am fuddugoliaeth i Lafur yn etholiadau San Steffan. Wedi'r cyfan, roedd ail-genedlaetholi'r rheilffyrdd yn bolisi Llafur Newydd yn ôl yn 1997, cofiwch, a ddigwyddodd dim byd. Mae'n hanfodol i Lywodraeth Cymru ddatgan ei bwriad yn glir yn y cyfeiriad hwn.

The railway system is now completely dependent on public funding and it is right for us to insist on more from the franchise. Although there will be a number of legal obstacles to overcome, it is important that we start on the work now, not wait and hope perhaps for a Labour victory in Westminster elections. After all, the renationalisation of the railways was a New Labour policy back in 1997, and nothing happened. It is vital that the Welsh Government declares its intention clearly in this regard.

Fundamental questions need to be explored around the franchising agreement as it stands. The Welsh Government must spell out whether it wants to become the sole owner of the Welsh rail franchise rather than being a joint signatory with the Department for Transport. We also need clarity on the national transport plan's ambition to integrate bus services with rail services. Professor Stuart Cole has argued that the Welsh Government will need to abolish the provisions of the Transport Act 1985 as they stand in Wales, and assume legislative competence for bus regulation. The easiest thing to do, of course, would be to simply re-let the franchise arrangements on the same public limited company model that is used currently.

Mae angen ystyried cwestiynau sylfaenol ynghylch y cytundeb masnachfreinio fel ag y mae. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru ddweud yn glir a yw am fod yn unig berchennog masnachfraint rheilffyrdd Cymru yn hytrach na bod yn llofnodwr ar y cyd â'r Adran Drafnidiaeth. Mae'n rhaid wrth eglurder hefyd ynghylch uchelgais y cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol i integreiddio gwasanaethau bysiau â gwasanaethau trenau. Mae'r Athro Stuart Cole wedi dadlau y bydd angen i Lywodraeth Cymru ddiddymu darpariaethau Deddf Trafnidiaeth 1985 fel ag y maent yng Nghymru, a chymryd cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol dros reoleiddio'r bysiau. Y peth rhwyddaf i'w wneud, wrth gwrs, fyddai bodloni ar ailosod y cytundebau masnachfreinio yn unol â'r un model cwmni cyfyngedig cyhoeddus ag a ddefnyddir ar hyn o bryd.

Plaid Cymru, having held the transport portfolio during the One Wales Government, simply does not believe that that model is suitable for future Welsh rail needs. If the Welsh Government goes for the default position, we will have missed a huge opportunity to take a progressive direction with our railways.

Nid yw Plaid Cymru, a oedd yn gyfrifol am y portffolio trafnidiaeth yn ystod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, o'r farn fod y model hwnnw'n addas at anghenion rheilffyrdd Cymru yn y dyfodol. Os bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn cadw at y sefyllfa sydd ohoni, byddwn wedi colli cyfle enfawr i ddilyn trywydd rhagweithiol gyda'n rheilffyrdd.

Debates about the future of train services are bound up with the question of public

Mae dadleuon am ddyfodol gwasanaethau trenau ynghlwm â materion yn ymwneud â

ownership, and Plaid Cymru recognises that we are in an age where value for money is more important than ever, and there is general disillusionment among the public towards corporations and multinational companies. Public opinion consistently supports the principle of public ownership in this regard. Plaid Cymru agrees with the principle that the rails should be a publicly owned asset. However, the question of public ownership is made difficult by European competition rules and the insistence on privatisation that has generally been expressed through various European directives—despite the fact that successful state-owned rail companies have persisted on the European mainland, in Denmark with DSB, and in France with SNCF. In terms of operation, it is vital to stress that any company operating the Welsh franchise would be operationally independent of the Government. A not-for-dividend company might need to be established by the Welsh Government in the first place, because it is difficult to see whether one would emerge organically. We do not foresee a situation where civil servants run the railways.

pherchnogaeth gyhoeddus, ac mae Plaid Cymru'n cydnabod ein bod yn byw mewn oes lle mae gwerth am arian yn bwysicach nag erioed, a lle mae'r cyhoedd wedi'u dadrithio'n gyffredinol ynghylch corfforaethau a chwmnïau rhyngwladol. Mae barn y cyhoedd yn gyson o blaid egwyddor perchnogaeth gyhoeddus yn hyn o beth. Mae Plaid Cymru'n cytuno â'r egwyddor y dylai'r rheilffyrdd fod yn ased cyhoeddus. Serch hynny, mae anawsterau ynghlwm â pherchnogaeth gyhoeddus oherwydd rheolau cystadlu Ewrop a'r ffaith fod gwahanol gyfarwyddebau Ewropeaidd yn mynnu'n gyffredinol fod yn rhaid preifateiddio—er gwaetha'r ffaith fod cwmnïau rheilffyrdd llwyddiannus yn nwylo'r wladwriaeth yn dal i fodoli ar dir mawr Ewrop, yn Nenmarc gyda DSB, ac yn Ffrainc gydag SNCF. O ran ei gweithredu, mae'n hollbwysig pwysleisio y byddai unrhyw gwmni a fyddai'n gweithredu masnachfraint Cymru'n weithredol annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth. Efallai y byddai angen i Lywodraeth Cymru sefydlu cwmni di-ddifidend yn y lle cyntaf, oherwydd mae'n anodd gweld a fyddai cwmni o'r fath yn datblygu'n organig. Nid ydym yn rhagweld sefyllfa lle byddai gweision sifil yn rhedeg y rheilffyrdd.

From a financial perspective, it would be essential to keep the company's finances off the UK and the Welsh balance sheet. The Welsh Government's role would not be in running the company; it would be in setting the franchise conditions and subsidy arrangements and then working together with the company, probably through a seat on its governing body, in order to take strategic decisions.

O safbwynt ariannol, byddai'n hollbwysig cadw materion ariannol y cwmni oddi ar fantolen y DU a Chymru. Nid rhedeg y cwmni fyddai rôl Llywodraeth Cymru, ond gosod amodau'r fasnachfraint a threfniadau cymhorthdal ac yna gydweithio â'r cwmni, drwy sedd ar y corff llywodraethu fwy na thebyg, er mwyn gwneud penderfyniadau strategol.

Stuart Cole said that there is potential to keep the profits made by the business and any other surpluses within Wales and within the railway franchise. He went on to say:

Dywed Stuart Cole fod potensial i gadw elw'r busnes ac unrhyw wargedion eraill yng Nghymru ac ym masnachfraint y rheilffyrdd. Dywedodd hefyd ei bod

'It's fair to say that any of the train operating companies have to make profits for their shareholders. The particular problem we had with the Welsh franchise was that it was designed for a low level of demand, and that low level of demand has not, in fact, continued—it has grown substantially. The Welsh government had to acquire more trains, through Arriva, and all that builds up

yn deg dweud bod yn rhaid i'r cwmnïau trenau wneud elw er mwyn eu cyfranddalwyr. Y broblem benodol â masnachfraint Cymru oedd ei bod wedi'i chynllunio ar gyfer lefel isel o alw, ac nad yw'r lefel isel honno o alw, mewn gwirionedd, wedi parhau—mae wedi tyfu'n sylweddol. Bu'n rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru gael gafael ar ragor o drenau, drwy Arriva, ac

the cost.'

mae hynny oll yn cynyddu'r gost.

That is the argument that we are setting forth today.

Dyna ein dadl heddiw.

The Tory amendment adds a new point at the end of the motion, to recognise

Mae gwelliant y Torïaid yn ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig, i gydnabod

'the important role that the owners of the rail network play in increasing the volume of commercial freight'.

'y rôl bwysig y mae perchnogion y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn ei chwarae o ran cynyddu faint o nwyddau sy'n cael eu cludo'n fasnachol ar y rhwydwaith'.

That amendment is acceptable to us. Increasing the volume of commercial freight in Wales was a key aim of the Welsh Government under Ieuan Wyn Jones's tenure as Minister for transport. We are happy to appreciate the important role that Network Rail plays in this process, although we need to see Network Rail become accountable to the Welsh Government. The company has taken the first step in that direction by devolving its internal functions to Wales—it now has a Welsh office and management team.

Mae'r gwelliant yn dderbyniol i ni. Roedd cynyddu faint o nwyddau sy'n cael eu cludo'n fasnachol yng Nghymru'n nod allweddol gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn ystod cyfnod Ieuan Wyn Jones yn Weinidog dros drafnidiaeth. Rydym yn fodlon iawn gwerthfawrogi rhan bwysig Network Rail yn y broses hon, er bod angen inni weld Network Rail yn dod yn atebol i Lywodraeth Cymru. Mae'r cwmni wedi cymryd y camau cyntaf ar y trywydd hwnnw drwy ddatganoli ei swyddogaethau mewnol i Gymru—mae ganddo bellach swyddfa a thîm rheoli yng Nghymru.

That is the challenge for the Government of Wales. We need to know the Government's stance on the issue of a not-for-profit model for the rail franchise. We need to know when the Government, unless it goes for the status quo, will make a decision and give a statement on this issue. I look forward to hearing contributions to the debate.

Dyna'r her i Lywodraeth Cymru. Mae angen inni gael gwybod beth yw safbwynt y Llywodraeth ar fodel dielw ar gyfer masnachfraint y rheilffyrdd. Mae angen inni wybod pryd y bydd y Llywodraeth, oni fydd yn mynd am y status quo, yn gwneud penderfyniad ac yn gwneud datganiad ar y mater hwn. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed cyfraniadau i'r ddadl.

Gwelliant 1 William Graham

Amendment 1 William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add new point at end of motion:

Yn cydnabod y rôl bwysig y mae perchnogion y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn ei chwarae o ran cynyddu faint o nwyddau sy'n cael eu cludo'n fasnachol ar y rhwydwaith.

Recognises the important role that the owners of the rail network play in increasing the volume of commercial freight.

Byron Davies: I move amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

Byron Davies: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

I welcome the opportunity to speak on this motion, which

Croesawaf y cyfle hwn i siarad ar y cynnig hwn sy'n

‘calls on the Welsh Government to explore alternative not for profit models of ownership of the railway network that deliver maximum benefit for the public and passengers’.

‘galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i archwilio modelau eraill dielw o berchnogaeth dros y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd sy’n esgor ar y manteision mwyaf posibl i’r cyhoedd ac i deithwyr.’

I feel sure that Plaid Cymru has well-intentioned motives behind this motion, but I cannot help feeling that there is some misunderstanding here. Before I explain what I mean by that confusion, I will talk about our amendment. Amendment 1 in the name of William Graham does what it says on the tin. We want to emphasise the importance of commercial freight to the railway network and our green agenda. We must try to get freight off our overloaded motorways and onto railways. We need to increase the volume of rail-freight traffic and there must be a priority for freight outside of peak hours. The owners of the rail network have an important part to play, because outside of peak hours is rightly seen as a good time for maintenance and improvement work. This must be planned around freight traffic. I argue that this kind of integration and co-operation has been lacking, to the detriment of freight traffic. I hope that all parties will support this obviously non-confrontational amendment.

Rwyf yn siŵr fod cymhellion Plaid Cymru wrth gyflwyno’r cynnig hwn yn rhai da, ond ni allaf beidio â meddwl bod camddealltwriaeth yma. Cyn imi egluro’r hyn a olygaf wrth sôn am y dryswch hwn, siaradaf am ein gwelliant ni. Mae gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham yn gwneud yn union yr hyn y mae’n ei ddweud. Rydym am bwysleisio pwysigrwydd cludo nwyddau’n fasnachol i’r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd a’n hagenda werdd. Mae’n rhaid inni symud nwyddau oddi ar ein traffyrdd gorlawn ac ar y rheilffyrdd. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod mwy o nwyddau’n cael eu cludo ar y rheilffyrdd a rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i gludo nwyddau y tu allan i oriau brig. Mae gan berchnogion y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd ran bwysig i’w chwarae, oherwydd ystyrir yn briodol iawn fod y tu allan i’r oriau brig yn amser da i wneud gwaith cynnal a chadw a gwella. Rhaid cynllunio hynny o amgylch traffig cludo nwyddau. Fy nadl i yw na welwyd y math hwn o integreiddio a chydweithredu, a hynny er anfantais i draffig cludo nwyddau. Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd pob plaid yn cefnogi’r gwelliant annadleuol hwn.

5.30 p.m.

I return to the motion. You are asking the Welsh Government

Dychwelaf at y cynnig. Rydych yn gofyn i Lywodraeth Cymru

‘to explore alternative not for profit models of ownership of the railway network’

‘archwilio modelau eraill dielw o berchnogaeth dros y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd’

or a Welsh Network Rail, if you wish. For me, this is where the confusion starts. Network Rail Ltd is a not-for-dividend private company limited by guarantee and any profits that it generates are reinvested into the rail network. Network Rail Infrastructure Limited was reported in the 2010 annual company report as being 100% owned by Network Rail Limited. As a company limited by guarantee, Network Rail Limited has no shareholders and thus is not owned by anyone. It is, however, subject to various statutory requirements and liable—as

neu Network Rail i Gymru, os mynnwch. I mi, dyma lle mae’r dryswch yn dechrau. Cwmni preifat di-ddifidend wedi’i gyfyngu drwy warant yw Network Rail Cyf, ac mae unrhyw elw a wneir ganddo’n cael ei ail-fuddsoddi yn y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd. Nodwyd yn adroddiad blynyddol y cwmni ar gyfer 2010 fod Network Rail Infrastructure Cyfyngedig yn gyfan gwbl ym mherchnogaeth Netowrk Rail Cyfyngedig. Ac yntau’n gwmni cyfyngedig drwy warant, nid oes gan Network Rail gyfranddalwyr ac felly nid oes neb yn berchen arno. Serch

happened prior to the privatisation of the Trustee Savings Bank—to any future legislation taking it into Government ownership.

hynny, mae'n ddarostyngedig i amryw o ofynion statudol ac yn agored—fel y digwyddodd cyn preifateiddio'r Trustee Savings Bank—i unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol a allai ei roi ym mherchnogaeth y Llywodraeth.

Therefore, in a way, this motion is disingenuous. Are you trying to discuss the franchise and operational management of the network in terms of timetables and rolling stock? If so, this is an entirely different kettle of fish. Or, do you want the devolution of Network Rail? Let us talk about both options briefly. We support any exploration to devolve Network Rail. It was in our manifesto; I stood for election on it and I stand by that commitment. There are obviously some complications to iron out, mainly because Wales does not have a complete railway network, but a shared one, if you include the borders railway lines. There is no way to travel between north and south Wales by rail without the English network. We have a truly British railway system in Wales in that sense.

Felly, mewn ffordd, mae'r cynnig hwn yn ffuantus. A ydych yn ceisio trafod masnachfraint a rheolaeth weithredol y rhwydwaith o safbwynt amserlenni a cherbydau? Os felly, mae hyn yn rhywbeth cwbl wahanol. Neu a ydych am weld datganoli Network Rail? Gadewch inni drafod y ddau opsiwn yn fyr. Rydym yn cefnogi unrhyw drafodaethau ar ddatganoli Network Rail. Roedd hynny yn ein maniffesto; sefais yr etholiad ar sail hynny ac rwyf yn dal i arddel yr ymrwymiad hwnnw. Wrth reswm, mae rhai cymhlethdodau i'w datrys, yn bennaf am nad oes gan Gymru rwydwaith rheilffyrdd cyflawn, ond yn hytrach un y mae'n ei rannu, os cynhwyswch linellau rheilffyrdd y gororau. Nid oes modd teithio rhwng gogledd a de Cymru ar y trên heb ddefnyddio rhwydwaith Lloegr. Mae ein system reilffyrdd yng Nghymru'n un gwbl Brydeinig yn hynny o beth.

I would be interested to see how a map of the rail network would work under Plaid Cymru's vision for an independent Wales. Therefore, either you have a massive capital budget stashed away to build new lines and reopen old lines, or this is a back-of-a-fag-packet idea. Secondly, on the franchise, I hope that you will be honest and accept that this motion has been badly drafted. I hope that, given the timing of the upcoming franchise and the fact that Network Rail is already a not-for-profit organisation, you meant to explore options—and I think that this is becoming obvious from what you said in your introduction—for a not-for-profit operator for our railways. This is an interesting concept and one that we would like to explore. A social enterprise could be a good model to look at, and social enterprises are businesses at the end of the day.

Byddai'n ddiddorol gweld sut y byddai map o'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn gweithio o dan weledigaeth Plaid Cymru o Gymru annibynnol. Felly, naill ai mae gennych gyllideb gyfalaf enfawr wedi'i chuddio yn rhywle i adeiladu llinellau newydd ac ailagor hen linellau, neu mae hwn yn syniad a luniwyd ar gefn pecyn sigaréts. Yn ail, ar y fasnachfraint, rwyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn onest ac yn derbyn bod y cynnig hwn wedi'i ddrafftio'n wael. Rwyf yn gobeithio, o ystyried amseriad y fasnachfraint sydd ar ddod a'r ffaith fod Network Rail eisoes yn sefydliad dielw, mai eich bwriad oedd edrych ar opsiynau—a chredaf fod hynny'n dod yn amlwg o wrando ar yr hyn a ddywedasoch yn eich cyflwyniad—ar gyfer gweithredwr dielw i'n rheilffyrdd. Mae hwn yn gysyniad diddorol ac yn un yr hoffem ei drafod. Efallai y byddai menter gymdeithasol yn fodel da, a busnesau yw mentrau cymdeithasol yn y pen draw.

However, I have to stress that, while this is an interesting concept, it is a long way from being sustainable and operationally credible

Serch hynny, rhaid imi bwysleisio, er bod hwn yn gysyniad diddorol, ei fod ymhell o fod yn gynaliadwy ac yn weithredol

as a railway operator. Therefore, sadly, the motion today does not ask for that, and we would welcome clarity from your side as to what your intention actually is. We will support this motion if you intend the exploration of Network Rail. However, if it was your intention to consider train operators and the franchise, we will ask you to withdraw the motion as it does not reflect this. As I have mentioned, if this motion is about railway ownership, it will be a very short exploration, as we already have a not-for-profit owner of the railway network. I am once again surprised that Plaid Cymru did not realise that and would hope in future that it gives greater consideration to this Chamber in its submission of topics for debate. Quite frankly, it is somewhat confusing. I do not wish to be unkind about it, but I am not entirely clear as to where you are coming from.

gredadwy fel gweithredwr rheilffyrdd. Felly, yn anffodus, nid yw’r cynnig heddiw’n gofyn am hynny, a byddem yn croesawu eglurhad gan eich plaid ynghylch beth yn union yw eich bwriad. Byddwn yn cefnogi’r cynnig hwn os archwilio Network Rail yw eich bwriad. Ond os eich bwriad oedd ystyried gweithredwyr trenau a’r fasnachfraint, gofynnwn ichi dynnu eich cynnig yn ôl gan nad yw’n adlewyrchu hynny. Fel y dywedais, os yw’r cynnig hwn yn ymwneud â pherchnogaeth y rheilffyrdd, bydd yn drafodaeth fer iawn, gan fod perchennog y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd eisoes yn gwmni dielw. Rwyf yn synnu unwaith eto nad oedd Plaid Cymru’n sylweddoli hynny a gobeithiaf y bydd yn y dyfodol yn rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth i’r Siambr hon wrth gyflwyno pynciau dadleuon. A dweud y gwir, mae’n peri rhywfaint o ddryswch. Nid wyf am fod yn angharedig, ond nid wyf yn siŵr iawn o ble yr ydych yn dod.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Mae’n dda gennyf glywed bod ein cyfeillion ar draws y Siambr yn talu sylw manwl i’r polisïau sy’n cael eu paratoi gan Blaid Cymru’r dyddiau hyn i geisio dylanwadu ar Lywodraeth Cymru ac, yn wir, i geisio paratoi yn yr achos hwn at 2018, pan fydd angen adnewyddu’r fasnachfraint ar gyfer rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru a’r Mers—nid wyf yn hoff o’r gair ‘gororau’, neu’r gair ‘trawsffiniol’, ond rwy’n hoff iawn o’r hen air ‘Mers’, neu ‘*Marches*’, rhag ofn bod unrhyw anhawster ynglŷn â chyfieithu’r gair.

Lord Elis-Thomas: I am pleased to hear that our colleagues across the Chamber are paying detailed attention to the policies being prepared by Plaid Cymru these days to bring influence to bear on the Welsh Government and, indeed, in this case, to try to prepare for 2018, when the franchise will need to be renewed for the railway in Wales and the Marches—I do not like the words ‘*gororau*’ or ‘*trawsffiniol*’—‘cross border’—but I am very fond of the old word ‘*Mers*’, or ‘Marches’, in case there is any difficulty with the translation of the word.

Mae’n bwysig imi drafod y pwnc hwn fel, o bosibl, y defnyddiwr rheilffyrdd mwyaf cyson yn y Siambr hon—yn wythnosol, hynny yw, os nad yn ddyddiol. Mae’r defnydd hwnnw o’r rheilffyrdd a’r cerdyn sydd gennyf i ganiatáu imi deithio yn rhatach oherwydd fy hynafiaeth—oed hŷn, rwy’n trio ei ddweud—wedi rhoi profiad newydd imi fel defnyddiwr, yn hytrach na theithiwr ar hyd ffyrdd, ond mae hefyd wedi rhoi profiad imi o anawsterau defnyddiwr, ac am rai o’r materion hynny rwyf am siarad.

In discussing this issue it is important to me as, possibly, the most regular rail user in this Chamber—on a weekly basis, if not on a daily basis. That use of the railway and the card that I have that allows me concessionary travel because of my antiquity—my seniority, I am trying to say—has given me new experience as a rail user, rather than a road user, but it has also given me an insight into the difficulties faced by passengers, and those are the issues that I want to discuss today.

Os ydym am greu cyfundrefn rheilffyrdd newydd yng Nghymru, yn fwy pwysig na’r berchnogaeth imi yw effeithlonrwydd y cysylltiadau a hwylustod y drafnidiaeth. Mae’r sefyllfa lle nad yw bysiau yn gallu

If we want to create a new railway regime in Wales, to me, more important than ownership are the efficiency of the connections and the ease of use of the transport. The situation where buses cannot interlink conveniently

cwrdd â threnau ar draws Cymru yn hwylus yn rhywbeth sydd yn gwbl annerbyniol. Mae’r gwelliant sydd wedi bod mewn gwasanaethau yn ddiweddar yn y canolbarth yn rhywbeth rwy’n ei groesawu’n fawr, ond mae llawer o’r diolch am hynny i gwmni a wobrwywyd yn ddiweddar am fod yn gwmni bysys deniadol a llawn antur o ran ei ddarpariaeth yng Nghymru, sef cwmni bysys Lloyds Coaches o Fachynlleth. Mae’r cwmni hwnnw wedi llwyddo mewn nifer o ddatblygiadau. Er enghraifft, gellir cyfnewid tocynnau rhwng rheilffordd y Cambrian a’r cwmni bysys. Dylwn fod yn gallu gwneud hynny’n effeithiol drwy Gymru gan symud at fodd o gydrannu tocynnau ar y bysiau a’r trenau yn hwylus. Rhaid i ni geisio darparu gwasanaethau sy’n gweithio ar y cyd ar draws Cymru, o’r gorllewin i’r dwyrain, tra ar yr un pryd yn cynnig dewisiadau Cymru gyfan, gan gynnwys y Mers, ar gyfer teithio hir amser.

with trains across Wales is completely unacceptable. The improvement in services recently in mid Wales is something that I warmly welcome, but much of the thanks for that is due to the work of a company that received an award recently as an attractive and innovative company in terms of its provision in Wales, namely Lloyds Coaches from Machynlleth. That company has succeeded in many developments. For example, it is possible to use tickets on both the Cambrian railway and the buses. We should be able to do that effectively throughout Wales by moving towards a system of using tickets conveniently on both buses and trains. We must also endeavour to provide services that work collaboratively across Wales, from west to east, while simultaneously providing all-Wales options, including the Marches, for long-distance travel.

Felly, carwn gyflwyno i’r Senedd heddiw un o’m breuddwydion, sef dal trên o Bwllheli yn y bore—gallaf ddal un yn barod i Birmingham International bob dwy awr—ond carwn ddal un o leiaf unwaith yn y dydd a fyddai’n mynd a fi i Gaerdydd, neu hyd yn oed i Gaerfyrddin neu Aberdaugleddau, ac yn ôl. Mae’n bwysig ein bod yn creu rhwydwaith sy’n parhau i gyfuno Cymru. Pan gyrhaeddaf Aberdaugleddau, dylai fod llong neu fws yno a fyddai’n fy ngalluogi i gyrraedd Crymych yn hwylus—nid ar long, ond ar fws. Mae cyfundrefn briodol o gysylltiadau yr un mor bwysig i ddefnyddwyr â pherchnogaeth y fasnachfraint.

Therefore, I would like to present to the Senedd today one of my dreams, namely, that I could catch a train from Pwllheli in the morning—I can already catch one every two hours to Birmingham International—but, at least once during the day, I want to board a train that would take me to Cardiff, or even to Carmarthen or Milford Haven and back. I do think that it is important that we create a network that continues to unite Wales. When I reach Milford Haven, there should be a ferry or a bus there that would enable me to reach Crymych conveniently—not on a ferry, but a bus, of course. An appropriate system of connections is as important to passengers as the ownership of the franchise.

Un peth arall, ni fyddwch yn synnu, Lywydd, i glywed bod gennyf ddiddordeb mewn teithio drwy Gymru gan fwyta’n iach. Mae’n ddrwg gennyf ddweud nad yw hyn yn bosibl ar hyn o bryd. O dan y fasnachfraint bresennol a’r trolïau poenus—

One other thing, you will not be surprised to hear, Presiding Officer, that I am interested in travelling across Wales while eating healthily. I am sorry to say that this is not possible at present. Under the current franchise, these wearisome trollies—

Andrew R.T. Davies: I am grateful to the Member for giving way. The motion we have before us today talks about the railway network. We would all agree with what you have to say, but the motion specifically talks about the network and we have not really heard anything about the network itself.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i’r Aelod am ildio. Mae’r cynnig sydd ger ein bron heddiw’n sôn am y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd. Byddem i gyd yn cytuno â’r hyn a ddywedwch, ond mae’r cynnig yn sôn yn benodol am y rhwydwaith ac nid ydym mewn gwirionedd wedi clywed dim am y rhwydwaith ei hun.

Lord Elis-Thomas: I am afraid that I will speak in the way which I speak. I assume that I am in order by tangentially relating this to the motion.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Mae arnaf ofn y siaradaf yn y ffordd y siaradaf. Tybiaf fy mod mewn trefn drwy gysylltu hyn yn ymylol â'r cynnig.

The Presiding Officer: It is your time and you can use it as you wish, although you are running out of it.

Y Llywydd: Eich amser chi yw hwn a chewch ei ddefnyddio fel y mynnwch, ond mae'ch amser yn prinhau.

Lord Elis-Thomas: I am about to sit down. So, I am afraid that my discourse upon the quality of the food off the trolley on the current Arriva trains franchise will have to wait for another day.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Rwyf ar fin eistedd. Felly, mae arnaf ofn y bydd yn rhaid i'm hymgom ar ansawdd y bwyd o'r trolïau ar fasnachfraint trenau Arriva ar hyn o bryd aros tan rhywbryd eto.

Vaughan Gething: I too welcome the opportunity to take part in this debate. I have a particular interest as a rail network user, and as the chair of the cross-party group on rail and a member of the cross-party group on co-operatives and mutuals, which both have an interest in the topic under discussion today. We all know that there is an imminent decision on the electrification of the Valleys lines and the Swansea main line, which is due within the next week and a half. We know that a significant challenge faces us about the shape and structure of the new franchise, which is due in 2018. We also know that full electrification of the Valleys network and the south Wales main line should allow us to have a more effective franchise going forward. For some people, 2018 may seem like a long time away, but, in reality, it really is not that far. If we are thinking about options, the preparatory work that we would need to do for that new franchise would really need to be done in this Assembly term.

Vaughan Gething: Rwyf finnau'n croesawu'r cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb neilltuol fel un sy'n defnyddio'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd, ac fel cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar y rheilffyrdd ac aelod o'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar gwmnïau cydweithredol a chydfuddiannol, sydd ill dau â diddordeb yn yr hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw. Rydym i gyd yn gwybod bod penderfyniad ar fin dod ar drydaneiddio llinellau'r Cymoedd a phrif linell Abertawe, a hynny yn ystod yr wythnos a hanner nesaf. Gwyddom fod cryn her yn ein hwynebu o ran ffurf a strwythur y fasnachfraint newydd, a ddaw yn 2018. Gwyddom hefyd y dylai trydaneiddio llinell y Cymoedd a phrif linell De Cymru yn llawn ein galluogi i sicrhau masnachfraint fwy effeithiol at y dyfodol. I rai pobl, efallai y bydd 2018 yn teimlo'n bell i ffwrdd, ond, mewn gwirionedd, nid yw mor bell â hynny. Os ydym yn meddwl am opsiynau, byddai angen gwneud y gwaith paratoi ar gyfer y fasnachfraint newydd yn ystod tymor y Cynulliad hwn.

I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate as the Welsh Labour Government has already committed to exploring alternative, not-for-profit and not-for-dividend models of ownership, as set out in our Assembly manifesto. I welcome the broad support that Plaid Cymru provides for that. Our manifesto pledges on the future of the franchise are on page 15 of our manifesto. On page 16, our manifesto makes it clear that we wish to see greater accountability to the Welsh Government from Network Rail in Wales. I accept some of the comments made by the

Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon gan fod Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru eisoes wedi ymrwymo i archwilio modelau gwahanol, dielw a di-ddifidend o berchnogaeth, fel a nodir yn ein maniffesto ar gyfer y Cynulliad. Croesawaf y gefnogaeth eang y mae Plaid Cymru'n ei rhoi i hynny. Nodir ein haddewidion maniffesto ar ddyfodol y fasnachfraint ar dudalen 15 ein maniffesto. Ar dudalen 16, mae ein maniffesto'n datgan yn glir ein bod am weld Network Rail yng Nghymru'n fwy atebol i Lywodraeth Cymru. Derbyniaf rai o sylwadau siaradwyr y

Conservative speakers about the difference between the track and the rolling stock and the franchise. However, there is no real difficulty in discussing the alternative models. Network Rail is a not-for-dividend company as a matter of fact. However, I will confine most of my comments to the future of the franchise because I think that there is an urgent need to change the current models of ownership of the rail network.

Ceidwadwyr am y gwahaniaeth rhwng y cledrau a'r cerbydau a'r fasnachfraint. Er hynny, nid oes anhawster gwirioneddol ynglŷn â thrafod modelau eraill. Cwmni di-ddifidend yw Network Rail mewn gwirionedd. Serch hynny, cyfyngaf y rhan fwyaf o'm sylwadau i ddyfodol y fasnachfraint oherwydd credaf fod angen dybryd inni newid modelau perchnogaeth cyfredol y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd.

It is pretty clear that the UK rail industry will continue to require significant public subsidy. In fact, that is seen as set to increase over the medium term according to the Department for Transport. The problem is that the industry does not allow a real influence on the part of the user and the citizen who support it, and trying to get actual figures on the amount of subsidy going into each company and how that affects the profits and dividends they declare is actually incredibly difficult. However, we know as a matter of course that dividends will continue to be paid out by franchise companies based on the current model. Shareholder value, not public value and the quality of the network and the passenger experience, is the overriding factor and driver.

Mae'n eithaf amlwg y bydd yn dal i fod angen cryn dipyn o gymhorthdal cyhoeddus ar ddiwydiant rheilffyrdd y DU. Yn wir, rhagwelir y bydd hynny'n cynyddu dros y tymor canolig yn ôl yr Adran Drafnidiaeth. Y broblem yw nad yw'r diwydiant yn caniatáu i'r defnyddwyr a'r dinasyddion sy'n ei gefnogi gael dylanwad gwirioneddol, ac mae'n hynod anodd cael gafael ar ffigurau gwirioneddol ar faint o gymhorthdal a roddir i bob cwmni a sut y mae hynny'n effeithio ar yr elw a'r difidendau y maent yn eu datgan. Er hynny, gwyddom i sicrwydd y bydd difidendau'n dal i gael eu talu gan gwmnïau masnachfraint ar sail y model cyfredol. Y gwerth i'r cyfranddalwyr, ac nid gwerth i'r cyhoedd ac ansawdd y rhwydwaith a phrofiad y teithwyr, yw'r ffactor pwysicaf a'r prif sbardun.

Professor Stuart Cole has set out four potential options for a future network, if we receive the necessary devolution and the ability to shape the franchise here in Wales. The first is to carry on as we are, which is clearly not the view of Welsh Labour and the Welsh Government, as we made very clear in our manifesto. Another option is a not-for-dividend company, where all the risk stays with the company—an alternative Glas Cymru model, if you like. Another option is a wholly owned model, owned by the Welsh Government. As Alun Ffred set out, there are potential difficulties with that given European Union procurement and competition rules. Another alternative is a fully co-operative rail franchise model, either owned by employees or, potentially, by customers. There is no reason at all why, from an organisational point of view, we should not have something that looks like John Lewis, a worker-owned co-operative, running a railway very successfully.

Mae'r Athro Stuart Cole wedi nodi pedwar opsiwn posibl ar gyfer rhwydwaith yn y dyfodol, os cawn y datganoli sydd ei angen a'r gallu i lunio'r fasnachfraint yma yng Nghymru. Y cyntaf yw parhau fel ag y mae pethau, ac nid dyna farn Llafur Cymru na Llywodraeth Cymru, wrth reswm, fel y datganwyd yn glir yn ein maniffesto. Opsiwn arall fyddai cwmni di-ddifidend, lle mae'r risg i gyd yn aros gyda'r cwmni—model Glas Cymru amgen, os hoffwch. Model arall fyddai model perchnogaeth lwyr, ym mherchnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru. Fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred, gallai fod anawsterau yn hynny o beth oherwydd rheolau caffael a chystadlu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Byddai model masnachfraint rheilffyrdd llwyr gydweithredol yn ddewis arall, naill ai ym mherchnogaeth y gweithwyr neu, o bosibl, y cwsmeriaid. Nid oes reswm yn y byd, o safbwynt cyfundrefnol, pam na allai rhywbeth sy'n edrych yn debyg i John Lewis, cwmni cydweithredol ym mherchnogaeth y gweithwyr, redeg rheilffordd yn

llwyddiannus iawn.

There is this point about what sort of structure would give the public a real stake in the future of the franchise and the way in which our rail services look. However, the point is that we should really be looking only at what will deliver the maximum value for the citizen, in terms of money and the passenger experience. At the moment, many of our trains are not places where we would wish to spend a great deal of time. We need to improve the rolling stock itself, the frequency of trains and their speed. In particular, we need to improve the connectivity—the point that Dafydd Elis-Thomas was making—between rail and bus services. There is precious little point in having a fantastic rail service that no-one can actually get to and use in any useful way. I think that there is a real case for a co-operative or mutual solution, but that has to be based not just on people who know co-operative and mutual businesses but real expertise from the rail industry about how to make it work.

Mae pwynt ynghylch pa fath o strwythur fyddai'n rhoi rhan wirioneddol i'r cyhoedd yn nyfodol y fasnachfraint a'r ffordd y mae ein gwasanaethau rheilffordd yn edrych. Serch hynny, y pwynt yw y dylem fod yn canolbwyntio'n unig ar beth fydd yn rhoi'r gwerth mwyaf i'r dinasyddion, yn ariannol ac o ran profiad y teithiwr. Ar hyn o bryd, mae llawer o'n trenau'n llefydd lle na fyddem am dreulio llawer iawn o amser ynddynt. Mae angen inni wella'r cerbydau eu hunain, amlder y trenau a'u cyflymder. Yn arbennig, mae angen inni wella'r cysylltedd—sef pwynt Dafydd Elis-Thomas—rhwng gwasanaethau bysiau a threnau. Nid oes fawr o ddiben bod â gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd rhagorol na all neb ei gyrraedd a'i ddefnyddio mewn ffordd fuddiol. Credaf fod achos cryf dros ateb cydweithredol neu gydfuddiannol, ond rhaid i hynny fod yn seiliedig nid yn unig ar bobl sy'n gwybod am fusnesau cydweithredol a chydfuddiannol ond hefyd ar arbenigedd gwirioneddol yn y diwydiant rheilffyrdd am sut i wneud iddo weithio.

That is why I am delighted to already be working with the Co-operative Party and others in the rail industry, including some of the rail trade unions, on how to make a rail franchise work on a co-operative or mutual model that can deliver for workers in the industry, passengers and, significantly, for the taxpayer to ensure that money does not continue to leak into dividend payments to shareholders, so that we see a fully improved rail network for users in Wales.

Dyna pam y mae'n dda iawn gennyf fy mod eisoes yn cydweithio â'r Blaid Gydweithredol ac eraill yn y diwydiant rheilffyrdd, gan gynnwys rhai o undebau llafur y rheilffyrdd, ar sut i wneud i fasnachfraint rheilffyrdd weithio ar fodel cydweithredol neu gydfuddiannol a all gyflawni i weithwyr y diwydiant, i deithwyr ac, yn arbennig, i drethdalwyr er mwyn sicrhau nad oes arian yn dal i ollwng i daliadau difidend i gyfranddalwyr, ac er mwyn inni gael gweld rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd wedi'i wella'n llwyr i ddefnyddwyr Cymru.

Eluned Parrott: This afternoon seems to have turned into a pedantry competition and, under the circumstances, I think that it would be churlish of me not to join in. I listened with great interest to the two opening speakers because I must confess that I was baffled by the reasons behind this debate and, indeed, the amendment this afternoon. Now, I understand, but I have to say that what has been said in the Chamber does not accord with what has been written down in the motion and the amendment. You have talked

Eluned Parrott: Ymddengys fod y prynhawn yma wedi troi'n gystadleuaeth bedantiaeth ac, o dan yr amgylchiadau, credaf y byddai'n anfoesgar imi beidio ag ymuno â hi. Gwrandewais â diddordeb mawr ar y ddau siaradwr cyntaf oherwydd rhaid imi gyfaddef fy mod mewn penbleth lwyr ynglŷn â'r rhesymau dros y ddadl hon ac, yn wir, y gwelliant y prynhawn yma. Nawr, rwyf yn deall, ond rhaid imi ddweud nad yw'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn y Siambr yn cyd-fynd â'r hyn sydd wedi'i ysgrifennu yn y cynnig a'r

extensively about franchises, services, passenger experience, train operating companies, and even food. All we needed for a full house was the subject of toilets. However, what has not really been discussed by the proposers of this motion is the actual railway network, as named in the motion. A dictionary definition of the word 'network' is,

gwelliant. Rydych wedi siarad cryn dipyn am fasnachfreintiau, gwasanaethau, profiad y teithiwr, cwmnïau trenau, a bwyd hyd yn oed. Y cwbl oedd ei angen i goroni'r cyfan oedd sôn am doiledau. Er hynny, yr hyn nad yw wedi'i drafod mewn gwirionedd gan gynigwyr y cynnig hwn yw'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd ei hun, yn unol â'r hyn a nodir yn y cynnig. Diffiniad y geiriadur o'r gair 'network' yw

'A system of lines or channels that cross or interconnect'.

'A system of lines or channels that cross or interconnect'.

For example, a railway network. In short, the term 'railway network' is the accepted industry term for the track and infrastructure, and I am surprised that several people in the Chamber who are spokespeople on the subject do not know that. However, thanks to our privatisation model, this is very different to a discussion about the services that run on that network. If you do not believe that this is necessarily true, I have had amendments on rail franchises and services ruled out of order because they are not pertinent to the content of this debate. So, here is where I have a problem: you ask us to consider a not-for-profit model for the railway network. As we have already heard, the railway network is run and managed by Network Rail. The clue is in the name. Network Rail already is a not-for-profit company, so why do you want us to explore alternative models when the one we already have is the one you say you want?

Er enghraifft, rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd. Felly, 'rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd' yw'r term a ddefnyddir yn y diwydiant ar gyfer y cledrau a'r isadeiledd, ac rwyf yn synnu nad yw llawer o'r bobl sydd yn y Siambr sy'n llefarwyr ar y mater hwn yn gwybod hynny. Serch hynny, diolch i'n model preifateiddio, mae hon yn drafodaeth wahanol iawn i drafodaeth am y gwasanaethau sy'n rhedeg ar y rhwydwaith. Os na chredwch fod hynny o anghenraid yn wir, cyflwynais welliannau ar fasnachfreintiau a gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd y dyfarnwyd eu bod allan o drefn am nad oeddent yn berthnasol i gynnwys y ddadl hon. Felly, dyma lle mae gen i broblem: gofynnwch inni ystyried model dielw ar gyfer y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd. Fel y clywsom eisoes, Network Rail sy'n rhedeg ac yn rheoli'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd. Mae'r cliw yn yr enw. Mae Network Rail eisoes yn gwmni dielw, felly pam ydych chi am inni edrych ar fodelau eraill pan fo'r model sydd gennym eisoes yn gwneud yr hyn y dywedwch sydd ei eisiau arnoch?

5.45 p.m.

By the same logic, I have to say that the Conservative spokesperson does not seem to have noticed that their amendment falls at the same hurdle. In recognising the important role of the owners of the railway network—

Yn ôl yr un rhesymeg, rhaid imi ddweud nad yw llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr fel petai wedi sylwi bod eu gwelliant hwythau'n wynebu'r un broblem. Wrth gydnabod rôl bwysig perchnogion y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd—

The Presiding Officer: Will you take an intervention?

Y Llywydd: A wnewch chi gymryd ymyriad?

Eluned Parrott: Go ahead.

Eluned Parrott: Gwnaf.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I am grateful to my colleague from South Wales Central for taking the intervention. I would make the

Andrew R.T. Davies: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelod o Ganol De Cymru am ganiatáu imi ymyrryd. Hoffwn ddweud i

point that we found ourselves in the same situation as you in submitting amendments that were ruled out of order, so I join you in finding it bizarre to see the way that the debate is going. We should be focusing on the network, which is what is in the motion before us.

ninnau hefyd ein cael ein hunain yn yr un sefyllfa â chi wrth gyflwyno gwelliannau y dyfarnwyd eu bod allan o drefn, felly rwyf finnau, fel chithau, yn ei chael yn rhyfedd gweld i ba gyfeiriad y mae'r ddadl yn mynd. Dylem fod yn canolbwyntio ar y rhwydwaith, sef yr hyn sydd yn y cynnig ger ein bron.

Eluned Parrott: Indeed, but your amendment does not make any sense, because Network Rail, as has been said by the spokesperson, has no shareholders and therefore no owners. The public is the owner of the UK's rail network. I hate to give credit to the last Labour Government at Westminster, but it effectively renationalised the rail infrastructure in this country, so I am fascinated as to which individual among the millions of taxpayers in the UK you want to single out for recognition as having a special role in terms of the future direction of the rail network.

Eluned Parrott: Yn wir, ond nid yw eich gwelliant yn gwneud synnwyr, gan nad oes gan Network Rail gyfranddalwyr, fel y dywedodd y llefarydd, ac felly nid oes ganddo berchnogion. Y cyhoedd sydd biau rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd y DU. Mae'n gas gennyf roi clod i'r Llywodraeth Lafur ddiwethaf yn San Steffan, ond aeth hi ati i bob pwrpas i ailwladoli isadeiledd y rheilffyrdd yn y wlad hon, felly bydd yn ddiddorol gweld pa unigolyn ymhlith y miliynau o drethdalwyr yn y DU yr ydych am roi cydnabyddiaeth neilltuol iddo am fod â rôl arbennig o safbwynt cyfeiriad y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn y dyfodol.

If the Plaid Cymru spokesperson had come here and said that Plaid Cymru would like rail operating companies to be run on a not-for-profit basis, I would have had some sympathy with that. Although I would say that Arriva Trains Wales has one of the best reliability records in the UK, and trying to change the franchise system in favour of not-for-profit companies would be fraught with legal issues, I do not think that that is a reason not to have the discussion. It is something that I would be very open to. If he had come here and said that he would like the Welsh railway network to be devolved, I might well have agreed, although I would also have recognised the point that has been made about Network Rail already having created a Wales division, and I would query whether complete devolution of the rail network would have hampered our chances of getting the service from London to Cardiff, and hopefully onward to Swansea, electrified. Our transport networks do not stop at our borders, and neither can our thinking. However, the Plaid Cymru spokesperson did not do that today. He failed to frame this debate accurately. He failed to recognise the difference between the railways infrastructure—the network—and the services that run on it. He even failed to distinguish between the several different train

Pe bai llefarydd Plaid Cymru wedi dod yma a dweud yr hoffai Plaid Cymru weld y cwmnïau rheilffyrdd yn cael eu rhedeg ar sail ddielw, byddai rhywfaint o gydymdeimlad gennyf â hynny. Er y credaf fod record Trenau Arriva Cymru o safbwynt dibynadwyedd gyda'r gorau yn y DU, ac y byddai ceisio newid y system fasnachfraint o blaid cwmnïau dielw'n llawn problemau cyfreithiol, nid wyf o'r farn fod hynny'n rheswm dros beidio â chael y drafodaeth. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn agored iawn iddo. Pe bai wedi dod yma a dweud ei fod am weld datganoli rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd Cymru, efallai'n wir y byddwn wedi cytuno, er y byddwn yn cydnabod y pwynt sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud bod Network Rail eisoes wedi creu is-adran i Gymru, a byddwn yn holi tybed a fyddai datganoli'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn llwyr wedi bod yn rhwystr inni o ran trydaneiddio'r gwasanaeth o Lundain i Gaerdydd, ac ymlaen i Abertawe, gobeithio. Nid yw ein rhwydweithiau trafnidiaeth yn dod i ben ar ein ffiniau, ac ni all ein syniadau wneud hynny chwaith. Ond nid dyna a wnaeth llefarydd Plaid Cymru heddiw. Methodd â chyflwyno'r ddadl hon yn gywir. Methodd â chydnabod y gwahaniaeth rhwng isadeiledd y rheilffyrdd—y rhwydwaith—a'r gwasanaethau sy'n rhedeg arno. Methodd

operating companies that run franchises in Wales—Arriva Trains Wales, First Great Western and Virgin. All we have heard about is one homogenous Welsh franchise. That franchise does not exist. Instead, we are being asked to vote to create what already exists. You have discussed a homogenous entity of a rail operating company and franchise that does not exist; Arriva Trains Wales, First Great Western and Virgin all operate services in Wales. It is just a nonsense.

hyd yn oed â gwahaniaethu rhwng y gwahanol gwmnïau trenau sy'n rhedeg masnachfreintiau yng Nghymru—Trenau Arriva Cymru, First Great Western a Virgin. Y cwbl yr ydym wedi clywed sôn amdano yw un fasnachfraint Gymreig unffurf. Nid yw'r fasnachfraint honno'n bodoli. Yn lle hynny, gofynnir inni bleidleisio i greu rhywbeth sydd eisoes yn bodoli. Rydych wedi trafod cwmni trenau a masnachfraint fel endid unffurf nad yw'n bodoli; mae Trenau Arriva Cymru, First Great Western a Virgin i gyd yn rhedeg gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Dwli yw hyn.

Bethan Jenkins: I will let Alun Ffred Jones deal with the issues that people have raised. [*Interruption.*] Yes—'follow that'.

Bethan Jenkins: Gadawaf i Alun Ffred Jones drafod y materion y mae pobl wedi'u codi. [*Torri ar draws.*] Ie—'dilynwch hynny'.

This is a timely debate. Passenger rail services are of huge importance to all of our communities in Wales. In my region of South Wales West there are three significant commuter streams: Swansea, Port Talbot and Bridgend. We have heard today from the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science that city regions are being pursued as a blueprint for economic and social development. It is obvious that transport will play a huge role in any city regions that might emerge in Wales, and getting the rail franchise right is one of the single most important issues when it comes to enabling people to access jobs and training.

Dyma ddadl amserol. Mae gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd i deithwyr yn aruthrol bwysig i bob un o'n cymunedau yng Nghymru. Yn fy rhanbarth i, sef Gorllewin De Cymru, mae tair ffrwd gymudo bwysig: Abertawe, Port Talbot a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Clywsom heddiw gan y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth fod dinas-ranbarthau'n cael eu defnyddio'n lasbrint ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a chymdeithasol. Mae'n amlwg y bydd trafnidiaeth yn chwarae rhan fawr iawn yn unrhyw ddinas-ranbarthau a allai ddatblygu yng Nghymru, ac mae sicrhau bod y fasnachfraint rheilffyrdd yn iawn yn un o'r materion pwysicaf oll o ran galluogi pobl i gael swyddi a hyfforddiant.

We are seeking consensus on ideas that we floated when we were in Government. We may be in opposition now, but we still have many ideas. In my region in particular, I know for a fact that all of the problems Ieuan Wyn Jones outlined around the current franchise are being felt on the ground. Overcrowding is a serious issue and deters people from using public transport. In addition, fares are simply too high. For a modal shift from car to train to happen, rail fares need to be more affordable than travelling by car. With regard to the car, there is still the convenience factor, which needs to be considered. For the train to become more attractive than the car we need to see more affordable fares that can compensate for that.

Gofynnwn am gonsensws ar syniadau a awgrymwyd gennym pan oeddem yn y Llywodraeth. Efallai mai gwrthblaid ydym ni nawr, ond mae gennym lawer o syniadau o hyd. Yn fy rhanbarth i'n arbennig, gwn yn bendant fod llawer o'r problemau a amlinellwyd gan Ieuan Wyn Jones ynghylch y fasnachfraint gyfredol yn cael eu teimlo ar lawr gwlad. Mae gorlenwi'n fater difrifol ac yn atal pobl rhag defnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Yn ogystal, mae'r prisiau'n rhy uchel o lawer. Er mwyn sicrhau newid moddol o'r car i'r trên, rhaid i docynnau trên fod yn fwy fforddiadwy na theithio yn y car. O safbwynt y car, mae'n dal i fod yn gyfleus, a rhaid ystyried hynny. Er mwyn gwneud y trên yn fwy deniadol na'r car rhaid inni weld tocynnau mwy fforddiadwy a all wneud iawn am hynny.

My concern is that, at the UK level, the debate around railways has resulted in suggestions that there are too many services. This was what came out of the McNulty report. In Wales, however, this is not the case. Our challenges are not that we have too many services, but that we do not have the capacity to meet demand. When Ieuan Wyn Jones said as Minister that we wanted a not-for-profit dividend model to develop the rail franchise in Wales, it was so that the operating profit could be ploughed back into the network in order to deliver extra capacity. Perhaps there could also be an agreement linked to lowering fares, if a future Welsh Government wanted to make the commitment through an additional subsidy, for example. We do not know what kind of resources would be available to do that, but I feel strongly that the option should at least be on the table.

Fy mhryder i yw fod y ddadl am y rheilffyrdd, ar lefel y DU, wedi esgor ar awgrymiadau fod gormod o wasanaethau. Dyna a ddaeth allan o adroddiad McNulty. Ond yng Nghymru, nid dyna'r sefyllfa. Yr her i ni yw nid fod gennym ormod o wasanaethau, ond nad oes gennym gapasiti i ateb y galw. Pan ddywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yn ystod ei gyfnod yn Weinidog ein bod am weld model di-ddifidend i ddatblygu masnachfraint y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru, roedd hynny er mwyn i'r elw gweithredu gael ei roi yn ôl i mewn i'r rhwydwaith er mwyn creu rhagor o gapasiti. Efallai y gellid creu cytundeb hefyd yn gysylltiedig â gostwng prisiau, pe bai Llywodraeth Cymru yn y dyfodol am wneud yr ymrwymiad drwy gymhorthdal ychwanegol, er enghraifft. Ni wyddom pa fath o adnoddau fyddai ar gael i wneud hynny, ond credaf yn gryf y dylai'r opsiwn fod ar y bwrdd, o leiaf.

Questions remain unanswered by the Welsh Government—questions that it must get to grips with. For me, a key question is whether the Welsh Government would itself have to establish a company to bid for the franchise, or whether it could invite interested parties to set up a company independently. I would also be interested in knowing whether we need any new powers, particularly over rail infrastructure and bus regulation, to ensure that any new service is fully integrated across all modes of public transport. We should be willing to wait for those answers, as long as the Minister can assure us that work has started and that her department and Carl Sargeant's department will get to grips with this work today.

Mae cwestiynau'n dal heb eu hateb gan Lywodraeth Cymru—cwestiynau y mae'n rhaid iddi fynd i'r afael â hwy. I mi, un o'r cwestiynau allweddol yw a fyddai'n rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru ei hunan sefydlu cwmni i gynnig am y fasnachfraint, neu a fyddai modd iddi wahodd carfanau â diddordeb i sefydlu cwmni'n annibynnol. Byddai'n dda gennyf wybod hefyd a oes angen pwerau newydd arnom, yn arbennig dros isadeiledd y rheilffyrdd a rheoleiddio bysiau, i sicrhau bod unrhyw wasanaeth newydd yn gwbl integredig ar draws pob math o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Dylem fod yn barod i aros am yr atebion hynny, cyn belled ag y gall y Gweinidog ein sicrhau bod y gwaith wedi dechrau ac y bydd ei hadran hi ac adran Carl Sargeant yn mynd i'r afael â'r gwaith hwnnw heddiw.

I hope that Alun Ffred will address some of the concerns later in today's debate. We want to look at different models, and Plaid Cymru's preferred model would be the not-for-dividend approach with a body similar, as Vaughan Gething said earlier, to Glas Cymru. At this stage, we need to be looking at these options. Whatever is agreed in 2018 will be with the Welsh travelling public for a very long time, if previous contract lengths are anything to go by. We must therefore take this opportunity to move towards a rail model

Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd Alun Ffred yn trafod rhai o'r pryderon yn nes ymlaen yn y ddadl heddiw. Rydym am edrych ar wahanol fodelau, a'r model a ffefrir gan Blaid Cymru yw'r model di-ddifidend gyda chorff tebyg, fel y dywedodd Vaughan Gething yn gynharach, i Glas Cymru. Ar hyn o bryd, rhaid inni fod yn edrych ar yr opsiynau hyn. Bydd beth bynnag y cytunir arno yn 2018 yn aros gyda theithwyr Cymru am amser hir iawn, os bydd hyd y contract hwn yn debyg i rai blaenorol. Rhaid inni felly fanteisio ar y

that serves all the people of Wales.

cyfle hwn i symud tuag at fodel rheilffyrdd sy’n gwasanaethu holl bobl Cymru.

Keith Davies: Rwy’n falch o gefnogi’r ddadl heddiw, ac am y cyfle i siarad ynddi. Mae sawl un wedi codi rhai o’r pwyntiau yr oeddwn am eu codi fy hun.

Keith Davies: I am pleased to support the debate today, and to have the opportunity to speak in it. A number of speakers have raised some of the points that I wished to raise myself.

I mi, prif nod y ddadl yw mantais i’r teithwyr, a chytunaf yn llwyr mai hynny a ddylai ein taro’n gyntaf. Dyma un arwydd o fusnes llwyddiannus, ac, yn bwysicach, dyma’r egwyddor, y pwyslais a’r traddodiad cymunedol yng Nghymru. Daw’r canlynol yn fwy angenrheidiol wrth ystyried yr economi gyfredol: manteision i deithwyr, gwasanaethau dibynadwy, a model cynaliadwy.

To me, the main focus of the debate is the benefit to travellers, and I agree completely that that is what should strike us first. That is one sign of a successful business, and, more importantly, that is the principle, the emphasis and the community tradition in Wales. The following will become more essential given the current economy: benefits to travellers, a dependable service, and a sustainable model.

Mae’r trefniadau cyfredol ar waith hyd at 2018, fel y mae sawl wedi dweud. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Vaughan Gething, dywedir yn glir ym maniffesto Llafur y bydd achos cryf i ailystyried trefniadau llywodraethu pan ddaw’r adolygiad y flwyddyn nesaf. Caiff ystyriaeth o fasnachfraint ddi-ddifidend ei chynnwys mewn adolygiad. Rhaid nodi hefyd mai yn 2006 y trosglwyddwyd y cyfrifoldeb am reoli’r fasnachfraint i Gymru—dair blynedd ar ôl creu’r fasnachfraint gyfredol.

The current arrangements are in place until 2018, as a number of speakers have said. However, as Vaughan Gething said, it is clearly stated in Labour’s manifesto that there will be a strong case for reconsidering the governance arrangements at the time of the review next year. Consideration of a not-for-dividend franchise will be included in a review. It must also be noted that it was in 2006 that responsibility for managing the franchise was transferred to Wales—three years after the current franchise was created.

Ar drywydd arall, mae rheilffordd Calon Cymru yn rhedeg drwy Lanelli, a chynheliais ddigwyddiad i fforwm y rheilffordd yn y Senedd y llynedd i’w hyrwyddo. Rwy’n ymwybodol yn awr o gynlluniau presennol y fforwm i ymchwilio i’r posibilrwydd o greu rheolaeth fwy lleol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae’r cynllun yn gam cyntaf o weld opsiynau a manteision, felly ni fydd yn briodol i mi roi gormod o sylw arno heddiw cyn y bydd yr ymgynghoriad wedi gorffen a bod yr ail gam o greu adroddiad wedi ei gwblhau.

On another point, the Heart of Wales line runs through Llanelli, and I hosted an event for the railway forum in the Senedd last year to promote it. I am now aware of the forum’s current plans to look into the possibility of creating more local management. At present, the plan is at the first stage of looking at options and benefits, therefore it would not be appropriate for me to say too much about it today before the consultation has ended and the second stage of creating a report has been completed.

Ar hyn o bryd, cychwynnir y trên bore am 4.30 a.m. yn Abertawe, ac mae prinder o deithwyr ar adeg mor gynnar. Efallai y gall rheolaeth leol sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth yn rhedeg er lles teithwyr, ar yr amseroedd y mae eu hangen—boed hynny’n gymdeithasol neu i gyrraedd y gwaith mewn pryd. Lles teithwyr yw’r nod pwysicaf.

At present, the morning train from Swansea leaves at 4.30 a.m., and there are few passengers at such an early hour. Perhaps local management could ensure that the service runs for the benefit of passengers, and at the required times—whether for social reasons or to get to work on time. The welfare of passengers is the most important goal.

Gyda hyn mewn cof, rhoddwyd £50,000 gan Lywodraeth Cymru i wella gorsaf drenau Llanelli, ac mae cynllun teithio'n rhatach ar reilffordd Calon Cymru, yn ogystal â chynlluniau yn y cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol i ddarparu gwasanaethau ychwanegol ar reilffordd Calon Cymru. Yn ôl ffigurau'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, bu codiad o 3 y cant y nifer y teithiau a oedd yn cychwyn neu'n gorffen yng Nghymru, o gymharu â lleihad o 0.64 y cant yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

With this in mind, the Welsh Government gave £50,000 to improve Llanelli train station, and there is a concessionary fare scheme on the Heart of Wales line, in addition to schemes in the national transport plan to provide additional services on the Heart of Wales line. According to the National Office for Statistics' figures, there was a 3% increase in the number of journeys beginning or ending in Wales, compared with a reduction of 0.64% in the United Kingdom.

Nid yw seilwaith rheilffyrdd yn fater wedi'i ddatganoli, felly cyfrifoldeb y glymblaid yn San Steffan ydyw. Galwodd Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru am fwy o ddweud yn y materion hyn, ond mae angen yr arian hefyd.

Railway infrastructure is not devolved, therefore it is the responsibility of the coalition in Westminster. The Welsh Labour Government has called for more say in these matters, but we also need the funding.

Yn fy marn i, beth sydd yn well nag eistedd yn ôl yn gyfforddus ar drên a gweld y byd yn pasio, yn hytrach na gyrru car am oriau? Er mwyn sylweddoli hyn, rhaid cael gwasanaethau trên sy'n ymatebol i ofynion y teithwyr. Dyma yw ein hagwedd ni yn y Blaid Lafur.

In my view, what is better than sitting back comfortably on a train and watching the world go by, instead of driving a car for hours? In order to realise this, we need train services that meet the needs of passengers. That is our view in the Labour Party.

The Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science (Edwina Hart): I welcome this opportunity, on behalf of the Government, to speak in this debate, because I think that it is timely with regard to the issues being discussed. Keith Davies mentioned in his contribution that we are talking about the benefit to passengers and the service in Wales. In many ways, that is why we will be supporting the Conservative amendment. They are talking about the importance of rail freight, because the owners of the rail freight network create the conditions that influence the flow of freight. Rail freight operators negotiate time slots for freight trains, which are contractually protected, and the owner has to strike a balance. It is also very important, from an environmental point of view, that we look at what freight we can move from road onto rail and how we can maximise the potential in that regard.

Y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth (Edwina Hart): Croesawaf y cyfle hwn, ar ran y Llywodraeth. i siarad yn y ddadl hon, oherwydd credaf ei bod yn amserol o ran y materion sy'n cael eu trafod. Dywedodd Keith Davies yn ei gyfraniad ein bod yn sôn am y manteision i'r teithwyr a'r gwasanaeth yng Nghymru. Mewn sawl ffordd, dyna pam y byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr. Maent yn sôn am bwysigrwydd cludo nwyddau ar y rheilffyrdd, oherwydd perchnogion y rhwydwaith cludo nwyddau ar y rheilffyrdd sy'n creu'r amodau sy'n dylanwadu ar lif cludo nwyddau. Bydd gweithredwyr cludo nwyddau ar y rheilffyrdd yn trafod slotiau amser i drenau cludo nwyddau, sydd wedi'u gwarchod o dan gontract, a rhaid i'r perchennog gadw'r ddysgl yn wastad. Mae'n bwysig iawn hefyd, o safbwynt amgylcheddol, ein bod yn edrych i weld pa nwyddau y gallwn eu symud oddi ar y ffyrdd ac ar y rheilffyrdd a sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r potensial i'r eithaf yn hynny o beth.

It is also correct that the contributions in the

Mae'n briodol hefyd fod y cyfraniadau yn y

Chamber have focused on our experience of travel and that of constituents and people who lobby us, because it is not just about who owns the railways and who does what, but about the experience that they have and what the Government going in understands that the experience should be. There is nothing more frustrating than when you can travel by train quite nicely, but then you go out of the door and find that the bus you needed to connect to left 30 minutes earlier, even though the train was on time. These are issues that we are expected to discuss in this Chamber.

Siambr wedi canolbwyntio ar ein profiad o deithio a phrofiadau ein hetholwyr a phobl sy'n ein lobïo, oherwydd mae hyn yn ymwneud nid yn unig â phwy sydd biau'r rheilffyrdd a phwy sy'n gwneud beth, ond hefyd â'r profiad a gânt a sut brofiad y mae'r Llywodraeth yn meddwl y dylai hwnnw fod. Nid oes dim yn fwy rhwystredig na theithio'n braf ar y trên, ac yna fynd allan drwy'r drws a gweld bod y bws oedd ei angen arnoch wedi gadael 30 munud ynghynt, er bod y trên yn brydlon. Dyma faterion y mae disgwyl inni eu trafod yn y Siambr hon.

When you take away some of the comments, I think that there is a general consensus in this debate about some of the issues that we want to develop in moving forward efficient passenger and customer-focused rail networks in Wales. It is very important that we have widespread support for that across civic society. People have already mentioned what people feel about the railways; they feel that they should be in public hands. They also feel that sometimes about water and other issues, but there is a feeling that, given all the money that has gone into the system, we should be seeing the rewards in terms of service delivery.

A hepgor rhai o'r sylwadau, credaf fod consensws cyffredinol yn y ddadl hon am rai o'r materion yr ydym am eu datblygu wrth fwrw ymlaen â rhwydweithiau rheilffyrdd effeithlon sy'n rhoi pwyslais ar y teithwyr a'r cwsmeriaid yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig iawn sicrhau bod cefnogaeth eang i hynny ar draws y gymdeithas sifig. Mae pobl eisoes wedi sôn am sut y mae pobl yn teimlo am y rheilffyrdd; teimlant y dylent fod mewn dwylo cyhoeddus. Teimlant felly hefyd weithiau am ddŵr a materion eraill, ond mae yna deimlad, o ystyried yr holl arian a aeth i mewn i'r system, y dylem fod yn gweld ffrwyth hyn oll o ran darparu gwasanaethau.

It is important that we start with a proper understanding of our powers in this area. The greater part of the responsibility for rail in Wales still rests with the Secretary of State for Transport in Westminster. It is not true to say that we have the power to award the Wales and borders franchise, but I do quite like the point about Wales and the marches that Lord Elis-Thomas made on that. We have an agreed set of shared responsibilities with the Secretary of State that relate to the current franchise. Crucially, we do not fund the franchise out of our block allocation; it is funded through a separately-negotiated grant from the Department for Transport. I would also ask Members to bear in mind that, as the franchise manager, the Welsh Government is also responsible for rail services for passengers in England and has a responsibility, therefore, to consult with the Secretary of State on matters that affect those services. We must not forget that the Wales and borders franchise operated by Arriva Trains Wales is only part of the rail system in

Mae'n bwysig deall yn iawn beth yw ein pwerau yn y maes hwn o'r cychwyn cyntaf. Yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth yn San Steffan sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am reilffyrdd Cymru o hyd. Nid yw'n wir dweud bod gennym rym i ddyfarnu masnachfraint Cymru a'r gororau, ond rwyf yn hoffi'r pwynt a wnaeth yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas ar Gymru a'r gororau. Mae gennym set o gyfrifoldebau y cytunwyd arnynt ac a rennir â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn ymwneud â'r fasnachfraint gyfredol. Un pwynt hollbwysig yw nad ydym yn ariannu'r fasnachfraint o'n dyraniad bloc; fe'i hariennir drwy grant a drefnir ar wahân â'r Adran Drafnidiaeth. Gofynnaf i Aelodau hefyd gofio bod Llywodraeth Cymru, fel rheolwr y fasnachfraint, hefyd yn gyfrifol am wasanaethau rheilffyrdd i deithwyr yn Lloegr a bod cyfrifoldeb arni, felly, i ymgynghori â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar faterion sy'n effeithio ar y gwasanaethau hynny. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio mai dim ond rhan o'r system reilffyrdd yng Nghymru yw

Wales; Virgin Trains, CrossCountry and First Great Western all provide important services in both Wales and England. Railways do not stop at borders; they carry on.

masnachfraint Cymru a’r gororau a weithredir gan Drenau Arriva Cymru; mae Virgin Trains, CrossCountry a First Great Western oll yn darparu gwasanaethau pwysig yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Nid yw rheilffyrdd yn dod i ben wrth gyrraedd y ffin; maent yn dal i fynd.

For all these reasons, our ability to influence rail decision making is relativity limited. This Government is working to change this and I welcome the support of other parties in bringing about fundamental changes to how we organise things. The Government is committed to examining the feasibility of establishing the Wales and borders franchise on a not-for-dividend basis and to making the case for greater accountability of Network Rail. We have clear lines on this, but the opportunity is there for us to look at other options. Members will remember—I think Vaughan Gething alluded to this—that Railtrack, the company that owned and operated the UK rail infrastructure from privatisation in 1994, collapsed in 2001, and that Network Rail was established by the Labour Government in Westminster and brought into Railtrack in 2002. I thank Eluned Parrott for her positive note on that. Network Rail was set up as a not-for-dividend company, as it remains today. So, strictly speaking, we already have a not-for-profit owner of the rail network in the UK. However, we feel that Network Rail has not always been sufficiently responsive to the needs of Wales in its planning and investment. I know that we very much welcomed the establishment of a Network Rail route for Wales back in November 2011. There is a managing director in Wales and that is quite important, because there is an element of accountability to the Welsh Government. Obviously, some of this work was undertaken when we were in partnership with Plaid Cymru in the last administration with the work taken forward then by the then Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economy and Transport. In response, we have to say that the managing director and his team have adapted to things, they see the benefit of closer working relationships with us, and we want to continue to take those working relationships forward. Alongside this, we are also looking at how the new Wales and borders franchise could be

Am y rhesymau hynny i gyd, mae ein gallu i ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau’n ymwneud â’r rheilffyrdd yn gymharol gyfyngedig. Mae’r Llywodraeth hon yn gweithio i newid hynny a chroesawaf gefnogaeth pleidiau eraill o ran gwneud newidiadau sylfaenol i’r ffordd y trefnwn bethau. Mae’r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i edrych ar ddichonoldeb sefydlu masnachfraint Cymru a’r gororau ar sail ddi-ddifidend ac i bledio achos gwneud Network Rail yn fwy atebol. Rydym yn glir ynglŷn â hynny, ond mae yma gyfle inni edrych ar opsiynau eraill. Bydd Aelodau’n cofio—credaf i Vaughan Gething gyfeirio at hyn—fod Railtrack, y cwmni a oedd yn berchen ar isadeiledd rheilffyrdd y DU ac a fu’n ei weithredu ers ei breifateiddio yn 1994, wedi mynd i’r wal yn 2001, ac y sefydlwyd Network Rail gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, ac y prynodd Railtrack yn 2002. Diolch i Eluned Parrott am ei nodyn cadarnhaol yn hynny o beth. Sefydlwyd Network Rail yn gwmni di-ddifidend, ac mae’n parhau felly hyd heddiw. Felly, a dweud y gwir, mae perchennog rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd y DU eisoes yn berchennog dielw. Serch hynny, credwn nad yw Network Rail bob amser wedi bod yn ddigon ymatebol i anghenion Cymru wrth gynllunio a buddsoddi. Gwn ein bod wedi croesawu’n fawr sefydlu llwybr Network Rail i Gymru yn ôl ym mis Tachwedd 2011. Mae rheolwr gyfarwyddwr yng Nghymru ac mae hynny’n eithaf pwysig, oherwydd mae elfen o atebolrwydd i Lywodraeth Cymru. Wrth gwrs, gwnaethpwyd rhywfaint o’r gwaith hwn pan oeddem mewn partneriaeth â Phlaid Cymru yn y weinyddiaeth ddiwethaf a bwriwyd ymlaen â’r gwaith bryd hynny gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a’r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ar y pryd. I ateb hynny, rhaid inni ddweud bod y rheolwr gyfarwyddwr a’i dîm wedi ymaddasu i bethau, maent yn gweld manteision cydweithio’n agosach â ni, ac rydym yn awyddus i barhau i fwrw ymlaen â’r berthynas waith honno. Law yn llaw â hynny,

developed. Alun Ffred alluded to the issues around public budgets and about how people are always talking about value for money and the increasing costs and every opportunity to reduce costs. Of course, there should not be reduced costs in terms of passenger safety or the choice that people require from rail and other various things.

rydym yn edrych hefyd ar sut y gellid datblygu masnachfraint newydd Cymru a’r gororau. Cyfeiriodd Alun Ffred at faterion yn ymwneud â chyllidebau cyhoeddus a’r ffaith fod pobl yn siarad o hyd am werth am arian a’r costau cynyddol a phob cyfle i leihau costau. Wrth gwrs, ni ddylid lleihau costau o ran diogelwch y teithwyr na’r dewis sydd ei angen ar bobl o ran y rheilffyrdd ac amryw o bethau eraill.

6.00 p.m.

The goal will be to reduce the burden on the taxpayer while improving services for customers, valuing the immense contribution made by the workforce, and ensuring that the network in Wales continues to play an important role in developing all those links. Vaughan Gething alluded to the work that he is undertaking, as chair of the cross-party group, on the involvement of trade unions. This is an opportunity to look at having very different models in the future and at how we can take them forward.

Y nod fydd lleihau’r baich ar y trethdalwr ac ar yr un pryd wella gwasanaethau i gwsmeriaid, gwerthfawrogi cyfraniad aruthrol y gweithlu, a sicrhau bod y rhwydwaith yng Nghymru’n parhau i chwarae rhan bwysig o ran datblygu’r holl gysylltiadau hynny. Soniodd Vaughan Gething am y gwaith y mae’n ei wneud, fel cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol, ar ran yr undebau llafur yn hyn. Dyma gyfle i edrych ar gael modelau gwahanol iawn yn y dyfodol ac ar sut y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â hwy.

Capturing the dividend is one way of achieving this, but we must make sure that we have examined all the opportunities before us. We are only at the start of this process, yet we already have an interest in how a co-operative or mutual could play a role in the next franchise, and a lot of us in the Chamber will be interested in the developments. The franchise engages local communities and empowers the workforce to provide the best possible service. The Minister for transport will be hosting an event to bring together some of the people who could have a role in delivering the next Wales and borders franchise. It is due for renewal, as everybody has indicated, in 2018. The UK Department for Transport begins the conventional procurement of a franchise two years before it is due to start, so we have a window of opportunity now to influence these areas. Once we have collected and examined the evidence, we have to get on with what change we want and what we need to do. There have been extensive discussions with the Secretary of State for Transport on this process, and I know that our Minister for transport has worked co-operatively with her on some of these issues, because the prize is great. We need to make a step change to get

Mae cipio’r difidend yn un ffordd o wneud hyn, ond rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod wedi edrych ar yr holl bosibiliadau sydd ger ein bron. Megis dechrau y mae’r broses hon, ac eto mae gennym ddiddordeb eisoes yn sut y gallai cwmni cydweithredol neu gydfuddiannol chwarae rhan yn y fasnachfraint nesaf, a bydd gan lawer ohonom yn y Siambr hon ddiddordeb yn y datblygiadau. Mae’r fasnachfraint yn tynnu cymunedau lleol i mewn ac yn grymuso’r gweithlu i ddarparu’r gwasanaeth gorau posibl. Bydd y Gweinidog dros drafnidiaeth yn cynnal digwyddiad i ddwyn ynghyd rai o’r bobl a allai fod â rhan yn y gwaith o ddarparu masnachfraint nesaf Cymru a’r gororau. Bydd yn cael ei hadnewyddu, fel y dywedodd pawb, yn 2018. Mae Adran Drafnidiaeth y DU yn dechrau proses gaffael gonfensiynol masnachfraint ddwy flynedd cyn bod disgwyl iddi ddechrau, felly dyma gyfle i ni yn awr ddylanwadu ar y meysydd hynny. Unwaith y byddwn wedi casglu ac wedi edrych ar y dystiolaeth, bydd yn rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen â’r newidiadau yr ydym am eu gweld a’r hyn y mae’n rhaid inni ei wneud. Cafwyd trafodaethau helaeth â’r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth ar y broses hon, a gwn fod ein Gweinidog ninnau dros

the service that we require.

drafnidiaeth wedi cydweithio â hi ar rai o’r materion hyn, oherwydd mae’r wobr yn fawr. Rhaid wrth newid sylweddol er mwyn cael y gwasanaeth sydd ei angen arnom.

On the overall discussion, it has been good for us to air our views on these various issues. You have the assurance of the Government that we will look at these issues, certainly on the not-for-profit option and others, and we will take them forward. I very much welcome the opportunity to contribute to what is an important discussion in Wales, not only for the passengers and the service, but for the development of business, the economy and jobs.

Ynglŷn â’r drafodaeth gyffredinol, bu’n fuddiol inni leisio ein barn ar y gwahanol faterion hyn. Gallaf eich sicrhau ar ran y Llywodraeth y bydd yn edrych ar y materion hyn, ac yn sicr ar yr opsiwn dielw ac eraill, ac y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â hwy. Croesawaf yn fawr y cyfle i gyfrannu at drafodaeth sy’n bwysig iawn yng Nghymru, nid yn unig i’r teithwyr a’r gwasanaeth, ond hefyd o ran datblygu busnes, yr economi a swyddi.

Alun Ffred Jones: Rwy’n ddiolchgar i’r Gweinidog am y ffordd mor gadarnhaol y gwnaeth ymateb i’r ddadl hon ac i Vaughan Gething a Keith Davies ar fy ochr chwith am eu cyfraniadau, am nad oeddent wedi ceisio camddeall y cynnig. Rwy’n falch ein bod wedi cael cyfle yma i drafod rhai o’r ystyriaethau hyn wrth inni edrych at osod y fasnachfraint unwaith eto yn y blynyddoedd nesaf. Gwnaeth Vaughan Gething y pwynt perthnasol fod yn rhaid i ni a’r Gweinidog ystyried y materion hyn yn fuan yn hytrach nag yn hwyrach.

Alun Ffred Jones: I am grateful to the Minister for the very positive manner in which she responded to this debate and for the contributions of Vaughan Gething and Keith Davies on my left, who did not seek to misinterpret the motion. I am pleased that we have had an opportunity here to discuss some of these considerations as we look towards renewing the franchise in the coming years. Vaughan Gething made the pertinent point that we and the Minister have to give consideration to these issues sooner rather than later.

Mae’n ddrwg gennyf fod y cynnig wedi drysu’r Torïaid a’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er mae’n rhaid imi gyfaddef—

I am sorry that the motion confused the Tories and the Liberal Democrats, although I must admit—

Andrew R.T. Davies *rose*—

Andrew R.T. Davies *yn codi*—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Will you take an intervention?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mewn munud, os caf orffen y pwynt. Mae’n rhaid imi ddweud mai’r geiriau a oedd yn dod i’m meddwl oedd ‘hollti blew’, ac mae sôn yn y Beibl am ddegymu’r mintys. Mae’n amlwg, yn ôl fy araith i, fod y cynnig hwn yn cyfeirio yn bennaf at y fasnachfraint, ond gan cynnwys hefyd yr is-adeiledd sydd y deallwn wedi cael ei ddatganoli i ryw raddau, ond, hyd yn oed wedyn, o dan drefniadau presennol Network Rail, sydd wedi dod â manteision i Gymru, mae’n amlwg bod angen iddo fod yn fwy atebol i Lywodraeth Cymru, sut bynnag y mae hynny’n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, fy mhrif bwyslais yn fy araith, ac a godwyd gan

Alun Ffred Jones: In a minute, if I can just finish the point. I have to say that the words that came to my mind were ‘splitting hairs’, and the Bible talks of tithing mint. It is obvious from my contribution that this motion refers mainly to the franchise, but it also includes the infrastructure, which we understand is devolved to some degree, but, even then, under Network Rail’s current arrangements, which have brought benefits to Wales, it is clear that it needs to be more accountable to the Welsh Government in some way. However, the main emphasis of my speech, as was reflected by Keith Davies and Vaughan in their contributions, was to

Keith Davies a Vaughan, oedd cyfeirio at fodel y cwmni a fydd yn cymryd drosodd y fasnachfraint, a sôn am Network Rail a'r is-adeiledd yng Nghymru, er bod y rhwydwaith hwnnw yn rhedeg yn Lloegr ar hyd y Gororau, rhan o rwydwaith Cymru ydyw o safbwynt y gwasanaeth rheilffordd.

refer to the model of the company that is to take over the franchise, and to talk about Network Rail and the infrastructure in Wales, although that network runs in England along the Welsh Marches, it is part of the Welsh network from the point of view of railway services.

A yw Andrew R.T. Davies eisiau cyfrannu yn awr?

Does Andrew R.T. Davies wish to contribute now?

Andrew R.T. Davies: I am grateful to the Member for giving way, and I agree with him that it is almost splitting hairs, but it is annoying when you go to the Table Office and find that, time and again, your amendments are ruled out of order. I believe that we had good contributions on the franchise and we, too, would like to contribute on that, but, on four occasions, we went to the Table Office to amend the motion, and the amendments were thrown back at us because they were not in keeping with the motion that we are debating, which is about the network. I accept the point about splitting hairs, but we need to understand what is in order and what is not.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am ildio, a chytunaf fod hyn bron yn hollti blew, ond mae'n ddiflas mynd at y Swyddfa Gyflwyno a chael, dro ar ôl tro, y dyfernir bod eich gwelliannau allan o drefn. Credaf fod gennym gyfraniadau da ar y fasnachfraint, a hoffem ninnau, hefyd, gyfrannu ar hynny, ond, bedair gwaith, aethom at y Swyddfa Gyflwyno i wella cynnig, a thaflwyd y gwelliannau yn ôl atom am nad oeddent yn gydnaws â'r cynnig yr oeddem yn ei drafod, sy'n ymwneud â'r rhwydwaith. Derbyniaf y pwynt am hollti blew, ond mae angen inni ddeall beth sydd mewn trefn a beth nad yw.

The Presiding Officer: I do not think that that is a matter for Alun Ffred Jones. I understand that your amendments were aimed at broadening the original motion. However, we can discuss that outside the Chamber if you are not happy.

Y Llywydd: Ni chredaf mai mater i Alun Ffred Jones yw hynny. Deallaf mai diben eich gwelliannau oedd ehangu'r cynnig gwreiddiol. Serch hynny, gallwn drafod hynny y tu allan i'r Siambr os nad ydych yn hapus.

Alun Ffred Jones: Diolch yn fawr i Andrew R.T. Davies am esbonio cefndir y drafodaeth. Beth bynnag, i fynd yn ôl at galon y drafodaeth, rwyf yn sôn yn bennaf am y fasnachfraint yn yr achos hwn ac at ba fath o gwmni y gellid ei greu a fyddai'n dod â manteision i deithwyr yn bennaf yma yng Nghymru ac a fyddai'n ein gweld yn datblygu rhwydwaith sy'n wirioneddol ymatebol. Mae gennym fodel yng Nghymru eisoes, wrth gwrs: mae Glas Cymru yn fodel o gwmni di-elw llwyddiannus iawn sy'n effeithiol iawn, hyd y gwelaf—ym mhob profiad yr wyf wedi'i gael gyda'r cwmni hwnnw—a fyddai'n sail i fodel arall.

Alun Ffred Jones: I thank Andrew R.T. Davies for explaining the background to the discussion. However, to get back to the nub of the discussion, I am talking mainly about the franchise in this case and about what kind of company could be created that would bring benefits to passengers mainly here in Wales and that would see us developing a truly responsive network. Of course, we already have a model in Wales: Glas Cymru is a successful not-for-profit company that is very effective, as far I can see—in all experiences that I have had with that company—which would be a basis for an alternative model.

Rwyf wedi cyfeirio at gyfraniad Vaughan Gething cyn hyn. Nid oes angen imi ailadrodd. Roedd yn gwneud pwyntiau am y broses a bod angen edrych arni yn gynharach

I have already referred to Vaughan Gething's contribution. I do not need to repeat myself. He made points about the process and that we need to look at that sooner rather than later. I

yn hytrach na'n hwyrach. Rwy'n hapus iawn bod y Blaid Lafur wedi dal i fyny gyda Phlaid Cymru, gan fod hwnnw'n ymrwymiad gennym yn ôl yn 2011, ond nid wyf eisiau mynd i geisio cael rhyw fath o ras yma. Y gwir yw bod y problemau yr oedd yn manylu arnynt o safbwynt y model y gellid ei ddatblygu yn rhai real iawn, ac nid ydynt yn rhai y gellir eu goresgyn yn hawdd. Felly, rwy'n derbyn y pwyntiau a wnaeth yn llawn. Mae'n bwysig iawn, wrth gwrs, fod y model hwnnw, os ydym yn llwyddo i gael cwmni di-elw, o fudd nid yn unig i deithwyr ond i weithwyr a threthdalwyr yn gyffredinol.

am very pleased that the Labour Party has caught up with Plaid Cymru, given that we made that commitment back in 2011, but I do not want to try to enter into any kind of race here. The truth is that the problems that he detailed in respect of the model that could be developed are very real ones, and they are not ones that can easily be overcome. Therefore, I accept the points that he made fully. It is very important, of course, that that model, if we do succeed in having a not-for-profit company, should be of benefit not only to passengers but to the workforce and taxpayers in general.

Nid wyf yn credu bod angen inni ymhelaethu geiriau. Roedd ymateb y Gweinidog yn un calonogol, ac rwy'n gobeithio y gallwn, wrth edrych ymlaen at y dyfodol ac at 2018, gydweithio o fewn y Siambr i weld a oes modd inni gael trefn newydd a fydd yn fwy ymatebol i anghenion Cymru, yn rhoi gwasanaeth gwell ac a fydd hefyd yn gallu cynnig gwasanaeth i Gymru a fydd yn mynd â ni i'r dyfodol gyda rhwydwaith sy'n llawer iawn mwy cyfoes ac sy'n rhoi delwedd well o Gymru na'r hyn sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd, sef rhai trenau sy'n edrych fel eu bod yn perthyn i Rwsia cyn yr ail ryfel byd. Dyna'r ddelwedd anghywir a, gyda chyhoeddiad positif yn yr wythnosau nesaf am drydaneiddio, gobeithiaf y bydd modd inni wneud hynny a'i wneud gyda'n gilydd.

I do not think that we need to waste words on this. The Minister's response was very encouraging, and I hope that, in looking to the future and to 2018, we can collaborate within the Chamber to see whether we can have a new arrangement that will be more responsive to Wales's needs, that will provide a better service, and that will also provide a service for Wales that takes us into the future with a far more modern network that presents a better image of Wales, instead of what we have at present, namely some trains that look like they belong in Russia prior to the second world war. That is the wrong image but, with a positive announcement in the next few weeks about electrification, I hope that we can do that and do it together.

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there is objection. In that case, I defer all voting on this item until voting time.

Y Llywydd: Y cynnig yw ein bod yn derbyn y cynnig heb welliant. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad. Felly, gohiriaf y bleidlais ar yr eitem hon hyd nes y daw'r cyfnod pleidleisio.

It has been agreed that voting time will take place before the short debate. Unless three Members wish the bell to be rung, I will proceed directly to voting time.

Cytunwyd y bydd y cyfnod pleidleisio cyn y ddadl fer. Oni fydd tri Aelod am i'r gloch gael ei chanu, symudaf yn syth at y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Voting deferred until voting time.

Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time

Cynnig NDM5035: O blaid 33, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 12.
Motion NDM5035: For 33, Abstain 4, Against 12.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Keith
Drakeford, Mark
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
James, Julie
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Simon
Watson, Joyce
Whittle, Lindsay
Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Roberts, Aled

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.

Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 6.09 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 6.09 p.m.

Dadl Fer
Short Debate

Anrhydeddu ein Harwyr—Gwarchod Cofebau Rhyfel yng Nghymru
Honouring our Heroes—Protecting War Memorials in Wales

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I ask those Members leaving the Chamber to do so quickly and quietly. I call Paul Davies to speak on the topic that he has chosen.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau hynny sy'n gadael y Siambr wneud hynny'n gyflym ac yn dawel. Galwaf Paul Davies i siarad ar y pwnc a ddewiswyd ganddo.

Paul Davies: I have agreed that Mike Hedges can have a minute of my time.

Paul Davies: Rwyf wedi cytuno y caiff Mike Hedges funud o'm hamser.

I am delighted to use my short debate today to highlight and promote the protection of war memorials across Wales. I am sure that Members from all parties in the Chamber this afternoon will agree that war memorials are an essential part of the cultural and social fabric of Wales and, indeed, Britain. Remembering the sacrifice of Welsh soldiers is important for all generations. Future generations must remember and never forget those who died for our freedoms. Future generations must also remember in order to learn from previous wars so that they are never repeated again. That is why it is important to protect our war memorials. It is therefore essential that Governments at all levels do all they can to protect and cultivate these memorials as they come under increasing threat.

Mae'n bleser gennyf ddefnyddio fy nadl fer heddiw i dynnu sylw at warchod cofebau rhyfel ledled Cymru ac i hyrwyddo hynny. Rwyf yn sicr y bydd Aelodau pob plaid yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma'n cytuno bod cofebau rhyfel yn rhan annatod o wead diwylliannol a chymdeithasol Cymru ac, yn wir, Prydain. Mae'n bwysig fod pob cenhedlaeth yn cofio aberth milwyr Cymru. Rhaid i genedlaethau'r dyfodol gofio a pheidio byth ag anghofio'r rhai a fu farw er mwyn i ni gael rhyddid. Rhaid i genedlaethau'r dyfodol gofio hefyd er mwyn dysgu o ryfeloedd y gorffennol fel na fyddant yn digwydd eto. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig gwarchod ein cofebau rhyfel. Mae'n hollbwysig felly fod Llywodraethau ar bob lefel yn gwneud eu gorau glas i warchod a gofalu am y cofebau hyn wrth iddynt ddod fwyfwy o dan fygythiad.

There is cross-pasty support for the protection of our war memorials. Politicians at all levels and from all sides of the political spectrum have advocated the protection of war memorials throughout Wales and, indeed, the United Kingdom. At Westminster, Therese Coffey, the Conservative MP for Suffolk Coastal, and Tony Lloyd, the Labour MP for Manchester Central, have both advocated the protection of war memorials. Ahead of the anniversary of the start of the first world war in 2014, we have an opportunity but also an urgency to discuss the issue of war memorials in Wales and work together to ensure that these memorials are safeguarded from those who

Mae cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i warchod ein cofebau rhyfel. Mae gwleidyddion ar bob lefel ac o bob pen i'r sbectrwm gwleidyddol wedi siarad o blaid gwarchod cofebau rhyfel ledled Cymru ac, yn wir, y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn San Steffan, mae Therese Coffey, yr AS Ceidwadol dros Suffolk Arfordirol, a Tony Lloyd, yr AS Llafur dros Ganol Manceinion, ill dau wedi bod yn eiriol dros warchod cofebau rhyfel. Ychydig cyn canmlwyddiant dechrau'r rhyfel byd cyntaf yn 2014, mae cyfle yma, a brys hefyd, i drafod cofebau rhyfel yng Nghymru a chydweithio i sicrhau bod y cofebau hynny'n cael eu gwarchod rhag y rhai hynny sydd am eu difrodi.

would do them harm.

There are an estimated 100,000 war memorials in the United Kingdom, according to the War Memorials Trust. Each war memorial is unique and plays a vital role in ensuring that the sacrifices made by so many are not forgotten by generations to come. Often, the names listed on a memorial may be the only record of that individual's sacrifice, yet, sadly, we are reading more and more about the damage and theft of war memorials across Wales and the United Kingdom. The rising cost of metals has meant that war memorials have become a target for theft for their scrap value, and the War Memorials Trust estimates that one memorial is damaged for its metal every single week.

Amcangyfrifir bod 100,000 o gofebau rhyfel yn y Deyrnas Unedig, yn ôl yr Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel. Mae pob cofeb yn unigryw ac yn allweddol o ran sicrhau na fydd y cenedlaethau a ddêl yn anghofio'r aberth a wnaethpwyd gan gynifer. Yn aml, efallai mai'r enwau ar y gofeb fydd yr unig gofnod o aberth yr unigolion hynny, ac eto, yn anffodus, darllenwn fwyfwy am ddifrodi a lladrata cofebau rhyfel ledled Cymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig. Oherwydd bod pris metelau ar gynnydd, mae cofebau rhyfel wedi dod yn dargedau i'w lladrata am eu gwerth sgrap, ac mae'r Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel yn amcangyfrif y caiff un gofeb ei difrodi ar gyfer ei metel bob wythnos.

Last year, metal theft cost Welsh local authorities almost £680,000. Members will remember that thieves stole the original bronze war memorial in Newbridge in December 2010, which has since been replaced by a marble plaque. I am sure that we can all remember when vandals set fire to a Denbigh war memorial in January 2011. The fire destroyed wreaths laid at the cenotaph and left the monument covered in scorch marks. What a disgrace. Members will recall that, in April 2009, graffiti was shamefully sprayed on a memorial in Cathays park in Cardiff to those who served on HMS Cardiff in the Falklands war. Unfortunately, these are only a few examples of a worrying trend that is on the rise.

Y llynedd, costiodd lladradau metel bron i £680,000 i awdurdodau lleol Cymru. Bydd Aelodau'n cofio i ladron ddwyn y gofeb ryfel efydd wreiddiol yn Nhrecelyn ym mis Rhagfyr 2010. Bellach, gosodwyd coflech farmor yn ei lle. Rwyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cofio i fandaliaid roi cofeb ryfel Dinbych ar dân ym mis Ionawr 2011. Dinistriodd y tân dorchau blodau a osodwyd ar y senotaff a gadawyd olion llosgi dros y gofeb. Mae'n warth. Bydd Aelodau'n cofio i graffiti gael ei chwistrellu'n gywilyddus, ym mis Ebrill 2009, ar gofeb ym mharc Cathays yng Nghaerdydd i'r rhai hynny a wasanaethodd ar *HMS Cardiff* yn rhyfel y Falklands. Yn anffodus, dim ond rhai enghreifftiau yw'r rhain o duedd sy'n destun gofid mawr ac sydd ar gynnydd.

Today, in the Chamber, we say that we will remember those who fought and died for this country. The theft or damage of a war memorial shows absolutely no respect for those servicepeople who have made the ultimate sacrifice for our country. There is also no regard or respect for what these plaques represent or mean to the local community. These are not victimless crimes; these are crimes against society, crimes against community and crimes against sacrifice. They denigrate those who were prepared to give all that they could to help and protect others. It must be noted that war memorials are not only expensive to replace, but they may also contain information that

Heddiw, yn y Siambr, dywedwn y byddwn yn cofio'r rhai a fu'n ymladd ac a fu farw dros y wlad hon. Nid yw lladrata neu ddifrodi cofeb ryfel yn dangos dim parch o gwbl at y dynion a'r menywod hynny a wnaeth yr aberth eithaf dros ein gwlad. Ni roddir ystyriaeth na pharch chwaith i'r hyn y mae'r coflechau hyn yn ei olygu i'r gymuned leol. Nid troseddau heb ddioddefwyr mo'r rhain; troseddau yw'r rhain yn erbyn cymdeithas, troseddau yn erbyn cymuned a throseddau yn erbyn aberth. Maent yn difrïo'r rhai a oedd yn barod i roi popeth i helpu ac amddiffyn eraill. Rhaid nodi ei bod nid yn unig yn ddrud codi cofebau newydd yn eu lle, ond y gallai fod ar y cofebau hyn hefyd wybodaeth nad

may not be recorded anywhere else. The War Memorials Trust says that, without its names and inscriptions, a war memorial may lose its commemorative function and relevance to that particular community. It can often be difficult to establish where a memorial has come from once it has been removed.

yw o bosibl wedi'i chofnodi yn unman arall. Dywed yr Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel y gallai cofeb ryfel, heb yr enwau a'r arysgrifau, golli ei diben coffadwriaethol a'i pherthnasedd i'r gymuned benodol honno. Yn aml, gall fod yn anodd pennu o ble y daeth y gofeb unwaith y bydd wedi'i symud.

I have tabled this topic for debate today to explore ways of protecting war memorials in Wales, and I would like to put forward three particular proposals for the Welsh Government to consider. The first proposal is to undertake a nationwide up-to-date inventory of war memorials in Wales. It is important that we have recorded data that detail the number and locations of all war memorials in Wales. I believe that local authorities should draw up a list of the war memorials in their area and identify which organisation or individual is responsible for each one. I acknowledge, for example, that if a memorial is located in a school, the responsibility for the memorial would fall to that school. There are also some community groups that have taken responsibility for local war memorials, and churches often look after the memorials in their care as well.

Rwyf wedi cyflwyno'r pwnc hwn ar gyfer y ddadl heddiw er mwyn edrych ar ffyrdd o warchod cofebau rhyfel yng Nghymru, a charwn gyflwyno tri chynnig penodol i Lywodraeth Cymru eu hystyried. Y cyntaf yw gwneud rhestr genedlaethol gyfredol o gofebau rhyfel yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cadw cofnodion manwl am niferoedd a lleoliadau holl gofebau rhyfel Cymru. Credaf y dylai awdurdodau lleol lunio rhestr o'r cofebau rhyfel yn eu hardal a nodi pa sefydliad neu unigolyn sy'n gyfrifol am bob un. Rwyf yn cydnabod, er enghraifft, os yw'r gofeb mewn ysgol, mai cyfrifoldeb yr ysgol honno fydd y gofeb. Mae rhai grwpiau cymunedol hefyd wedi cymryd cyfrifoldeb dros gofebau rhyfel lleol, ac mae eglwysi'n aml yn gofalu am gofebau sydd o dan eu gofal hefyd.

Drawing up a list of war memorials in each area could be done in conjunction with In Memoriam 2014, a national project to locate, log and then maintain war memorials, or it could be done using the records available on the UK national inventory of war memorials website. The War Memorials Trust is also working with a number of other organisations on a project entitled We Still Remember. The website will allow the public to enhance the current information on war memorials and link up many of the local websites and resources with information.

Gellid llunio rhestr o gofebau rhyfel ym mhob ardal law yn llaw ag In Memoriam 2014, prosiect cenedlaethol i leoli, cofnodi a chynnal a chadw cofebau rhyfel, neu gellid gwneud hynny drwy ddefnyddio'r cofnodion sydd ar gael ar wefan rhestr genedlaethol y DU o gofebau rhyfel. Mae'r Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel hefyd yn cydweithio â nifer o sefydliadau eraill ar brosiect yn dwyn y teitl We Still Remember. Bydd y wefan yn caniatáu i'r cyhoedd ychwanegu at y wybodaeth gyfredol ar gofebau rhyfel ac yn cysylltu llawer o wefannau ac adnoddau lleol â gwybodaeth.

6.15 p.m.

This will hopefully help many of the custodians, volunteers and young people keen to engage with their war memorials. Phase 1 of the project, which will put the basic building blocks in place, is due to be delivered this November. The focus over the summer and early autumn will be on ensuring they can meet that target. Once the project is up and running, the partners will be keen to promote and publicise this resource to

Y gobaith yw y bydd hynny'n helpu llawer o'r ceidwaid, y gwirfoddolwyr a'r bobl ifanc sy'n awyddus i ymgysylltu â'u cofebau rhyfel. Bwriedir cyflawni rhan 1 y prosiect, a fydd yn rhoi'r sylfeini yn eu lle, ym mis Tachwedd eleni. Canolbwyntir dros yr haf a dechrau'r hydref ar sicrhau y gallant gyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Unwaith y bydd y prosiect ar waith, bydd y partneriaid yn awyddus i hyrwyddo a rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r adnodd

encourage engagement, and I strongly urge the Welsh Government to involve itself with this project and work with the War Memorials Trust and its partners.

hwn i annog pobl i ymgysylltu, a galwaf yn gryf ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ymwneud â'r prosiect hwn a gweithio gyda'r Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel a'i phartneriaid.

My second proposal is that there should be a statutory duty to protect war memorials. This would mean that the legal duty would require local authorities across Wales to ensure that war memorials in their areas are maintained. At the moment, the War Memorials Act 1923 permits local authorities to use public money for the maintenance of memorials, but they are under no obligation to do so. Therefore, my proposal would involve ensuring each local authority, working closely with community groups and organisations, has a custodian whose job it would be to maintain and protect memorials in the area. Their job would also include working with other departments to promote war memorials in the area. In November 2010, the War Memorials Trust approached local authorities across the United Kingdom to ask if they had a war memorials officer in place. At present, there are a number of local authorities across Wales where there is no point of contact for the local community to find out more about memorials in the area, and that is something that needs to change. Collaboration between the Welsh Government, local authorities and local communities is essential to ensure that war memorials are being protected appropriately.

Fy ail gynnig yw y dylai gwarchod cofebau rhyfel fod yn ddyletswydd statudol. Golyga hynny y byddai'r ddyletswydd gyfreithiol yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru sicrhau bod cofebau rhyfel yn eu hardaloedd yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Deddf Cofebau Rhyfel 1923 yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus i gynnal a chadw cofebau, ond nid oes rheidrwydd arnynt i wneud hynny. Felly, byddai fy nghynnig yn ceisio sicrhau bod gan bob awdurdod lleol, yn cydweithio'n agos â grwpiau a mudiadau cymunedol, geidwad yn gyfrifol am gynnal a chadw a gwarchod cofebau yn yr ardal. Byddai'r swydd hefyd yn cynnwys cydweithio ag adrannau eraill i hyrwyddo cofebau rhyfel yn yr ardal. Ym mis Tachwedd 2010, gofynnodd yr Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel i awdurdodau lleol ledled y DU a oedd ganddynt swyddog cofebau rhyfel. Ar hyn o bryd, mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru lle nad oes man cyswllt i'r gymuned leol gael gwybod mwy am gofebau yn eu hardal, ac mae angen i hynny newid. Mae'n hollbwysig fod Llywodraeth Cymru, awdurdodau lleol a chymunedau lleol yn cydweithio i sicrhau bod cofebau rhyfel yn cael eu gwarchod yn briodol.

Some local authorities in Wales have a war memorials officer of sorts who is the single or main point of contact at the council to deal with war memorial issues. However, they are rarely called 'war memorial officers' within the local authority structure as war memorials are just one part of their job, but this is the phrase used by the War Memorials Trust to identify the person who deals with war memorials. I do not wish to undermine the work that has been done so far in establishing contacts at local authorities. However, a statutory duty on local authorities to provide a war memorial officer would not only be a point of contact for the public, but would ensure that these authorities work in partnership with local community groups and organisations who have already established

Mae gan rai awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru swyddog cofebau rhyfel o fath, a'r swyddog hwnnw yw'r unig fan cyswllt neu'r prif fan cyswllt yn y cyngor sy'n ymdrin â materion yn ymwneud â chofebau rhyfel. Er hynny, anaml iawn y'u gelwir yn 'swyddogion cofebau rhyfel' yn strwythur yr awdurdod lleol gan mai dim ond rhan o'u gwaith yw'r cofebau rhyfel, ond dyna'r teitl a ddefnyddir gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel i ddynodi'r sawl sy'n ymdrin â chofebau rhyfel. Nid wyf am danseilio'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd hyd yma i sefydlu cysylltiadau yn yr awdurdodau lleol. Serch hynny, byddai rhoi dyletswydd statudol ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu swyddogion cofebau rhyfel nid yn unig yn fan cyswllt i'r cyhoedd, ond hefyd yn sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau hyn yn gweithio

responsibility for some memorials in the area. Some community groups do a fantastic job of protecting war memorials and they should be encouraged to continue to do so. We must support the efforts of community groups who have established responsibility for memorials in Wales. A strong working relationship with a local authority would better safeguard and protect memorials at a time when thefts and damage to memorials are on the rise.

mewn partneriaeth â grwpiau a mudiadau cymunedol lleol sydd eisoes wedi cymryd cyfrifoldeb am rai cofebau yn yr ardal. Mae rhai grwpiau cymunedol yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol o warchod cofebau rhyfel a dylid eu hannog i barhau i wneud hynny. Mae'n rhaid inni gefnogi ymdrechion y grwpiau cymunedol sydd wedi cymryd cyfrifoldeb am gofebau yng Nghymru. Byddai perthynas waith gref ag awdurdod lleol yn diogelu ac yn gwarchod cofebau'n well ar adeg pan fo lladrata a difrodi cofebau ar gynnydd.

Finally, the third proposal is in relation to combatting the removal of war memorials for scrap. Sadly, war memorials have also become embroiled in a black market for public art. Some memorials with figurative sculptures are stolen to order and it can often be difficult to establish where a memorial has come from once it has been removed. I know that the Minister is aware of the state-of-the-art SmartWater signature that is visible only under ultraviolet light, which helps police to trace any items that are stolen. Once applied, SmartWater is virtually impossible to remove and can withstand burning, sandblasting and long-term exposure to UV. Furthermore, if a thief attempts to remove SmartWater, they risk inadvertently spreading forensic evidence on to their clothes and any tools they are using. This can then be used by police to link them directly to the crime scene. This is one way of protecting war memorials that I hope the Welsh Government would be happy to promote; perhaps the Minister would be kind enough to refer to this point in his response.

Yn olaf, mae'r trydydd cynnig yn ymwneud ag atal cofebau rhyfel rhag cael eu cymryd ymaith yn sgrap. Yn anffodus, mae cofebau rhyfel hefyd ynghlwm mewn marchnad ddu ar gyfer celf gyhoeddus. Caiff rhai cofebau â cherfluniau ffigurol eu lladrata ar gais ac yn aml iawn gall fod yn anodd pennu o ble y daeth cofeb unwaith y bydd wedi'i symud. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn gwybod am y llofnod SmartWater diweddaraf na ellir ond ei weld o dan olau uwchfioled, sy'n helpu'r heddlu i olrhain eitemau sydd wedi'u lladrata. Mae bron yn amhosibl cael gwared ar lofnod SmartWater a gall wrthsefyll llosgi, sgwrio â thywod a'i adael o dan olau uwchfioled am amser hir. Yn ogystal, pe bai lleidr yn ceisio cael gwared ar lofnod SmartWater, gallai'n ddiarwybod iddo ledaenu tystiolaeth fforensig ar ei ddillad ac unrhyw offer y mae'n ei ddefnyddio. Gall yr heddlu ddefnyddio hynny wedyn i'w gysylltu'n uniongyrchol â lleoliad y drosedd. Dyma un ffordd o warchod cofebau rhyfel yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru'n falch o'i hyrwyddo; efallai y bydd y Gweinidog garediced â chyfeirio at y pwynt hwn yn ei ymateb.

It is also essential that councils across Wales are given greater powers and resources to hold scrap metal dealers to account and to work with them to highlight items such as name plaques and those with obvious dates on them, so that dealers will be aware of exactly what they are. Clearly, the severity of the crime of memorial theft needs to be stressed to scrap metal dealers. At present, scrapyard owners have a responsibility to register with local authorities, but once they have registered, local authorities have little power to regulate them. I understand that the Local Government Association is calling for

Mae hefyd yn hollbwysig rhoi rhagor o bwerau ac adnoddau i gynghorau ledled Cymru i ddwyn delwyr metel sgrap i gyfrif a chydweithio â hwy i dynnu sylw at eitemau megis placiau enwau a phlaciau â dyddiadau amlwg arnynt, er mwyn sicrhau bod delwyr yn gwybod yn union beth ydynt. Wrth reswm, dylid pwysleisio wrth ddelwyr metel sgrap pa mor ddifrifol yw lladrata cofebau. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar berchnogion iardiau sgrap i gofrestru ag awdurdodau lleol, ond unwaith y byddant wedi cofrestru, ychydig iawn o rym sydd gan awdurdodau lleol i'w rheoleiddio. Rwyf ar

local authorities to be given new powers, which could include the installation of CCTV in scrapyards, number plate recognition, and the introduction of annual licences. I hope that the Minister will look at this. Perhaps he can tell us whether the Welsh Government intends to give local authorities more powers to regulate and monitor scrapyards.

ddeall fod y Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol yn galw am roi pwerau newydd i awdurdodau lleol, a allai gynnwys gosod teledu cylch cyfyng mewn iardiau sgrap, adnabod platiau rhif ceir, a chyflwyno trwyddedau blynyddol. Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn edrych ar hyn. Efallai y gall ddweud wrthym a yw Llywodraeth Cymru'n bwriadu rhoi rhagor o bwerau i awdurdodau lleol i reoleiddio a monitro iardiau sgrap.

The forthcoming centenary of the first world war offers us a fantastic opportunity to help communities across Wales remember those who fought for our freedoms. We should be proud of our military heritage, and governments at all levels should do everything within their power to help protect and promote our war memorials in Wales. This is about honouring and remembering our heroes. It is only right that those servicemen and women who lost their lives for our country and for our freedoms should receive this kind of public recognition. It is absolutely crucial that we remember the sacrifices that the armed forces and their families made, and those that they continue to make, every day, for the safety of our country. Let us do that by protecting our war memorials for generations to come. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear.']

Cyn hir, bydd canmlwyddiant y rhyfel byd cyntaf, a dyma gyfle gwych inni helpu cymunedau ledled Cymru i gofio'r rhai a fu'n ymladd er mwyn i ni gael rhyddid. Dylem ymfalchïo yn ein treftadaeth filwrol, a dylai llywodraethau ar bob lefel wneud eu gorau glas i helpu i warchod a hyrwyddo ein cofebau rhyfel yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn fater o anrhydeddu a chofio ein harwyr. Mae'n briodol fod y dynion a'r menywod hynny a gollodd eu bywydau dros ein gwlad a'n rhyddid yn cael y math hwn o gydnabyddiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn cofio aberth y lluoedd arfog a'u teuluoedd, a'r aberth y maent yn dal i'w wneud, bob dydd, er mwyn diogelu ein gwlad. Gadewch inni wneud hynny drwy warchod ein cofebau rhyfel ar gyfer y cenedlaethau a ddêl. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch.']

Mike Hedges: First, I agree with everything that Paul Davies has just said. It is important that we protect our war memorials. Among other things, they act as a reminder to our young people of what has happened in the past. Regarding those things that young people do not know, they can see the memorials, they can ask questions to their parents and others, and they can be informed. I know about the scourge of metal theft, and it is really important that composites are used. They are not as good, but they are not worth stealing, and we therefore have a chance of keeping them.

Mike Hedges: Yn gyntaf, cytunaf â phopeth y mae Paul Davies newydd ei ddweud. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwarchod ein cofebau rhyfel. Ymhlith pethau eraill, maent yn atgoffa ein pobl ifanc o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y gorffennol. O ran yr hyn nad yw pobl ifanc yn ei wybod, gallant weld y cofebau, gallant holi eu rhieni ac eraill, a gallant ddysgu. Gwn am bla lladrata metel, ac mae'n hynod bwysig defnyddio cyfansoddion. Nid ydynt cystal, ond nid ydynt yn werth eu lladrata, ac mae gennym felly fwy o obaith eu cadw.

One of the problems that Paul Davies did not mention is that chapels and churches are closing, and some of the war memorials inside them are being lost. Some are built into the stone itself. The fact that these memorials are being lost is very sad, and something needs to be done to identify what is there and to try to save whatever we can. I

Un broblem na chyfeiriodd Paul Davies ati yw fod capeli ac eglwysi'n cau, a bod rhai o'r cofebau rhyfel sydd ynddynt yn mynd ar goll. Mae rhai wedi'u gosod yn y garreg ei hun. Mae'n drist iawn fod y cofebau hyn yn cael eu colli, a rhaid gwneud rhywbeth i gofnodi'r hyn sydd yno a cheisio achub hynny a allwn. Rwyf yn credu'n gryf mewn achub hynny a

am a great believer in saving what we can, rather than saying that we are going to save everything. We want to save the maximum amount possible.

allwn, yn hytrach na dweud ein bod am achub popeth. Rydym am achub cymaint ag y gallwn.

My final point is that I also support the attempts to form a war memorial in Flanders. Flanders may not be part of Wales, but an awful lot of Welsh blood has been spilled there. There were an awful lot of Welsh bodies on some of the fields in Flanders—more than the population of some of the biggest towns in Wales. I know that one of Paul's constituents and one of mine are working on trying to get a war memorial there. I know about the difficulty of getting support from the Welsh Government or from the National Lottery, but it is really important that we remember the war dead not just in Wales, but in the place where they died.

Fy mhwynt olaf yw fy mod yn cefnogi'r ymdrech i godi cofeb ryfel yn Fflandrys. Efallai nad yw Fflandrys yn rhan o Gymru, ond collwyd llawer iawn o waed Cymreig yno. Roedd llawer iawn o gyrff Cymreig ar rai o gaeau Fflandrys—mwy na phoblogaeth rhai o drefi mwyaf Cymru. Gwn fod un o etholwyr Paul ac un o'm hetholwyr innau'n gweithio i geisio sicrhau y codir cofeb ryfel yno. Gwn ei bod yn anodd cael cefnogaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru a'r Loteri Genedlaethol, ond mae'n hynod bwysig ein bod yn cofio'r meirw nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond hefyd yn y man lle buont farw.

The Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage (Huw Lewis): I welcome this debate, and I sincerely thank Paul Davies for highlighting these issues in the Senedd today. War memorials form a very important part of our national heritage and culture by commemorating our shared past. War memorials reflect not just past conflicts, but the social contexts in which the events and participants are remembered. They are a testimony to the grief felt by so many at times of conflict, especially the two world wars. Given the approaching anniversary of the start of the first world war, as Paul mentioned, it is all the more important that they are protected as a memorial to those who lost their lives, as well as those who returned and the many civilian casualties.

Y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth (Huw Lewis): Croesawaf y ddadl hon, a charwn ddiolch o galon i Paul Davies am dynnu sylw at y materion hyn yn y Senedd heddiw. Mae cofebau rhyfel yn chwarae rhan bwysig iawn yn ein treftadaeth genedlaethol a'n diwylliant drwy goffáu'r gorffennol a rannwn. Mae cofebau rhyfel yn adlewyrchu nid yn unig ryfeloedd y gorffennol, ond hefyd y cyd-destunau cymdeithasol ar gyfer cofio'r digwyddiadau a'r rhai a gymerodd ran ynddynt. Maent yn tystio i alar cynifer o bobl adeg gwrthdaro, ac yn arbennig felly'r ddau ryfel byd. O gofio bod canmlwyddiant dechrau'r rhyfel byd cyntaf ar ein gwarthaf, fel y dywedodd Paul, mae'n bwysicach fyth eu gwarchod er mwyn coffáu'r rhai a gollodd eu bywydau, yn ogystal â'r rhai a ddychwelodd adref a'r sifiliaid lu a anafwyd.

There are thought to be 100,000 war memorials in the UK, and around 3,000 of those are here in Wales. They take many differing forms, including the frequently seen community crosses, plaques, whole buildings, memorial hospitals, church organs, chapels and windows. Most of our war memorials are publicly recognised and in a good state of repair. Clearly, however, a lack of regard for some memorials has resulted in their neglect or in vandalism. As Paul mentioned, they are vulnerable these days, it seems, to metal theft and sheer greed. While war memorials in public places may

Credir bod 100,000 o gofebau rhyfel yn y DU, ac oddeutu 3,000 ohonynt yma yng Nghymru. Mae sawl gwahanol fath, gan gynnwys rhai a welir yn aml megis croesau cymunedol, coflechau, adeiladau cyfan, ysbytai coffa, organau eglwysi, capeli a ffenestri. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'n cofebau rhyfel yn cael cydnabyddiaeth gyhoeddus ac mewn cyflwr da. Ond yn amlwg, mae diffyg parch at rai cofebau'n golygu eu bod wedi eu hesgeuluso neu eu fandaleiddio. Fel y dywedodd Paul, ymddengys eu bod yn cael eu targedu'r dyddiau hyn gan ladron metel a'u bod yn destun trachwant noeth. Er bod

sometimes suffer, it is those that are on or in private property, are not publicly accessible and may not even be recorded, that are most likely to be lost through oversight or ignorance. That is why the work that is being conducted by the UK National Inventory of War Memorials is crucial. We do need to have a proper record of all our war memorials in Wales so that they can be properly afforded future protection. I welcome the UK National Inventory of War Memorials' work in compiling the UK's first comprehensive national register.

cofebau rhyfel mewn mannau cyhoeddus weithiau'n dioddef, y rhai hynny ar dir preifat, y rhai na all y cyhoedd fynd atynt a'r rhai nad ydynt efallai hyd yn oed wedi'u cofnodi, sydd fwyaf tebygol o fynd ar goll drwy esgeulustod neu anwybodaeth. Dyna pam y mae gwaith Rhestr Genedlaethol y DU o Gofebau Rhyfel yn hollbwysig. Mae angen inni gadw cofnod priodol o'r holl gofebau rhyfel yng Nghymru er mwyn inni allu eu gwarchod yn iawn yn y dyfodol. Croesawaf waith Rhestr Genedlaethol y DU o Gofebau Rhyfel i lunio cofrestr genedlaethol gynhwysfawr gyntaf y DU.

Many memorials are beautifully maintained by communities, by Royal British Legion branches and other organisations. I would like to take this opportunity to pay tribute to the many volunteers who care for such memorials across Wales. The War Memorials Trust also works hard to promote the importance of our war memorials to ensure that they continue to be an appreciated and understood part of our cultural heritage. The trust provides expert advice to those involved in war memorial conservation projects and is also able to offer financial assistance. Cadw, the Welsh Government's historic environment service can provide grant assistance for war memorials in certain circumstances and works closely with the War Memorials Trust in Wales.

Caiff llawer o gofebau eu cynnal a'u cadw'n hyfryd gan gymunedau, gan ganghennau'r Lleng Brydeinig Frenhinol a sefydliadau eraill. Carwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i'r gwirfoddolwyr lu hynny sy'n gofalu am y cofebau hyn ledled Cymru. Mae'r Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel hefyd yn gweithio'n galed i hyrwyddo pwysigrwydd ein cofebau rhyfel er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn dal i gael eu gwerthfawrogi a'u deall o safbwynt ein treftadaeth ddiwylliannol. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn rhoi cyngor arbenigol i'r rhai hynny sy'n ymwneud â phrosiectau gwarchod cofebau rhyfel a gall gynnig cymorth ariannol. Gall Cadw, gwasanaeth amgylchedd hanesyddol Llywodraeth Cymru, roi cymorth grant i gofebau rhyfel mewn rhai amgylchiadau ac mae'n cydweithio'n agos â'r Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebau Rhyfel yng Nghymru.

War memorials are a testimony to those who lost their lives in war, but there are many other ways in which we can remember. Museums, for example, offer extensive displays of military heritage and many also hold collections of personal possessions, letters and oral reminiscence that help us to understand the dangers and challenges that soldiers have faced in the past and that they face now in the present.

Mae cofebau rhyfel yn tystiolaethu i'r rhai hynny a gollodd eu bywydau mewn rhyfeloedd, ond mae sawl ffordd arall o gofio. Mae amgueddfeydd, er enghraifft, yn cynnig arddangosfeydd helaeth o dreftadaeth filwrol ac mae gan sawl un hefyd gasgliadau o eiddo personol, llythyrau ac atgofion llafar sy'n ein helpu i ddeall y peryglon a'r heriau a wynebwyd gan filwyr yn y gorffennol ac a wynebir ganddynt nawr yn y presennol.

The People's Collection Wales has been a helpful tool in pulling together wartime stories. We should also note that the Davies sisters' gifts of Belgian artists' work during the first world war transformed the range and quality of Wales's national art collection. The protection of military sites is also important.

Bu Casgliad y Werin Cymru o gymorth i ddwyn ynghyd hanesion adeg rhyfel. Dylem nodi hefyd i roddion y chwiorydd Davies o waith artistiaid o Wlad Belg yn ystod y rhyfel byd cyntaf weddnewid ystod ac ansawdd casgliad celf cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'n bwysig hefyd gwarchod safleoedd milwrol.

Some of the best-preserved examples of military sites have been protected by Cadw, either as scheduled ancient monuments or as listed buildings, and we are now working to establish a battlefields register for Wales. Wales has a long and poignant military history and whether it is through war memorials, through protecting the historic fabric or collections of people's stories, we have a shared duty to ensure that our armed forces are not forgotten.

Mae rhai o'r enghreifftiau gorau o safleoedd milwrol wedi'u gwrachod gan Cadw, naill ai fel henebion rhestredig neu fel adeiladau rhestredig, ac rydym wrthi'n gweithio i greu cofrestr o feysydd y gad yng Nghymru. Mae gan Gymru hanes milwrol hir ac ingol a boed hynny drwy gofebau rhyfel, drwy warchod y gwead hanesyddol neu gasgliadau pobl o straeon, mae gennym oll ddyletswydd i sicrhau na chaiff ein lluoedd arfog eu hanghofio.

I have listened to Paul's remarks with much interest. This aspect of Welsh heritage is typical of the issues facing all historic assets. They are vulnerable fundamentally if people do not understand and appreciate their significance and their meaning, and they are vulnerable to opportunist thieves and casual acts of vandalism. However, the greatest potential threat by far—and this also underlies those cases of theft and vandalism—is a lack of understanding. A great deal of the problems that we face presuppose ignorance on the part of those people who would do ill.

Gwrandewais ar sylwadau Paul â diddordeb mawr. Mae'r agwedd hon ar dreftadaeth Cymru yn nodweddiadol o'r materion sy'n wynebu pob ased hanesyddol. Maent yn sylfaenol agored i niwed oni fydd pobl yn deall ac yn gwerthfawrogi eu harwyddocâd a'u hystyr, ac maent yn agored i gael eu lladrata gan ladron sy'n gweld eu cyfle ac i gael eu fandaleiddio'n achlysurol. Ond y bygythiad mwyaf o bell ffordd—ac mae hynny hefyd wrth wraidd y lladrata a'r fandaleiddio—yw diffyg dealltwriaeth. Mae llawer iawn o'r problemau sy'n ein hwynebu'n deillio o anwybodaeth y rhai hynny sydd am ddrwgweithredu.

My heritage priorities and the proposed heritage Bill will look at the measures that we can take to designate and protect memorials and military heritage. However, we also need to consider how we and our communities can ensure that the stories that underpin the memorials are documented and celebrated. It is understanding and remembering, more than anything else, that will protect the future of these memorials.

Bydd fy mlaenoriaethau treftadaeth a'r Bil treftadaeth arfaethedig yn edrych ar y camau y gallwn eu cymryd i ddynodi a gwarchod cofebau a threftadaeth filwrol. Serch hynny, mae angen hefyd inni ystyried sut y gallwn ni a'n cymunedau sicrhau bod y straeon y tu ôl i'r cofebau'n cael eu cofnodi a'u dathlu. Dealltwriaeth a chofio, yn anad dim, a fydd yn diogelu dyfodol y cofebau hyn.

I am reminded of a particularly poignant story of a memorial in my own constituency, in the small village of Brithdir, which was a small and modest memorial. It was erected in 1938 because the economic situation of that village during the 1920s and 1930s was so precarious that it took the villagers 20 years to raise the money to get what they regarded as a decent memorial for those who fell in the 1914-18 war together. Twelve months later, that same village was sending young men to the second world war. The poignancy of that story is something that the young people of Brithdir today ought to know about and ought to understand and respect. War memorials and military heritage have the benefit of a

Fe'm hatgoffir o hanes ingol iawn am gofeb yn fy etholaeth innau, ym mhentref bychan Brithdir, a honno'n gofeb fechan ddigon dirodres. Fe'i codwyd yn 1938 oherwydd roedd sefyllfa economaidd y pentref yn ystod y 1920au a'r 1930au mor fregus nes iddi gymryd 20 mlynedd i'r pentrefwyr gasglu'r arian i godi'r hyn y credent oedd yn gofeb deilwng i'r rhai a gwympodd yn rhyfel 1914–18. Flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, roedd yr un pentref yn anfon dynion ifanc i'r ail ryfel byd. Mae dwyster y stori honno'n rhywbeth y dylai pobl ifanc Prydain wybod amdano a'i ddeall a'i barchu. Mae cofebau rhyfel a threftadaeth filwrol yn elwa ar gefnogaeth gref ac egnïol, ac, yn y Llywodraeth, byddwn

strong and energetic support base, and, in Government, we will play our part in celebrating and protecting this legacy.

yn chwarae ein rhan i ddathlu a gwarchod yr etifeddiaeth honno.

6.30 p.m.

In conclusion, in response to Paul's comments, an inventory is under way. In terms of a statutory duty to protect, we now have an open process in the development of the heritage Bill in order to take a good, long look at that, although we must remember the complexity of the patterns of responsibility that Paul has already outlined. Therefore, it is not an entirely straightforward business. However, we can certainly take the debate forward. In terms of theft and the application of SmartWater, I would be very happy to look at that further. I know that there are initiatives being operated by Royal British Legion branches and I would be happy to ask officials to take a look at the all-Wales picture in that regard.

I gloi, ac i ateb sylwadau Paul, mae rhestr ar y gweill. O ran dyletswydd statudol i warchod, mae gennym bellach broses agored wrth ddatblygu'r Bil treftadaeth er mwyn edrych yn drylwyr ar hynny, er bod yn rhaid cofio cymhlethdod y patrymau cyfrifoldeb a amlinellwyd eisoes gan Paul. Felly, nid yw'n broses gwbl syml. Ond gallwn yn bendant symud y drafodaeth yn ei blaen. O ran lladrata a defnyddio SmartWater, byddwn yn hapus iawn edrych ymhellach ar hynny. Gwn fod canghennau'r Lleng Brydeinig Frenhinol yn rhoi rhai cynlluniau ar waith a byddwn yn fodlon iawn gofyn i'm swyddogion edrych ar y darlun ledled Cymru yn hynny o beth.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes today's business.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.31 p.m.
The meeting ended at 6.31 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Antoniw, Mick (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)
Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)

Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Parrott, Eluned (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)
Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)
Roberts, Aled (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

This page is intentionally left blank